Humanities

Paul Axelrod. *Values in Conflict:*
The University, the Marketplace, and the Trials of Liberal Education
McGill-Queen's University Press. xii, 204. $65.00, $24.95

This is a useful book that argues sensibly in support of the values of liberal education in the current Canadian context – and describes the threats to those values. Paul Axelrod's central thesis is that '[t]he cultivation of intellect, long a central objective of university life, is threatened by political and economic pressures that are redefining and reshaping the functions of higher learning.' The most crucial role of universities, according to Axelrod, is that of nourishing intellectual life, and yet 'a variety of forces has conspired to shrink the space that the university provides for fostering the life of the mind. More than ever, higher education is expected to cater directly, quickly, and continually to the demands of the marketplace.'

Axelrod argues that the qualities of mind traditionally associated with liberal education are valuable in themselves as goals of postsecondary education and also appropriate for many of the market-driven needs (employability) seen as essential by government and parents alike. The accepted values associated with an inquiring mind are, so his argument goes, ideally suited for both democratic citizenship at large and the performing of market-related tasks.

There is nothing new to this argument, but Axelrod's strength is the lucidity with which he establishes the context both for the emergence, over the centuries, of a belief in liberal education and for the current demand by government and public alike for skills-related postsecondary education aimed at employment and the acquisition of measurable economic advantage.

Values in Conflict is not an impassioned work, and one does not get that sense of excitement and insight one gets in reading Martha Nussbaum's *Cultivating Humanity*, for instance. But one seldom disagrees with Axelrod except, perhaps, for his dispassionate, low-key approach. His analysis of the current vogue by government (both external to the university and – in some cases – internal to it) for indicators and measurement of success makes sensible points and provides useful data, but his very lack of indignation (contempt?) for the absurdity of the widespread use of often irrelevant 'indicators' gives a kind of blandness to what is a well-argued analysis of both the prevalence of a belief in performance indicators and the limitations of such a practice.

In his opening chapter Axelrod sets out to describe the history of belief in education, arguing that what was meant in the past by education was often what we now mean by the term 'liberal education,' and goes on to place those values and practices in the contemporary Canadian context in which

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

'in the eyes of many, economic performance, not intellectual enlightenment, is the university's preeminent raison d'être.'

He then explains the extensive current emphasis on educating students for employability and on sponsoring university research that targets economic issues. Again, he is dispassionate in this analysis, although programs such as the Ontario Access to Opportunities Program (ATOP) that offered universities an economic stimulus for increasing enrolment in engineering and computer-science programs deserve a more spirited treatment – at least in the opinion of this reviewer. The program was intended to alleviate the allegedly insatiable demand (by high-tech firms in their heyday) for trained employees, and was instituted just before the high-tech meltdown and subsequent laying off of thousands of trained workers. Axelrod comments sagely: 'The boom and bust experience of high-tech companies on the stock market beginning in the latter half of 2000 was but one indication of the field's endemic volatility. The reduction of its workforce by some 50,000 employees (half the workforce) by the Canadian high-tech giant, Nortel, throughout 2001 was another.' ATOP is still in existence.

The very absence of passion that I have pointed to does give *Values in Conflict* a seriousness and integrity. As a guide both to what is happening to the way Canadians regard university education and to the history of Western belief in higher education generally, it is useful and articulate. And it shows – implicitly – that universities frequently acquiesce in the use of market-driven judgments and indicators of performance. (ROWLAND SMITH)

Tom Pocklington and Allan Tupper. *No Place to Learn: Why Universities Aren't Working*
University of British Columbia Press. 224. $85.00, $24.95

This is a timely book that delivers fully on the polemical promise of its main title but only intermittently and unevenly on the explanatory promise of its subtitle. As befits two political scientists, the authors have a strong sense of public policy and the public interest, but their common discipline also skews their analysis and findings at times (especially, perhaps, in their deeply uninformed disparagement of 'postmodernists'). However, their book is worth reading for its shortcomings as well as its accomplishments, especially at a time when the government of Canada claims to be substantially reinvesting in postsecondary education and enabling the provinces to do likewise, and when the response from the Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada to the federal Innovation Agenda seems far more enthusiastic than that from the Canadian Association of University Teachers.

For those who have lived through waves of hostility to universities from

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

governments, business, and (other) special-interest groups, including the Canadian Citizens Coalition with its annual deriding of SSHRC-sponsored projects with 'funny' titles or 'plainly' fatuous objectives, it may be hard to recognize their places of work in the following key claim: 'Universities, more so than other powerful Canadian institutions, sail on seas of unwarranted deference.' For those who have contested university policies and priorities from the inside as critical or dissident faculty, the university as the recipient of unrivalled deference may be equally unrecognizable. Tom Pocklington and Allan Tupper seem at times to ignore the powerfully anti-deferential dimensions of collegial processes, the ongoing exercise of academic freedom, and the critiquing of everything from differential and socially divisive tuition fees to unduly directive contract research. We are not the saps and scoundrels they occasionally suggest we are; nor are we so dependent on American academic self-critique as they imply. That said, there remains an important element of truth in the authors' insistence that large areas of university motivation and practice have been virtually exempted from criticism from insiders or outsiders. Campuses can host truisms as readily as can boardrooms or union halls; conversely, universities have no monopoly on searching inquiry and candid disclosure. If universities are less sacrosanct than the authors allege, they are surely capable of being as smugly corruptible as they try to show.

No Place to Learn is impelled by the belief that 'modern Canadian universities wrongly and seriously devalue the education of undergraduate students.' The authors argue that this crisis of values is fed by the overvaluing of highly specialized research 'often far removed from the needs of undergraduate students,' and by the undertaking of substantial amounts of such research as a consequence of 'increasingly close links between universities, governments, and large corporations.' This displacement of the broad public interest by the particular agendas of elites is made possible in significant measure by the most prevalent and sanctified illusion in Canadian academe, namely that 'teaching and research are mutually reinforcing activities.' To believe this is to claim benefits for undergraduates where there may be only damage or benevolent neglect; it is also to mistake research careerism for a desire to teach all students better, and to see sponsored or contract research as part of the process of building a better pedagogue and bringing relevant knowledge promptly and productively back to the classroom and the curriculum. Add to these mutually aggravating tendencies the fact that universities more than any other workplace are dominated by 'jealousy and a sense of oppression,' and we seem to have a recipe for inevitable disaster. Fear not, however. Pocklington and Tupper figure that universities have still sufficient autonomy, faculty have still enough control of the academic agenda, to

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

provide the conditions for necessary and effective 'reform.' Many of the mistakes are of our own making, and the remedies are within our grasp.

No Place to Learn concludes with 'Real Problems, Real Solutions,' deriving the latter from the bond between 'teaching and reflective inquiry.' Excellence must begin in the undergraduate classroom but need not end there. And this fundamental truth must be reflected in the estimation of professorial performance, and the distribution of incentives and rewards for faculty. Meanwhile, graduate education must change to produce a less anxious and narrow next generation of teacher-scholars who value (and are valued for) teaching introductory as well as advanced classes and are more intent on the quality than on the quantity of their research and publication. The fault lies not with benighted leaders or naïve techno-utopians but with ourselves, that faculty are working so hard while universities are not working as they ought to. In a sense, we get the academic governance we deserve, since much of it remains self-governance. This challenge deserves to be met individually and collectively by Canadian academics, and more concertedly than hitherto. At the same time, we need to recommit to a public role as intellectuals. Until we do, a book like this one, 'unapologetically aimed at the general reader,' may well be used to increase the ascendancy within universities of medical and scientific research. The notion of the 'ivory tower' will continue to be used as a glib pejorative unless we revisit and recycle its highly informative history more thoroughly than Pocklington and Tupper do. Above all, we need to demonstrate that the humanities knowledge and skills we work to preserve, disseminate, and augment offer other and more effectively historicized options for reform than 'nostalgic appeals to the traditions of liberal education.' (LEN FINDLAY)

F. King Alexander and Kern Alexander, editors.
The University: International Expectations
McGill-Queen's University Press. xiv, 138. $70.00, $27.95

This compilation of essays aims to provide discussion of prevailing issues and expectations that confront university and college leaders. The contributors include a vice-chancellor, five presidents, several higher education theorists, and two legal experts familiar with the new types of litigation that may confront modern universities. Issues considered include the role of the contemporary university, the mechanisms of increasing state intervention, the impact on small not-for-profit liberal arts colleges of competition from for-profit vocationalist universities, the implications of human rights legislation, and the exposure of universities to the jurisdiction of foreign courts for legally offensive communication through the Internet. Additionally, there are recent surveys of developments in the higher education systems of Australia, Ontario, and South Africa.

Among the contributions two stand out. Kern Alexander offers a broad-

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

ranging, historically informed reflection on the objectives of the university, its role in society, and its relation to government that sounds the keynote for the anthology. Acknowledging the pressures placed on tertiary institutions by the economic imperatives of modern governments, Alexander sees the university as a bulwark against rudderless progress under the influence of science and technology because of its ability to develop knowledge as a prerequisite to a desirable state of civilization. Education, he argues, can mitigate the negative inclinations of humanity in pursuit of the common good. It is a noble vision, with distinguished antecedents, but one that undermines its own utopianism by betraying anxiety about the ability of the institution, after all, to curb the reality of individual self-interest.

The second stand-out is the essay by F. King Alexander on the consequences of the shift to knowledge-based economies in the Western world, with increased expectations from governments that universities will serve the economic needs of the state. Alexander's account is chilling in its cold-eyed analysis of how governments are using accountability mechanisms (performance-based systems, fiscal incentives, outcomes indicators, league-table rankings, and the rest) as a means of balancing state issues with university interests. If Kern Alexander's essay offers a utopian ideal, this essay more than hints that we may be heading towards the dystopian obverse; certainly, his analysis explains why universities are such a site of tension as the objectives of government policy makers and higher education leaders, and of academic staff and 'management,' clash.

The rest of the essays are variable. Michael J. Beloff's speculations on the potential implications of Britain's Human Rights Act (1998) and the European Convention on Human Rights (2000) make very salutary reading that no university leader can afford to ignore. Similarly, David W. Olien's compendium of questions to be resolved concerning the pedagogical use of IT should prove useful for those who have to grapple with the issue. On the other hand, Don Aitken's glib acceptance of 'reinvention' as a natural process (by which he means the transformation of universities into quasi-private businesses) while acknowledging that academics 'hate the whole process' glides over the very issues that most leaders are struggling to resolve. Ian Clark's account of the evolution of the Council of Ontario Universities is also disappointing: the lack of critical reflection makes the essay less illuminating than it otherwise might have been.

Despite its variability, this volume largely achieves what it sets out to do. It makes one aware of the causes of change and of trends in the direction of change. It establishes a need for crucial decisions to be made about what the nature and roles of universities should be in the future. To make such decisions remains a major challenge; the future well-being of universities and of the societies that they serve will depend upon the wisdom of these decisions. (ALISTAIR FOX)

Elena Hannah, Linda Paul, and Swani Vethamy-Globus, editors.

Women in the Canadian Academic Tundra: Challenging the Chill
McGill-Queen's University Press. xii, 274. $75.00, $29.95

A compilation of narratives and testimonial essays, *Women in the Canadian Academic Tundra*, can be contextualized with three other recent and related texts. The complementary collection *The Madwoman in the Academy: Forty-Three Women Boldly Take On the Ivory Tower*, edited by Deborah Keahey and Deborah Schnitzer, also deals with women in Canadian higher education. A second book, Indhu Rajagopal's *Hidden Academics: Contract Faculty in Canadian Universities*, focuses on the employment sector most dependent on women. A third document is the complaint initiated (at the time of this writing) with the federal Human Rights Commission, by eight senior women academics alleging discriminatory practices in the Canada Research Chairs program.

On the face of things, the situation has never been better for women in higher education in Canada: record numbers and record percentages of female students, professors, and administrators. But these four texts show women as, variously, frozen out, abjected, hidden, and disenfranchised. How to account for this seeming disjunction? The forty-five front-line reports in *Women in the Canadian Academic Tundra* present, in the aggregate, a sense of the sometimes subtle and sometimes dramatic shifts in women's lives and work as the academy undergoes substantive transformation and restructuring. The 'chilly climate' – to use a phrase popularized by University of Western Ontario law professor Constance Backhouse – has become a permafrost, a frigid underlay.

Many of the contributors are sessional or contractually limited instructors, who can attest to the university's perpetuation of academic 'McJobs' to keep productivity up and costs down. (The situation is neatly encapsulated in one contributor's ironic account of summer language teaching to corporate clients: the department put the profits into a research grants fund to which sessional instructors – like herself – could not apply.) And while intellectual property rights are a general concern in the newly privatized academy, limited-term contract employees have an even more tenuous control of their lectures and course designs.

According to this collection, the crucial issues are somewhat different for tenure-track and tenured women. While female academics are proceeding well through the normal channels of tenure and promotion, administrative advancement is far less certain: the 'glass ceiling' model is replaced here by the metaphor of a 'leaky pipeline.' The crucial position of departmental chair – which functions as the relay point for other opportunities – is elusive for women. Further, women may well be alienated by a corporatized and uncongenial administrative culture. A tendency to 'back room' deal-making – itself a result of increased reliance on private funding – means that more positions are being awarded outside of peer-conducted public searches. In

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

these processes (as the Human Rights Commission complaint is intended to illustrate) equity goals are shunted to the side.

Last, the '24/7' workplace of the contemporary university presents constant and sometimes insuperable challenges for women, in every employment category, faced with the demands of maternity, child rearing, elder care – and sometimes all at once.

Women in the Academic Tundra could incur criticism for presenting a slanted picture of gendered academic life, since the contributors were self-selecting, responding to a call for submissions. (More essays from academics of colour and lesbian scholars would have been welcome, and only one piece is from a francophone academic; but the collection is otherwise diverse in terms of age, ability, geography, and field, with some illuminating contributions from First Nations women.) And while one respects the editors' desire to let the testimonies 'speak for themselves,' a more analytical and action-oriented conclusion would have been appreciated. Overall, what is impressive about this collection is the grit, humour, and savvy of these academic survivors. While 'tundra' is a 'barren land' by definition, it has nonetheless a rich diversity of flora and fauna. 'Tundra plants have developed many adaptations for survival,' according to *The Canadian Encyclopedia*. 'Their low stature exploits the more favourable microclimate near the ground.' Staying 'close to the ground' of experience and solidarity, with collections such as this one, allows Canadian women academics to continue to, tenaciously, flourish. (HEATHER MURRAY)

Indhu Rajagopal. *Hidden Academics: Contract Faculty in Canadian Universities*
University of Toronto Press. xx, 330. $65.00, $27.50

Indhu Rajagopal's detailed and revealing examination of contract faculty in Canadian universities should prove to be invaluable for anyone interested in the present and future state of the academy. Rajagopal's thorough statistical analysis not only supplies previously undocumented information about part-time faculty but also shows how academe's long-standing dependency upon part-time labour is indicative of other changes underway within our universities, which are often as invisible as part-time faculty themselves. Rajagopal's exposure of part-time faculty in Canadian universities, then, has a threefold aim: one, to reveal the presence, work, aspirations, and frustrations of what she argues is the most exploited body of workers in academe; two, to show how full-time faculty and university administrators benefit from this exploitation and perpetuate myths which enable it; and three, to demonstrate how exploitative labour relations between part-time and full-time faculty result from the growing 'corporatization' of the university.

Since universities and governments rarely keep official data on contract

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

faculty, Rajagopal's work marks an important advance in this area. Rajagopal's analysis is based upon surveys of part-time and full-time faculty as well as university administrators which she conducted in 1991–92, augmented by national and international studies and statistical data from the late 1990s. Her study of part-time faculty ranges widely; she surveys their terms of employment, working conditions, career aspirations, research, age, qualifications, and gender. According to her research, even though administrators, chairs, and program directors believe that part-time faculty are 'indispensable,' most still 'do not consider it cost efficient to collect data on part-timers, whom they consider transient.' The absence of such information, Rajagopal argues, has devastating effects upon part-time faculty, since the university's reluctance to account for their work reveals only too clearly how it is devalued and marginalized. Through anecdotes, Rajagopal powerfully conveys the effect of such marginalization on contract academics. They often perceive themselves as 'captive' to the 'women's work' of academe, characterizing themselves as the 'intellectual proletariat.' Rajagopal, however, does not limit her analysis to anecdotal evidence; she also presents significant statistical evidence to underscore that the individual experiences of part-time faculty result from real, rather than perceived, exploitation. According to her studies, part-time faculty are not only subject to low wages and poor working conditions; they are also excluded from most decision-making bodies, while full-time faculty control their working conditions and act as 'gate-keepers' of the collegium, consistently refusing them entry.

This refusal, Rajagopal argues, is legitimized by academe's prevailing ideology, which confirms the value of researchers over teachers academically, professionally, and socially. The devaluation of both contract faculty and teaching is inversely related to the increasing valuation of research within academe. Rajagopal reveals that, although administrators assert that financial expediency is the main reason for hiring contract faculty, in fact, they are also often hired to enable full-time faculty research, by either keeping the student-faculty ratio low, preventing increases in teaching loads, or facilitating research leaves. While research enables advancement through the academic ranks for most continuing faculty, teaching experience leads to few, if any, benefits for either full- or part-time faculty. The devaluation of teaching also justifies the gap in pay and status between those who are contracted to do research and those who are not. However, Rajagopal explodes the myth that most part-time faculty do no research. According to her surveys, there is little difference in research activity between full-time faculty and those part-timers who earn most, or all, of their income in the university. Yet, university administrators and full-time faculty consistently maintain that part-timers are not active researchers,

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

and thus enact policies, such as limiting research funding exclusively to full-time faculty, which reinforce and perpetuate this myth.

Rajagopal's *Hidden Academics* not only explodes such myths, but also shows that the perpetuation of these and other myths is useful in the 'corporatization' of the university. Most important, Rajagopal reminds us that in 'bottom-line' educational policy, contract faculty are an excellent value, and will continue to be, as long as their actual value remains invisible and poorly remunerated. This reality, though, will remain concealed until universities begin regular collection of data on part-time faculty and acknowledge the crucial role they play in the delivery of undergraduate education. Although Rajagopal offers few solutions to the problems she uncovers, her research and critique convincingly argue that, after decades of increasing dependency upon part-time labour, the academy needs to address an inequity which has become systemic, and more disturbingly, indispensable to the expedient administration of post-secondary education.
(ANNE GEDDES BAILEY)

Martin L. Friedland. *The University of Toronto: A History*
University of Toronto Press. xiii, 764. $60.00

There has been no institutional history of the University of Toronto published since 1927. Martin Friedland admirably remedies this lack on the occasion of the university's 175th anniversary. A university history should deal with constitutional issues, tell the stories of its parts, note contributions of individuals to the evolution of its functions, and convey a sense of the institution's impact on the lives of its members. Accomplishing this, while covering almost two centuries of one of the most complicated postsecondary structures in the English-speaking world, is a significant achievement. Friedland organizes his material chronologically, offering 'relatively short chapters that ... look at specific issues and events – often turning points.' Along the way, he inserts material on individual faculties, the development of the academic profession, profiles of significant individuals, and the spirit of the times. By returning to such themes in different eras, Friedland conveys a sense of the university as an evolving entity. He succeeds in telling a story that holds the reader's interest.

The volume is divided into eight parts. The first part ('Beginnings') includes nine chapters, tracing the sixty-year evolution of King's College/University College up to the Federation Act of 1887, which laid the groundwork for what could be called a university. Parts 2 through 5 ('Federation,' 'Aspirations,' 'Turbulence,' 'Growth') track, in twenty-three chapters, about seventy years' development – through the two world wars and the Depression – of undergraduate, graduate, and professional faculties, with research and teaching functions. Parts 6 through 8 ('Expand-

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

ing Horizons,' 'Adjustment,' 'Raising the Sights'), in ten chapters, take the story a further forty-five or so years, to 1999, presenting what was done to create the modern multiversity, with its panoply of interdisciplinary activities and points of contact with the wider society.

In dealing with Toronto's academic profile, Friedland gives proper credit to the humanities, the federated college structure, and to the Arts and Science Honours Program, as distinguishing features throughout much of the university's rise to prominence. He also makes it clear that several strong basic science departments and a number of professional faculties, particularly Medicine and Engineering, were equally significant contributors to the university's stature, based on their rapid growth and research contributions in the early decades of the twentieth century.

One strength of the volume is its detailed accounts of the contributions of individual faculty. Friedland also traces the professoriate's evolving roles in teaching and research and – latterly – as an influential collective force in university politics. Incidents about 'academic freedom,' spanning a century, are recounted in lively fashion, for their own significance and as reflecting the milieus of the times.

Friedland's picture of student life is more episodic, but with significant accounts of the struggle for admission of women in the 1880s, the student strike of 1896, athletics in several periods, and the activism of the 1960s. Those who wish for more comprehensive accounts of this or other facets of the university's history are directed by the author to the work of other scholars or to his separately published footnotes, almost equal in length to the book, and to his source material, much of which is already deposited in the University Archives.

Friedland takes his account to the dawn of the twenty-first century. He carries well the burden of selecting what to say about the most recent decades. He cannot, almost by definition, identify the most significant recent 'turning points,' in the way he focused, for example, on the interplay or religion and politics in the university's first sixty years, or on the emergence of graduate studies and research activity in the next sixty. He does, however, provide a good, topical account of a period that many of his readers will remember well. His reflective epilogue indicates where he expects the next history of the university to look: to the fate of the humanities and social sciences, to the balance between applied and fundamental research, and to the resolution of questions about accessibility and corporate influence. (JACK DIMOND)

Annabel Patterson. *Nobody's Perfect: A New Whig Interpretation of History*
Yale University Press. ix, 288. US $27.50

Annabel Patterson hopes to characterize 'liberal' thought in the eighteenth century, and to rescue the term 'whig' from the dustbin in which, she

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

argues, Sir Lewis Namier and Sir Herbert Butterfield placed it. Since nobody's perfect, Patterson's Whigs – the 'party' – and her whigs – the political philosophy – occasionally wandered from their 'liberal' principles, but really were true 'progressives.' She studies six such men.

John Almon, the bookseller and political activist, sought to publish parliamentary debates and putative libels. Edmund Burke was not as reactionary as the *Reflections* suggest; his speech on conciliation with the colonies is a prose version of *Paradise Lost* and shows his true whig colors. Edward Thompson's edition of Andrew Marvell's letters and other writings was ethically and politically charged with 'progressive' principles. Sir Joshua Reynolds was not the conservative he was thought late in his life, but the favourite painter of the Whigs. Thomas Erskine defended Paine for publishing the *Rights of Man*, worked in Milton's intellectual tradition, and was committed to the idea of progress. William Wordsworth did not allow the revised *Prelude* to be published in his lifetime because it did not adequately negate his whig principles of 1805.

Patterson never properly explains why she chooses these as opposed to other whigs. The Stage Licensing Act of 1737, the intimidation and arrest of Opposition printers and writers, the prohibition on publishing parliamentary debates, bloody and brutal penal laws, and turning the coat for office and elevation were familiar Whig achievements. The political life of Sir Robert Walpole or William Pulteney would have made a different story.

The book includes many serious factual and conceptual errors. Here are samples. The 'genial version of Hobbes' David Hume wrote a history of England based upon 'a theory of absolute monarchy' attractive to absolutist George III. The government during the Jacobite rebellion in 1745 was Tory. The *Gazetteer* in 1760 was 'liberal,' though its stated editorial policy and practice were 'impartial.' The Whig 'Patriot' Opposition to Walpole was a 'party' to which (Tory Jacobite) Bolingbroke belonged. Lord North 'hired' Samuel Johnson to propagandize for his government. Moreover, there is no need to speculate about the publication date of Johnson's *Taxation No Tyranny*: it has long been established as 8 March 1775.

The work of Butterfield and Namier is far more complex, and in its 'empirical' mode had far less influence than Patterson thinks. Linda Colley's book on Namier would have helped, as indeed, among many other ideological historians, would E.P. Thompson on the left and J.C.D. Clark on the right. Patterson regards whig and republican as apparent synonyms and imposes modern terms like 'conservative,' 'liberal,' and 'democratic' on eighteenth-century thought. These are demonstrably inappropriate for the complex hierarchic monarchy that Britain then was and that successive Whig governments supported. That nation required oaths and subscription of the Thirty-Nine Articles for entrance to Oxford, did not abolish slavery until 1807, and allowed partial Catholic emancipation only in 1829. It is hardly news that Sir Joshua was a favourite painter of the Whigs and is not

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

evidence for his attitude towards the French Revolution in 1790, when health and blindness forced him to stop painting. As Richard Wendorf demonstrated, by then Reynolds clearly was in Burke's camp regarding the French revolution. It is imprudent to praise someone as in the 'progressive' intellectual tradition of John Milton, who defended regicide and served a militarist, intolerant, theocratic government. Patterson's stark division between Good Whigs who are liberal and democratic and Bad Tories who are conservative and reactionary is simplistic and unhistorical.

Let us test Patterson's hypothesis or, rather, her assumed truth. The eighteenth century included a brilliant man of letters who transcended his humble origins through his own efforts, believed in progress, opposed censorship, published parliamentary debates, toasted the next insurrection of the enslaved negroes, excoriated colonialism and imperialism, encouraged women writers, opened his home, purse, and heart to the poor, and mocked Sir Joshua's social pretensions and gold-laced sitters, who would not be missed if 'extirpated.' That is the man whom Annabel Patterson describes as 'the inveterate ['long continuance of any thing bad'] Tory Dr. Johnson.' (HOWARD D. WEINBROT)

Richard Johns. *A Theory of Physical Probability*
University of Toronto Press. vi, 260. $85.00

The role of probability and statistics in the study of physical phenomena has a long and well-established history. Probability was used to describe the behaviour of physical systems in a formal sense as early as the eighteenth century with the introduction of statistical mechanics, but probability took centre stage in physics with the discovery of quantum mechanics in the early twentieth century. So it is with much enthusiasm that this reviewer, an experimental particle physicist with an interest in probability and statistics, waded into *A Theory of Physical Probability*, a monograph by philosopher Richard Johns, which promised to be an 'investigation of physical probability, the kind of probability involved in irreducibly random processes.'

The book is organized into four main sections: The first section defines formally 'logical probability,' a framework that is an extension of the traditional Keynesian concept of the same name. Logical probability is then used to define the 'causal theory of chance,' a definition of probability that could be applied to describe physical phenomena. The last two sections of the book explore the application of this theory to classical statistical mechanics and quantum mechanics in this new language.

The causal theory of chance is based on a logical framework in which one can identify epistemological relationships between processes or systems and the phenomena they cause. Having this relationship formalized in the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

language of his logical probability, Johns then develops the concept of the 'chance' of a particular event. He defines chance as being a degree of belief of the outcome. Although quite attractive to a subjective Bayesian, I found his operational definition of degrees of belief (as the value of a contract or bet) to be difficult to connect to what we typically would employ as probabilities in a physical context. The latter are often defined classically in terms of the limiting frequencies of the occurrence of an event given an ensemble of similarly prepared systems. He does show how one can make the connection between his definition of chance and frequencies, and he carefully constructs a formal system based on this definition, showing that it satisfies the standard Kolmogorov axioms of probability.

The last two topics in the book are perhaps the most interesting to the physicist. Unfortunately, the applications of the causal theory of chance to physical systems are somewhat limited. In the case of classical stochastic mechanics, Johns uses boundary conditions and Lagrangian mechanics to define classical states of motion uniquely, but he creates an unconvincing argument to reconcile the time-invariance of physical laws (i.e., they operate the same regardless of whether we go forward or backward in time) with the 'arrow of time' (that many phenomena occur in nature only as time marches forward). He invokes the concept of entropy without ever defining what he means by it in his framework.

In the application of his theory to quantum mechanics, Johns provides a very readable account of the fundamental issues confronting the foundations of quantum theory today. He discusses the debate surrounding the Einstein-Podolsky-Rosen paradox and Neils Bohr's response to it, and the more recent contributions made by John Bell, David Bohm, and others. He tackles the thorny problem of how to understand measurement, and lays out the conceptual battlefield over which philosophers and physicists to this day do battle. His own view, which he develops in the last few chapters, is that quantum states have in fact epistemological significance in addition to their specific physical relevance, and he argues that there is a natural way to understand measurement in this context.

Overall, I found the book well written and accessible to an audience outside the traditional philosophical mold. It has a clear focus, is well researched, and contains a complete list of references and index. As a physicist, I found the book somewhat uneven in the depth and understanding of classical and quantum physics theory, but I did enjoy the strong philosophical underpinnings it develops. I recommend it to anyone interested in an up-to-date review of the application of probability to physical systems, and especially to those who continue to struggle with the mysteries of quantum mechanics. (PEKKA SINERVO)

Jillian Scott McIntosh, editor. *Naturalism, Evolution, and Intentionality*

University of Calgary Press. vi, 258. $22.00

One of the most active philosophical research programs during the 1990s occurred at the intersection of the philosophy of biology and the philosophy of mind. Led by people such as Ruth Millikan, Daniel Dennett, and Fred Dretske, this 'naturalized' philosophy of mind made liberal and enthusiastic use of recent findings in psychology, neuroscience, anthropology, and evolutionary biology.

Among the contributors to this volume are Colin Allen, Paul Davies, Larry Shapiro, and Eric Saidel, and the various essays testify to both the fruitfulness and, to some extent, the nearing exhaustion of that program. The book is divided into three sections. The first set of papers explores the extent to which the mind can be understood as an adaptation, that is, as the product of evolution by natural selection. Part 2 narrows the discussion slightly, with four papers on the 'teleosemantic' approach to mental content. The teleosemantic project attempts to fix mental content through appeals to the evolutionary conditions under which certain cognitive mechanisms came to be fixed. For example, we know that frogs will habitually flick out their tongues at small, black objects that cross their field of vision. They will flick not just at flies, but also at BBs and a slew of other similar-looking things. Is the frog's eye telling the frog's brain 'fly in range,' or is it telling it 'fly-or-BB in range'? Can the question be settled by appeals to the frog's selection history? This is known as the disjunction problem, and has become a bit of a scratching post for teleosemanticists.

Most of the papers in the first two sections are exercises in academic housekeeping – the tidying up of loose ends, the adjudication of disputes, and the general kibitzing that is the workaday world of academic philosophy. That is not in any way a criticism, because a lot of important philosophy is just of this sort. A particularly good example is Phil Hanson's paper 'Darwin's Algorithm, Natural Selective History, and Intentionality Naturalized.' Hanson does an excellent job of clarifying the running dispute between Jerrry Fodor and Daniel Dennett on the relevance of natural selection to an adequate theory of intentionality, and of exposing some basic flaws internal to both positions.

Similarly, Colin Allen's witty paper 'A Tale of Two Froggies' is an extremely valuable caution to philosophers looking to tackle once again the question of what the frog's eye is telling the frog's brain. As he argues, 'The tale of froggie neurosemantics is perhaps a useful nursery-primer for philosophers seeking to develop competence in natural semantics,' but for both scientists and philosophers the real action lies elsewhere. This is the most convincingly argued essay in the book.

The third section closes the book with two very interesting papers on vision. In 'Why Vision Is More Than Seeing,' neuroscientist Mel Goodale shows how our vision is actually quite modular, with at least one main

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

system for perception and another for action. While these normally work seamlessly together in co-ordinating human behaviour, Goodale shows how they can be experimentally isolated. In certain cases, it is possible to have perception without action, and even action without perception.

Mohan Matthen's 'Our Knowledge of Colour' is by far the most philosophically challenging and sophisticated paper in the book. He stakes out an original position on the epistemology of colour vision, showing along the way how it instructively contrasts with our perception of musical harmony.

One minor annoyance in this book is that there is virtually no cross-referencing between the articles. Given that many of the papers contain both significant overlap in subject matter and fundamental disagreement on major questions, it would be nice if the editor had had the authors do a bit of internal calibrating of their respective positions. Otherwise, she has put together a very useful collection of essays. (ANDREW POTTER)

Susan Mann. *Dream of Nation: A Social and Intellectual History of Quebec*
McGill-Queen's University Press. 344. $75.00, $27.95

It is good to see *Dream of Nation* back in print. Susan Mann, who first published it in 1982, is a gifted writer who accurately summarizes academic debates while also bringing historical moments to life. And what moments they were! Mann was a dynamic, fluently bilingual member of the Université d'Ottawa history department in the 1970s when the largely francophone student body stayed up all night and partied in exhilaration as René Lévesque's Parti québécois swept to power in November 1976. The faculty fiercely debated *fédéralisme* and *libération* in the halls of the department's rickety old Victorian offices. On campuses and within Quebec's new government, passions also ran high over feminist demands for daycare, abortion clinics, and fair pay. Mann was in the thick of things, and the book vibrates with the excitement of a Quebec hurtling towards – who knew what?

Though the book is less rich in illustrations and statistics than Brian Young and John Dickinson's useful *Short History of Quebec,* it captures the reader's imagination. *Dream of Nation* conveys the feverish energy of Montreal's imperious nineteenth-century Bishop Ignace Bourget, who enlisted numerous new orders of nuns and priests to replace the *rouge* nationalism of 1837 with an Ultramontane empire. This 'Clerical Offensive' featured schools, orphanages, northern colonization treks, and even a Zouave regiment sent to defend the pope. Such initiatives helped create a willing audience for the anachronistic pulpit politics which associated even the congenitally conciliatory Liberal Wilfrid Laurier with spectres of godlessness and guillotines. Another chapter deftly synthesizes the reasons rural Quebeckers

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

flooded into Montreal and the conditions they found: smallpox, slums, bad milk, and 'black holes' in factory basements for child cigarmakers who acted childish. A much reprinted chapter, 'The Prussians Are Next Door,' explains how federal mishandling of Great War recruitment combined with Ontario's suppression of French schools to channel French-Canadian militancy towards fellow Canadians rather than faraway Germans. A creative chapter on postwar culture conveys the dramatic impact of television in 1950s Quebec. If it opened up a world of consumerism, it also provided a forum for Quebec artists and entertainers. Quebeckers bonded around little black and white screens aglow with hockey, the comical Plouffe family, and a particularly riveting journalist named René Lévesque.

Mann's discussion of women is less felicitous. Building blocks were lacking: non-hagiographic historical writing on Quebec women's history has been (and, according to historian Micheline Dumont, still is) rather thin. The author substitutes gendered analogy for gendered history in asserting the British Conquest was like rape; but neither the Quebec Act's concessions to French law and custom fifteen years after conquest nor the ability to launch rebellion in 1837 suggest the battered and demoralized victim of a rape. A chapter on the 1970s that interweaves feminism with separatism and nationalism is confusing. Mann does summarize well the cautious feminism of the early 1900s, with ladies from leading families kept on a short leash by authorities such Montreal's Bishop Bruchesi, who defined feminism as the 'zeal of woman for all those noble causes in the sphere to which Providence has assigned her.' Such pontifications helped postpone female franchise until 1940, over twenty years behind most provinces. In 1980, as the author colourfully recounts, some fifteen thousand self-proclaimed 'Yvettes' (the docile girl featured in traditional Quebec schoolbooks) rallied to the 'No' side in the referendum campaign, the event that closes the book.

Mann writes so vividly, and synthesizes most themes so well, that one wishes for more. The work would benefit, for example, from revision to include scholarship since 1980. Although two chapters on the Rebellion decades remain an excellent introduction to the subject, Allan Greer's exposition of popular leadership now questions older hierarchical assumptions. Perhaps presciently, Mann entitled the chapter on the Quiet Revolution 'Noisy Evolution'; and indeed work by Michael Behiels subsequently revealed how the intellectual groundwork for the Lesage era was laid in the 1950s. Readers, often drawn to Quebec history because of concern with contemporary politics, will wish for an updated last chapter to cover the rise of new parties, the cliffhanging 1995 referendum on sovereignty, and other recent instalments of 'the Dream.' We can only hope for a sequel to this engaging survey of the fabled and too-often 'foreign' province next door. (JAN NOEL)

Douglas Walton. *Legal Argumentation and Evidence*

Pennsylvania State University Press. xvii, 374. US $65.00

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Douglas Walton is a prominent scholar in the field of argumentation theory. In this book he aims to show how argumentation theory can be applied to many aspects of legal argumentation. The book will be of interest to a variety of specialists, but also to others; as Walton says, anyone interested in legal argumentation will find it helpful as an introduction to the basic principles of legal reasoning and forms of argument.

For the purpose of modelling legal argumentation, most previous books on legal logic have concentrated almost exclusively, Walton notes, on deductive or inductive logic.

But Walton contends that a number of significant argument-types used in law are neither deductively valid nor inductively strong but fall into a 'third category of arguments' and that the reasoning in such arguments - 'plausible reasoning' - is the most important kind in legal argumentation.

Walton uses the notion of plausible reasoning to construct a 'new' theory of evidence. The theory says, roughly, that something is evidence if it is inferred by plausible reasoning from 'initial impressions (appearances that seem to be veridical) of a (credible) person' and then used 'to gain acceptance of something that was in doubt.'

One of the 'most intractable difficulties' confronting a theory of evidence is to make sense of the concept of circumstantial evidence. Walton examines five criteria for distinguishing such evidence from direct evidence, and finds them wanting. The distinction, he concludes, is 'too shaky a foundation to build a theory of evidence on'; yet it is an important distinction for a theory of legal argument. How, then, should it be drawn? Walton holds that his plausibilistic theory of evidence offers a general answer to this question.

Legal argumentation in a trial occurs in a context of disputation. Walton believes that what is needed to model disputational uses of argumentation is 'a dialectical structure in which there are rules for different kinds of conversations (dialogues).' In his view, argumentation in a legal case should be analysed and evaluated as a connected series of moves in a goal-directed dialogue of the 'critical discussion' type. In evaluating such argumentation, what matters is not just the correctness of the chain of reasoning but how the chain of reasoning is used to make some point in the context of the dialogue.

Understanding this 'pragmatic' aspect of legal argumentation requires a consideration of the concept of relevance. Walton thinks that the only potentially useful way to define relevance for logic is as a dialectical notion of how an argument is used in a given case to relate to some issue under discussion. The central thesis of his book (he says) is that *legal* relevance is based on (a kind of) dialectical relevance. To evaluate the dialectical relevance of a given argument in a legal case, we ask whether the argument

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

can be 'chained forward' in a connected sequence of reasoning that has as its ultimate conclusion the thesis of the proponent in the dialogue.

The plausibility of an argument made by the proponent (or respondent) in a dialogue may depend on her credibility. For the purpose of modelling argumentation where the credibility of a participant in a dialogue is a factor in evaluating the plausibility of her argument, a 'credibility function' needs to be added to formal dialectic. The way to do this, Walton holds, is to think of a participant in a dialogue as what is now called an agent in multi-agent systems in computer science. In any dialogue an agent will begin with a particular credibility rating which can be adjusted in the light of evidence about his character (e.g., his veracity), with a consequent adjustment in the initial 'plausibility value' of his argument. On this approach, then, the character of an arguer can be relevant to the assessment of his argument, contrary to logical tradition.

Impressively researched and clearly written, this book is a notable contribution to the study of legal argumentation. A pity, then, that it is annoyingly repetitious. And in places the discussion is insufficiently rigorous; in particular, more careful attention needs to be given to the logical issue of when a plausibilistic inference is correct. (DEREK ALLEN)

Randal Marlin. *Propaganda and the Ethics of Persuasion*
Broadview. 328. $29.95

It is a common belief that people are essentially reasonable and that they act and believe well only when their actions and beliefs can be supported by good – if possible conclusive – reasons. It is also well known that people are creatures of emotion, with limited time and a need to elicit the co-operation of others. These considerations produce a tension between the generally desirable aim of conviction and the often necessary, commonly practised but less praiseworthy activities of persuasion. It is true that a convincing communication can also employ persuasive techniques (and that it can sometimes be so delivered that people are not, in fact, convinced), but persuasion is clearly quite independent of conviction and is usually practised without it. These facts raise descriptive questions about the means and aims of persuasion, particularly those varieties that have come to be called propaganda, and ethical questions about its moral justifiability. Randal Marlin addresses both these matters.

After a preliminary chapter on the value of studying propaganda, which also introduces two seminal figures in that study, George Orwell and Jacques Ellul, Marlin proceeds to outline briefly the history of the practice, especially as an instrument of state control of opinions, and the principal techniques employed. These subjects occupy the second and third chapters of the book, but are revisited in the final chapter, which is devoted to the Internet as a means of communication. Ethical questions about both state

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

propaganda and commercial persuasion are taken up in chapters 4 and 5, while the social and political issues of freedom of expression and control of the media are the focus of the sixth and seventh chapters. In each of these areas Marlin is erudite, sensitive to nuance, and sensible. What is more, as befits a Broadview Press book, both the descriptive points and the ethical issues are illustrated by a wealth of Canadian, as well as other, examples.

Broadly speaking, Marlin favours those social arrangements that permit widespread reasoned discussion of public issues and reliable access to the information required to make good decisions both about public policy and private consumption. Nevertheless he recognizes that it is not desirable or even possible to eliminate merely persuasive discourse and that even the state may be justified in applying it in certain limited circumstances. He worries about reasonable limitations on the right of free expression, notably in cases of hate propaganda generated by private citizens and organizations. He is also concerned about the dangers presented to rational discourse and genuine democracy by the persuasive power of wealth, particularly when it leads to a monopoly over sources of information and attractive and accessible means of disseminating opinion. Marlin's own social outlook, then, can be labelled as towards the left end of the liberal democratic spectrum.

Although there is much to admire in this book, I think the author may someday give us an even better one. This better book could develop in one or more of three ways. It could build on the discussion of Ellul's notion of pre-propaganda to address the wide variety of ways in which our ordinary manner of discourse, embedded as it is in our way of life, renders us more receptive to certain types of persuasive message than others. This book could draw on the work of those influenced by Gramsci or Foucault, but might lead to techniques for recognizing and overcoming one's own prejudices. Second, even if this better book retained a restriction to deliberately persuasive discourse, it could offer a more sharply conclusive discussion of communicative ethics. I was never sure exactly what sorts of persuasive discourse Marlin considered permissible or impermissible, or the precise reasons for doing so. Finally, even if the open-ended approach to the ethical questions remained, the ethical portions of the better book might be organized into sections according to issues raised, theories applicable and case studies to which they might be applied. Such an organization would make the book an even better teaching tool. (THOMAS MATHIEN)

Dorota Glowacka and Stephen Boos, editors. *Between Ethics and Aesthetics: Crossing the Boundaries*
SUNY Press. x, 310. US $81.50, $27.95

The essays collected in this volume are divided into four thematic sections. The first part is devoted to questions about relations between philosophy

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

and art, with a focus on Kant, Schiller, and Hegel. The second part is equally theoretical. It focuses on the ethical philosophy of Emmanuel Levinas, and his demand that ethics and aesthetics respect the radical alterity of other people. The third part explores how aesthetics and politics may be combined, and the fourth part presents contemporary artists and art critics speculating on the possibility of an ethical art practice.

Although the contributors are not all drawn either from philosophy in particular or academics in general, and include a few artists and activists, as well as some professors of English and theology, potential readers require a background in philosophical theory in order to be able to understand and engage with all but a few of the shorter essays in part 4. Readers familiar with the work of a variety of feminist and continental philosophers including Adorno, Cixous, Derrida, Heidegger, Irigaray, Levinas, Lyotard, and Spivak are in the best position to respond to the claims and arguments made in *Between Ethics and Aesthetics*. None of the contributors, who include very prominent theorists such as Jean-François Lyotard, Terry Eagleton, and Drucilla Cornell, as well as a number of talented but less famous academics based in Nova Scotia, engage with similar debates about interactions between aesthetics, ethics, and politics occurring in contemporary analytic philosophy (by the likes of Noel Carroll, Marcia Muelder Eaton, and others).

The strongest essays in the book ally theoretical speculations on big questions about the nature of relationships between ethics and aesthetics with detailed analyses of particular phenomena, whether Holocaust art or the aesthetic dimension of globalization. Others are stronger either in one dimension or the other. Some of the essays engage with philosophical theories with only minor attention to their application to particular artworks and others analyse particular confrontations between artworks and ethical imperatives without relating this in a complex way to theoretical issues about the relationship between art and ethics.

The essays also vary a great deal in length. Some, such as the short contribution of Terry Eagleton, do little more than provide a useful sketch of a variety of ways in which contemporary academics link ethics and aesthetics. The final chapter, by the activist Marusya Bociurkiw, is also so short that it does little more than give brief descriptions of some projects by Canadian video artists along with a few remarks about their general political significance.

The essay by Elizabeth Edwards on the banality of Andy Warhol is in productive tensions with all of the other essays in the book. All of the other authors either assume or argue that ethics is profoundly relevant to the aesthetic domain, and generally vice versa, while Edwards examines the appeal of art which refuses to engage with ethics. She explores art that provides what she describes as amoral pleasures. Her interpretation of Warhol and the pleasures his art may provoke represents a useful contrast

to the other approaches taken in the book, although she does at times seem to reduce ethics and morality to concerns with shame and blame.

Although the individual essays do not on the whole make references to one another, they are very usefully read in conjunction, with many of them in particular responding to the work of Levinas. Readers who are willing to engage in close reading of some very difficult material will be rewarded by a number of insights into a variety of ways in which ethics and aesthetics can usefully inform one another. (AMY MULLIN)

Margaret Visser. *Beyond Fate*
Anansi. xii, 170. $17.95

Visser's wide-ranging dissection of fatalism in modern Western society, originally broadcast and delivered as the CBC's prestigious Massey Lectures, makes an idiosyncratic case for 'transcendence' in an 'addicted' culture. Bored and distracted, prone to embarrassment over status yet deriving joy from shopping, given to both relativism and the new-fangled iron cage of genetic determinism, we are, in her view, a sorry lot. The solution is a reinvigoration of the Christian notions of love, justice, guilt, and forgiveness: forms of attentiveness and responsibility that the theologian Bernard Lonergan, one of Visser's guiding lights, called the Transcendental Precepts.

There is much to admire in Visser's analysis, in particular her dazzling exercises of metaphorical excavation in the opening section. Here, the author of graceful previous works on table manners and food ritual once more delivers the easy erudition and deft insight characteristic of her charming form of cultural anthropology. The discussion of lines and circles is particularly engaging, demonstrating how much these simple geometric figures dominate our thinking about self, narrative, movement, time, and space. She is likewise incisive and convincing in the scattered sections that trace connections between ancient thought and contemporary life, with brief excursions into the psychology of boredom and addiction, the true cost of 'cheap' fast food, and the endless burdens of consumerism's positional goods.

Unfortunately, the whole proves less than the sum of its parts. By nature eclectic and accessible, these lectures skim too fast and too lightly over the vast terrain of fate's empire. Is it really true that ours is more an honour/shame (Greek) culture than a guilt/forgiveness (Christian) one? A glance at daytime television would suggest otherwise, though the results are perhaps pathological rather than healthy. Are the Greeks really as monolithically fatalistic as she suggests? A footnote excepts Aristotle in passing, but the exception is significant and worth pursuing. (Visser concentrates on Democritus instead, a controversial emphasis.) And, most

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

important, is Christian moralism, even the nuanced kind Visser has in mind, really the solution to the addictions and consumption spirals of everyday life? Experience appears to indicate the opposite – that, indeed, contemporary society has been able to fold itself comfortably around Christian moralism without much effort, and that this, not an alleged penchant for giving in to fatalism, is now our deepest problem.

On all these points, Visser would have found much food for thought in the work of a recently deceased moral philosopher, Bernard Williams, whose influential books of Greek-inflected ethics, *Shame and Necessity* and *Moral Luck*, add humour and wisdom, even while taking full measure of life's tragic dimension, to the contemporary philosophers she does cite, including Alasdair MacIntyre and Charles Taylor. The other significant omission, to my mind, is Ian Hacking's ground-breaking work, *The Taming of Chance*, which traces the early modern world's shifting relationship to fate and chance via the new field of probability theory. But these are bibliographic quibbles; I doubt they would alter Visser's basic argument in favour of Christian improvement. Cultural observers from Aristotle and Juvenal in the ancient world to Nietzsche and Veblen in the modern have known that the vices of excess and indulgence, the posturing and jockeying for position so typical of human society, are not diminished by sermons and scolding. Critics invariably do better to find levers of pragmatic self-interest, signs of deteriorating health, and even claims about immanent happiness and human flourishing. Visser agrees with Hume (though she does not cite him) that justice is an artificial virtue: we make it up as we go along, finding languages and ideas that will help us realize it (human rights, the rule of law, toleration), even as we acknowledge that the might-makes-right natural world will not generate justice on its own. But she goes too far, as contemporary geneticists also go too far, in seeing nature as wholly indifferent to our desire for justice, and therefore concluding that our best option is a transcendental one.

We, too, with all our conflicted cravings and bright hopes, are part of the natural world – for there is no other. Aristotle saw this, and also saw that any escape from fate and the limits imposed by it was to be found not in some transcendental move but, instead, in ourselves. A god cannot save us if there is no god; only we can save ourselves – right here, right now. (MARK KINGWELL)

Frances Froman, Alfred Keye, Lottie Keye, and Carrie Dyck.
English-Cayuga Cayuga-English Dictionary
University of Toronto Press. xli, 744. $150.00

Writing a dictionary is an enormous task. In a recent book edited by William Frawley, Kenneth Hill, and Pamela Munro, *Making Dictionaries. Preserving Indigenous Languages of the Americas*, the editors set out what they

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

call lexicographic war stories on making dictionaries. These include the following: 'how difficult it was to know where to begin; how the project went on and on and the book kept expanding from a modest list of words and glosses to something like a cultural encyclopedia; how, when the work was finally completed and published, some people were unimpressed, and even mean-spirited and critical – "What! You forgot to include ...???."' The authors of the book under review undoubtedly experienced many of these feelings. The dictionary was compiled by a team including Cayuga language teachers at Six Nations (Frances Froman, Alfred J. Keye, Lottie Keye) and a linguist (Carrie J. Dyck) and was produced under the auspices of the Sweetgrass First Nations Language Council. The work was done over seven years, and involved many people. The dictionary has over three thousand entries, including, according to the description on the jacket, one thousand verb forms and many nouns never before recorded in print; extensive cross-referencing; thematic appendices that highlight cultural references and list sixteen hundred further entries; and a brief grammatical overview. It is a work of many years, and much care and love has gone into it.

Following acknowledgments, the book begins with an introduction which provides information on the Cayuga people and the language as well as discussion of dialect differences and spelling systems. Next is a user guide which describes the dictionary entries and spelling system. This is followed by an English-Cayuga section, a Cayuga-English section, and appendices on time, numbers and money, kin terms and nationalities, chiefs' names, place names, traditional and ceremonial language, government and business terms, vocabulary from the Thanksgiving Address, particles, and a grammatical sketch.

Like many North American Aboriginal languages, words in Cayuga are complex in structure. Nouns consist of a stem which is usually both prefixed and suffixed. The verb is more complex, containing a stem, a pronominal prefix, an aspect suffix generally, and additional suffixes. That the stem is not word-initial poses a challenge to dictionary writers. In English-Cayuga entries, there is an English keyword on the first line, followed on the next line by a Cayuga word and its translation. Following this is grammatical information about the stem that the word is built on, and further words that are related in meaning. In the Cayuga-English section, the main entry is a stem, without affixes. This is followed by Cayuga words in different aspects that are formed on that stem. Both English-Cayuga and Cayuga-English entries thus include full words. A learner of Cayuga can work with the English-Cayuga entries and see words rather than pieces of words; a more sophisticated user who can identify stems can use the Cayuga-English entries. The dictionary is thus carefully designed to meet multiple needs. The layout is attractive, and information is easy to find.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

The Cayuga dictionary is the third major Iroquoian dictionary published by the University of Toronto Press. Michelson and Doxtator's Oneida dictionary appeared in 2002 and Woodbury's Onondaga dictionary in 2003. These works are all of the highest quality, and show that, despite the lexicographic battles, those who are willing to persist in making a dictionary do something of enormous value. These dictionaries differ in many ways, and for many reasons, but all accomplish something that Frawley, Hill, and Munro address: 'A dictionary is a thousand pages of ideas and history, a guide to the mind and world of a people. No book – except for, perhaps, religious documents, themselves guides to the mind and world of a people – has a shelf life longer than a dictionary. Surely that must be worth something.' The authors of the Cayuga dictionary are to be thanked for the energy and effort that they put to creating this work, one that will be invaluable to generations to come. (KEREN RICE)

K. Nakajima, editor. *Learning Japanese in the Network Society*
University of Calgary Press. xix, 204, $29.95

Learning Japanese in the Network Society is a collection of papers presented at the Second International Conference on Computer Technology and Japanese Language Education, held in August, 1999, at the University of Toronto. This is a comprehensive presentation of both theoretical and practical applications of computer technology by the leading researchers as well as teachers in Japanese as a second language education. The editor's keen eye selects the most significant and essential topics for the issues of computer-assisted language learning (CALL) today.

K. Nakajima organizes this book in four chapters: a general view on what network society can do for language learning; the database capabilities for language education; learner autonomy; and collaboration and copyright issues. She selects nine papers which discuss issues and achievements in these four fields.

The first chapter contains two articles on multimedia learning: K. Akahori, 'Using Multimedia in the Network Society' and M. Tsutsui, 'Developing CALL Software'. Akahori's paper provides readers with the theoretical and technological aspect of multimedia learning systems, whereas Tsutsui provides some more practical aspects for creating multimedia software. Tsutsui emphasizes the importance of the collaborative effort between teachers and technology specialists to create good programs: sage advice.

Chapter 2 contains three papers: H. Yamamoto, 'A Gradual Approach to Technology-Based Instruction,' provides a highly technical paper, but with a good overview on what a database can do to support computer-managed instruction systems. He also discusses the relationships of those

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

instructional tools to the curriculum. The other two papers are focused on more specific functions. Y. Kawamura reports on programs which help to determine the relative difficulties of reading materials in 'Analyzing Japanese Textbooks Using the Vocabulary and Kanji Level Checker,' and Y. Tohsaku and H. Yamamoto introduce the testing program on the internet in 'Internet-Based Self-Assessment for Language Skills.' This second chapter also provides a good combination of theoretical and practical information. The information on active testing sites on the Internet is especially useful for all involved in Japanese education.

The topic of learner autonomy in chapter 3 could be the most interesting because computer technology application seems to be very promising in this field. J. Cummins's 'Learning through Target Language Text' reports an interesting approach to using the target-language text as input for learning. Y. Suzuki, H.C. Quackenbush, and Y. Shimizu present research results on reading systems that are accompanied by audio support. The last paper focuses on the topic of heritage language learning, 'Teaching Heritage Language: Individualized Learning'. Here M.O. Douglas discusses various issues in teaching heritage learners and preparing curricula including computer technology. Although these three papers address very important issues, they raise many more questions than they answer. Perhaps this is because 'learner autonomy' is an enormous but still vague concept; it is difficult for readers to find a clear focal point here. Even so, this is an area in which we could expect major contributions from research, and a corresponding development of computer technology in the future, and those papers show us directions.

The last chapter contains one paper, 'Copyright in Japan and Distribution of the CASTEL/J Database' by A. Oikawa. Although his discussion is on the database developed from the project, Computer Assisted System for Teaching and Learning / Japanese (CASTEL/J), this paper presents the crucial problems we have to face. We are now aware of the Internet copyright issue. We also know that collaboration is the next step we might take. The network society has made a wider range of collaboration possible, though not without obstacles. This paper is very thought-provoking.

In general, this book provides those who are interested or already engaged in application of computer technology in Japanese language education a good deal of information both theoretical and practical. As the computer-capable generation grows, so does the use of the computer in education. As Nakajima says in the introduction, we have found a powerful help for teaching and learning Japanese, which is one of the world's most difficult languages. Having a wide range of information on computer application in Japanese language education in one book is of great use and benefit. (HIROKO K. SHERRY)

Lynne Bowker. *Computer-Aided Translation Technology: A Practical Introduction*

University of Ottawa Press. xx, 185. $45.00, $27.50

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

As Lynne Bowker says in the introduction, 'This book is aimed primarily at translation students and trainers, but it will also be of interest to professional translators who would like to know more about CAT [computer-assisted translation] technology.' The six chapters deal with 'Why do translators need to learn about technology?,' 'Capturing data in electronic form,' 'Corpora and corpus-analysis tools,' 'Terminology-management tools,' 'Translation-memory systems,' and 'Other new technologies and emerging trends.' These are followed by a useful glossary, an appendix on commercially available CAT tools, a good bibliography, and an index.

This then is a technical course manual or technological handbook for translators with money. It assumes access to specialized databases and corpora and the money to afford specialized software. It gives detailed technical explanations on how to create, manage, and use electronic textual data, textual databases, corpora, concordances, and memory systems. Most of this information has already been published elsewhere, particularly in various works on computing in the humanities written over the past few decades, although it may be considered useful to gather it together from the perspective of translation. An important distinction, made in the introduction, is that between machine translation (MT) and computer-assisted translation (CAT). Bowker rightly says that the former, machine-driven, has a valid but highly circumscribed role to play, whereas the more important, and the focus of the book, is human-driven, computer-assisted translation.

It is not a book intended for the general literate reader who has to translate in the course of his or her day-to-day reading, writing, studies, teaching, or research. This orientation is made clear in the section of the introduction on 'Contents and Coverage.' On the one hand, emphasis is given to specialized tools used mainly in other fields, such as lexicography and corpus linguistics, tools for optical character recognition (OCR), voice-recognition technology, and corpus-analysis. On the other hand, and somewhat illogically, the key area of the World Wide Web is excluded because it is 'used by people in many professions' or 'to research hobbies' – which would be like excluding dictionaries because they are used in Scrabble, or voice-recognition technology because it is used on dating networks. This is an unfortunate omission, since the book is published in Canada and the only book mentioned by Bowker that deals with translation and the WWW is one published in Europe. The Canadian translator needs information on Web search strategies and resources for translation, such as bilingual Canadian Government sites (from http://www.gc.ca/ one can go to the hundreds of particular department and agency sites that deal with the various themes of everyday experience) allowing the user to switch from

one official language to the other, or translation sites like TransSearch (http://www.tsrali.com/), which offers a bilingual concordancer based on a database of translations from the Canadian Hansard and decisions of the Supreme Court of Canada and other Canadian courts of justice. The one concession to the WWW (it gives URLs of product Web sites and online reviews) is the appendix on commercially available CAT tools, which is doomed to rapid obsolescence (products and prices change almost daily) and should have been put on the Web, not on paper. (RUSSON WOOLDRIDGE)

Paul Robert Magocsi and Ivan Pop, editors.
Encyclopedia of Rusyn History and Culture
University of Toronto Press. xii, 520. $95.00

Most Westerners have never heard about Carpathian Rus', also known as Transcarpathian Ukraine or Subcarpathian Ruthenia, a region slightly smaller than Holland, historically inhabited by Carpatho-Rusyns and divided among Poland, Ukraine, Romania, and Slovakia. Even worse, people coming from this region are at times not sure about their own identity. Most certainly, they are neither Romanians nor Hungarians, but are they some sort of Poles, Slovaks, or Ukrainians, as many of their neighbours try to convince them? Have they always been there, in the central part of the Carpathian mountain ranges? Is their vernacular a language or just a dialect? Are they a separate nationality? Can they exist as such without their own state? Now most live in Ukraine, but before 1945 they had never belonged to any East Slavic or Ukrainian state. Is this what makes the Rusyns different?

All these and many other questions are answered by the book under review, a magisterial work written by seventeen authors from various countries and edited by two experts on the subject. The first of them, Paul Robert Magocsi, has been holding the chair of Ukrainian Studies at the University of Toronto since 1980. He is a prolific author and an expert on Ukrainian history. Carpathian Rus' is an object of his fascination and almost lifelong study. There is no other person who would know more about this region than Magocsi. The second expert, Ivan Pop, a diplomatic historian of the twentieth century and a native of the Subcarpathian region, spent most of his scholarly career at Moscow's Institute of Slavic and Balkan Studies of the Soviet Academy of Sciences. In 1992, he returned to his native land to pursue its history according to a Rusyn conception. Criticized by Ukrainian nationalists, he moved to the Czech Republic, where he continues his work. Magocsi and Pop wrote most of the entries together with a third author, Bogdan Horbal, a young Lemko historian educated in Poland and New

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

York.

The *Encyclopedia of Rusyn History and Culture*, the first major reference book in its field and a great scholarly achievement, has 1070 entries and 1400 cross references, covering a broad variety of topics. Most of these entries are not available anywhere else so that the book fills a gaping lacuna. Many entries include short bibliographies that are helpful for further study. The text is clearly written and presents a new interpretation of the history of Carpathian Rus'. It moves the Rusyns from the margins of history, where they have been put by most historical works on Hungary, Poland, Ukraine, or Slovakia, to the centre of historical events in the region. It shows Rusyns' achievements, vitality, and creativity but also their suffering and the unfair treatment they have frequently received from neighbouring peoples.

The *Encyclopedia* has already provoked a fierce discussion among specialists in Ukrainian and Central European history. The Eighth Annual World Convention of the Association for the Study of Nationalities, held in New York in April 2003, devoted an entire session to the book. Reviews have appeared in several journals. Some reviewers question the basic terms and definitions used by the authors and claim that they do not explain quite clearly who is a Rusyn. Is, for example, a 'Lemko partisan and political activist in Poland of Ukrainian national orientation' still a Rusyn? Why are the Hutsuls living on the southern slopes of the Carpathian Mountains categorized as Rusyns while their brethren from the northern slopes, over two hundred thousand of them, are not? How many people living in Carpathian Rus? are Rusyns and how many are Ukrainians or Slovaks? An encyclopedia with a list of entries that would satisfy all readers probably does not exist, but an entry on the Ukrainian Insurgent Army (UPA) should definitely have been included in this book. Also Volodymyr Shukhevych, Stanisław Vincenz, Antoni Ossendowski, and Ludomir Sawicki, important scholars and writers linked to the region, should not be missing. Some bibliographies are too short or do not exist at all, though sometimes, as in the case of the famous ethnographer Oskar Kolberg, they would be easy to prepare. The book has no illustrations, no index, no chronological table, and no general bibliography. All these positive and negative aspects are good reasons to publish a new and bigger edition of the *Encyclopedia of Rusyn History and Culture.* (PIOTR WROBEL)

Paul Robert Magocsi. *Thee Roots of Ukrainian Nationalism: Galicia as Ukraine's Piedmont*
University of Toronto Press. xviii, 214. $50.00

Paul Magocsi has devoted the better part of his career to Ukrainian studies – its language, bibliography, and history. This collection of his essays on the part of Ukraine known as Galicia goes to the centre of his interests. Most

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

have appeared before, but two new pieces give coherence to the collection: a survey of Galicia's history and an analytical framework for examining the rise of the Ukrainian national movement.

Ukrainian nationalism developed differently from most others in eastern Europe. Unlike Poland and Hungary, Ukraine never had a 'noble nation' to give its people definition and, unlike the Bulgarians and Serbs, Ukrainians had no independent state to promote a specific national sentiment. Furthermore, an educated class using literary Ukrainian was slow to form, politically divided, and little inclined to independence. Cossack traditions (now hyped as a national legacy) had been captured by imperialist Russia and in any case pertained only to the south and east, while the Galicians to the west were notoriously loyal to the Habsburg monarchy. The prospects for political independence were therefore distinctly unpromising. The tacit question at the volume's core is how Ukrainian nationalism emerged from such unpropitious circumstances.

Galicia played a decisive part in this. A frontier land within a frontier land (which is what *ukraina* means), Galicia's borders have fluctuated ever since the Middle Ages, but it is culturally distinct. Predominately Greek Catholic (Uniate) rather than Eastern Orthodox like the rest of Ukraine, it fell to Austrian rather than Russian rule in the later eighteenth century. It housed the motor of the Ukrainian national movement that emerged in the later nineteenth century and provided a driving force for independence in the 1990s. Had it not been for the Galicians, Ukrainians might conceivably have been assimilated into the Russian *ethnie*. Even so, but for the unexpected collapse of Austria-Hungary in 1918, it might never have gained much autonomy, and only the Soviet collapse of 1991 precipitated independence.

In searching for an explanation, Magocsi rejects nostalgia, hindsight, and 'winners' history' (though the inappropriate term 'national revival' creeps in at one point). Rather he applies his microscope to particular circumstances and developments: Galicia under Austrian and Soviet rule, the language factor in east Galician nationalism, divergent 'Old Ruthenian' and Russophile tendencies. There is also a useful list of Ukrainian materials in Vienna and an account of the industrious but retiring Ivan Levyts'kyi, founding father of Ukrainian bibliography. But perhaps the most interesting component is a study of the Kachkovs'kyi Society. This organization devoted to encouraging self-improvement among the Galician peasantry distributed primers in Ukrainian to encourage literacy, established reading rooms, and organized agricultural shows, concerts, popular theatricals, and torchlight parades to engage adherents. Nationalists tried to disrupt its meetings and eventually captured most of its followers. Such studies of popular organizations are indispensable to an understanding of how national consciousness was formed. There are too few of them.

Magocsi is understandably quick to pass over less pleasant aspects of

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Galician history – the methods of the Counter-Reformation that purged churchyards of the Orthodox dead and the activities of those nationalists who flirted with the Nazis or joined the SS. One might also question his characterization of Ukraine's road to independence as 'a remarkable success story.' The privations suffered by Galicians since independence hardly reflect triumph. Yet, though Magocsi writes with evident affection for his ancestral country, his commitment does not usually warp his judgment or diminish his tolerance of other points of view.

The collection contains matter of real value, especially relating to social realities in the later nineteenth century when many educated Galicians hovered between cultural commitments and sometimes changed their minds about what being Ukrainian meant for them. Other nationalities went through the same formative uncertainties, but the usual tendency is to gloss over them. It is to Magocsi's credit that he allows his readers to see how alternative tendencies espoused by the intelligentsia might have prevailed and how chance developments in the wider world might have led to a different outcome. Though nationalism flourishes as an area of research, one sees too few studies of this kind. (PHILIP LONGWORTH)

Michael Behiels and Marcel Martel, editors. *Nations, Ideas, Identities. Essays in Honour of Ramsay Cook*
Oxford University Press 2000. xix, 231. $32.95, $22.95

This festschrift pays homage to Ramsay Cook, whose long career, at the University of Toronto, York University, and recently with the *Dictionary of Canadian Biography* has spanned four decades and has touched the lives of numerous Canadian students. As a personal note, I remember his assistance to me when I was a, then, young doctoral student working at the, then, Dominion Archives. His support and advice continued long after, and I am sure hundreds could talk of analogous experiences.

In the introduction, Michael Behiels sets Cook's career against the nationalism and internationalism of the postwar years. 'In Cook's view, the most powerful ideological force shaping and reshaping Canada has been – and remains – nationalism.' Behiels also cites Cook's 1966 comment that there has sometimes been too much nationalism for Canada's own good. Certainly the forces of nationalism, French, English and Aboriginal, have shaped much of Cook's writing.

The organization of the volume does not adhere completely to this nationalist theme. There are subsections on nationalism and the Canadian question and a related one on culture. Other subsections are distinct, including those on ideas, women, and Native people. These areas do intrude on the theme of national identity, but, more important, their presence recognizes the wide-ranging interests of his many graduate

students. Some of Canada's more important historians in these areas honed their skills under Ramsay Cook's encouraging but critical supervision.

As with most collections there are differences in the quality of individual contributions. Some pieces are insightful and rest upon significant new work. Others have a slightly unfinished or derivative feel. Overall, though, it is an interesting group of papers. For example, Ruth Compton Brouwer's work on the clash of two women over the development of medical education in Korea resists clichés or simplistic theories. Instead she studies two sincere and basically good people, one Canadian and one Korean, who nonetheless disagree over priorities. As she concludes, 'I have also, I hope, demonstrated that there can be fruitful ways of exploring relationships between missionaries and non-Westerners that go beyond familiar themes of racism and resistance.'

Norman Knowles assesses the impact of religion in the Crowsnest region in the early twentieth century. He emphasizes the importance of religion to the local community, not as part of some subtext of social control or worker resistance but on its own terms. Religion, he says, was important as religion. This article raises as many questions as it answers. In what way, for example, did religion serve the needs of the congregation? What specific messages made it relevant? Nonetheless, the approach is a fresh one and allows us to view community ties differently.

Finally, I would mention Anne Davis's study of the politics of museums. Davis looks at the politics of displays in some particularly controversial cases. Most of her time is spent on the 'Spirit Sings' issue in Calgary during the 1988 winter Olympics and on the 'Out of Africa' exhibit at the Royal Ontario Museum. Both instances reveal what happened as museology moved beyond mere display to interpretation. As historians know only too well, there is no longer a dominant ideology upon which to rest an interpretation. Thus all interpretations become a battleground. Unfortunately, museologists do not have the same well-buttressed traditions of academic freedom. Perhaps they should.

There are other articles that deserve mention. The articles by Michael Behiels and James Pitsula reflect the overall strength of the section on Native people. Peter Rider's piece on sealing ties a controversial topic to regional sense of identity.

There is also one surprising omission from the collection. Nobody undertakes to assess Ramsay Cook's work itself. Patrick Dutil does have a useful piece on Cook's role politically during the 1960s. As well, the introduction does touch on the intellectual context in which Cook wrote. Something more is needed, though. Cook is one of the most prominent intellectuals of his generation. His writings reflect a particular take on the country and on the intellectual process. His writings have influenced countless historians. A serious assessment of his writings is due.

That comment aside, this is a volume of strong papers. Ramsay Cook

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

deserves the honour, and many of the writings should lead to further analysis and investigation. Michael Behiels and Marcel Martel are to be congratulated. (DOUG OWRAM)

Theodore Binnema, Gerhard J. Ens, and R. C. MacLeod, editors.
From Rupert's Land to Canada
University of Alberta Press. xxxiii, 292. $34.95

From Rupert's Land to Canada is a festschrift celebrating the work of John Elgin Foster (1938–1996), student, professor, and scholar at the University of Alberta. In effect, it is a document put together by colleagues, students, and friends in lieu of Foster's own studies left uncompleted at his death: 'a guide to Metis Historical Studies, A History of the Wintering Village at Buffalo Lake, and a general history of the Metis in North America.' A festschrift cannot take the place of the work Foster was about, of course, but it is, none the less, useful and informative regarding his scholarly area.

In their introduction, the editors position *From Rupert's Land to Canada* as 'a source for undergraduate courses on the Canadian West,' referring specifically to their sketch of Foster, to his essay (included) on ethnogenesis of the Metis, and to the bibliography of his writings. Despite extensive reservations regarding the editing and proofreading of the book generally, particularly with regard to the wretched writing in several of the essays (an undergraduate 'source'?), one can see its usefulness as an introduction to various issues in the field. Particularly heartening is the book's recognition of teaching as a significant scholarly activity, given its proper roots in such research as Foster pursued. The effectiveness of teaching as publication is demonstrated throughout the book as Foster's colleagues and students testify to the abiding influence upon them of his personal guidance and engagement as a teacher.

After some thirty pages of introductory material (a foreword by Lewis G. Thomas, a biographical sketch of Foster as student and scholar, a bibliography of his writings, acknowledgments, a list of contributors, and a map), the main text of *From Rupert's Land to Canada* is divided into three sections: (1) 'Native History and the Fur Trade in Western Canada' (eight essays); (2) 'Metis History' (four essays, including one of Foster's own); (3) 'The Imagined West' (four essays). The editors have appended some hitherto unpublished papers by Louis Riel, together with commentary and translations (Foster acted as co-ordinator for the 1985 publication of his *Collected Writings*), but they admit that the documents will not 'revolutionize the study of Louis Riel.'

The book would be greatly strengthened by the addition of a simple general narrative of the history of the West in the period covered. Some larger context than that offered by individual essays would go far to make

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

the latter intelligible to an undergraduate. Michael Payne's essay on 'Fur Trade Historiography' offers an excellent introduction to the shifting ground of historical writing in the area, but one needs more. Even a simple chronicle of dates and events would be useful. Further, one could wish that the genuinely interesting and useful discussions of marriage practices within the fur trade by Jennifer S.H. Brown and Heather Rollason Driscoll could have brought to bear some consciousness of the European history of marriage. The phrase 'tender ties,' used in reference to the connection of fur trader and his 'country wife,' is insufficiently informed by a larger sense of history. De Rougemont's argument, for example, that love is peculiar to Islamic and Christian cultures could be significant when considering the implications of a European's 'turning off' a Native 'country wife' for a white European Christian. What were the cultural assumptions of the partners? What confirms or sanctifies human connections of this kind as properly extending beyond sex, children, and material support? Like the book as a whole, these essays and several others are good, but in need of firmer direction and greater clarity. This said, *From Rupert's Land to Canada* remains a worthy memorial of a worthy scholar and teacher. (KENNETH M. MCKAY)

J.L. Granatstein. *Canada's Army: Waging War and Keeping the Peace*
University of Toronto Press. xvi, 520. $50.00

According to Histor!ca, the business-financed, Toronto-based lobby that favours more Canadian history in the schools, we need to learn more about our military past. Far from a pacifist past, Histor!ca declares in *Telling the Story of Canada's Military History*, 'Canada's history is one of never adequately preparing for war, but performing brilliantly when war broke out.' This is partly true. Canada's peacetime defence arrangements have routinely verged on the ridiculous, yet we have emerged from each of the great wars of the previous century with considerable military credit and on the winning side.

What is absent both from Histor!ca and our national historical memory is any understanding of how this seeming miracle was achieved. If consistent neglect of defence pays off in marvellous wartime performance, why worry? Our 'Militia Myth' – Canadians are such natural warriors that they don't have to train and prepare themselves' – is sufficient rebuttal to peacetime advocates of military preparedness. The marvel that most European armed forces are currently little better than Canada's should be a source of delight to Canadian pacifists and militarists alike.

However, any age of miracles has its sceptics. Unlike Histor!ca's well-heeled adults, smarter kids in history classes may wonder how Canadians were transformed from amateur night performers into the skilled professionals who captured Vimy Ridge in 1917 and who drove deeper

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

than other troops who landed on D-Day, 1944. Historian and defence advocate Jack Granatstein has provided his answer. More than a solid history of Canada's land forces, *Canada's Army* is a well-aimed, six-hundred-page barrage on the Militia Myth.

Granatstein's book is not, of course, an attack on the Canadian militia. Arguably, the militia has been the biggest single victim of the Canadian militia myth. Why study war when crowds preferred a ceremonial review or a slam-bang sham battle? If equipment was short – and in peacetime it always was – strip the militia of its scout cars for Suez peacekeeping in 1956 and of its Cougars for Bosnia in 1993. American law protects the jobs of National Guard members summoned to serve; what government would dare demand as much from Canadian employers?

As early as 1875, Lieutenant-Colonel Henry Fletcher told Canadians that defence policy depended on the answers to three questions: how many, how good, and how expensive? Faced with an American threat too big even for the British to face, the government had settled on having forty thousand ill-trained, ill-equipped militia at a million dollars a year. Such a force could keep our southern border secure without remotely worrying Americans. Canadians could live free from military service, collect a peace dividend big enough to build the CPR, and run to the rescue of their former colonial masters, Britain and France, without worrying much about home defence.

What they did not bring to Europe's wars, Granatstein reminds us, was training, experience, doctrine, or equipment. Thereby hangs an embarrassing, costly, and painful tale. Lacking more than an occasional miracle, even the bravest of Canadian volunteers paid in blood because of politically attuned but ill-trained officers as well as because of Canada's unique Ross Rifle or the highly flammable US-made Sherman tank in 1944.

If Jack Granatstein's book on Canada's army has a mission, it is to tell the smarter kids in Histor!ca's classroom that neither instincts nor miracles can make an army successful in war. The second in a series of three substantial one-volume histories of Canada's still-distinct armed services, Granatstein's follows Marc Milner's volume on the Royal Canadian Navy, published in 1999, and precedes Allan English's forthcoming account of the Royal Canadian Air Force. Deliberately or not, the published volumes represent a passionate reminder that young Canadians have paid with their lives or freedom for the perfectly predictable disasters inflicted on them at Second Ypres or Mont Sorrel in the First World War and at Hong Kong or Dieppe and in the freezing waters of the Atlantic between 1939 and 1945. At the height of the desperate struggle to get convoys to England, Canadian ships and crews were kicked out of the fighting and sent to learn their business.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

More autonomous and prickly in its nationalist identity, Canada's army was usually left to figure out its own solutions. The miracle was that they often came up with good answers and excellent leaders. General Arthur Currie, a hero of this book, and Major-General Bert Hoffmeister, the best Canadian commander of the Second World War, were both militia officers. Hoffmeister took his inadequacies so seriously that he had an early nervous breakdown. Unusual good sense allowed him back into uniform, to shape and lead 'Hoffy's Maroon Machine,' the Fifth Canadian Armoured Division, in Italy and the Netherlands. Currie's slower maturation from Victoria real estate agent to commander of the Canadian Corps allowed him to inherit and improve on the tactical common sense of his British predecessor, Sir Julian Byng. By using the initiative and experience of junior leaders and backing them with all the artillery ammunition he could lay his hands on, Currie devised the ponderous but effective 'Canadian way of war' inherited by his less talented successors in Italy and northwest Europe.

Granatstein's important contribution in *Canada's Army* and in earlier books, is to remind us that the learning curve had a high cost in lives. However veiled in propaganda and self-admiration, our early battles were often defeats aggravated by inexperience and incompetence. German chlorine gas at Ypres in April 1915, provided an admirable alibi for a largely self-inflicted disaster. The casualties in Normandy in 1944 that made the Third and Second Canadian Infantry Divisions the most blood-stained formations in General Montgomery's army were the price of military amateurism, inconceivable only months later. By-products of heavy losses were our two conscription crises.

Today, Granatstein argues, Canada's land forces have been so consistently robbed of modern equipment and training time that the government's claim of 'combat-capable forces' is an internationally embarrassing lie. Jack Granatstein hopes his readers will learn from history. (DESMOND MORTON)

Susan M. Turner. *Something to Cry About:*
An Argument against Corporal Punishment of Children in Canada
Wilfrid Laurier University Press. xix, 317. $29.95

Do you spank your children? If so, then Susan Turner has a question for you. Spanking is a form of corporal punishment, defined as the infliction of physical pain for the purpose of correcting behaviour. As such, it satisfies the legal definition of an assault. Assaulting another person is generally wrong and, with one significant exception, unlawful. That exception is embodied in section 43 of the Criminal Code, which authorizes parents or teachers to administer corporal punishment on children under their authority as long as 'it does not exceed what is reasonable under the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

circumstances.' Similar legal provisions once allowed the use of corporal punishment by husbands against wives, masters against servants and apprentices, guards against prisoners, and captains against crew members. Only the exception for children survives. The question Turner wants you to ponder is: How can that exception be justified? Why should we think we have the right to hit our children?

Defenders of the corporal punishment of children generally rest their case on two lines of argument. Affirmatively, they claim that parents and teachers need recourse to this method of correction in order to keep children in line. Against this claim, Turner concedes that hitting a child may be an effective temporary means of interrupting disruptive behaviour. However, she argues that it is not only unnecessary but actually ineffective as a long-term strategy for improving behaviour. Negatively, the defenders claim that at least the milder forms of physical punishment, such as spanking, do no harm to children. In response, Turner rests her case on empirical evidence that children subjected to corporal punishment may as a consequence suffer both physical and psychological trauma, including long-term effects such as an increased tendency towards aggression. The use of such punishment by parents is also a risk factor for more severe forms of child physical abuse.

If some form of conduct is both unnecessary and harmful, that is a pretty good moral case against it. But Turner is also interested in the legal status of the corporal punishment of children. To this point court challenges to section 43 have been as unsuccessful as attempts to lobby the government to repeal it. Worse, in applying the section courts have interpreted the boundaries of reasonableness to include punching and kicking children, as well as causing bruising or bleeding by hitting them with various objects (sticks, belts, etc). Turner devotes a chapter to arguing that a constitutional challenge to section 43 should now succeed, on the ground that it constitutes an unjustifiable infringement of children's right to security of the person.

Should the section be struck down, parents might justifiably worry that they would be liable to a criminal charge for spanking their children. Turner does little to reassure them on this question, beyond making the point that the law does not in general take notice of trivial offences. It is likely, therefore, that only blatant instances would attract legal attention, such as spankings in public, which add an element of humiliation to the physical pain, or those which result in perceptible injuries. Instead, she looks to the educative effects of legal reform – whether accomplished through the legislature or the courts – which she hopes will one day make spanking socially unacceptable.

Many readers will find Turner's moral and legal arguments compelling, as I did. However, it must also be said that this is an unnecessarily difficult book to read. For one thing, as a philosopher Turner has been unable to

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

resist including entire chapters on values and ethical theories (chiefly utilitarianism) which add little to the development of her case. If hitting children is indeed both harmful and unnecessary, then you don't have to be a utilitarian to condemn it. Furthermore, building the case against corporal punishment on the basis of utilitarianism weakens it, for it allows an escape route to those (and they are many) who reject the theory. Additionally, the crucial parts of her case are scattered through different chapters rather than collected together in one logically developed argument. Because of these impediments, the book may attract a less extensive readership than its subject and argument deserve. And that would be a shame, for the children's sake. (WAYNE SUMNER)

Douglas Mann. *Structural Idealism: A Theory of Social and Historical Explanation*
Wilfrid Laurier University Press. ix, 309. $42.95

Douglas Mann's *Structural Idealism* begins with a passage from Richard III: 'Go, gentlemen, every man unto his charge ... March on, join bravely ... If not to heaven, then hand in hand to hell.' Presumably such an opening gambit is meant to inform readers about the ambitious project to follow (and perhaps claim a certain modesty about the outcome). And indeed, this is no false claim, as Mann invites onto the intellectual battlefield some of the most commanding sociological and philosophical minds of the past two hundred years, including Hegel, Marx, Nietzsche, Weber, Freud, Collingwood, Foucault, and Derrida. As Mann puts it, 'My goal here is to produce a bird's-eye view of the archaeology of a social act within what I term a "structural idealist" model.' By structural idealism, Mann means two things. First it is a descriptive method and unified theory of sociological explanation that overcomes the limits of 'historical idealism' and 'social-structuralism.' Structural idealism is to provide a 'bridging concept' between 'individual conscious human intentions' on the one hand and 'deep structures' on the other hand. Second, Mann uses the term 'structural idealism' to refer to the actual functioning of the 'social mind.' Structural ideals 'rely on semi-conscious and unconscious ports of entry to find their way into our lives.' They involve an 'idea that suggests the normal or proper ... ordering of a historical agent's social field.' Mann gives the 'idea of private property' as an example. This idea is both the basis of the system of capitalism that orders everyday interaction and a general moral ideal such that a child's claim to control use of her toys and a millionaire's possession of stock certificates manifest the same structural ideal.

Unfortunately, Mann's basic premise – that the presumed deadlock between agency and structure in social theory is rooted in the dichotomy between idealism and materialism – is false. He sets out the premise on his first page: 'This division between idealists and materialists gets played out

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

within sociology as the debate between agency – the focus on individual decision making, with the associated assumption of a relatively free, rational subject – and structure – the focus on the social, economic, and in general the material forces that shape, guide, or determine human behaviour.' Clearly, this necessary alignment of idealism with agency and materialism with determinism does not stand up to scrutiny. As Mann's own discussion of Hegel shows, history is for Hegel the teleological, predetermined unfolding of human ideas. Similarly, Mann's quick dismissal of structuralists like Saussure, Barthes, Levi-Strauss, and even Durkheim means that their cultural-linguistic emphasis on the ideal *as* structure is largely overlooked. Indeed, while the Durkheimian school of sociology is described by the author as 'largely discredited,' this reader cannot help but be reminded of Durkheim's dynamic notion of 'collective representations' when considering Mann's 'structural ideals.' Durkheim defines collective representations as 'the way the group thinks of itself (agency) in relation to the objects which effect it (structure).' Equally, materialism cannot straightforwardly equate with determinism if Marx's central notions of praxis and class consciousness are taken seriously.

In the second half of the book, Mann considers the intellectual shift from modern to postmodern thought as a movement from the study of deep meaning to superficial meaning. He goes on to discuss consumer culture as indicative of the type of 'structural ideals' animating postmodern life, a culture in which the 'liquid body' is the site of identity construction. In this half of the book, Mann also discusses the 'Canadian School of Cultural Critique' (Innis, McLuhan, Grant, etc) and their common interest in nature/culture/technology as structural ideals.

In the end, Mann does not convince this reader that his theory of 'structural ideals' is anything new under the sociological or philosophical sun. His work does not provide a bridge between material and idealism, but it *does* offer a valuable model of a middle-range theory of historical action. More generally, Mann provides an interesting and stimulating tour through various literatures, thinkers, and cultural issues, and raises the important question of the purpose and method of cultural studies. (PATRICIA CORMACK)

Margaret R. Conrad and James K. Hiller. *Atlantic Canada: A Region in the Making*
Oxford University Press 2001. viii, 236. $25.95

This work is the product of two well-regarded specialists in the history of Atlantic Canada. Each has published a great deal, Margaret Conrad on the Maritimes, especially Nova Scotia, and James Hiller on Newfoundland and Labrador.

The book synthesizes the history of the region from the beginnings, such

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

as we can know them, until 1989. Few authors have previously made the attempt at synthesis, probably because of the artificiality of the concept 'Atlantic Canada.' The region consists of the three Maritime provinces, which are in close geographic proximity, and which, in part because of this, have had intimate links historically, *plus* Newfoundland, which is separated from the Maritimes by a large expanse of water, has had an exceptionally distinctive history, and entered Confederation only in 1949. Typically, the history of the region is written province-by-province, or, occasionally, the three Maritimes are treated as a collectivity.

Conrad and Hiller have woven a coherent narrative, no easy task for such a diverse and complex region. Although not the product of original research, the book is nonetheless based on a sure command of the available scholarly material, which is thereby, in effect, made accessible. It is well-balanced both in terms of the Maritimes-Newfoundland dichotomy and in other respects. Notably, the authors never neglect the First Nations, who tend to disappear from histories once they cease to threaten the survival of settler populations. Conrad and Hiller are also sensitive to the differences in the situations of, for example, the Mi'kmaq and the Innu. Thus comprehensiveness of treatment is combined with awareness of specificity.

There are occasional lapses in accuracy. New Brunswick was not the only officially bilingual province when Premier Louis Robichaud made it so in 1969 – Quebec was officially bilingual from Confederation until 1974. Of all parts of the Atlantic region, Conrad and Hiller seem least familiar with Prince Edward Island. They repeat a common error, referring to the leasehold system of landholding in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries as one of *absentee* ownership; in fact, at any time there were resident landlords, some with sizeable estates, and the key distinguishing feature was the nature of the land tenure, not the location of the owners. The authors have the satiric-patriotic society known as the Brothers and Sisters of Cornelius Howatt (named for a prominent Island opponent of entry into Confederation in 1873) involved in a 'tractor demonstration' by the National Farmers' Union in the summer of 1971, but the group was not formed until the end of 1972, on the eve of centennial celebrations. Obvious parallels are missed; the folk art of A.L. Morrison on Island historical themes is not mentioned when the work of Nova Scotian Maude Lewis is. In this respect, the authors' sureness of touch deserts them.

Such reservations aside, Conrad and Hiller have done an admirable job of integrating the material with which they are familiar, and they have not dodged difficult questions or provided easy answers. The judgments tend to be judicious and moderate to the point of understatement: regarding the Churchill Falls débâcle, which has enriched Quebec at the expense of a considerably poorer province, the authors declare that 'For Newfoundlanders, the effective loss of one of the province's greatest assets prompted justifiable questions and unease about their place in Confederation.' Yes.

One has the impression that Conrad and Hiller could write a much larger volume, and effortlessly provide more depth on many topics; it would be welcome.

The book is part of a six-volume series, *The Illustrated History of Canada*, and it contains well over 150 illustrations. Many are beautiful colour reproductions of paintings, and some choices, such as those by Alex Colville and David Blackwood, are inspired. The range in other illustrative material is wide, including pungent political cartoons and photographs of distinctive scenes, such as a small boy in Labrador standing between two prize cod which dwarf him.

This is an excellent book, and if the rest of the series matches its standard, Oxford University Press can be proud. (IAN ROSS ROBERTSON)

Robert Adamoski, Dorothy E. Chunn, and Robert Menzies, editors.
Contesting Canadian Citizenship: Historical Readings
Broadview Press. 429. $32.95

'Citizenship studies' is a new banner for scholarship that is (or wants to be) interdisciplinary, and that tries to integrate theoretical developments into empirical research. One of the risks haunting attempts to construct fields of inquiry that go against the grain of disciplinary boundaries and challenge the theory vs. research, general vs. particular split is over-inclusiveness. In the 1980s and 1990s, many scholars gave their work a veneer of sophistication by simply inserting a few references to 'masculinity,' 'tropes,' and 'social imaginary' in work that was conceived and carried out with traditional tools. Today, historical and contemporary research arising out of old social-control concerns is sometimes retro-fitted with references to 'citizenship.' And the anthology under review has its share of such articles.

The fact that a concept is fashionable, however, does not mean that it lacks analytical bite. The editors promise a great deal: 'The historical inquiries comprising this book, therefore, seek to contextualize current citizenship debates by charting the genealogy of the citizen, and of relations of citizenship in which he/she have been immersed, back to these volatile times – back to the formative years of the Canadian state.' While this goal would have been better served if at least one of the noted theorists of citizenship that Canada has given the world (Charles Taylor, James Tully, Will Kymlicka, Engin Isin) had been asked to provide an epilogue, the best contributions in the book do deliver on the promise made in the editors' introduction. And one political theorist, Janine Brodie, contributes a very

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

interesting essay outlining the varieties of Canadian citizenship that have been set out, since Confederation, in successive speeches from the throne – showing, among other things, that historical research does not always need to rely on that holy grail of social historians, the archives. The denunciation of capitalism uttered from the throne during the Depression is very revealing about our neo-liberal present, in which capitalism has been naturalized to an extent unprecedented in Canadian history.

From the point of view of theory, the most interesting essays are those that turn aside from the coercive forms of exclusion already documented at length in existing historical work and pay attention instead to documenting more sophisticated practices of governance. Unlike overt racism, many of the liberal practices by which groups are included and yet marginalized are specifically Canadian. Shirley Tillotson's article on the development of paid workers' holidays and state-funded recreation, Lorna McLean's article on Frontier College, Jennifer Stephen's study of the category of the unemployed in Ontario, and Sean Purdy's study of housing reform and nation formation are examples of a historiography that is left and feminist but goes beyond documenting outrageous practices.

In turning our attention to the features of Canadian state formation that exclude and marginalize but in a liberal rather than in a coercive manner, paying close attention to the sophisticated legal machinery developed for the governance of aboriginal peoples will be very fruitful for everyone, no matter what our empirical focus. Claude Denis's 'Indigenous Citizenship and History in Canada: Between Denial and Imposition' has a fascinating analysis of the ways in which contemporary Canadian courts are recognizing certain aboriginal claims and rights – but in a way that assumes that Native rights only apply to practices deemed to be intrinsic to Native 'culture,' with culture treated, as in 1950s anthropology, as unchanging, ahistorical 'tradition.' He shows that certain fishing rights have been granted by courts because they have been thought to exist since 'time immemorial,' whereas attempts to generate jobs through casinos have been deemed illegal because gambling is not 'traditional.'

Denis's article reminds us that non-aboriginal Canadians ignore aboriginal scholarship at our peril. The racism that excluded the Chinese and the prejudice that sterilized the feeble-minded were not specifically Canadian. But the Indian Act, and its numerous legal and political offspring, are distinctly Canadian. That the other contributions in the anthology barely mention the specifically Canadian machinery for governing Natives and aboriginality in their contributions is perhaps a sign of how far we still need to go in heeding our own theoretical advice. (MARIANA VALVERDE)

Edgar-André Montigny and Lori Chambers, editors.
Ontario since Confederation: A Reader
University of Toronto Press 2000. xi, 457. $70.00, $29.95

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

In the recent battles between national and social historians over what constitutes real Canadian history, the history of the provinces (and other regions of Canada) has been largely ignored. For those determined to restore the primacy of the nation state the history of the provinces is (quite literally) provincial, while those who champion workers, women, and people of colour have not found the province a very useful framework for addressing matters of class, gender, and race. All this, however, may be changing. Given the size, breadth, and general quality of this new collection of essays, perhaps the history of Ontario is making something of a comeback.

Ontario since Confederation: A Reader contains twenty-one essays that address a wide range of issues. Focused rather loosely around state and society, the collection brings together work on Native peoples, labour, agriculture, education, class formation, gender, the family, politics, and public policy. The only conspicuous lacuna is religion and culture, a rather surprising omission given the strength of religion in Ontario life, the role of the churches in the state system, and the high quality of scholarship being done in this area. Most of the essays are written by younger scholars and are drawn from dissertations or recently published monographs. The quality of the contributions is uneven, but the overall standard is quite high, and in a few cases the essays are truly outstanding. Like a good church picnic there is lots to choose from, the dishes are fresh, and the portions generous – and there is the danger of feeling rather full afterwards.

How well the collection will work as a reader, however, is uncertain. Unfortunately, the organization of the volume does not lend itself readily to teaching the history of Ontario – for example, there is no overview of the writing of Ontario history or bibliographical guide to the existing literature. At the same time, however, the essays do offer students handy distillations of the central ideas of larger studies, always a useful resource for those who never have the time to sift through the complete monograph.

One is also left with an unsettling questions. After reading over 450 pages of text, what really defines the history of this province? What forces have shaped Ontario life; how is this region different from other regions; how does Ontario relate to the larger systems of which it is a part? Or simply, why is this a region? In a very thin and unsatisfactory preface the editors do their best to dodge these important questions, and however fascinating the essays few of the contributors even consider the broader significance of their project. (WILLIAM WESTFALL)

John Douglas Belshaw. *Colonization and Community: The Vancouver Island Coalfield*

and the Making of the British Columbia Working Class
McGill-Queen's University Press. xxx, 322. $75.00

John Belshaw's *Colonization and Community* explores the social history of coal mining on Vancouver Island for the last half of the nineteenth century. The study adds to an older literature that found in the industrial conflict and radical politics of mining communities on Vancouver Island the origins of a class-based provincial political culture. Reflecting the turn to social history in Canada in the 1970s and 1980s, Belshaw sought to revisit the subject of Vancouver Island coal mining history by exploring the social character of mining families and communities. Two elements of Belshaw's methodology stand out. First, he aims to understand typical characteristics of social behaviour such as marital status, family income, and mobility through the systematic recording and interpretation of information from manuscript census records, government-generated statistics, church records, and other sources of quantifiable data. Second, the book asks: Did Vancouver Island miners, the largest portion of whom had migrated from Britain, simply reproduce the customs and practices of the home country, or did local influences give mining society on Vancouver Island a distinctive, new-world stamp? To answer this question, Belshaw compares his findings for Nanaimo, Wellington, and Cumberland on Vancouver Island with the extensive literature on mining in the United Kingdom.

Belshaw's social analysis challenges an older tendency to see the history of mining on Vancouver Island as the product of 'cultural baggage' carried by immigrants from Britain. Throughout *Colonization and Community* the author emphasizes the influence of local conditions in the making of a distinctive class culture in communities such as Nanaimo, Wellington, and Cumberland. 'Confronted with a compromising geology and the colonial variant of monopoly capitalism,' he asserts, 'the imported standards of British colliers provided a reference point, a benchmark in industrial and social relations; pre-emigration experience, however, could not predetermine colonial circumstances.' Two illustrations of this thesis stand out. Framing questions from a long-standing British debate about the impact of industrialization on the standard of living of working people, Belshaw creatively reconstructs the wages and cost of living of Vancouver Island miners. Significantly, he finds that while miners' wages on the Island were much higher than in Britain, this advantage was offset by the higher cost of living and the lesser chance of women and children to add to the family income. This was especially the case for miners' sons who were frequently kept out of the mines in British Columbia by the preference of owners, especially the Dunsmuir family, for cheap Chinese labour. In addition, Belshaw challenges conventional thinking by suggesting that, to 1900 at

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

least, Island miners were much more conservative than earlier writing has suggested. British miners on Vancouver Island protested their failure to meet expectations 'not as a radical, unstable, unmarried industrial proletariate, not even as an inherently anti-Asian white community,' but rather as 'family men with long-term interests to protect ... Skills, custom, and security were their principal "British" watchwords, not rebellious racism, revolution, and socialism.'

Belshaw focuses on the most privileged members of coal mining society on Vancouver Island and thus leaves more to be said about the less skilled members of the workforce, many of whom were Chinese, and about women, about whom the census manuscripts for the years 1881, 1891, and 1901 will yield additional insight. New material published or made available since the mid-1990s seems underused: comparisons to my study of class and status in Vancouver, fuller reference to Helen Brown's conclusions about schooling in Nanaimo, and a more comprehensive analysis of the 1901 manuscript census for Vancouver Island mining communities come to mind. In addition, reference to British studies of the role that paternalism and deference played in leading working people in factory communities to respond conservatively to employers seems curiously absent. Quibbles aside, however, *Colonization and Community* contributes substantially to our understanding of settler society in nineteenth-century British Columbia. Statistically based profiles of whole communites in British Columbia are rare. Belshaw's conclusion that the immigration experience in British Columbia should be viewed as a recalibration (through adaptation to local circumstances) rather than as a simplification (and thus replication) of the home society is an important insight for all immigrant studies. Finally, his observations about working-class politics will be controversial, but are important, and merit further investigation. (ROBERT MC DONALD)

Janice Gross Stein. *The Cult of Efficiency*
Anansi 2001. xvi, 295. $18.95

Janice Stein has excelled as a scholar and commentator on international relations. In her insightful Massey Lectures, which are published in *The Cult of Efficiency*, she focuses on different conceptions of efficiency and their relation to the evolving roles of the state. She distinguishes between productive efficiency, understood as the maximization of production, and utilitarian efficiency, understood as the realization of internal values. She then relates the increasing acceptance of utilitarian efficiency to an emerging 'culture of choice' and an increased emphasis on individualism. She writes: 'Beneath the surface of conversation about efficiency is a deeper debate about the intrinsic value of choice. Choice has become a value and is increasingly construed as a right.' The idea of the culture of choice put forth

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

by Stein has its roots in economic utilitarian thinking dating back to Jeremy Bentham and Adam Smith, and significantly influences current debate on the issue of the effective provision of public goods.

The central focus of Stein's book is the changing role of the state, characterized primarily by a shift from the direct provision of goods to the financing and regulation of the production of goods by private actors. She writes: 'The post-industrial state is increasingly a partner and contractor, working jointly with other institutions – private as well as public – to set the terms on which others deliver public goods.' The post-industrial state, as outlined by Stein, rejects both monopolistic control by the government and complete dominance by the private market in the provision of public goods. Stein illustrates the changing role of the state in extensive discussions of changes in the health care and educational systems. She primarily focuses on what she terms 'public markets,' or what might be called 'government financed and regulated goods,' which arise out of the often complementary inefficiencies of both states and markets.

Stein isolates a number of major forces that underlie the changing economic roles of the state – particularly the creation of public markets or government-financed goods. Foremost among these forces are the economic inefficiencies and negative societal impacts of both monopolistic state control and unfettered market dominance. She further notes that government regulation can control the social shortcomings of the production of goods by private actors, while concurrently realizing a high level of economic efficiency. She not only discusses those ideas which have significantly promoted new roles for the state, but also those that have not necessarily had significant impacts (i.e., globalization). Stein notes that while globalization is a carrier of neo-liberal economics and the culture of choice, it does not significantly constrain the effective political control of the state along the lines that some critics of globalization put forward.

In analysing the changing role of the state, particular attention is paid to the demands for, and creation of, new forms of political accountability. Stein writes: 'The emergence of public markets for public goods opens a new conversation that goes beyond efficiency. Its most important contribution may be the creation of a new agenda of accountability.' She strongly emphasizes the importance of governments' provision of standards of effectiveness that the public understands. 'If accountability is to have teeth, the measures of effectiveness have to be reported in ways we as citizens can understand. It is through this process of transparent public reporting that a chain of accountability is created in a mature democratic society.' A discussion of a reduced role of governments as a direct provider of public goods is accompanied by the realization that governments are increasingly more coercive, effectively becoming, as Stein puts it, 'the accountability police.'

Janice Stein likes to grapple with issues of political change, and she is

very good at recognizing where important transformations are and are not occurring. *The Cult of Efficiency* is an excellent exploration of the evolving economic roles of the state and their intellectual, economic, and social roots. (MARK W. ZACHER)

Enrico Dal Lago and Rick Halpern, editors. *The American South and the Italian Mezzogiorno: Essays in Comparative History*
Palgrave. ix, 256. US $29.95

The South, as the backward and conservative counterpart of a modern and progressive North, has been a conventional trope in the political imaginary of the Atlantic world for more than a century. At its most encompassing, the dyad defines the entire planet, as when it is used as a synonym of, or euphemism for, the explicitly hierarchical 'First' and 'Third' world. At the national level, this dual image can be found within countries as diverse as Spain, Germany, the Netherlands, Mexico, and even tiny Puerto Rico. Few cases, however, are as putatively prototypical as the two this book deals with.

In the first part of the volume, the editors and Piero Bevilacqua frame their discussion around three comparative approaches sketched by Peter Kolchin in a historiographic chapter on the American South. The first approach compares the South to the North or 'un-South,' as Kolchin phrases it. I would argue, however, that in these dichotomies, which have functioned as Derridean binary oppositions, the North has represented the standard and thus has been defined in its own terms, and it is the South that has represented the 'other,' the 'un-North.' This is not a mere semantic paradox. It has shaped the historiography of 'Souths' everywhere. The authors acknowledge so when they state that these South/North comparisons have normally focused on what the South is *not* (which usually comes down to *what it has failed at*). The second approach compares different regions within the South and tends to break down the monolithic concept by highlighting the differences between, say, tidewater Virginia and the upcountry, or Naples and Sicily. The third approach, comparisons between 'Souths,' has a long tradition in comparative studies of slavery but few antecedents in the type of cross-Atlantic comparisons this book presents.

The second part of the book deals with rural elites and workers. The chapters by Richard Follett on Louisiana sugar planters and by Marta Petrusewicz on the Neapolitan 'landed intelligentsia' reach a conclusion similar to that of many studies of nineteenth-century landed elites in other Souths (south of the Rio Grande, for instance). Rather than feudal or reactionary, these groups were capitalist and obsessed with material progress but also politically and socially conservative. Significantly, the label used by Petrusewicz, 'liberal conservative,' has also been applied to Brazilian and

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Argentine rural oligarchies. The chapters by Steven Hahn and Lucy Riall form a less comparable pair because the first focuses on Black labourers after emancipation and the second on the Sicilian landed estate rather than on the peasants themselves. But both describe a process similar to what the Dependency theorists of the 1970s labelled 'uneven development': the coexistence of liberal legal reforms with de facto social continuities, and of capitalist modes of exchange with semi-coercive labour systems.

In the third part of the book, J. William Harris and Giovanna Fiume sketch the historiography on gender in the United States and Italian South respectively. The dominant topics in these two literatures seem quite different: the southern 'belle' (or rather, its deconstruction), slavery, and race in the former; and problematizing the presumed traditionalism of peasant women and families in the latter. Nonetheless, William Harris offers a suggestive list of questions for comparison.

The last three chapters of the book are explicitly comparative. Enrico del Lago draws parallels between the nation-building projects of antebellum and pre-unification northern liberals and their self-vision as liberators of the oppressed southern masses. Donna Gabaccia explores the interplay of regional and racial/ethnic identities among Black migrants from the American South and Italian immigrants from the mezzogiorno. Bruce Levine compares the debates about how capitalist southern plantations and latifundi were, an issue that relates to the first sentence of this review. The trope of the modern North and the backward South represents an ideological construction that has served to justify international and internal imperialism or, at its most benign, hubris and condescension. But it also reflects some undeniable realities. The 'Norths' did generate technologies that produced more of what people need or want and political economies that distributed that more evenly. There, children – and mothers – died less often. Adults – of either sex – lived longer. Modernity may have been an ideology. But modernization was a socioeconomic process with palpable results. The strength of this book, besides its comparative perspective, lies in its willingness to tackle both. (JOSE C. MOYA)

Ronald N. Harpelle. *The West Indians of Costa Rica: Race, Class, and the Integration of an Ethnic Minority* McGill-Queen's University Press. xx, 238. $70.00

Between 1850 and the Great Depression, the Caribbean Sea was alive with waves of migrants. The emancipated slave populations of the British Caribbean and their descendants made the body of water one of the most complex temporary worker and settler frontiers of this great period in human migration. In moving around – sometimes drifting, more often sailing or steaming full-tilt to a chosen harbour – hundreds of thousands of

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Afro-Antillean men and women created a West Indian cultural and political community whose rimlands included the shores of Central America, from Belize (then British Honduras) to Panama. In this elegantly written book, Ronald Harpelle tells the story of one of these dynamic West Indian settlements, the Costa Rican province of Limón. His study is replete with fresh data gleaned from the local and national press, and from American and British consular reports. Harpelle's book is a welcome addition to the growing literature on what we might call the 'Greater West Indies,' a corpus that now includes a surprising number of studies of Limón.

The trajectory recreated by Harpelle is one of the constitution, crisis, and assimilation (or destruction, which for the author is essentially the same thing) of the West Indian community in Costa Rica. Between 1880 and 1914 the boom in railroad construction and the banana industry attracted tens of thousands of West Indians to Limón and generated a thriving cultural and civic life in the port city and its environs. The United Fruit Company, a virtual suzerain of the Caribbean lowlands, provided paternalistic employment while British consular officials looked out for the rights of these subjects of the Crown – rather tepidly, as Harpelle makes clear. Anglican and Methodist churches provided spiritual and educational cohesion – indeed, the West Indian community was the most literate in Costa Rica at the time, and this was reflected in a healthy newspaper culture. The fate of the community was tied to the fate of the banana industry, which entered into crisis in the war years and never fully recovered, rallying slightly in the 1920s only to dip badly in 1928 and crash in the Depression. This middle stage in the life of the community involved a remarkable upsurge in support for Marcus Garvey's Universal Negro Improvement Association (UNIA). West Indian Limón was devastated by the transfer of United Fruit Company operations to Costa Rica's Pacific coast, starting in 1934, and by an agreement between the company and the government that Hispanic workers would henceforth get hiring preference. This led to an out-migration of able-bodied young West Indian males, and pressure on the remaining community to adopt Costa Rican citizenship and commit itself to cultural assimilation – pressure that came simultaneously from a racist state and local elites.

Harpelle's reconstruction of Garvey's days in Limón as a young man, clashing with conservative local elites, as well as the radical period of the UNIA in Limón and its subsequent co-optation, is a significant contribution to a subject currently of great interest to African-American and Caribbean historians. He dispels certain myths about the relationship between the state and the West Indian community, particularly the widely held belief that West Indians were legally barred from travelling to the heartland of the country prior to the Civil War of 1948. He justly draws attention to the endemic racism among Hispanic Costa Ricans at every level of dominant society, and argues that the accommodationist strategy of the West Indian

elites failed on every occasion to achieve its ostensible goal of improving the condition of ordinary people of African descent. His book also has the virtue of including every angle and trying to tell the whole story of the West Indian community's rise and fall, and it should long be a worthwhile starting point for those interested in the Caribbean coast of Costa Rica. (STEVEN PALMER)

Michael Lambek, editor. *A Reader in the Anthropology of Religion*
Blackwell 2001. xi, 620. US $41.95

This sizeable anthology contains thirty-seven selections written mostly by anthropologists, along with a general introduction composed by the editor, Michael Lambek. Lambek also supplies introductory remarks to the four divisions or 'parts' into which the selections are sorted ('The Context of Understanding and Debate,' 'Poiesis: The Composition of Religious Worlds,' 'Praxis: Religious Action,' and 'Historical Dynamics: Power, Modernity, and Change'), as well as introductory statements for the subdivisions of the four parts and for each individual entry. Part 5, entitled 'Research Tools,' furnishes 'A Guide to the Literature,' which consists of a regional index of persons who have contributed to our knowledge of religion in different parts of the world, a topical index that lists persons who have had something to say on a variety of topics (e.g., '*cognition* Bloch 1998, Boyer, Sperber'), and a general bibliography.

Lambek has obviously put a great deal of effort into assembling and introducing the collection. While I like certain of his individual selections less than others, overall I think that the anthology contains much that is pedagogically useful. There are extracts from such 'classical' authors as E.B. Tylor, E. Durkheim, and M. Weber, as well as excerpts from later writers, some more famous than others but virtually all with something interesting (if not always something persuasive) to say. Yet, for all that, I deem the collection disappointing.

Towards the end of his general introduction, Lambek remarks that his 'primary aim has been to include a substantial body of significant work of relatively lasting significance.' While I have some doubts about 'lasting significance,' I think that Lambek does supply us with a sample of works that are well regarded by many contemporary anthropologists. But instead of pointing to what he generously views as an 'extended conversation,' his selections collectively suggest a directionless babble. Fortunately, however, we are now in the early stages of an interdisciplinary revolution in our understandings of, and debates about, human religiosity. Some anthropologists, still a minority within their own discipline, are major contributors to that development, yet they are given almost no recognition in Lambek's collection.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Lambek refers to Clifford Geertz's 1966 complaint that the anthropology of religion of that time was not theoretically adventurous. He then suggests that that is no longer true, for some anthropologists 'have discovered' existentialism, continental phenomenology, Lacanian psychoanalysis, and much else, and he provides references to essays in his anthology that incorporate some of those discoveries. He also remarks that 'Yet other anthropologists have been increasingly attracted to the insights of cognitive psychology in the ambitious attempt to build a universal (objectivist) theory of human knowledge that would incorporate religious ideation,' but he supplies no immediate references, having awarded no space in his anthology to major examples of that approach.

The anthropologists to whom he refers in passing, it should be noted, are attracted to more than the insights of cognitive psychology. In addition to sometimes actively collaborating with psychologists in the design and execution of experiments to test hypotheses, those anthropologists draw on the cognitive sciences in general, along with evolutionary biology, the neural sciences, and developmental and evolutionary psychology. For the most part, moreover, they have a keen sense of their obligations as scholars to transcend the armchair and furnish evidence for their theories.

I deem the approach to religion that Lambek slights – an approach found in the work of anthropologists such as Scott Atran, Pascal Boyer, Stewart Guthrie, Dan Sperber, and Harvey Whitehouse – to be truly and cumulatively exciting. It seeks to answer questions such as these: Why do we have religion? What is the evolutionary background? Why do we have the sorts of religion that we do and not other imaginable kinds? How are religions organized? How are they transmitted? And why are there family resemblances among the religions of the world? I judge those questions to be of great importance. And I regard some of the answers proffered to them to constitute giant steps in the right direction. Lambek apparently does not share my enthusiasm. I hope that some day he will tell us why.
(BENSON SALER)

R. Beasley, M. Danesi, and P. Perron. *Signs for Sale: An Outline of Semiotic Analysis for Advertisers and Marketers*
Legas 2000. 102. $14.95

P. Perron, M. Danesi, J. Umiker-Sebeok, and A. Watanabe, editors. *Semiotics and Information Sciences*
Legas 2000. 188. $25.00

Signs for Sale and *Semiotics and Information Sciences* are opposed, Janus-like, by their format (the first being a class textbook and the second a collection of conference research articles) and by their target audiences (non-technical readers versus fairly technical readers, such as academics and software

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

engineers). Yet they are coupled, not only by the common authors/editors and publishing house, but by their focus on how semiotic theory can be brought to bear on practical endeavours that have considerable economic stakes.

Signs for Sale is a 'user-friendly introduction to the semiotic study of advertising.' The first chapter is a brief presentation of semiotics and the history of advertising, plus a statement of three caveats to their approach. The authors point out in one of these that 'it is certainly not the point of a semiotic analysis to determine ... the degree to which [an advertisement] will induce consumers to buy the manufacture's product.' Actually, they do suggest principles of *effective* advertising (such as the 'Principle of Textuality,' which states that the appeal of an advertisement is proportional to the number of connotative chains it has), but they are reluctant to include sales as any measure of effectiveness. Marketing is 'more about selling signs than selling products,', so product sales are of little importance. Advertisers will be delighted with that simplification; their customers perhaps less so.

The other three chapters deal specifically with *product image* (logos, brand names and jingles), the notion of *textuality* in advertising, and *semiotically based marketing research*. Textuality and product image are largely inseparable. After getting the buyer's attention, the next move in the advertising gambit is to create a textual world in the buyer's mind where the product is both recognizable and positively valued. Like any writer of fiction, the advertiser must understand where meaning lies for the reader, and the way signs cohere. The chapter on marketing research describes the preliminary work needed to understand which connotative chains buyers will recognize and how they will be valued. Each of these chapters is followed by practical exercises.

For an academic, 'an outline of semiotic analysis for advertisers and marketers' will seem as worthy as 'a guide to pollution for polluters.' Advertising is semiotic pollution, industrialized sophism, and as such the most profound enemy that academia might engage. In their conclusion, the authors attempt to defuse inevitable criticisms. They rightfully claim that advertising is an art form, but reject any responsibility: though 'it is no exaggeration to claim that advertising has become one of the most powerful forms of social discourse in history,' the authors do 'not believe that people are victimized by advertising,' because 'we have no one to blame but ourselves.'In other words, in a free market, only the market is free. Such reasoning is comforting, and kindly exonerates us all, from drug dealers (if there weren't any buyers ...) to environmental polluters (if there were no consumers of industrial products ...). Though semioticians are unlikely to buy that argument (or the book – it is for apprentice advertisers), they will find an excellent focus for research in the tremendous array of consensual folly of which advertisers are the curators. For example, the authors note that *Gateway 2000*'s success depended on an advertising campaign that

featured 'employees standing in cow pastures.' Is it not a profound semiotic mystery to understand the role a cow might play in how we buy computers?

Semiotics and Information Sciences will be more familiar terrain for academics in general, and semioticians in particular.

In 'Extensible Software Applications as Semiotic Engineering Laboratories' S. Diniz et al use their partially implemented *Karelzirn*, a programmable robot game, as 'a concrete illustration of the semiotic points [they] raise,'and a test bed to 'explore the nature of such a peculiar semiotic environment.' *Karelzirn* allows the end user to create variant games by reprogramming the objects in the game environment, such as walls and lampposts, and robot behaviours. Such extensions to the game are created fluidly through interface wizards and familiar analogical thinking. Thus Diniz et al. 'actually build semiotic machines that in their turn allow users to build their own.'

Similarly René Jorna's 'Decision-Making, Semiosis and the Knowledge Space: The Case for *Studas*' describes that same weaving of the user's interaction and the software formalization. *Studas* is a computerized decision software whose application field is decision support for university students' career choice. Another example of a dialogue feedback system, but on a larger scale, is described in Blaise Cronin's 'The Scholar's Spoor,' which studies citations, references, and acknowledgments – both their referential structure and their use as measures of influence and importance of given works within academia. As well, William Pencak's 'Harold Innis, Thorstein Veblen, and In-formation' presents Innis's views, often influenced by Veblen and resonant with Peirce, on how academic institutions, because they are information-*processing* machines, actually condition and even stifle creative thought.

Peter Bøgh Andersen's 'Wind, Currents, Propellers, and Rudders. An Exercise in Dynamic Semiotics in the Domain of Maritime Navigation' gives a good introduction to the theory of feedback semiotic systems. The first sections deal with some of the most wide-ranging questions of semiotics: How are complex semiotic systems such as natural languages possible at all? How do they arise? How are they maintained without centralized rule management? If they are rule-governed, how can they be creative? In contrast to the symbolic universe of computer design, the design of such naturally occurring semiotic systems is terribly bad: they are redundant (multiple ways to say the same thing), polysemous (*run* is a noun or a verb, and can mean a tear or a exercise), circular (dictionary lookup will show that *transport* is defined by *convey*, which is itself defined by *transport*), subject to the paradoxes of self-referentiality ('This sentence is false.'), and accept logical inconsistency ('Do you like strawberry pie? – Yes and no'). Andersen suggests that the new sciences of self-organizing systems (chaos

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

theory and catastrophe theory) give us some insight into why these seemingly bad design choices are actually good, and foundational for large semiotic systems. Recursion and self-referentiality are what regulate the system and give it both stability and flexibility. In the second part, some of the notions developed in the theory section are applied to the area of marine navigation.

Frank Nuessel's 'Philosophical Revolutions and Twentieth Century North American Linguistic Theory' presents the history of linguistics in terms three phases: Bloomfield's empiricism (1930s), Chomsky's rationalism (1960s), and Lakoff and Johnson's neo-empiricism (1980s). Nuessel notes: 'These shifts are not Kuhnian scientific revolutions but rather responses to the basic philosophy of the preceding generation'. Nuessel suggests that linguists rely on a relatively coherent set of metaphors to ensure that dialectical response to past work. Metaphor, then, becomes the crucial substrate of thinking. The theory of metaphor's lifecycle is the subject of Roberta Kevelson's 'Peirce's Interpretant: "Clichés to Archetypes" Revisited.' She rethinks her position (first developed in her *Inverted Pyramid*) on McLuhan's notion of archetype (a literalized cliché) by better situating it within Peirce's philosophy, and particularly within his treatment of how signs 'hybridize'(her term) information.

Finally, Ronald Stamper's 'Extending Semiotics for the Study of Organizations' is perhaps the most comprehensive presentation of the 'interface semiotics' presented in this collection, i.e. semiotics as a seamless extension of information sciences and computer science. Stamper's approach stretches from the material universe (physics and economics) where *cost* arises, through the symbolic structures of information (artificial and natural language processing), all the way to social institutions where *value* is found.Ultimately the robustness and usefulness of any product, software or otherwise, is not to be found in the technology it offers, but in how that technology plays out in the lives of users. If studies show there is no 'correlation between investment in information technology and value added,'it is in part because 'the instruments for measuring [economic wealth] value only material things. Information and its products do not count in our policymaking discourse unless they help to "sell more soap." But signs (information) create value because they enable us to form and enjoy relationships with one another, and build communities based upon our shared norms. Until we are able to give a clear account of our semiological forms of wealth, they will be ignored.'Stamper points out the clear financial advantages of the semiotic approach for software engineering, but the most general lesson he wishes to convey is sociological: 'I would like to see our institutions giving more emphasis to human relationships and communities and rather less to material consumption.'In an information economy, that shift is both worthwhile and expedient. (WILLIAM WINDER)

Marina Roy. *Sign after the X*
Advance Artspeak. vii, 220. $18.95

It is amazing to realize how much meaning a single letter can have in today's image-conscious pop culture. It seems that everything from movies to sports names is being marketed with the same twenty-fourth letter of the alphabet – the letter 'X.' There is Nissan's X-Terra model; there are X-treme sports; there is the action hero 'Triple X'; there are XXX movies; and the list could go and on. In effect, the letter X has become synonymous with youth, danger, excitement. But its signifying power is not an invention of pop culture. X has been around for centuries as the mathematical variable *par excellence*, as a signature used by those who cannot write, as a blasphemous letter assigned to cartoon bottles of alcohol and boxes of dynamite, and as a symbol marking treasure on a pirate's map. In a word, X has always constituted a pictography of danger and the unknown from times that predate X-treme sports and X-File TV programs.

Sign after the X is an enjoyable and insightful investigation of this pictography, reminding us that it continues to be a fundamental means of making meaning. Marina Roy looks at the various uses to which X has been put across the ages, focusing on its present abuses. X is symbolically powerful because it conjures up images of things that are just beyond the realm of decency and goodness. In today's sexually charged culture, X means 'Look at me, I'm X-rated and X-citing.' X is, in a phrase, one of the most provocative symbols of contemporary pop culture, defining it in a compact yet effective way. And the reason is, ultimately, because it reverberates with mythical symbolism that reaches back to the origin of pictography as a craft controlled by those in power. It is a modern-day hieroglyph.

The only way to explain why we extract so much meaning from a simple letter is, in fact, to see it as a product of an unconscious pattern of pictorial symbolism that continues to have emotional hold on the modern mind. Its particular cross design reverberates with contradiction and opposition. No wonder that advertisers and image-makers have adopted it as a symbol of 'cool.' *Sign after the X* is an antidote to this brilliant ploy, showing by illustration how extensive the use of X has become in our youth-obsessed pop culture. One can approach the study of pop culture from the standpoint of ideology and other trendy viewpoints. But, there is nothing more effective than deconstructing it by illustration. As an artist, Roy understands this well. By showcasing the ingenious uses of X with her own drawings, her lexical examples, and her truly insightful annotations, she has been able to convey a much more subversive warning than any 'radical' pundit ever has about the inanity of a lifestyle that is all superficial

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

symbolism and little depth. (MARCEL DANESI)

Robert E. Babe. *Canadian Communication Thought: Ten Foundational Writers*
University of Toronto Press 2000. 448. $75.00, $29.95

The idea that Canada has what Robert Babe describes as 'a rich heritage of communication thought' is familiar to students of Canadian intellectual history. Babe's book on the subject is welcome nonetheless, though its subtitle, promising to identify ten 'foundational writers' of Canadian communication theory, is misleading: several of the individuals surveyed thought of themselves (and are thought of today) as social scientists, political analysts, economists, or literary theorists. A more accurate subtitle would have been 'the theme of communication in ten Canadian thinkers.'

Babe's opening, a broad introduction to communication thought, argues that the American political economist Thorstein Veblen, was – because of his central insight that consumer goods had taken on 'communicatory as opposed to utilitarian properties' – not only generally an important influence on early theories, but also a crucial influence on the development of Canadian thought (but not on later American theory, which took a more pragmatic turn). Babe thinks that Veblen's impact on Harold Innis, the touchstone Canadian figure in this study, led generally to a humanist and critical communications theory in English Canada, and that observation leads Babe into large generalizations about what is 'essentially Canadian.'

Babe begins his account of the growth of Canadian theory with Graham Spry, who argued that radio in Canada should become 'a majestic instrument of national unity and national culture,' and who joined his early interest in radio with his cultural nationalism to bring about the founding of the Canadian Radio League in 1930.

In the chapter that follows, Babe turns to Innis, who emerges as the protagonist of his larger narrative. Innis's distinction between two kinds of media and two kinds of cultures 'time-binding' vs 'space-binding' (not unlike the distinction sociologists make between *Gemeinschaft* and *Gesellschaft*) – provides Babe with the central dialectic of his own study. While Innis's binary was based on differences he postulated between oral and literate cultures, the way time-bound society is associated for him with such values as collectivity and common good, an appreciation for historical continuity, and an emphasis on the local, as opposed to the space-bound society's imperial, presentist, and individualist orientation, makes it clear that at some level Innis was allegorizing an idealized version of Canada in opposition to the United States.

Babe follows his treatment of Innis with very useful discussions of John Grierson, the Scotland-born founder of Canada's National Film Board, and Dallas Smythe, whose Canadian childhood permitted him to end his career

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

in Canada as a refugee from American Red-baiting. While Grierson is as important for what he did (the founder of the NFB, he was also an innovator of documentary film and a shaper of Canadian film aesthetics) as for what he thought, his importance meant that the ideas he also articulated – particularly on communication as propaganda – contributed to the emerging dialogue in Canada. His and more particularly Smythe's observations about the way mass media became a 'Consciousness Industry' show how Canadian thinkers anticipated later critiques, such as Noam Chomsky's, of the media's influence on perception. The surveys that follow – of Macpherson, Irene Biss Spry, Gertrude Joch Robinson – show the continual appearance in Canada of figures who were important because of the way they denaturalized concepts previously conceived of as natural and inevitable.

What may most interest readers of this volume will be Babe's concluding discussions of three prominent Canadians: George Grant, Marshall McLuhan, and Northrop Frye. The discussion of Grant, which stresses his rejection of 'progressive liberalism,' is lucid, thoughtful, and helpful. That Babe's long treatment of McLuhan is less so – it will be most useful to those not already familiar with the large outlines of his thought – may be equally due to the limitations of space and to the problems inherent in any attempt to codify this fascinating and frustrating figure.

Babe's discussion of Frye is the most disappointing in the book, chiefly because Babe spectacularly misreads Frye's loss of faith in the Methodist version of Christianity, viewing it as a general loss of faith in the divine and a choice for nihilism. This misunderstanding results in an unrecognizable portrait of the man who (as more than one essay in last year's special issue of *University of Toronto Quarterly* on the visionary tradition in Canada suggested) always valued the numinous world.

Despite these limitations, the general reader of *Canadian Communication Thought* will find much of interest here and will need no background in communications or media theory: among the work's virtues are a clear prose style and a willingness to explain basic concepts. Its corresponding weakness is the way its introductory tone sometimes combines with a formulaic structure in the ten chapters to make it feel like a course textbook, but it is also a new mapping of the intellectual topography of Canadian culture, one that in its continual return to Innis as the unifying figure of this study, accepts the proposition that a 'Toronto School' of communications theory has emerged and continues to play a role. (RUSSELL MORTON BROWN)

John G. Gibson. *Old and New World Highland Bagpiping*
McGill-Queen's University Press. xxiv, 424. $49.95

This book is a sequel to the author's 1998 volume *Traditional Gaelic*

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Bagpiping, 1745–1945 (also published, in Canada, by McGill-Queen's University Press). Expanding on many of the same themes, it seeks to relate Highland bagpiping as practised in Nova Scotia to the early evidence for traditional piping in Gaelic-speaking Scotland. John Gibson is one of a group of enthusiasts, based in Nova Scotia, who passionately defend the region's piping traditions. They maintain that it preserved distinctive styles of playing that became virtually extinct in Scotland or elsewhere, and that these styles are both sophisticated and somehow more authentic than that of mainstream piping, as practised in Scotland over the past hundred years and spread around the world, including to the rest of Canada. The latter style has been adversely affected by its associations with the army and with the court, so that musically much of the life has been drained out of it.

I am perhaps overstating the case, but readers of this learned work should be aware of Gibson's bias. His archival research, in both Scotland and Nova Scotia, establishes much about regional styles and transmissions, and puts a host of names on the map. We must be grateful for the wealth of information about genealogies and tenantries but the subtext is not entirely convincing. There were pipers throughout the Highlands, particularly before the clearances, but from the mostly anecdotal evidence we cannot tell what or how they played, or how good they were. Gibson says 'Poor piping after all has always been easy to identify,' but the average English or French eighteenth-century visitor may have been unable to do even this, and to the uninitiated ear, middling piping is less easy to identify, or to distinguish from great playing. For example, several times in her journals Queen Victoria mentions hearing pipers, who must have included the finest in the land; but, despite her fondness for things Scottish, the references are non-committal, and, after attending a concert at which Chopin played and had thought to impress her, she notes merely that 'several pianists' had performed.

Gibson rightly insists that there were other centres of excellence (if one may use this modish phrase) besides that in Skye which is associated with the MacCrimmon family: not only in Mull, but also in Perthshire and other parts of eastern Scotland. Recent publication of the 1820 MacArthur-MacGregor manuscript of piobaireachd (classical music for Highland bagpipes) has helped to reinforce this point. He concludes that most pipers would have played light music as well as piobaireachd, though probably then, as now, most played exclusively the light music.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

A more controversial thesis is that there was in the Highlands a developed style of playing jigs, reels, and other light music, which was gradually superseded in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries by more contrived, educated styles of playing. Somehow truer to the Gaelic spirit, it was transplanted and preserved in Nova Scotia within living memory. This idea is acceptable only in part. Styles of playing both piobaireachd andlight music have altered dramatically even within the past hundred years, and continue to evolve; there have been changes in ornamentation, tempo preferences, absolute pitch, scalar intervals, settings of tunes, and so on. As yet no history of piping has addressed these issues seriously; and we can only guess at the sound of the light music in the eighteenth century, though it was probably played fast, with relatively little ornamentation. Today, thanks to a loosening of social barriers and the Celtic revival on both sides of the Atlantic, we are witnessing an acceptance of less regimented styles of playing, in both piobaireachd and light music.

Nova Scotia has contributed to this movement, with its distinctive repertoire and style of playing light music, influenced by fiddling and adapted to accompany step-dancing, but it is basically a folk tradition. Piobaireachd, the great glory of Highland Gaelic music, is largely absent from the Nova Scotia story, despite the sojourn there of Donald MacCrimmon and John MacKay. To set alongside Gibson's loving research, and to redress the balance, one yearns now for a more detailed historical account of piping in Ontario and elsewhere in English-speaking Canada. (DAVID WATERHOUSE)

Brian Pronger. *Body Fascism: Salvation in the Technology of Physical Fitness*
University of Toronto Press. xvi, 276. $27.50

This book is primarily an exploration into the darkness of our technological souls. What troubles Brian Pronger is the postmodern, technological, and scientific vision of the body (and exercise) that dominates physical education, government policies, and the physical fitness industry. His purpose is to probe this vision by calling upon an array of theorists, who in one way or another are considered 'postmodern' – Heidegger, Deleuze, Guattari, and Foucault, for example – using bits and pieces of their work, like a toolbox, to construct his own theory of the body. This does not make for easy reading, but those who persevere will be rewarded with a marvellously fascinating and incisive critique of what our modern technological way of being has sacrificed.

Pronger begins by carefully delineating his topic and laying out his analytical tools. His primary method is deconstruction, which he prefers to call 'the philosophy of the limit.' What he wants to expose is how seemingly innocuous, well-intentioned systems – in this case discourses surrounding

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

the technology of physical fitness – do violence, both symbolically and materially, to our potential for living full lives. The philosophy of the limit asks what lies beyond a particular system, what does it exclude, and what are its limits? In this case, how do the science and technology of physical fitness form a coherent system for producing the body and what elements of the body are excluded? Included among his tools are the 'logics of parergonality' (how a system suggests something beyond), 'secondness' (what it resists), and 'alterity' (openness to otherness).

The first stage of Pronger's analysis questions the independence of science from systems of power within the technology of fitness. For him, the science of physical fitness (as both practice and texts) is not a detached, politically neutral way of producing knowledge. Rather, it engages lives, and it changes them through government policies (e.g., health promotion) and through less explicit, but no less powerful, politics of the body. A full-fledged theory of the body, certainly one developed and applied to the cult of physical fitness, maintains Pronger, does not yet exist. The next stage in the analysis is to develop such a theory, one that considers ways in which the body becomes accessible to the power of modern science and technology; also how it is possible to resist this power and open up spaces for alternative possibilities of the moving body.

More important, and certainly of interest to physical educators, exercise scientists, and health promotion specialists, is the application of this theoretical framework to the technology of physical fitness. Pronger is not arguing that regular physical activity, careful diet, and generally taking care of ourselves is bad. His problem lies with the dominant discourses of physical education and fitness, which take for granted that science is the best way to optimize the body's potential for health, productivity, longevity, and happiness. The 'texts' of fitness (e.g., government policies and publications, scientific and popular texts, fitness products) are scrutinized to show how they turn bodies into a problem in need of technological solutions. These discourses of the physically fit body, especially as it ages, resist the inevitable movement of life and represent, according to Pronger, a nihilistic way of passing through life. It is this nihilism which produces the embodied political system he calls body fascism.

Can we escape? Pronger argues that seeing through our nihilism is working with it, not just escaping it. If we understand what body fascism leaves out, we can then foster the alterity, the otherness of post-technological ways of being embodied. Although Pronger hints at practices like the contemplative martial arts, yoga, tantra, and somatics, he leaves concrete strategies for another volume.

Body Fascism is an intricately argued, densely written philosophical treatise in the postmodern style, and a short review cannot do it justice. It is a very important contribution, perhaps *the* most significant so far, to critical scholarship concerning the relationship of the body to the cults and

industries that surround physical fitness in our technological world. (M. ANN HALL)

M. Ann Hall. *The Girl and the Game: A History of Women's Sport in Canada*
Broadview Press. xii, 284. $27.95

As with Canadian social history more broadly, issues related to gender and women's history have been a dominant theme in recent Canadian sport history. Beginning with Helen Lenskyj's *Out of Bounds: Women, Sport and Sexuality* (1986), the last two decades have seen a wide-ranging exploration of women's and girls' physical activity. Patricia Vertinsky has explored important issues related to the control of women's bodies in the nineteenth century, Bruce Kidd has detailed the organizational efforts of Canadian female athletes in the inter-war years, while other more specific studies (such as examinations of Toronto's Margaret Eaton School by both John Byl and Anna Lathrop) have also been undertaken.

Ann Hall's *The Girl and the Game* is the latest addition to this impressive literature, and Hall is well qualified for such an undertaking. Her scholarship extends beyond the historical to include issues both sociological and political. Indeed, Hall has taken a leadership role in feminist activism in Canada around issues of girls' and women's health and access to physical activity.

In *The Girl and the Game*, Hall sets out 'to trace how male hegemony in Canadian sport was (and still is) resisted by women and how their efforts have been supported and opposed both by men and other women.' To this end, Hall compiles in one (basically chronological and predominantly narrative) volume the important developments and struggles in the history of women's sport in Canada since the late nineteenth century. While the early history of women's sport has received treatment elsewhere, one of Hall's most important contributions is her focus on more recent developments (in which Hall herself has been involved). As a result, Hall's history of the formation and work of the Canadian Association for the Advancement of Women and Sport (CAAWS) is one of the significant contributions of *The Girl and the Game*. Yet, as with many surveys that take on such a broad subject, there is much to both praise and critique.

In methodological terms, Hall makes an important contribution through innovative use of the newspaper columns of early female sportswriters, such as Bobbie Rosenfeld and Alexandrine Gibb. There is room, however, to problematize these columns as sources. One is left to ask if there were more critical ways in which these could have been used. Were they examined to see not only how they exposed the heretofore untold stories of women in organized sport, but also how they in other regards reflect the biases of their authors, some of whom may well have written prescriptively and

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

reinforced traditional gender stereotypes as a way of promoting women's sport? Do these columns reflect lived experience or the experiences their authors wanted to share with the public? What about alternative practices (e.g., homosexuality) that were not revealed?

In *Feminism and Sporting Bodies* (1996), Hall outlines her theoretical stance as an advocate of feminist cultural studies and the importance of praxis, incorporating activism into academe. She notes that feminist scholarship should include women of colour and ethnicity and working-class women, and also study categories such as disability, religion and sexual orientation. However, for all the talk that feminist cultural studies recognizes and incorporates diversity, this new book does little of this and Hall is left to observe that her political agenda 'has not been easy to follow in this particular historical project.'

The Girl and the Game is predominantly the story of white, middle-class women in organized sport. While there is some recognition of working-class women, the evidence presented is also geographically skewed in favour of central Canada, particularly Toronto. And instead of opening new ground on areas of ethnic and immigrant sport, or perhaps acknowledging that neither women nor men are homogenous and that men may have suffered under the patriarchy she describes, Hall is left largely to summarize and synthesize arguments made elsewhere.

Hall explains: 'I have also applied a very broad brush in writing this story for no other reason than so little has been written before. It is important to develop the big picture and leave it to others to fill in the details through more specific studies.' However, this broad brush has been wielded before and much work has already been done to fill in the details. Hall is right in noting that much is left to be done, and her work on CAAWS and the 1980s furthers this project, but there is already considerable research on, for example, images of female athletes in the media.

The Girl and the Game is to be commended for the scope of the task it sets out for itself – the stories of the nineteenth-century bicycling 'craze,' the Edmonton Grads, and the All-American Girls' Professional Baseball League are all found in this volume – and it is to be recommended as the most comprehensive compilation to date of this important history. (RUSSELL FIELD)

Robert K. Barney, Stephen R. Wenn, and Scott G. Martyn. *Selling the Five Rings: The International Committee and the Rise of Olympic Commercialism*
University of Utah Press. xvi, 384. US $35.00

This book is the culmination of several years of extensive archival work at the International Olympic Committee (IOC) headquarters and the Olympic archives in Lausanne, Switzerland. The end result is an accessible book for a

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

range of readers: those seeking an account of the financial aspects of the modern Olympic movement and scholars seeking material to advance a more thorough sociological and philosophical critique of this global spectacle.

Selling the Five Rings seeks to examine how the modern Olympic movement has been transported from a small entity since its inception in 1896 to what the authors cogently describe as a 'commercial giant of imposing power and influence.' The authors provide a comprehensive documentation of the history of television and corporate sponsorship through primary source documents, including minutes of the IOC executive boards, general sessions, and various IOC subcommittees, and reports of key marketing agencies and commissions concerned with financial matters of the Olympic movement. Breaking new ground in their exhaustive narrative of the litany of decisions and events that have spelled financial success for the Olympic movement, the text is engaging if somewhat too detailed at various points.

The book begins by highlighting both the impressive athletic and financial successes of the recent 2000 Sydney Olympics, but it tempers such achievements with the most damaging moment in the IOC's over one-hundred-year history: the 1998–99 IOC bribes-for-votes scandal. Detailing the commercial formulas employed for the 1984 Los Angeles Olympic Games, the authors lend insight into the background of the bribery cases, focusing on the potential for financial gain for host cities. These focal events lay the groundwork for the rest of the work.

Detailing the financial deliberations and turbulent negotiations that have become the mainstay in managing the Olympics, important milestones in the history of the IOC are discussed in two parts. Part 1 explores the IOC's rather late awakening to the fact that their 'product,' namely the five-ring Olympic symbol, was attractive on a global scale. Detailed accounts of the controversial and at times adversarial dealings between Helms Bakeries and the IOC over the protection of the modern Olympic movement's most valuable assets – 'image and recognition' – shed light on the complexities of the emerging sponsorship realm that surfaced for the 1932 Olympics. Part 2 of the book focuses on the IOC as a corporate entity. The emergence of TOP (The Olympic Program) in the early 1980s begins a journey of extensive bargaining and backroom deals that attests to the power of the IOC as a worldwide organization; however, the authors do a good job in emphasizing the power of American broadcast executives as well. Canadian IOC member Richard Pound becomes a key figure when the IOC entered complex financial dealings. His role in challenging the 'sweetheart deals' that the European Broadcasting Union had historically been awarded in comparison to the three major American networks makes for a particularly strong section.

'Selling the five rings,' as the title of the book attests, has become the defining feature of this modern global media event; however, while focus-

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

ing on the machinations of the IOC as a corporate entity, the authors never fully challenge the aggressive marketing and advertising that has ensued. The addition of a political economy/globalization perspective could effectively situate much of this book within the global trends of the past twenty years. Secondly, while it may be true that as the new IOC president, Jacque Rogge, states, 'The Olympics are primarily put on for television,' the authors sidestep serious consideration of the ramifications for sport development: increasing corporate dependency has shaped the very definition of sport and inclusion in the Olympic program. Athletic events are even scheduled to suit the needs of television rather than the athletes. Furthermore, the fact that athletes seek corporate dollars to cover the costs of training and competing has meant levels of risk-taking that have not abated at a time when the IOC has seen its profits dramatically increase. Finally, a more thoughtful engagement with the unchallenged assumption that business and corporate excellence is equated with sporting excellence is necessary.

Without question, the Olympic message has spread globally with the advent of enormous TV rights and advertising dollars. However, by concluding that the future success of the IOC's marketing initiatives includes guaranteeing exclusivity for its primary sponsors, the authors highlight the tenuous links that already exist between sponsors' products and the Olympic ideals. Who or what organization will take a much-needed watchdog role that oversees the extent to which Olympic sponsors draw on and develop the very values that provide them their profits? 'Creative' marketers rather than Olympic scholars have dangerously become the main interpreters of Olympic values – key points in the broadcast of the Olympic ceremonies have already succumbed to misinterpretations of the Olympic symbols and values. (CORA MC CLOY)

H.J. Jackson. *Marginalia: Readers Writing in Books*
Yale University Press. 324. us $27.95

This beautifully produced and printed book charts the history, inspiration, and meaning of marginalia, the writing by readers in their own books or other people's. There are a number of paradoxes here. The first arises from the value attributed to such writing, especially when it is commentary by one distinguished person or another, which thereby creates an interesting and important association copy, and yet contradicts the modern view, formed by fastidious collectors, who think that annotation ruins books forever and want them in mint condition. Public libraries embody the contradiction, for they forbid marginalia by their readers and yet collect them. The view that writing mutilates a book sees marginalia as an appropriation of a work by its annotator, who thereby parasitically acquires

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

an audience for himself, intervening between the text and future readers and even, in Virginia Woolf's (to my mind, rather crazed) opinion, perpetrating a kind of sexual assault upon them.

A further paradox explored by the author is that although apparently spontaneous and impulsive, as when the reader records a correction or impassioned agreement or irritation arising from his own experience, marginalia are not as innocent or transparent as they sometimes seem, being the product of tradition and convention or a means of self-aggrandisement, or as in the case of gift copies of books mostly older than 1820, being a means to further friendship and love. The author is herself a labourer in the great Coleridge industry, and it was Coleridge who both coined the term 'marginalia' and was their most unflagging practitioner, finding them an invaluable aid to his own composition, and thereby dominating the golden age of this activity in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century.

The author is at her happiest in her remarks on Coleridge, as in comparing his marginalia to 'someone running upstairs taking two steps at a time.' It is the writers of his period who justify the author's claims for the importance of her subject, and it is among them that marginalia that can claim to be 'competent' or 'transcendent,' to use her terms, are ordinarily to be found. There is also much fascinating information here about works reused as commonplace books by their possessors, or interleaved with additional pages for private commentary, or 'grangerised,' that is expanded, sometimes massively, into many volumes, with plates and images from elsewhere.

The author is at her lightest when she indulges her taste for literary anecdotes, and she is properly suspicious of the modern grand theories of reading, as in the notion that there was a movement from the objective early modern annotator to the subjective modern one, or from a 'public' reading habit to a 'private' one. She is at her heaviest in her forays into reader-response theory, or in the occasional leaden-footed remark, such as that 'the records of specific reading encounters can lead to legitimate historical generalizations,' and many of her carefully garnered quotations are pretty banal. yet some which have no end except themselves are delightful in themselves, like Nabokov's speculations on the identity of the insect in Kafka's *Metamorphosis*, which left me wondering why I had never asked this question myself.

This seems to me to be the great excuse for this magnificently erudite learned work, not that annotations illustrate a convention or are typical of an era or add to our historical knowledge or literary learning or interest in human nature, although they do, but that they can give delight. The undelightful ones remain a problem. 'The current blanket prohibition against writing in books is unnecessarily repressive,' the author concludes, 'and it is not much comfort to know that it is bound to be ineffectual' (she

does not discuss that bane of the modern bibliophile, for which there can be no excuse, the highlighter pen). Yet I had not realized that I was a puritan lover of the pristine book until I read this one; and the author might be glad to know that I am a partial convert to her cause, as my copy of her own book now testifies. (SHERIDAN GILLEY)

W.H. New, editor. *Encyclopedia of Literature in Canada*
University of Toronto Press. xxii, 1348. $75.00

Building upon earlier reference works on Canadian literature, W.H. New and his 308 contributors offer more than 1400 single-author entries and hundreds of other articles of 'currently available information about writers and writing in Canada.' In his preface the editor notes that the *Encyclopedia* 'interprets widely the term "literature in Canada."'

Certainly this 'plurality of Canadian literature' is fully displayed in the *Encyclopedia*, with substantial entries on Acadian writing, Commonwealth in Canadian literature, Aboriginal languages, exploration literature, the publishing industry, and gay and lesbian writing, among many others. Entries provide useful cross-references throughout, with informative biographical data and suggestions for further reading. Of particular value are the many articles on First Nations oral and written languages and literatures (including several by Robert Bringhurst).

Despite New's promise of 'currently available information,' many entries seem to stop about 1998 or 1999 (the Governor-General's Awards, for example). While there is an unavoidable gap in providing current information in such a text, the inclusion of a reference to the death of Timothy Findley in June 2002 will prompt readers to wonder why other relevant information from the 1998–2002 period is omitted. In addition, this *Encyclopedia* presents many problems for a reader seeking accurate information on names, titles, and dates. In the 'Awards' article, Gunnars's *The Rose Garden* appears as *The Garden Rose*, Fred Wah's *Diamond Grill* as Way's *Diamond Girl*, and Constantin-Weyer's *Un homme se penche sur son passé* as *Un homme se pendre sur son passé* (this title is reported accurately in the individual-author entry, but his mother's name should appear as Bompard; and the December 1988 symposium on his work at Saint-Boniface is ignored, as is the inaugural issue of *Cahiers franco-canadiens de l'Ouest* [Spring 1989] devoted to his work). In the 'Biography' article the name of Andrée Yanacopoulo is misspelled, *Signé* is missing its accent, and the name of Gabrielle Roy's biographer François Ricard is misreported (it does appear correctly in Alison Calder's entry on Roy). Crozier's *A Saving Grace* is once retitled *Mrs. Bentley*, and Vera Lysenko's *Yellow Boots* becomes *The Red Boots* (possibly a confusion with Sullivan's *The Red Shoes*). Similar oversights and errors include the Legate and Moritz biographies of Leacock;

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Paulette Collet's *Deux patries, deux exils* on Marie Le Franc and *L'hiver dans le roman canadien-français* in the article on motifs in Quebec writing in French; Atwood's *Strange Things* in the article on 'North'; Denis Sampson's *Brian Moore: The Chameleon Novelist*; Sheila Munro's *Lives of Mothers and Daughters*; Solecki's *The Last Canadian Poet* and *Beyond Remembering* on Pratt; and Shields's *Jane Austen* biography. Benson and Conolly's *Oxford Companion to Canadian Theatre* is omitted from the article on 'Theatre History,' and Ronald Wright (shortlisted for the 1989 Trillium Award for *Time among the Maya*) is named as the winner of that award.

Numbers seem to pose particular difficulty in this volume, too often unreliable in its details (correct information is indicated in parentheses): Laurence went to Africa in 1951 (1950); Davies died on 3 (2) December 1995; Klein's *The Rocking Chair* was published in 1984 (1948); Klinck's edition of *Literary History of Canada* appeared in 1956 (1965); MacLennan died on 9 (7) November 1990; Ricard's biography of Roy was published in 1966 (1996); *The Roaring Girl* won the Governor-General's Award in 1997 (1995); Škvorecký's *The Engineer of Human Souls* appeared in 1977, 1983, and 1984 (1977 in Czech, 1984 in English); *The Handmaid's Tale* in the 'United States and Canadian Literature' article is said to have appeared in 1987 (1985); in Gerald Friesen's 'Chronology' we learn that St Laurent became prime minister in 1940 (1948), and that the first Quebec referendum was held in 1976 (1980).

On balance, the reader of *Encyclopedia of Literature in Canada* can learn much. Such a reader will also wisely keep earlier and other such works close at hand, heeding the caution expressed here by Catherine Sheldrick Ross in her article on 'Reference Guides to Canadian Writing': 'the information may not be complete or exactly in the form desired.' (JOHN J. O'CONNOR)

George Elliott Clarke. *Odysseys Home: Mapping African-Canadian Literature*
University of Toronto Press. xii, 492. $85.00, $35.00

Odysseys Home is an impressive tome that comprises an introduction, twelve essays under the subheading 'Sorties,' eleven book reviews bearing the subheading 'Incursions: Selected Reviews,' and several catalogues of resources in the form of bibliographic essays and bibliographies under the subheading 'Surveys.'

George Elliott Clarke defines his critical approach as essentialist, and is mindful of the critiques made against essentialism in favour of terms such as metissage and créolité. However, the wide range of strategies that Clarke adapts from various theorists and his reliance on history as a vital heuristic tool make me wonder whether the essentialist claim is just, whether, if any label were needed, empirical might not have been more accurate.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Among its several functions, the introduction delineates how a more intricate analysis of African-Canadian literature might be done. It also links the essays, book reviews, and surveys inasmuch as they were published separately and were not initially written for inclusion in a single volume. The link is effected through Clarke's implicit (and sometimes explicit) insistent weaving of literature and ontology.

In the first three essays, Clarke undertakes to distinguish African-Canadian literature from its African-American counterpart, even while acknowledging the influences of the latter; and to deal with the language specifics of Africadian (Clarke's neologism for Blacks living in Canada's Atlantic provinces) literature. Perhaps there is some irony in the fact that the writer who best exemplifies the use of Black Nova Scotian English is Frederick Ward, an African American who grew up in Missouri.

Literature as a site for contestation of identity is dealt with in the third essay but emerges forcefully in the essay 'Liberalism and Its Discontents: Reading Black and White in Contemporary Québécois Texts' (an essay modelled on Toni Morrison's essays in *Playing in the Dark)*. On the one hand, 'Liberalism' probes the unconscious figuration of Blackness in Euro-Québécois literature (and psyche), and on the other, contestations of that figuration in Afro-Québécois works such as Dany Laferrière's *Comment faire l'amour à un nègre sans se fatiguer.* But Clarke frames this analysis with Frantz Fanon's *Masque noir, peau blanche*, and thus expects his audience to read his chosen texts as metonyms for White figurations of Blackness and Black contestations of such figurations.

Clarke includes in *Odysseys* three of his most controversial essays: 'The Treason of the Black Intellectuals' (echoing Harold Cruse's equally controversial *The Crisis of the Black Intellectual*); 'Clarke versus Clarke: Tory Elitism in Austin Clarke's Short Fiction'; and 'Harris, Philip, Brand: Three Authors in Search of Literate Criticism.' In 'Treason' the list of those whose views are treated, not all negatively, includes André Alexis, Rinaldo Walcott, Djanet Sears, M. Nourbese Philip, Cecil Foster, and Dionne Brand – in other words a stellar cast of African-Canadian authors. The disagreements here arise, in some cases, as a result of ill-chosen rhetoric, but, in others, they are ideological. In 'Clarke versus Clarke,' the controversy is starker, to the extent that G. Clarke's analysis of A. Clarke's short stories implies discomfort with the conservative values of the latter's protagonists. The 'Harris, Philip, Brand' essay is harsher in its title than in its analysis. Whereas Clarke's introduction and first three essays are de facto demonstrations of the knowledge necessary to analyse African-Canadian literature and culture adeptly and respectfully, the 'Harris, Philip, Brand' essay diagnoses what Clarke identifies as weaknesses in the approaches used and conclusions drawn by some of the critics of African-Canadian literature: Lynette Hunter, Carol Morrell, Joseph Pivato, Himani Bannerjee, and Rinaldo Walcott. Clarke's implicit message to these critics is twofold: that

they should take the time to state their thoughts clearly, and that they should not turn the literature into weapons for a particular cause.

From the reviews, one easily discerns Clarke's criteria for good literary art. Even if the critic 'is not called merely to celebrate but to elaborate the condition of his or her subject(s),' here Clarke tilts in favour of celebration. In fairness to him, the books he exults over merit their praise.

The 'Surveys' section is every researcher's dream, for it provides an exhaustive bibliography of primary works and collections that will prove invaluable to future scholars of African-Canadian literature.

The vast erudition evident in *Odysseys* and the rhetorical skills required to shape it are impressive. It is full of the provocations critics of a 'new' literature need to help clarify their methodologies and sharpen their conclusions. (H. NIGEL THOMAS)

Conny Steenman-Marcusse, editor, *The Rhetoric of Canadian Writing*
Rodopi. 304. US $65.00

Both strengths and disappointments of this uneven but earnestly good-willed and exceptionally diverse gathering of essays find a kind of emblem in its title, which recalls my sixth-grade teacher's doggerel contribution to rhetorical theory: 'THE has a weakness / When it hints at uniqueness.' Admittedly this collection title is merely an adoption from that of the fourteenth Leiden conference held three years past, when 'the Association for Canadian Studies in the Netherlands (ACSN) assembled scholars from all over the world ... to present their views on the rhetoric of Canadian writing past and present.' Conny Steenman-Marcusse is coy about confirming that all inclusions in the collection were originally delivered at the conference, but in many individual contributions and subtly in the tone of the whole encapsulated in its title, I sense that blurring of distinctions, that benevolent softening of focus, that can easily occur among objects viewed at a distance. Indeed, between yet another enthymeme of Canadian identity implied in 'The Rhetoric of Canadian Writing' and the balkanized exempla composing its content there exists a virtual oxymoron, reflective perhaps of the goodwill and positive ethos invested in 'multiculture,' that officially sanctioned oxymoron whose '-ism' is evoked uncritically more than once in the collection. Sixteen commentators with little procedural common ground discernible among them beyond a loose drift towards feminist and/or postmodernist gestures mine a richly marbled vein of work by writers (curiously characterized by the editor in her introduction as 'lesser known but certainly not lesser quality') so varied in time, place, generic assumptions, and circumstance as Tomson Highway, Wayne Johnston, Margaret Atwood, Nancy Huston, Elizabeth Simcoe, Thomas King, Catharine Parr Traill, Rudy Wiebe, Elizabeth Montgomery, Patrick

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Anderson, Susan Swan, and Stompin' Tom Connors. And, of course, there are separate essays, both excellent of their type by Louise Dupre and E.F. Dyke respectively, for French and Aboriginal writing: eclectic, relentlessly eulogistic, and (well) separate.

Given this ambitious range and variety, the collection sustains a commendably high level of scholarship and stylistic flair. Highlights include Susan Swan's wittily self-referential and innovative keynote entry on 'the writers' conscience' as well as Steenman-Marcusse's adroit analysis of autobiographical topoi in Swan's own novel *The Biggest Modern Woman in the World*; Robert Druce's elegant deconstruction, again through biographical topoi, of Patrick Anderson's poetry; Eric Miller's splendid threnody on 'Elizabeth Simcoe and the Fate of the Picturesque'; Kathleen Venema's diligent mapping of Wiebe's rhetorical strategies in *A Discovery of Strangers* on those of English-Canadian exploration texts; Hans Bak's fascinating reconfiguration of Johnston's *The Colony of Unrequited Dreams* as historical tragedy; Martin Reinink's sophisticated cautionary analysis of metaphor and metonymy in the *inventio* of literary history; and the intelligent negotiation by J.M. MacLennan and John Moffatt of Stompin' Tom Connors's songbook as a commonplace book synecdochal of Canada's regional angst.

Unsatisfactory as this brief list must be, it will serve perhaps to justify my contention that a cleavage of promise and delivery exists between title and content. The strength of the collection lies in the wide scope of writing it accommodates, not in the range or depth of rhetorical theory it essays. Despite frequent footnoting of Homi Bhabha and Jacques Derrida, there is little evidence about the footnotes that rhetoric has undergone any rethinking since Cicero. That analogy is at all problematical; that sequence always argues consequence; that open systems cannot be ordered in the absence of what classical rhetoricians called decorum – such matters have little visibility here. Only Martin Reinink is self-conscious about the act of critical commentary as itself rhetorical, and few contributors venture much beyond topos-hunting, especially biographical and topographical topoi; some contributors evidently identify the retelling of narratives as 'rhetorical analysis.' Perhaps the next Leiden conference might address 'What is rhetoric?' – a genuine rhetorical question. (MICHAEL DIXON)

Lorraine York. *Rethinking Women's Collaborative Writing: Power, Difference, Property*
University of Toronto Press. x, 206. $50.00, $24.95

In *Rethinking Women's Collaborative Writing: Power, Difference, Property*, Lorraine York challenges the 'strong tendency to celebrate women's collaborations unproblematically and idealistically.' By reading 'women's

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

collaborations as ideological projects that harbour various ideological potentials, some more hierarchical, some more liberatory and subversive,' York is able to argue convincingly against the idealization, and also as she puts it, the fetishization of women's collaborative work. Yet, York's historicist approach does not result in a history or a narrative of progress from single authorship to collaboration. Rather, by placing the practice of collaborative writing in a historical context, she exposes persistent concerns over territory, privacy, property, and ownership.

Although not intended as a history of collaboration, the study's investigation of the historical contexts for collaboration helps to make its argument. Drawing on the work of Jeffrey Masten, York notes that, as early as 1647, the partnership of playwrights Beaumont and Fletcher was considered somewhat 'odd,' presaging the homophobic response that would characterize nineteenth-century approaches to literary collaboration. But it is in the Romantic period that, according to York, the bonds between ownership, copyright, and individual authorship were sealed and the image of the solitary male visionary began to represent authorship. For York, nineteenth-century literary collaborations constitute a complex form of resistance to the Romantic ideal, while responses to collaborations by women, such as Michael Field, illustrate how gender expectations further solidify the position of single authorship in the period. Despite the 'Death of the Author' announced by Roland Barthes and confirmed by Michel Foucault in the twentieth century, anxieties about property and territory in the creative process continue to shape the way collaborative work is carried out and received. Anxiety is demonstrated in the negotiations between collaborators that York documents and in the relentless attempts to ferret out the *true* author of the collaborative work by critics. Within the academy, the promotion and tenure process serves as a stark example of the problem. This history of anxiety exposes the persistence of single authorship as the standard against which other practices are judged either strange or wonderful.

Given the hounding of collaborative projects by the spectre of single authorship, it is perhaps not surprising that those who embrace collaboration want to make a virtue of necessity by idealizing its difference. According to York, Anglo-American feminists are most likely to idealize collaboration and to see all collaboration as ideologically subversive. However, York shows the material and theoretical factors conditioning this response: the philosophical dominance of individualism, the continued influence of maternal feminism, and the absence of well-established traditions of collective or co-operative action. In Europe, she cites Italy as a country whose strong co-operative and collective movements have produced a more sophisticated theoretical understanding of power. In North America, collaboration is strongly identified with the intimacy of the colleagues, whether friends or lovers, and theorists depict a process of

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

fusion rather than negotiation, consensus building rather than dissent, transcending differences rather than respecting them. As a result, unequal power relations within the collaboration are often left unexamined, raising the question: 'If collaboration is a safe place of fusion, of affirmative union, and monovocality, then what has this theory to do with the notion of difference?'

York offers Cixous and Clément's term 'differently engaged' to describe collaboration that allows for difference while calling for analysis of the balance of power within collaborative relationships. In the final chapter, York takes a 'hard look' at power in *The Book of Jessica*, the text based on the collaboration between Maria Campbell and Linda Griffiths, and suggests, without stating explicitly, that critics have been unable to imagine Campbell as a participant in the collaboration and thus have produced criticism that 'replicates the property dispute that lies at the heart of the text.' Following on this provocative discussion, York includes an epilogue exploring 'the ethics of working collaboratively' in her own pedagogy and recognizes the 'indisputable differences in power that structure the university.' York's study of women's collaborative writing is a bold, often courageous, analysis of authorship and its relation to property and power. (RENÉE HULAN)

Tilottama Rajan and Michael J. O'Driscoll, editors.
After Poststructuralism: Writing the Intellectual History of Theory
University of Toronto Press. vii, 344. $50.00

This anthology will of great use to practitioners and to historians (hostile, friendly, or disinterested) of literary theory. It is, however, 'history' of a distinctly poststructuralist kind; for, as the editors ask in their introduction, how *does* one write 'intellectual history' 'when both the conceptuality of ideas and the linearity of history have been called into question.' Periodization, progress, continuity, causality, teleology – in the wake of post-structuralism, all such old standbys have been deeply 'problematized.' Although conceding (in what has become a nervous and classic post-structuralist gesture) that such notions remain 'useful and indeed necessary,' the editors prefer to organize these contributions under such rubrics as 'genealogies,' 'performativities,' 'physiologies,' and 'technologies.' Mantric terms, these, intended to calm readers who many notice the appearances of 'questionable' 'necessities.'

Tilottama Rajan herself offers the best of the 'genealogical' essays, a brilliant account of the strange 'error' by which – in a manner Freud would have understood – deconstruction mislaid its Sartrean legacy. By helping to recover that legacy, Rajan joins Christina Howell and Bernard-Henri Lévy in making it impossible for a serious understanding of deconstruction's history to continue its long Oedipal repression of Sartre. It's time to grow

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

up.

To say that these essays vary in quality is not to say that there are any bad essays here. It is merely to note that some continue to reverberate weeks after the book has been deposited on its appropriate shelf. Rodolphe Gasché's learned 'Theatrum Theoreticum' (a 'performativity'), for example, offers an arresting linkage of theatrical lighting (e.g., limelight) in the nineteenth century to the deconstructive enterprise. Ian Balfour's consideration of the sublime by reference to de Man and to Hegel's *Aesthetics* is one of the collection's several reminders of the indispensability of Hegel. Victor Li's wittily titled and well-written 'The Premodern Condition' provides a probing indictment of the self-confuting paradoxes at work in the special status accorded to the 'primitive' in Lyotard and Baudrillard. It is very hard, after all, to identify those 'primitives' as a form of absolute otherness to the hyper-cerebralized West while writing in, of all places, Paris. D.H. Lawrence (unmentioned by Li) did the job more adroitly and received greater respect from ethnologists of the time.

However, Li's strictures *against* what others have called 'pragmatic self-refutation' (where one's very utterance is the best argument against the claim it advances) point to an interesting tension in the collection. Against it we can set Mani Haghighi's 'The Body as History' (from 'physiologies,' naturally) which defends certain Foucauldian paradoxes against criticisms levelled by Charles Taylor: 'all of which are reducible to one version or another of the "relativist's conundrum," the ... claim that all relativist postulates are self-undermining.' These charges he calls 'uninspired and inconsequent.' He wishes! However, perhaps even 'physiologists' are permitted a weakness of the old history: apologetics for one's favourite authors.

Haghighi's essay points up something else. Of the thirteen contributors to the volume, eleven seem to be professors of literature, something that matters less in this volume – and in North American poststructuralism – than the stately deployment of concepts and the syntactical 'rigour' on which poststructuralism always prided itself. Peter Dews (who offers a fine, but too brief, paper on Lacan, Merleau-Ponty and Slavoj Žižek) is the only apparent philosopher. Curiously, however, this volume reflecting upon poststructuralism does not probe its own verbal forms, including the astonishing change the movement effected in the prose that issues from literature departments and the social and historical conditions of the humanities that made such a change possible.

Haghighi's disciplinary background is unclear, but he offers a nice example of the tendency to *absolute assertion* that would become the new style's favourite tic: 'What they [Taylor and Judith Butler] fail to acknowledge is that, for Foucault, history is itself a body – in the most literal and concrete sense of the word.' This literal and concrete 'body' then turns (*ignotum per ignotius*) into the Deleuze and Guattari 'body without organs.'

Although the prose insists on making a 'conceptual' point (history = body, *sans* residue), in *fact*, the concept is just another pretty metaphor. Perhaps, then, to fault theory for being indifferent to literature is unfair. Rather than being absent from poststructuralism, perhaps 'literature' is present as *abstract* poetry. (T.H. ADAMOWSKI)

Shaobo Xie and Fengzhen Wang, editors. *Dialogues on Cultural Studies: Interviews with Contemporary Critics*
University of Calgary Press. xviii, 280. $34.95

This book results from an international conference, 'Critical Theories: China and West,' held at Hunan Normal University, Hunan, China, in 1997. In the months following the conference, the editors conducted the interviews by e-mail. The interviewees are Arif Dirlik, Teresa Ebert, Barbara Foley, Fredric Jameson, Pamela McCallum, J. Hillis Miller, Masao Miyoshi, Bruce Robbins, John Carlos Rowe, Henry Schwarz, Richard Terdiman, and Hayden White.

This collection distinguishes itself from other collections of interviews in the way that it lives up to the word 'dialogues' in its title, in the absence of the effects of face-to-face dialogues between interviewer and interviewee. The feature that nonetheless gives this work substance is that all the interviewees are asked the same thirty-three questions. Dialogues thus emerge when one organizes one's reading around multiple responses to particular questions. In their introduction, the editors offer an insightful sampling of these illuminating dialogues, which also make the volume particularly valuable for classroom use in courses in cultural studies.

The volume, however, is not quite as symmetrical as I've made it sound. Only two interviewees respond to all or nearly all of the questions (Ebert, Rowe). Some write essays designed to respond to some of the questions (Miller, Miyoshi, Schwarz, Terdiman). Most select some of the questions, responding to them individually, or in small groups of two or three. One engages in an e-mail dialogue with the editors to supplement her answers to her selection of questions (Foley). These differences, however, are more of an advantage than a disadvantage. Whatever is lost in not seeing every interviewee responding to each question is more than compensated for by adding consideration of why each interviewee made his or her choices. One could even ask students to identify what it is about a particular theorist's approach that makes some questions more pertinent than others.

The various issues in cultural studies that are debated in these dialogues are effectively encompassed in *Cultural Critique*'s statement of purpose in its first issue in 1985: rather than consider cultural phenomena 'as isolated, self-subsisting artifacts,' such phenomena are to be considered 'in terms of their economic, political, social, and aesthetic genealogies, constitutions, and effects.' Culture is the context of contexts, the container of all these

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

genealogies.

Objections to the project of cultural studies over the last few decades have typically come from those who wish to turn back the clock to study literature for itself, as a 'self-subsisting artifact.' An example would be Harold Bloom, who became a particularly prominent and public voice on this issue in the 1990s.

It might, however, be more useful to question cultural studies from another angle, one suggested by cultural studies itself. Cultural studies insists on the value of looking at things not in their isolation but in their broader cultural context. But culture itself is conceived in splendid isolation. Culture contextualizes but it is not itself contextualized. It's this conception of culture as totally autonomous that makes one wonder if cultural studies, even as it sees itself questioning modernity, is really deeply embedded in modernity's dualistic world-view that separates humankind from its earthly habitat.

Michael Serres, in *The Natural Contract* (1992, translated 1995), suggests that what is genuinely new in our time is the unprecedented extent to which history is entering nature and nature is entering history. John Bellamy Foster's *Marx's Ecology: Materialism and Nature* (2000) reminds the Marxist tradition that historical materialism encompasses a dialectic of nature as well as a socioeconomic dialectic. The recent emergence of ecocriticism and the explosive growth of ASLE (Association for the Study of Literature and Environment) are additional signs that changes are afoot. To revitalize itself for the twenty-first century, cultural studies may need to broaden its focus to find ways to contextualize culture on planet Earth.
(ROBERT WESS)

Anthony A. Barrett. *Livia: First Lady of Imperial Rome*
Yale University Press. xx, 426. US $45.00

After proving to his own satisfaction that Agrippina, the mother of Nero, did not poison her husband Claudius, Anthony Barrett has turned his talents for historical advocacy to Livia, the wife of Augustus. Since he has less to explain away, he can be more faithful to the ancient evidence. His book falls into three parts. First, Barrett gives a comprehensive survey of Livia's family and life, setting out in chronological order both the little that is attested and the large amount that has been conjectured about her activities. The second part is thematic: Livia's private life, Livia as wife, mother, property-owner, and friend and patron, her death and posthumous reputation. The third part comprises more than one hundred pages of appendices on the ancient sources and specific problems. The book is engagingly written and Barrett has considered all the relevant evidence, even translating two medicinal recipes which the late Latin writer Marcellus

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

attributes to Livia as an illustration of her 'healthy lifestyle.'

Livia is an elusive figure. It is not surprising, therefore, that the details carefully assembled by Barrett somehow fail to delineate a fully rounded character. Barrett denounces the Livia of Robert Graves as memorably depicted on television by Siân Phillips as a 'popular confusion between the historical and fictional' because the historical Livia did not spend her whole life 'plotting, scheming, conniving' and removing enemies by guile and poison. After rejecting the salient features of the Livia of the ancient sources, however, Barrett is left with a colourless personality who, despite her scandalous second marriage, really was the respectable matron depicted in Augustan art and literature so that she seems 'at first sight better suited to our modern notions of middle-class respectability than to an active if understated role at the very centre of Rome's political life.'

There is much for the pedant to carp at in Barrett's book. It contains too many misprints, too many trivial errors of fact, too much sloppy writing: for example, Livia is once carelessly presented as already married to Octavian in 41 BC. A suspiciously high percentage of sentences either have a main verb in the potential or inferential mode ('would have,' 'must have,' etc) or a main clause in the form 'Tacitus/Suetonius/Dio states/reports.' Moreover, Barrett often slides surreptitiously from hypothesis to fact, as when the mistress about whom Octavian's first wife complained is 'possibly Livia,' then 'almost certainly Livia' on successive pages. Nor is Barrett's treatment of substantive problems consistently satisfactory. According to all our ancient narrative sources, the sycophantic Velleius Paterculus no less than Tacitus, Suetonius, and Cassius Dio, Livia was six or seven months pregnant when she married Octavian. If she was, then Octavian could have been the biological father of her younger son Drusus. That Livia did indeed conceive Drusus by Octavian, not her husband, was argued by the psychologist Gregorio Marañon in *Tiberius: A Study in Resentment*, translated by W.B. Wells (1956) – which Barrett appears nowhere to cite. Uncertainty over whether Livia's first or second husband was the biological father of Drusus would explain the otherwise surprising fact that, while Augustus conspicuously preferred Drusus over his older brother Tiberius, it was Tiberius, not Drusus, to whom he married his only daughter. Barrett argues that the betrothal of Octavian and Livia has been confused with their subsequent marriage on 17 January 38 BC, and hence that Livia was already pregnant when she and Octavian first had sexual relations. His argument rests, however, not (as he tendentiously implies) on the principle that 'the concrete evidence of inscriptions and birthdates must, other things being equal, be considered more reliable than literary information that derives ultimately from gossip and propaganda,' but on an inference from Suetonius's report that the emperor Claudius asserted in an edict that his father Drusus shared a birthday with his maternal grandfather Mark Antony, who is known to have been born on 14 January. My late colleague

Graham Sumner removed the contradiction in the evidence much more convincingly than Barrett when he suggested that Claudius confused his *avus* the triumvir with his *abavus*, the grandfather of the triumvir, the great orator M. Antonius who is one of the main interlocutors in Cicero's *De Oratore*. (TIMOTHY BARNES)

R. Andrew McDonald, editor. *History, Literature, and Music in Scotland, 700–1560*
University of Toronto Press. xx, 238. $45.00

A decade or so ago, a slim miscellany of specialized essays on medieval Scotland might have seemed timely and practicable; now, few publishers indeed, even Scottish ones, would commit themselves to such a project. Undaunted, the title of this book sweeps dramatically across disciplines and centuries. *History, Literature, and Music in Scotland* does not, significantly, point out a thematic path along which readers may negotiate ruggedly unfamilar Scottish terrain. Rather than establish such a theme in the introduction to the volume, the editor celebrates the recent burgeoning of historical research and writing about medieval Scotland, and offers this collection of essays as instances of the vitality and diversity of Scottish historiography today. Taken together, the editor declares, these essays exemplify the critical assemblage of disparate sources. Any reader not already comfortably ensconced within the discipline of Scottish history may be forgiven for being unconvinced by such assertions of cohesion. Not often enough do these essays take into account the possibility that the reader may be unfamiliar with the material: convolutions of chronology and topic frustrate the reader not already at home with the specific topic. Too often, a review of the state of the question about the authorship and transmission of quite abstruse texts obviates any more enabling and inviting presentation of the important topics broached in the essays themselves. The editor has not articulated a dynamic for the book beyond its serving as a showcase for Scottish studies. Consequently, the writing often lacks cohesion: crowded background instead of significant focus.

Some of the essays in this book hesitate between general and specialized interest, and end up neither good introductions nor especially groundbreaking studies. Promising an effectively tight focus on the depiction in saga and legend of St Magnus of Orkney, George M. Brunsden's 'Earls and Saints' leads its reader through a cluttered review of events and sources. R. Andrew McDonald sets out in 'Soldiers Most Unfortunate' to identify the sources and significance of regional hostility towards the pro-Norman Scottish monarchy of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, but surveys the opposition of the MacHeths and the MacWilliams to the Canmore dynasty. Margaret McIntyre reviews historians' criticisms of Margaret Tudor before alluding to Louise Fradenburg's trenchantly revisionary studies of the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

controversial queen; Fradenburg's attention to literary depictions of Margaret is unfortunately not reflected here. Here, involved contexts substitute for specific findings.

Several essays in the collection purport to develop connections between literature and history in medieval Scotland. At the start of 'The Scottish Gaze,' Benjamin T. Hudson promises to identify the 'literary flavour' to the historical tradition founded in Iona and continued at Dunkeld; specific literary qualities – sobriquets, archaisms, refrains, and ethical comment – only begin to emerge at the end of this essay. In 'Off quhat nacioun art thow?' – studying the assertion of national feeling in Hary's *Wallace* – Richard J. Moll draws deeply on R. James Goldstein's *The Matter of Scotland* but insufficiently on recent research into Lowland attitudes towards Gaelic language and culture. The recurrent derivativeness of the work seems at times inadvertent: in 'Carnival at Court,' on William Dunbar's dream vision 'Off Februar the fyiftene nycht,' Mary E. Robbins indicates no awareness of the by-now standard Bakhtinian readings of Dunbar by Deanna Evans and Joanne Norman, and surveys ground thoroughly covered already.

It is thus a pleasure to come upon Elizabeth Ewan's 'Many Injurious Words.' Subtly contextualized, skilfully paced, and rich in implication, this essay advances our understanding of the motives and provocations for late-medieval Scottish women's recourse to verbal and physical assault. Likewise, Andrea Budgey's engrossing survey of the evidence for the performance of instrumental music in medieval Scotland promisingly emphasizes the continued Irish influence on Scottish musicians. In sum, Ewan's enlivening catholicity of reference and instance is too little emulated: for all its celebration of the rise of Scottish studies in the last decade, there is a depressingly retrospective feeling about this volume. (DAVID J. PARKINSON)

Ilse E. Friesen. *The Female Crucifix: Images of St. Wilgefortis since the Middle Ages* Wilfrid Laurier University Press. x, 174. $45.00

This wide-ranging, well-organized, and clearly written book examines from an art-historical perspective the cult of a once widely venerated (and now little known) saint, who went under the name not only of Wilgefortis (probably derived either from *virgo fortis* 'strong virgin' or from *hilge vratz* 'holy face'), but also Kümmernis, Uncumber, Ontcommer, and Liberata (all of which mean 'unencumbered,' 'freed'). The saint's legend, with some regional and temporal variations, is based on the figure of a young woman, daughter of a heathen king of Sicily (or Provence), and promised in marriage to a king of Portugal. Converted to Christianity, Wilgefortis vowed to remain a virgin like the Virgin Mary. She was imprisoned and tortured on her father's orders because of her refusal to enter into this marriage and

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

received the 'gift' of a beard from Christ, so that she would no longer be attractive as a marriage partner. Her father, infuriated at her deformation, had her crucified. This story, in conjunction with various local accretions, made Wilgefortis the object of devotion by those in trouble, especially those facing enforced marriages, by the raped and abused, by prisoners and soldiers, and by the dying.

Friesen carefully traces the likely origins of the art associated with Wilgefortis – paintings and sculptures – beginning with the famous *Volto Santo* crucifix in Lucca, Italy, dating from the twelfth or thirteenth century. She shows how the robed figure on the cross, with its slightly swollen breasts, eventually came to be confused with the female saint, who then developed an iconography of her own. The cult stretched from England to the Tyrol and flourished in the late Middle Ages, even extending into the Baroque era, before being officially discouraged. In an effort to track down its artistic remains, Friesen made several field trips, some of them to remote parts of the Tyrol, uncovering works long forgotten, some damaged, some locked away. The central chapters of the book focus on England, Holland, Bavaria (Neufahrn, Burghausen), and western Austria. Accompanying her discussion of the cult and its artistic representations is a series of twenty-four plates, conveniently keyed in the margins of the text, many of the pieces resurrected and photographed by Friesen herself.

The concluding chapters broaden the previous discussion of the bearded saint to the phenomenon of hirsutism in general and female beard-growing in particular, both past and present (its origins in trauma, both physical and emotional, are medically well documented) and to twentieth-century religious concerns with gender stereotyping and androgyny as reflected in art, literature, and music. Among other instances, *The Crucified Woman* (1976), now installed on the campus of Emmanuel College at Victoria University in the University of Toronto, and the controversies surrounding it, are discussed, and mention is made of the appearance of St Wilgefortis in Robertson Davies' *Fifth Business.*

This book is an important, learned, and multidisciplinary contribution to our knowledge of the medieval cult of saints: Friesen has restored for us an aspect of medieval devotion in danger of being lost. The book includes a bibliography and an index. The Wilfrid Laurier University Press is to be congratulated for its careful and attractive production of her work, both text and plates; my only irritation is that the notes are placed at the end, rather than at the foot of the pages (easier for the publisher, no doubt, but not for the reader). (PAULINE A. THOMPSON)

Jennifer Margaret Fraser. *Rite of Passage in the Narratives of Dante and Joyce*
University Press of Florida. xx, 256. US $55.00

The figure of the diptych, a two-panelled folding support for iconography and/or writing, structures this intertextual study of Dante and Joyce – focusing chiefly on Dante as a reader of Virgil and Joyce as a reader of Dante. As Jennifer Margaret Fraser warns, Dante and Joyce are two names that 'wish to signify' in the context of her reading 'an arena of contending initiatory figures who are engaged in the write of passage: the pilgrim, the reader, the writer-in-progress, the novice poet, the author.'

Where the image of the diptych suggests parataxis, its hinges impart to it a strong sense of binding through the circular narrative of initiation, which results, as expected, in a full circle for the *Divine Comedy* and in a spiral of centrifugal and centripetal forces in Joyce's work. This spiral uncoils in the last chapter ('A Portrait in 3-D') into a further *tessera* related to Dante Gabriel Rossetti, which partially turns the image of the diptych into a triptych.

In this work, initiation is intended as the sum of strategies that turn a pilgrim into an author as well as a psychoanalytical/anthropological pattern that leads from womb to tomb back to womb – in an attempted reconciliation between the maternal bodily womb and masculine imagination. The maternal thus becomes a complex and contradictory figure for intertextuality, insofar as it signifies both imitation and creativity. Not by chance, then, the analysis of both panels begins with the theme of the embryo. The whole Dante panel, indeed, is structured around the reading of the controversial embryology canto, *Purgatorio* 25, which Fraser perceives as spanning and spilling over the whole theological and poetic structure of the poem. Subsequently, the Dantean intertext provides the input for an 'embryonic' reading of the construction of Stephen Daedalus's character in the Joyce panel. Around this central pattern of the embryo, the other hinges tell familiar tales of fall and redemption, conversion, nurturing and threatening mothers, intertextual sirens that allure writer as well as reader astray.

As it often happens when a strong logic is applied to rich, open, and all-encompassing texts, this reading leads to both insights and forced interpretations, as does the approach of the analysis itself, a deeply textual one, which follows, playfully and almost metonymically, words and rhymes as they bounce within and through the works of Dante and Joyce. This kind of analysis provides a strong testimony to one of the most important qualities of Dante's and Joyce's works: in Fraser's words, 'they rescript us as writers, and in so doing they offer us multiple keys that open up myriad doors that were supposedly closed and locked.' Certainly this study shows how Dante's and Joyce's works are open, overflowing texts,
which strongly empower the reader to trace his/her own pattern and

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

instruct him/her on the endless possibilities of the *fieri*: whether this openness is yet another textual siren who leads astray those who are, in Dante's words, 'in piccioletta barca' (*Paradiso*, II, 1) is a question worth addressing. (ELENA LOMBARDI)

Sheila Delany. *Chaucer and the Jews: Sources, Contexts, Meanings*
Routledge. xi, 258 US $90.00

This collection is a timely contribution to the current debate regarding constructions of alterity during the later Middle Ages. During the last decade, studies of Orientalism and postcoloniality in medieval texts have begun to intersect with studies of medieval anti-Semitism, giving rise to new insights regarding how medieval views of 'the Jew' both influenced and were influenced by conceptions of 'Saracen' identity. Sheila Delany's new volume seeks to contribute to this debate by providing a selection of articles, both new and previously published, centred on the canonical figure of medieval English literature. Only five of the essays, however, actually treat Chaucer's writings; the others deal with such topics as depictions of Jews in fourteenth- and fifteenth-century England, use of Hebrew authorities in Christian exegesis, historical treatment of Jews in medieval England, and pedagogical approaches to teaching medieval texts (such as Chaucer's *Prioress's Tale*) which, for modern readers, are disturbingly anti-Semitic. The wide range of the essays dilutes the focus of the volume, as the editor acknowledges in her introduction: 'the volume considers much more than Chaucer per se ... because I have sought to challenge the idea of the "author per se."' Delany's stated goal is to 'embed the author in a network of practices and discourses constitutive of his own.' A laudable goal, but one which is incompletely realized in this volume, which lacks a sufficiently strong editorial framework to explicate how Chaucer's work emerges from (and, perhaps, participates in) late medieval discourses of anti-Semitism and anti-Judaism.

The essays collected in the first of the volume's three sections, centred on Chaucer's own writings, are of uneven quality. Delany's own 'Chaucer's Prioress, the Jews, and the Muslims' and Sylvia Tomasch's 'Postcolonial Chaucer and the Virtual Jew' are the most substantial articles in a section which, on the whole, is rather weak. The second section, titled 'Chaucerian Contexts,' includes some of the most stimulating material in the whole book; unfortunately, its connection to the stated theme of the volume is tangential. Especially noteworthy are two new excellent essays by Mary Dove ('Chaucer and the Translation of the Jewish Scriptures') and Denise Despres ('The Protean Jew in the Vernon Manuscript'). In spite of the title, Dove's fascinating essay has very little to do with Chaucer, being a study of how late fourteenth-century translators of the Vulgate Bible drew upon

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Hebrew exegetical techniques in their own explication of the literal sense of holy scripture, as well as their justification of why a vernacular translation should be made available. Despres has written several important articles on literary and pictorial depictions of Jews in medieval texts, revealing how Christian devotion to the Virgin was frequently predicated on the destruction of Jews, either metaphorically or actually. This new essay examines the famous Vernon manuscript, illuminating the relationship of the anti-Judaism of several of the works collected there to the overall devotional framework of the miscellany. The final section, 'Chaucer, Jews, and Us,' is a coda devoted to modern reactions to medieval anti-Semitism. The two new essays, on teaching Chaucer to Orthodox students in the New York area, are rather anecdotal. Colin Richmond's 'Englishness and Medieval Anglo-Jewry,' however, is a moving response by a British historian to the attempted erasure of Jewish history in England, both in actual history (during the thirteenth century) and historiographically (during the second half of the twentieth century). Five of the previously published essays (Richmond, Narin van Court, Mandel, Delany, and Rose) appeared within the last decade, most of them within other essay collections, which makes it difficult to understand why they are reprinted here. Seminal essays on the book's topic by Steven Kruger and Louise Fradenberg do not appear (although Narin van Court's essay, often cited in current literature, is wisely included). The collection thus falls between two stools, as it were, being neither a collection of classic essays on an important topic, nor a group of new responses to the state of the field. *Chaucer and the Jews* inconveniently lacks a list of the original venues of the previously published essays (useful for the preparation of bibliographies). Most frustrating is the lack of corresponding page numbers for citations of previously published articles within other essays in the volume: for example, when Tomasch refers to Delany (82n15), the page cited refers to the original publication in *Medieval Encounters*, rather than the reproduction of Delany's essay found in the present volume. A similar reference to Narin van Court appears in Despres (161n6). It would have been useful to update the notes to the previously published essays; unfortunately, the only updated note appears in Delany's own reprinted essay, referring to her work in progress (57n42).
(SUZANNE CONKLIN AKBARI)

James M. Gibson, editor. *Kent: Diocese of Canterbury*
Records of Early English Drama.University of Toronto Press. 3 volumes.
ccxxiv, 1664. $500.00

The Records of Early English Drama (REED) series has transformed scholarly understanding of the history of English drama before 1642. Combing private, civic, and ecclesiastical records, county by county (and sometimes

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

city by city), the several editors have assembled a mass of previously unpublished information that is gradually prompting a radical rewriting of the history of early English theatre.

With the publication of documents from the diocese of Canterbury, REED has now produced sixteen sets of records since the series began in 1979. This is the first to require a full three volumes.

The editor, James Gibson, sums up the ambitious and painstaking scope of these volumes well: 'This edition attempts to include all records of dramatic, musical, and ceremonial activity before 1642 in the diocese of Canterbury: records of professional travelling players and minstrels; records of amateur town and parish plays, liturgical plays, household plays, and school plays; records of musical performances by professional travelling musicians and by civic musicians, including waits and people responsible for horn blowing, drumming, and rough music; records of civic ceremony incorporating musical or mimetic activity, including marching watches with pageants, triumphs and festive celebrations, royal visits, bullbaiting, and bearbaiting; and ceremonial customs incorporating mimetic or minstrel activity, such as the boy bishop celebrations, Hocktide rituals, and summer games.' Remarkably, yet another complete edition in the REED series will be devoted to Kent: Diocese of Rochester.

By way of introduction, Gibson provides an overview of the regional historical background; a lengthy summary of the major discoveries arising from the records, grouped by genre; details of the hundreds of documents consulted; and a brief explanation of editorial procedures. The extracts from the records follow, grouped largely by boroughs and parishes in alphabetical sequence. Various appendices contain supplementary material, such as biographical information found in the Kent records on John Bale and Christopher Marlowe (very little, unfortunately). Finally, there are translations of all records originally given in Latin or French; extensive endnotes; an essay on the patrons and travelling companies mentioned in the records; Latin and English glossaries; and an essential (and very helpful) index.

Many fascinating details emerge from these records. One, to which Gibson draws attention in his summary introduction, is the existence of a popular and longstanding New Romney passion play, first mentioned in 1463–64. Unlike many other religious plays in the diocese, the New Romney passion play survived the early suppression of traditional drama by reforming clergy. It was still being performed in 1560 and, perhaps, as late as 1568. 'This survival of the New Romney passion play well into the first decade of Elizabeth's reign,' Gibson notes, 'resulted from the solid support of the play by the wealthy and powerful men of the town's oligarchy.' No doubt their support had much to do with the profitability of the play. Receipts from four days of performance in 1560 came to '25 12s 10d, – which, at the probable gate price of a penny a head meant at least

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

6,000 people descending on the innkeepers, hostelers, and victualers' of a town whose population was only 200.

The New Romney 'playbook' is mentioned frequently in the records, but unfortunately has not survived. Gibson, however, has been able to piece together from the records a credible reconstruction of 'the probable characters, structure, and staging of the New Romney passion play.' There were, apparently, 'four separate plays within the passion play,' each having its own day. The narrative, based largely on the Gospel of John, began with the early ministry of Christ and ended with his ascension. The two central days were devoted to his arrest, trial, crucifixion, and descent into hell. At least seven fixed stages were required for the passion play's performance.

Other religious plays in the diocese included 'a miracle play of Saint Mary' at Boxley Abbey in 1408–9, a 'play of St Christina' at Bethersden in 1521–22, and Lydd's parish play of St George, to which several references survive between 1456 and 1534. Like New Romney's passion play, Lydd's saint's play was performed over four days. Whether this involved four performances of the same play or, as in New Romney, a longer play in four parts is not clear.

Lydd and New Romney also feature in a tantalizing series of references to 'the St Nicholas bishop of the town of Romney.' Although 'no reference to the custom survives either in the New Romney town records or in the parish records of St Nicholas' Church' in New Romney, many references are found in the chamberlain's account book in nearby Lydd between 1428 and 1485. Since the boy bishop and his retinue entertained the people of Lydd over the Christmas season, one assumes they also amused the parishioners of New Romney. In the latter case, however, they were not paid and so failed to find a place in the records.

One puzzling feature of the Kent volumes is the small number of references to Robin Hood plays and games, so popular elsewhere in England. In Kent, there is just one reference to the plays – performance, from Hythe in 1532, and one prohibition, from Dover in 1527. There are, however, numerous references to morris dancers, and, in that context, on three occasions, to a cross-dressed Maid Marian. From Canterbury, in 1589, comes the information that the role was played by a twelve-year-old boy 'dressed in womans apparell' and braided hair.

The price of these three volumes is unfortunately prohibitive for most individuals. Nevertheless, library copies will provide – along with the other volumes in the REED series – a treasure trove of detailed information for scholars of early English drama. Gibson is to be commended for completing a thorough and painstaking research project and for providing a thoughtful interpretation of his material. The REED editors are to be commended for another addition to their invaluable series. (MAX HARRIS)

Janet Hill. *Stages and Playgoers: From Guild Plays to Shakespeare*

McGill-Queen's University Press. xii, 242. $65.00

'Loved the movie. Hated the audience,' reads the caption of a *New Yorker* cartoon current as I write this, below the picture of two couples meeting in a cinema lobby. That such alienation is not solely modern is indicated by certain things Hamlet has to say about plays and their reception, but Janet Hill tends to write as if audiences were homogeneous groups, responding to early plays in concert. Her discussions of how plays work on their observers and listeners seem not to leave much room for differences of sensibility. Medieval English audiences especially, as she represents them, sound like salt-of-the-earth, no-nonsense types, who know what they like and have an immediate rapport with the performers. Indeed, the audience itself, she claims, was the real subject of medieval drama: 'When each guild play ended, its audiences were still on stage. They continued to live on that stage for the rest of their lives.'

The writing in this book, then, is given to the metaphorical and the rhapsodic. It's fair enough to claim that the language and style of some medieval English religious plays engage with contemporary demotic energy – this is the 'realism' of 'the York Realist' – so long as one also recognizes that there are some fairly long and tedious stretches of the York plays which are simply rhetorical monologues, with all the dramatic appeal of versified lectures. A modern academic audience might tolerate such stuff for a while, fortified by antiquarian curiosity, but it is hard for any performer to play it with sustained animation, and it is tough on its listeners. Why should this have been less true in 1503 than in 2003? If Janet Hill knows the answer she doesn't tell us, since nearly all her evidence about audiences is inferred from play texts, and the only texts she uses to do this are those still recognized as genuinely dramatic and accessible pieces. This circularity produces a medieval audience with remarkably modern critical tastes.

The central idea tested in the book is that of 'open address,' a term Hill is careful to distinguish from direct address, but which over the course of the entire work proves to be considerably elastic. A good deal of the argument also turns on pronouns: how 'we,' pronounced from the stage, can be inclusive of the audience, in distinction to the exclusive 'you,' the address of choice, as she sees it, in the plays of the professionals. Once again too much seems to hang solely on the evidence of dramatic texts, and when one arrives at the Shakespearean period the distinction seems to call for consideration of other formalities of language between performers and audiences. 'Our play' is presented to the audience with respect and deference to its judgment; Ben Jonson's prologues consistently address the listeners as guests, here to enjoy themselves, met by hospitable and generous hosts. Theatre should have the shared enjoyment of a feast.

The book is not very up to date in its scholarship. Serious reading seems to have stopped eight years before publication. Hill confidently assumes

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

that the plays at Wakefield were those preserved in the Towneley manuscript, a view in need of some defending these days. Though gratitude is expressed to the Records of Early English Drama project, the third chapter opens with the assertion that 'by the last quarter of the sixteenth century the story of the English professional theatre was primarily one of London,' exactly counter to recent emphases inspired by REED work. Slips of fact are made throughout, including the bibliography, which is clumsily laid out, and confuses, for example, the work of the theatre historian Richard Southern with that of the medieval political and social historian Richard William Southern under one authorial entry. And what a Lancashire audience may have been doing in sixteenth-century Chester is puzzling. An early modern theatre outing? (JOHN H. ASTINGTON)

Renate Blumenfeld-Kosinski, Luise von Flotow, and Daniel Russell, editors.
The Politics of Translation in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance
University of Ottawa Press 2001. 222. $24.95

This lively collection of essays presents itself as arising at the intersection of translation studies with medieval and early modern studies. It appears in the 'Perspectives on Translation Series' from the University of Ottawa Press, a series committed to furthering the 'cultural turn' in translation studies away from predominantly linguistic analyses and towards social and political accounts of translation. Simultaneously, it belongs to a series from the Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies. The essays themselves, almost all by members of departments of literature, do not situate themselves in relation to developments in translation studies. They continue the attentiveness to the cultural significance of translation that has long characterized the study of the Middle Ages and Renaissance, periods when *translatio* was a dominant cultural trope. The interdisciplinary dialogue may be one-sided, but this volume augurs well for further convergence of these fields.

To read these eleven essays (based on papers given at a 1997 conference) is to return to highly charged moments of cultural change in Europe: the Christianization of the Roman Empire; the rise of monastic, aristocratic, and merchant communities; the emergence of national identities; and the effects of exploration, printing, and humanism. Translation into French is best represented, but there is also work that focuses on Latin, Greek, Italian, and English (Old, Middle, and Early Modern). As Luise von Flotow points out in her introduction, the essays are concerned not only with confrontations between discrete cultural systems, but also with the way particular individuals intervene in this process. Some figures are familiar: Alfred the Great, Erasmus, Shakespeare. More exciting are profiles of lesser-known writers: Hasan al-Wazzan recording his African journeys in broken Italian, or Etienne Dolet burned at the stake for his translation of a single phrase.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

These are detailed case studies, of two types. Most of them compare a particular translation to its source, explaining changes in light of the author's aims or situation. The textual comparisons focus on a range of features: from lexis or grammar to concepts or content. Similarly varied are the strategies for explaining alterations: the subtle, or not so subtle, intrusion of the author's moral concerns; insight into the meaning of the original; the wilful erasure of cultural difference. Of particularly interest is the pair of essays on Montaigne's translation of Sebond's *Theologia naturalis*. The elegant article by Philip Hendrick uncovers how Montaigne's stylistic changes register an intellectual program quite different from Sebond's – more concerned with human agency, while more sceptical of systematizing dogma. Where Hendrick's piece overstates its case, claiming that Sebond and Montaigne are representative of medieval and Renaissance world-views, the essay by Edward Tilson provides a useful corrective, refining our sense of what makes Sebond's work, and Montaigne's translation of it, unique.

The other approach focuses not on specific translations but on how the very notion of translation took shape in a particular place and time. The essays of this sort recall current work on medieval vernacularity and on Renaissance ideologies of rhetoric. Here the collection moves beyond the appraisal of particular translations in order to consider how a target culture, as a cultural system, both enables and regulates the work of translators. Especially compelling is Andrew Taylor's sophisticated discussion of the fifteenth-century English writer Reginald Pecock. Taylor shows that the charged issue of biblical translation, as patrolled by church authorities, lies behind Pecock's writerly career, even though Pecock never translated the Bible or took a stand on the issue.

The title of this volume deserves a caveat: 'politics' is construed in the widest possible sense, where for 'political' one could substitute 'cultural,' 'ethical,' or even 'hermeneutical.' Only a concept so large could contain the various concerns of these essays. And it is hard to picture it being news to any reader that, 'no translation is an innocent, transparent rendering of the original.' But every collection demands some rhetorical posture, and this one succeeds in enabling a set of thoughtful studies on a topic of current import in several fields. (WILL ROBINS)

Marsilio Ficino. *Platonic Theology: Volume 2, Books V–VIII*.
English translation by Michael J.B. Allen with John Warden.
Latin text edited by James Hankins with William Bowen
Harvard University Press. 416. US $29.95

Marsilio Ficino (1433–99) was the most prominent and respected of the humanist intellectuals at the court of Lorenzo de'Medici during the height of the Florentine Renaissance. In 1462, Cosimo de'Medici had given Ficino

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

the villa at Careggi, where Ficino established the Platonic Academy. Ficino and his disciples devoted themselves to the revival of Platonism, an endeavour that they believed would revitalize Christianity, primarily by inspiring a more comprehensive understanding of the nature of the soul. In 1463 Ficino undertook the first translation into Latin of Plato's complete works (a project that lasted more than six years), as well a number of other texts written in the Platonic tradition, including those of Plotinus and Pseudo-Dionysius, the Aeropagite. By the early 1470s Ficino, already an eminent philosopher, astrologer, physician, and musician, was preparing to enter the priesthood. It was during this period that he wrote the *Platonic Theology* (subtitled *On the Immortality of the Soul*), a work that he himself considered his *magnum opus*. The longest of Ficino's philosophical treatises, comprising eighteen books, the *Platonic Theology* is his most extensive articulation of 'the essence' and permanence of the soul. The work is strongly indebted to the Neoplatonic tradition originating in Plotinus and Proclus, and to Christian theology, particularly the works of Augustine, Aquinas, and the Areopagite. The *Platonic Theology* is Ficino's fullest attempt to reconcile Platonism and Christianity, a reconciliation that he hoped would bring about a philosophical revival akin to a golden age of theological metaphysics.

The *Platonic Theology* was published in Florence in 1482; it was republished in Venice in 1491, and subsequently republished as part of Ficino's *Opera Omnia* (Basel, 1561 and 1576; Paris 1641). The only modern edition of the complete *Platonic Theology* is Raymond Marcel's three-volume edition (Paris, 1964–70). Michael J.B. Allen's translation (with John Warden) and James Hankins's edition (with William Bowen) of the *Platonic Theology: Volume 2, Books V–VIII* is their second of five planned volumes of Ficino's complete text.

The volumes are being published by the new I Tatti Renaissance Library, whose laudable project, inaugurated in 2002, has been the publication of a series of English translations of influential Latin texts written in Italy between the fourteenth and seventeenth centuries that have remained untranslated and known by only a small number of scholars. The general aim of the series is the production of English translations that will appeal both to specialists and non-specialists, and that will enrich our understanding and appreciation of Renaissance cultural production.

The overall organization of Allen's translation and Hankins's edition of the five-volume *Platonic Theology* is as follows: volume 1 contains books I–IV and Allen and Hankins's general critical introduction to the entire work; volume 2 contains books V–VII; volume 3 will contain books IX–XII; volume 4, books XIII–XV; and volume 5, books XVI–XVIII 'with some attendant texts.' Volume 5 will also contain a comprehensive author/subject index, an index of sources, and a concordance to the 1576 Basel edition and to Marcel's edition.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Like volume 1 (which I reviewed in *UTQ* 72:1), volume 2 is exemplary in the quality of both the translation and the editorial apparatus. The text is presented in a dual-language format, with the English translation on the opposite page to the Latin text. The chapters in both the Latin text and the translation are developed according to paragraphs, also facilitating comparison between the translation and the original. The volume includes a section of crisp and informative explanatory notes (one set to the Latin text and one to the translation), a selected bibliography of influential philosophical studies of Ficino's works, and an index of names. The general introduction covers a broad range of topics, including Ficino's sources; the philosophical, historical, and political contexts of Ficino's metaphysics and his 'missionary goals'; the open-ended structure of the work, which is consistent both with 'a medieval formatting' and the Platonic 'dialogic inquiry'; and Ficino's 'intended audience' of '*ingeniosi*,' the young scholars 'who were the Florentine counterparts to Socrates' most gifted interlocutors and questioners, and who required intellectual conviction' for their 'acceptance of' and 'fervent commitment to' Christianity.

Allen and Hankins's commendable scholarly endeavour will be invaluable not only to individuals interested in the legacy of Ficino's contributions to Renaissance Neoplatonic philosophy, but also to those interested more generally in questions of early modern intertextualities and interdisciplinary cross-fertilization. (VIVIANA COMENSOLI)

Elmar J. Kremer and Michael J. Latzer, editors.
The Problem of Evil in Early Modern Philosophy
University of Toronto Press 2001. viii, 180. $60.00

In the popular understanding of what philosophers spend their time thinking about, the question of theodicy – how a perfectly good and perfectly powerful God can allow evil – holds a place of prominence. This is sometimes a source of surprise and irritation for academic philosophers, many of whom long ago abandoned questions about God in favour of more practical concerns, such as why more people are not socialist or how many clones of Hitler one must make before cloning itself is judged unethical. However this may be, the popular view is not entirely wrong: in recent years there has been a growing scholarly interest in the philosophy of religion, particularly in connection with seventeenth- and eighteenth-century thought, and *The Problem of Evil in Early Modern Philosophy* provides some fine examples of the substantial work being done in this area.

The volume brings together nine papers originally delivered as part of a conference on the problem of evil in early modern thought held at the University of Toronto in late 1999. Following historical order, the collection begins with Francisco Suarez, and moves smoothly through essays on Descartes, Spinoza, Malebranche, Pierre Bayle, and Leibniz. The editors

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

have done an excellent job; the papers here fit together so well that one sometimes has the impression that the authors are responding to one another. The scholarship is solid and frequently quite original, and the writing is clear and free of jargon in every case but one (Robert C. Sleigh, Jr's piece on Leibniz, which employs a number of ponderous academic gimmicks).

Not surprisingly, the author of the *Theodicy* is given more sustained attention than the other thinkers considered in the book. Of the three essays on Leibniz, Donald Rutherford's piece on the philosopher's debt to the stoics is the standout. Rather than focusing on the justifications for God's action and inaction in the world, Rutherford turns the discussion around and concentrates on the implications that knowledge of divine order has for human happiness. His argument develops so elegantly that one almost misses the striking conclusion: Leibniz's attempt to reconcile his stoic affinities with Christianity reveals in him a strain of progressive, even radical, thought which ultimately calls into question the authenticity of his Christianity. The deep tension in early modern attempts to combine classical thought with biblical religion is very fertile ground, and Rutherford's cageyness about resolving this conflict is helpfully suggestive of how the issue might be explored further.

The collection's two essays on Spinoza are also extremely well done. Graeme Hunter's thoughtful and rather daring article on Spinoza's relationship to the Christian church draws on a careful reading of the *Tractatus Theologico-Politicus*, a work which many Spinozists have failed to consider sufficiently. On the strength of the discussion here, there is good reason to think that Hunter's forthcoming monograph reconciling the two texts will be highly valuable.

Steven Nadler's piece shows how Spinoza reworks the theodicy developed by the medieval Jewish philosophers, accepting their account of knowledge and happiness but rejecting their solution. Why does virtue suffer while the vicious flourish? For many theists, the response to this version of the problem of evil is to maintain that virtue, obedience to God's law, is not rewarded here on earth, but in a world to come. Spinoza, however, rejects the personal immortality of the soul and is therefore required to make the more difficult argument that virtue is its own reward. This issue is at least as old as Plato, but Nadler's treatment of it is fresh and lively, demonstrating with enviable clarity the interconnections between the religious, ethical, and epistemological aspects of Spinoza's account.

To be sure, those outside the field – provided they have any inclination at all to read in this area – may find some of these essays taxing. Still, anyone with a background in early modern thought or the philosophy of religion will find enough engaging and illuminating work in *The Problem of Evil in Early Modern Philosophy* to make it well worthwhile. (MARTIN NEMOIANU)

Christina Luckyj. *'A Moving Rhetoricke': Gender and Silence in Early Modern England*
Manchester University Press. viii, 198. $69.95

Breaking away from feminist critics' claims that in early modern texts feminine silence equals subservience, Christina Luckyj destabilizes silence as a signifier by examining the 'semantic elasticity' of silence in Western philosophical thought. Recognizing that early modern silence was 'an unstable and highly contested site,' she posits a sixteenth-century paradigm shift from what she refers to as 'rhetorical' to 'antirhetorical' constructions of silence, and considers the impact of this shift on gender construction. In the complex history of silence, she finds a 'multifaceted lens' through which to examine gender politics.

Luckyj identifies two prevailing models of 'rhetorical' silence: silence as impotence and as eloquence. Citing examples that jump from Cicero to Petrarch, Thomas Wright to Shakespeare, and Plato to Plutarch, she clearly demonstrates that these models of silence, 'defined by and contained within the rhetorical paradigm,' have a long lineage. According to Luckyj, movements such as Ramism, Neo-platonism, and Puritanism championed not only a growing distrust of rhetoric but also a 'new validation of silence'; as silence became 'antirhetorical,' it became inscrutable, unreadable, ungovernable, and profoundly subversive. Drawing on a range of specific sixteenth-century examples, including the famous silence of Sir Thomas More, and the abuses of the *ex officio* oath, she argues that silence in early modern England became firmly associated with 'the political resistance of the emerging subject.'

In chapter 2 Luckyj considers the potential advantages for early modern women of the shifting multivalency of silence. In an age that increasingly distrusted rhetoric as an instrument of political control, silence provided an 'inscrutable site of resistance,' a 'prudent self-containment' to which men were encouraged to aspire. As men increasingly adopted the traditionally feminine virtues of silence and discretion, these virtues became 'elevated by association,' and the traditionally gendered categories of active male speech and passive female silence became confounded.

In examining 'Silence and Drama,' Luckyj claims she will explore the shifting inscription of early modern silences 'on the body of the actor,' but she mentions very few actors and spends regrettably little time examining embodied silence within the semiotic richness of stage performance. Instead she focuses on traces of silence as recorded in the lines of specific characters. Silent characters such as Lavinia and Cordelia are prominent in her argument 'not as female subjects but as embodiments of masculine scepticism about the limits of masculine rhetoric and hermeneutics.' In the works of male playwrights, she finds fascinatingly contradictory readings of

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

feminine silence as defiance rather than subjection, a seductive strategy rather than a traditional sign of feminine modesty: contradictions that aptly reflect an ambiguity in early modern texts, 'which demand that a woman be both inviolable and available.'

The book's final chapter explores the ways in which early modern women reflect upon the complex relationship of silence and gender in their writing. In the writing of Askew, Wroth, Cary, and others, Luckyj finds evidence of feminine silence as both a bridle and a veil. She concludes in an epilogue with reference to Ovid's Philomela: 'a classical precedent for conflating feminine silence as impotence with feminine silence as agency.'

Luckyj's designations of silences as 'rhetorical' and 'antirhetorical' sometimes prove problematic, for her uses of these terms are almost as multivalent as the silences she describes. In some places she equates 'antirhetorical' with 'anti-Ciceronian,' while in others she defines it as 'unreadable,' and proceeds to read 'unreadable' silences with claimed accuracy. While making a clear case for the heterogeneity of early modern uses of silence, she overlooks the heterogeneity of early modern uses of rhetoric, and in doing so she denies herself the opportunity to explore the considerable significance to her argument of early modern women's increasing access to rhetorical study. Shifting from the spoken silences of drama to the written 'silences' of prose, she cites several rhetorically self-conscious texts by women that may well leave readers wondering how such texts can helpfully be designated 'unreadable' or 'antirhetorical.'

While her terms sometimes obscure her argument, her span of examples is impressive and her evidence of the 'semantic elasticity' of early modern silence is compelling. She admirably succeeds in her aim of making it 'more difficult to refer unthinkingly to early modern women as "chaste, silent, and obedient."' (JANE FREEMAN)

Germaine Warkentin and Carolyn Podruchny, editors. *Decentering the Renaissance: Canada and Europe in Multidisciplinary Perspective 1500–1700*
University of Toronto Press, 2001. xii, 388, $35.00, $15.00

This is a fine collection of nineteen essays that have their origins in papers presented at a conference in 1996. It was clearly a fascinating gathering, and despite the diversity of topics in the individual contributions, their authors have gained much from reflecting on each other's work in preparing the final versions of their essays. Though drawing scholars from a range of disciplines – including archaeology, history, literary studies, sociology, and geography – there is a keen sense of the contributors trying to reach beyond the limits of their individual fields and participating in a wider but coherent project. Although some readers may be tempted merely to dip into this book to follow research in their own areas, I strongly

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

recommend reading the entire volume. While this collection makes strong claims for attention on the excellence of its individual parts, it makes even more significant claims because of the sum of these parts.

The central premise of *Decentring the Renaissance* is that scholarship has too readily accommodated familiar Eurocentric conceptual frameworks about the New World when investigating early modern Canada. The idea of civilization resting in the rediscovery of classical antiquity in Italy and spreading out to the peripheries – one of the traditional cornerstones for thinking about the Renaissance – needs to be reviewed by attending to evidence that interrogates European perspectives. Fundamental to this endeavour is a reconsideration of Native peoples' experience of Europeans, locating evidence from oral traditions and the archaeological record, and paying attention to the different historiographies involved. The aim is not to replace European accounts but to reposition them so that their assumptions are not so overwhelmingly dominant that they are imagined to be the only ones available. The collection further acknowledges that much modern scholarship about early modern Canada is distorted because it is governed by models that homogenize all New World encounters. In an outstanding essay, Mary C. Fuller, for example, re-examines Newfoundland and its fishing industry. Despite attempts by arm-chair voyagers (Anne Lake Prescott's consideration of William Vaughan's *Newfoundland* in the volume is a wonderful companion piece to Fuller) to present its fishing wealth in terms of a classical 'golden land,' here was an environment that runs against the grain of most colonial experience. Newfoundland was 'anti-romantic': its discovery by Europeans and its subsequent development rested largely with anonymous sailors; it did not have a single grandee to claim its entry into European understanding. Newfoundland's wealth was not based on gaining and cultivating land but in the less possessive activity of fishing. But, as some contemporaries argued, the Newfoundland trade brought in more wealth than the precious metals of the West Indies. Certainly more Europeans visited its waters each year than travelled between Spain and its colonies.

Anti-Romantic might generally be applied to the way the collection reflects the conditions of early encounters between Europeans and Natives in Canada. The small scale and instability of the ventures is what constantly confronts the reader. For instance, despite later European celebrations of the Jesuits' and other orders' attempts to evangelize among Native peoples, records show that only about two hundred clerics left Europe for New France between 1610 and 1658 and many of these were forcibly sent and had little interest in the project. The scholarly gains from such demystifying reconsiderations are considerable. As these essays reveal, the precariousness of the European enterprise in Canada meant that interrelations with the Natives were paramount to survival. Both groups lived in uneasy accommodation with one another and both strategically placed members of

their tribes within the other's communities to learn their ways and language. The dynamics of survival could mean a relaxation of European norms, including traditional political divisions among competing nations.

If the volume has a fault, it is that too many of the essays posit an overly reductive and homogenous view of the Renaissance, one that does not acknowledge the variety of European responses to it. In a few essays, too, wrestling with conceptual models appears an end in itself rather than a point of departure. Yet, overwhelmingly, this is a volume that substantially furthers how we understand early modern Canada. With new research that is similarly redrawing Renaissance Europe's relations with the Near and Far East, a powerful challenge to the often cosy nationalist and/or postcolonial preoccupations of recent writing on the European 'Age of Discovery' is determinedly underway. (THOMAS HEALY)

Kathleen M. Comerford and Hilmar M. Pabel, editors. *Early Modern Catholicism: Essays in Honour of John W. O'Malley, S.J.*
University of Toronto Press 2001. xxxiii, 324. $70.00

This collection of essays marks the fifth volume in John O'Malley's association with the University of Toronto Press. He has edited three in the Erasmus edition and coedited, with Gauvin Bailey, T. Frank Kennedy, and Frank Harris, the enormous collection of essays on Jesuit art, culture, and science, papers given at the first conference on this topic in 1997. Another collection, also bound, I think, for the Press, is planned from the second, held at Boston College in 2002. He has published elsewhere, on a range of subjects, Erasmus, Renaissance rhetoric, studies of religious culture in the sixteenth century, reflections on Vatican II. In *Trent and All That: Renaming Catholicism in the Early Modern Era*, he suggested, after a review of more confrontational descriptions, that the most useful term for the field whose study he has led is 'early modern Catholicism' as contrasted to Counter-Reformation, or even to its recent replacement, Catholic Reformation. His suggested change effectively puts Catholicism into early modern history. One of his early books was on the first Jesuits, and he has written on Jesuit spirituality. He is the editor of the very useful *Catholicism in Early Modern History: A Guide to Research*. It is clear from the notes and allusions in this Festschrift that he has also been a committed teacher, mentor, and advisor for a generation of students who acknowledge and quote him in nearly every one of these papers.

The authors of the sixteen essays range widely across the field O'Malley has renamed, from an account of the influence of the fifth council of the Lateran on the Council of Trent (Nelson H. Minnich), to the papacy in the age of reform (William V. Hudon), to the episcopacy in sixteenth-century Italy (Francesco D. Cesareo) , minority and popular Catholicism (Christine Kooi and Keith P. Luria respectively), teaching religion in the sixteenth and

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

seventeenth centuries (Kathleen M. Comerford), and the new clerks regular of the sixteenth century (Mark J. Lewis). Jesuit activity is studied in papers on confraternities as modes of spiritual community (Nicholas Terpstra), on the non-Spanish contribution to South American colonial architecture (Gauvin Alexander Bailey), on the catechism as a musical event (T. Frank Kennedy), and on the adaptation of the composition of place from the *Exercises* to a Chinese setting (Xiaoping Lin). The importance of Erasmus for O'Malley is recognized in Hilmar M. Pabel's essay on the *Ars Moriendi*, his concern with rhetoric and preaching in Corrie E. Norman's study of preaching and ritual on Holy Thursday in the court of Paul V. Before O'Malley's study it was often thought that preaching was badly neglected. In her paper on the Daughters of Charity, Susan E. Dinan begins by observing that the subject of gender finds its place more easily in O'Malley's new terminology, as does D. Jonathan Grieser's concern with Catholics and Anabaptists. These wider spaces allow for some revaluation, shown in particular by Wietse de Boer's paper on Calvin and Borromeo and the analogies between the notions of discipline, in two figures not often linked. This paper works with cross-confessionalism, but it points up a particular strength of the volume, past its range and the bibliographical materials accompanying each essay. The broader description for the phenomenon as a whole, as early modern Catholicism, opens new explorations, new parallels, new ways of looking at what looks like familiar material, already judged, classified. While the papers themselves are finished, they everywhere suggest work in progress, based on intensive study of the particular with an openness designed to reveal rather than to confront or to confute. This has been John O'Malley's own habit, made manifest by the only subject in the last session of the second four-day conference on Jesuit culture in Boston last June: 'What have we learned?' This was a preamble to an invitation to the audience to suggest, on the basis of that learning, particular and general directions in which we might, tentatively, go next. O'Malley's 'way of proceeding' has produced not only his own studies, but a generation of students carrying on his tradition and his style. (PATRICIA BRÜCKMANN)

Nasrin Rahimieh. *Missing Persians: Discovering Voices in Iranian Cultural History*
Syracuse University Press 2001. xiii, 191. US $34.95, $17.95

A statement that occurs near the end of this study seems to indicate its crux: 'Despite their appearances, the [first and last] narrators convey a deep-rooted psychological resistance to cultural makeover they go to great lengths to embrace.' The interplay of acceptance and rejection of 'the West' permeates, to a greater or lesser extent, all the writings featured in this text. The notion of *alterity*, understood to 'evoke a sense of awareness of linguistic, cultural, and psychological differences from others that con-

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

stitutes the notion of the self,' underscores the selections of quotations and interpretations.

The five writings examined in this book are 'read as instances of lives written into Persian cultural history' and should be considered part of 'our collective cultural imagination.' Since Persian cultural conventions preclude the full revelation of the *self* outside a communal and political context, the study characterizes the environment for the revelation of the *self,* as it occurs in each of the writings. Theories of cross-cultural encounters are used to unravel textual subtleties.

The first 'missing Persian' is Uruch Beg, a secretary attached to a delegation sent by the Persian Shah 'Abbas I to Europe in 1599. He converted to Catholicism in Spain and did not return to Persia; his Persian diary was originally translated into Castilian. This study makes use of a Spanish translation published in 1946, because there is 'merit in uncovering the ambiguities of a text that claims to speak for the Persian whose own voice has long been lost.' The study probes the diary of this sixteenth-century Persian for its sense of identity, view of the outside world, and language resources.

Haji Mirza Muhammad 'Ali Mu'in al Saltanah, wrote an account of his travels to Europe and North America in 1893 (first published in 1901 in Paris). This study uses the 1982 reprinted text, since 'The questions the editor's introduction to the reprinted version did not answer were crucial in forming my own strategies for reading this narrative.' Theory and conjecture fill in for the limitations of the text and the human tendency to be tedious and obtuse. For, as Nasrin Rahimieh observes, 'closer readings of [the] dense and laborious entries shed light on a larger problem of communication through which he had to negotiate his observations and perceptions.' This self-satisfied traveller, who equates being Persian with living in Persia, travelled in an age before new modes of knowledge found their way into the Persian intellectual environment.

'Abdullah Mustawfi was a product of a changed environment in Persia. He was a member of a diplomatic posting to St Petersburg and visited the capitals of Europe in 1904. His *Description of My Life* is 'life writing interwoven with social history.' Mustawfi's experiences in the West reinforced his belief in the need to resort to 'knowledge and insight acquired outside Persia' in order to revamp 'Persian linguistic and national identity.' Mustawfi deliberately presents himself as a role model for a 'cultural makeover.' The study reads this text as a 'personal life history inextricably intertwined with a particular historical moment'; the felicitous matching of theory and text makes for particularly interesting reading.

The unfinished memoirs of the fourth 'missing Persian' Taj al-Saltanah, daughter of a Shah, thought to have been written in 1914, emerge 'out of an arena, albeit textual and imaginative, of cultural contact and conflict.' The study uncovers the 'gaps ... and contradictions' of this text which are

'integral to [Taj al-Saltanah's] self-perception and self-representation.'

Najmeh Najafi wrote three books about her experiences. The 'narrative strategies' of the first are used to 'grasp the way in which [Najafi's] identity is made to fit the image of Persia as an anxious and grateful recipient of American aid and protection.' Multiple gender issues are addressed through the texts of the two female 'missing Persians,' Najafi and Taj al-Saltanah.

In the conclusion, the author reiterates her sense that the depersonal-ized accounts she has dealt with in this study can tell much 'about the narrating self and its struggles with conflicting cultural archives.' (RIVANNE SANDLER)

Rebecca Ann Bach. *Colonial Transformations: The Cultural Production of the New Atlantic World, 1580–1640*
Palgrave 2000. xiv, 290. US $29.95

Scholars of early modern transatlantic studies and the literature of the encounter should welcome the addition of Rebecca Ann Bach's fine study to the growing corpus of work in this area. *Colonial Transformations* brings together a wide range of both literary and non-literary materials concerning the cultural interactions that occurred in England, Ireland, and the New World during the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries. While building from the important works produced by scholars such as Stephen Greenblatt, Mary Fuller, and Jeffrey Knapp over the last decade, Bach sets out to examine the reciprocal process of cultural transformation on both sides of the Atlantic that resulted from England's early colonial projects in Ireland, Bermuda, and Virginia. The author reads texts ranging from promotional pamphlets, legal proceedings, and maps in conjunction with more familiar works of poetry, sermons, masques, and plays. This allows Bach to explore the complicated cultural interactions articulated, sometimes overtly and other times more obscurely, in works such as Spenser's *Amoretti*, Jonson's plays and masques, and Captain John Smith's accounts of his adventures in the New World.

One of the important correctives Bach's work offers is its attention to the social differences extant among the early colonists and planters. She notes in her introduction that 'we literary critics and cultural studies practitioners pay attention to the hybridity of the native subject but too often see the colonizer as a monolithic representative of governmental or technological power, rather than a constructed category painfully maintained in order to preserve English power in the face of appealing or divisive difference.' Her work joins that of Thomas Scanlan and Kim Hall in their efforts to create a broader sphere of understanding of what Bach terms the 'New Atlantic World.' Such studies are invaluable to the scholarly discourses surrounding the issues of cultural encounter, gender, class, and race in the literature of

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

this period.

Chapter 1, 'Colonial Poetics in Spenser's *Amoretti*,' examines Spenser's sonnet sequence within the context of English colonial policy in Ireland. Readers have long been familiar with the connections between Elizabethan Irish policy and works such as *The Faerie Queene* and the *View of the Present State of Ireland* (Bach chooses not to address questions surrounding the authorship of the *View* raised by Jean Brink), but as Bach points out they have tended to isolate the *Amoretti* from the politics of its site of composition. By focusing on the problematic language of violence and submission that marks the rhetoric of Spenser's sonnets, Bach is able to elucidate the complexities of gender and colonialism that imbue contemporary commentaries and propaganda concerned with Ireland. This is an important move for Bach, who argues that the *Amoretti* 'is as deeply imbricated in [Spenser's] colonial career as his public epic poetry. Indeed, it is precisely the *Amoretti*'s personal vision that links these poems to Spenser's colonial desires, desires which were clearly at the heart of his life and ambitions.'

The second chapter, 'Bermuda's Ireland: Naming in the Colonial World,' deals with the colonies on both sides of the Atlantic and focuses on the issue of naming in Ireland, Bermuda, and Virginia. Bach demonstrates that mapping and naming/renaming in Britain's colonies went beyond the descriptive towards a policy of intervention and transformation. Her discussion of place names in both Ireland and Virginia reveals the erasure of indigenous names and the disenfranchisement of their respective populations, while her discussion of the colonization of the uninhabited Bermudas and their subsequent naming attends to the class divisions and imperial fantasies of the colonizers themselves. For Bach naming itself becomes 'a powerful transformative action in the mouths and texts of people in the emerging Atlantic world.'

Bach takes up analysis of more familiar literary texts in the third and fourth chapters, which explore the representation of England's colonial world on the London stage and in court masques and city pageants. In chapter 3 ('The New Atlantic World Transformed on the London Stage') Bach presents an engaging reading of Ben Jonson's plays written for the Jacobean stage. This reading demonstrates how these plays, when viewed as part of a textual world including Virginia Company propaganda, travel accounts, and sermons written for the Company, self-consciously set out to negotiate Britain's evolving sense of national identity, an identity transformed by the instantiation of empire. Chapter 4 ('Colonial Transformations in Court and City Entertainments') continues in the same vain but this time juxtaposing the exclusive court spectacles of the masque with the public celebration of city pageants. Bach sees both forms of entertainment as 'central to England's emerging imperial identity.'

In the final chapter ('A Virginia Maske') Bach crosses the Atlantic once more to analyse John Smith's *Generall Historie of Virginia* and his subsequent

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

account of an incident involving his entertainment by Powhatan women, including Pocahontas. This chapter explores the intertextual relationship between the histories of the New World and the literature of the Old. Bach makes a strong case for the influence of Jonson's aristocratic masques on Smith's account of the 'Virginia Maske.' The transformative aspect of this influence is multifaceted as Smith transforms himself, his *Generall Historie*, and Pocahontas and the Powhatan women themselves. Bach's close reading of this episode demonstrates the complex interaction of gender, colonialism, and self-articulation at play in this well-known colonial text.

Bach ends her book with a brief epilogue ('Late Twentieth-Century Transformations: Pocahontas and Captain John Smith in Late-Twentieth Century Jamestown') in which she examines the continuing presence of what she refers to as the 'undifferentiated Indian.' This is manifest in the contemporary displays of the Jamestown museum and its gift shop, which fail to correct long-standing misinterpretations of Native American cultures and their interaction with European and Euro-American dominance. Rebecca Ann Bach's book is at its best when reading literary texts in the context of non-literary colonial writings and explicating the transformative and destructive elements of colonialism in the New Atlantic world. (SCOTT MANNING STEVENS)

C.E. McGee and A.L. Magnusson, editors, with Valerie Creelman and Todd Pettigrew. *The Elizabethan Theatre XV. Papers Given at the Fifteenth and Sixteenth International Conferences on Elizabethan Theatre Held at the University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Ontario*
P.D. Meany. xviii, 339. $59.00

Of the fifteen contributors to this volume of essays, ten are Canadian. So too are the editors and support staff. I say this not at all to complain of provincialism, or even by way of tacit acknowledgment that a set of conference papers based on an occasional conference at the University of Waterloo is apt to be dominantly Canadian, but in admiring tribute to the astonishing contributions that Canadian scholars continue to make to textual studies and performance history.

The individual essays here are consistently interesting and original. They are also coherently organized into an extended debate on cutting-edge critical questions. The first major topic is 'Collective Invention and Collaboration.' Paul Werstine leads off with a historical critique of his favourite shipping-boys, W.W. Greg and company, for highlighting individual artistic composition at the expense of collective activity. Suzanne Gossett takes the Middleton project as her model for rethinking instances of collaborative authorship. Jeffrey Masten argues for a new kind of reading that will be sensitive to the likelihood of collaboration rather than single

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

authorship. Kathleen McLuskie talks about the commercial context of theatrical activity as a venue in which collaboration naturally thrived.

Richard Hillman discusses a different sort of 'collaboration' – if that is the right term for work that is continued by another writer or writers after the original dramatist's death. Arguably, this is a matter of stage history rather than collaboration in the usual sense, though Hillman wants to demonstrate that the additions to *The Spanish Tragedy* 'pick up and expand an element latent in the original'; Hieronimo's original lines addressed to the old Bazulto as a 'lively image' of Hieronimo's own grief 'prepare the way for the more fully developed psychological interaction with the Painter that comprises the Fourth Addition.' Michael Keefer, writing about *Doctor Faustus*, is interested too in what Jeffrey Masten has called 'diachronic forms of collaboration.' He argues convincingly (in a response to Leah Marcus, for whom the two early texts are alike in their radicalism) that the A-text is a 'radically interrogative text' while the B-text is 'an "orthodox effacement" of its heterodoxy.' Moreover, we need to bear in mind Roma Gill's conjecture that actors may well have collaborated in the problematic texts we have. Helen Ostovich's excellent essay is perhaps done a disservice by its inclusion in this debate on collaboration, for her exploration of what she calls a 'Cultural Collaboration' involves Ben Jonson in an 'uneasy collaboration among men to redefine women's roles in a period of cultural change.' The men who are thus collectively responsible for the misogyny we find in Jonson's plays are both his contemporaries and the ancient authors he read. The concept of collaboration is in danger at this point of being broadened into intertextuality, at which point we are going to find collaboration in virtually any written work. Still, the singleness of purpose in this collection of essays is laudable and vibrantly up to date.

The volume's second grouping is also coherent, and on a related concern: dramatists in relation to community, involved in the collective enterprise of defining a theatre and a nation. Jean Howard looks at prostitutes and shopkeepers in London; Janelle Day Jenstad studies mercantile practices; Alan Somerset looks at theatre conditions away from the big city, in the counties. In all such venues, theatrical activities 'gave their inhabitants scope to express their senses of community and nation.' Ton Hoenselaars and Leanore Lieblein explore this topic in non-English venues, in Holland and in Quebec. Paul Yachnin, Irene Makaryk, and Paul Stevens look at individual texts by major authors – *Hamlet*, *Macbeth*, Milton's *Eikonoclastes* – with a similar close attention to issues of forming nationhood in the vein of Richard Helgerson, Claire McEachern, and Benedict Andersen. Thus both major topics in the collection are coherent and timely; the papers speak to one another. The volume richly deserves to be read as a whole conversation, indeed as a collaboration, rather than as a repository for individual articles that one might wish to consult from some project. (DAVID BEVINGTON)

Stephanie Nolen. *Shakespeare's Face*
Alfred A. Knopf, Canada. xvii, 366. $39.95

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Shakespeare's Face is a book destined rapidly to become a curiosity. The bulk of it consists of the work of a journalist, Stephanie Nolen, who broke the story of the portrait that may or may not be the earliest image we have of Shakespeare to the *Globe and Mail* in May 2001. Nolen came across it because it happened to be in the possession of a neighbour of her mother's, one Lloyd Sullivan; it had been in his family for many years, and they believed it to have been painted by an ancestor, John Sanders, an actor in Shakespeare's company, and, as a label on the back helpfully states, a portrait of Shakespeare done in 1603. Unfortunately, however, the professional genealogist hired to trace Sullivan's family line back to Sanders was unable to find a direct link, so that the very name attached to the painting, 'the Sanders portrait,' is as speculative as almost everything else about it.

Nolen is obviously a woman of great persistence and persuasiveness. In order to get together a book's worth of material about this portrait, which almost no one from the vast array of scholars and experts called upon to pronounce upon it will actually confirm to be that of Shakespeare, she has traced in considerable and chatty detail the various processes by which she and Lloyd Sullivan have attempted to authenticate it, interspersing her own chapters between those of several eminent Shakespearean scholars and other experts. Thus Stanley Wells, Andrew Gurr, Jonathan Bate, and others write essays which supply a variety of reasons why this might be a portrait of Shakespeare. Wells and Gurr, for instance, suggest that 1603 might have been a particularly good time for Shakespeare to get his portrait painted; Marjorie Garber thinks that what she characterizes as 'the male minx in the Sanders image, with his knowing eyes and flirtatious, up-curved mouth' is just the sort of cultural fantasy that suits our current notion of the portrait-function, although for Alexander Leggatt it is the sitter's oblique gaze that better suits our image of Shakespeare. Alexandra Johnston and others from the REED project allow that 'there is nothing in the label that disproves the ascription' to Shakespeare. In other chapters art historians Robert Tittler and Tarnya Cooper examine the painting's visual vocabulary and consider that it portrays a promising young man, and its emotional expressiveness, uncommon in English portraiture of this period, would be appropriate for the face of an actor. (Jonathan Bate, interestingly, queers the whole pitch by suggesting that it might have been a portrait of Fletcher.)

Nolen's essays spell out the difficulties faced by amateurs trying to prove the date and origins of what was essentially a family heirloom about which someone had a hunch: the discouragement of gallery curators, the cost of investigation by professional archivists and conservators, the sheer amount

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

of time and devotion required. This is probably the most interesting part of the book. The success of Nolen in getting her discovery, along with the dogged efforts of the portrait's owner, Lloyd Sullivan, written up at such length, with the bolstering of a galaxy of experts, testifies more to the power and vitality of the Shakespeare industry than to the significance of the portrait in its own right. Nolen and Sullivan long so desperately for this to be the real Shakespeare that they are dismissive of experts mentioned who pronounce definitively negative views, surprisingly few, it seems. But in the end this book's chief value will be as a footnote. (SANDRA CLARK)

Margo Swiss and David A. Kent, editors.
Speaking Grief in English Literary Culture: Shakespeare to Milton
Duquesne University Press. 365. US $60.00

The title of this collection of twelve essays promises a topic with an exciting potential for enhancing our understanding of Renaissance literature. 'To speak grief' tears through the ligatures binding subjectivity and society together. Its dangerous excesses dissolve social boundaries even as they necessitate the further entrenchment of power relations, gender divisions, and corporeal categories. A number of the contributions, particularly those of Michael McClintock, Paul Parrish, Donna Long, and Margo Swiss, tap into grief's disturbing energy. But in our age of cultural studies the volume's title promises more than it has to offer. The volume should have been entitled *The Theme of Grief in English Literary Works from Shakespeare to Milton*, since most of the essays make no attempt to trace out grief's connections to the institutions, discourses, and practices of English literary culture.

Although I appreciate some of its individual contributions, the overall collection does not advance our understanding of grief in the period. It fails to distinguish the unique conceptual space of grief from the well-worn topics of mourning, melancholy, and loss, adding nothing new to current discussions of these topics. Marjory Lange's essay is an exception in elaborating a distinction between sorrow and melancholy, but she seems more preoccupied with religious melancholy in her study. Half the essays also overlap unproductively with elegy criticism almost two decades after G.W. Pigman III's *Grief and English Renaissance Elegy* and Peter M. Sack's *The English Elegy*. But early modern grief means much more than the disease 'melancholy' and takes textual forms other than the predictable elegy. Sorrow is one of the concupiscible passions generated by the intellective appetite. Early modern anatomical treatises depict it moving between the body and the mind, ultimately troubling the soul: that is why the passions are called perturbations. In the period, Thomas Wright's *The Passions of the Minde in Generall* reveals a culture's awareness of manipulating emotions for powerful rhetorical effects, which are by no means confined to a single

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

genre.

The reason that the volume fails to advance our knowledge of grief is that it lacks a coherent vision. It is uncertain of its critical praxis. Four of the essays amount to bloodless close readings/commentaries, stubbornly resistant to contemporary critical dialogue. These essays could have been written decades ago. In contrast, the remaining essays strive to offer something more than a traditional commentary on a theme in a literary work. Ranging impressively throughout Shakespeare's plays, Fred Tromly argues that Shakespeare questions the hierarchical relationship implicit in conventional comfort-giving and provides in Cordelia and Lear's shared grief a rare glimpse at 'an ideal of mutuality in consolation.' Phillip McCaffrey's essay, the volume's only sustained theoretical analysis, works out a fine psychoanalytic reading, in which he articulates the complex yet fragile defences against grief in Marvell's 'The Nymph.' The introduction should have been the place to argue for the volume's critical coherence, but it sorely lacks vision too, stumbling through a few examples of grief in Shakespeare and several disconnected commonplaces from literary criticism and social history. At one point, it intones statistics on deaths caused by plagues and wars as though sorrow in English literary culture could be grasped numerically. The editors would have been wiser to cut their ties with a traditional literary criticism that treats grief as a perfunctory theme or an empirical object and to organize the volume around gender. Half of the essays in the volume may be said to approach grief through a keen sensitivity to gendered representations.

Nowhere does the volume's lack of coherent vision seem more pronounced than in the afterword by Ralph Houlbrooke. As one might expect, he performs his task of tying up the many loose ends with learning, grace, and ingenuity. However, I find it bizarre that an early modern historian should be given the final word in a volume with a third of its essays demonstrating no regard for interdisciplinary approaches to literature. Houlbrooke registers this concern, when he makes 'a plea for closer cooperation between literary scholars and historians.' I wish too that this volume in conceptualizing, reading, and organizing the texture of early modern grief had demonstrated a closer co-operation between its editors and its contributors. (GRANT WILLIAMS)

John Donne. *Essays in Divinity: Being Several Disquisitions Interwoven with Meditations and Prayers*. Edited by Anthony Raspa
McGill-Queen's University Press 2001. lxxx, 210. $75.00

John Donne's *Essays in Divinity* is not one of his more widely read works. Prior's to Anthony Raspa's edition, the work was published by John Donne the Younger in 1651, edited by Augustus Jessopp and published in 1855, and re-edited by Evelyn M. Simpson and republished in 1952. A generous selection of the work appears in Herschel Baker's *The Later Renaissance in*

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

England (1975) – an edition unmentioned by Raspa – and a substantial chapter (thirty pages, but mostly quotation and paraphrase) is devoted to the work by Simpson in her survey of Donne's Prose (1924). Jointly, the two confer canonical status on the work. To Baker it is 'a sort of theological compendium or resevoir of the doctrines, themes, and motifs that Donne embellished in his later work.' The *Essays* were evidently composed as an exercise in theological speculation, 'the voluntary sacrifices of severall hours,' prior to Donne's ordination the following year, as a means of self-testing, of assuring himself of his own orthodoxy and his vocation, and, as well, his theological competence as one who had taken no formal academic degree: 'whether he were worthy, and competently learned to enter into Holy Orders,' as the publisher's address 'To the Reader' puts it.

There are editorial problems in *Essays*, but they are not textual; and there are bibliographical problems inherent in the complicated survival of copies of the original. But these Raspa convincingly disposes of: there is but one edition and but one issue that is authoritative. One printing in 1651 appeared both as a stand-alone publication and two years later in a separate reissue of unsold sheets in the third edition of *Paradoxes and Problems* (1653). Behind all the surviving forty-six copies of *Essays* lies a single missing manuscript, described by his publisher, Richard Marriot, as 'an exact Copy, under the Authors own hand,' to which each surviving copy is an independent witness. Rather than multiply accidental variants needlessly, Raspa has conjoined three particular witnesses to constitute his copy-text. Two at Cambridge University Library and a third at the British Library were chosen on grounds of the quality of the surviving volume (or part volume) and the convenience of its present location. Four other copies are collated fully, and additional ones were spot-checked for in-press corrections, of which there were a number.

Few of the resulting editorial emendations are substantive. The vast majority are corrections to the marginalia. Given the evident care with which the 1651 text was seen through the press (presumably by the younger Donne), and given the number and accuracy of the marginalia (as revealed by the Raspa's textual notes printed at the bottom of the page), the underlying manuscript was the object as well of its author's careful attention. The work of this edition then is to recreate the theological climate of early seventeenth century Europe. This is not an editorial problem as such; still, a good deal of thought has gone into the construction of the resulting commentary. For example, the Press has increased the trim size from the standard six by nine to seven by nine so that these marginalia, now adjacent to the text to which they refer, have enough space to be intelligible at a glance.

The Donnes' scholarly care, *père et fils*, is reduplicated by Raspa, not only in the preparation of his critical text, but also and especially in his learned introduction and the text's extensive annotations, on which the introduc-

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

tion's scholarship is grounded. The sixteenth century was the golden age of scholarly editions of the Church Fathers (think of Erasmus), and the brazen age of controversial polemic stimulated by the Protestant Reformation and the Church of Rome's Council of Trent (think of Error in book 1 of *The Faerie Queene*). Framed as exposition of the first verses of Genesis and of Exodus, Donne's text is the object of Raspa's careful recuperation of the 'Cultural Context' of these knotty disquisitions. Thanks to this distinguished edition, it becomes materially more intelligible to contemporary readers. (W. SPEED HILL)

Carole Blackburn. *Harvest of Souls: The Jesuit Missions and Colonialism in North America, 1632–1650*
McGill-Queen's University Press 2000. x, 174. $60.00

The *Jesuit Relations*, originally published in the seventeenth century and then reprinted with an English translation in 1896–1900, have provided historians and anthropologists, as well as literary and religious scholars, with rich material for research on the early encounter of French missionaries with the Native nations of eastern Canada. Crammed with travel accounts, ethnographic descriptions, legends of saintly sacrifice and chronicles of war, the *Relations* have sustained a wide variety of readings. Catholic writers have looked to them for inspiration, while secular historians used them to construct a story illustrating the fundamental colonial struggle of 'civilization' against 'barbarism.' In recent decades, traditional interpretations have been overturned as scholars highlight the intolerant and ethnocentric dimensions of the Jesuits' words and their missionary actions. Meanwhile, ethnohistorians such as Bruce Trigger have mined the *Relations* for data that can help them reconstruct a history that places Native peoples at centre stage.

Carole Blackburn's new book takes an original approach to a familiar topic, drawing on postcolonial studies to examine the *Relations* as a discourse of power. Throughout the thousands of pages published between 1632 and 1673, she maintains, the Jesuits were consistently creating and reinforcing 'dichotomies between colonizers and the colonized,' an 'othering' process that not only reflected but concretely contributed to the subordination of Natives. The fact that the postcolonial literature was developed in the historical context of nineteenth- and twentieth-century empires, colonial settings in which Natives tended to be subjected to European domination in ways that were inconceivable in New France, does lead to a degree of awkwardness, though the author is not unaware of the incongruities.

Blackburn develops her thesis through a discussion of three broad themes. Under the heading of 'Wilderness,' she shows how the Jesuits

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

assimilated indigenous peoples with the forest and its wild beasts, a physical and spiritual environment forsaken by God. She demonstrates in a subsequent chapter that Natives were portrayed as lacking a state, as well as the laws and constraints needed to keep passion and sin in check. Finally, her chapter on 'Conversion and Conquest' brings out the aggressive, even militaristic, side of Jesuit rhetoric; the fact that France lacked the means to conquer the Natives of Canada as Spain had conquered those of Mexico and Peru, was cause for regret to some French Jesuits. None of these points is entirely new, but all are developed more fully and stated more forcefully than in previous studies.

In analysing Jesuit rhetoric in this way, *Harvest of Souls* does make a valuable contribution to the field, though the analysis has a rather schematic, almost mechanical, quality. Blackburn concentrates on the most brutally judgmental passages from the *Jesuit Relations* to the neglect of texts that display greater complexity, uncertainty, and even counter-currents subversive of the colonialist thrust.

Furthermore, a historian cannot help regretting the exclusive focus on discourse. This is a book about the Jesuits and their texts; the author shows little interest in contemporary work that attempts to retrieve the *Native* experience of missions and Christianity. She would have been well advised to consult the literature on indigenous peoples and missions in colonial Latin America; studies by Inga Clendinnen, Sabine MacCormack, and William B. Taylor are of particular interest to anyone trying to get beyond the assimilation/resistance polarity that dominates North American mission historiography. (ALLAN GREER)

Derek J. Penslar. *Shylock's Children: Economics and Jewish Identity in Modern Europe*
University of California Press 2001. xi, 374. US $45.00

This is an innovative and important work of modern Jewish history, hard to pigeonhole precisely because its novelty puts it beyond existing rubrics. Derek J.Penslar's theme is the central role that economic matters have played in modern Jewish identity, social organization, and self-understanding. While focused on German-speaking Jewry, where these debates were most intense, his canvas is all of modern western and central Europe, with some excursions beyond, into eastern Europe, the United States, and Jewish settlement in the land of Israel. The book draws upon and synthesizes historical treatments of economically related issues in a variety of countries. To this it adds material drawn from wide reading in nineteenth-century Jewish magazines and newspapers, as well the archives of Jewish philanthropic organizations. The book convincingly demonstrates the power of economic issues in shaping modern Jewish consciousness and activism.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

The story is rich in ironies. Above all, much of modern Jewish economic reflection and communal activism was based on internalization of anti-Semitic criticisms of the links between Jews and commerce. From the eighteenth century onward, there were two prongs to the anti-Semitic critique to which Jewish intellectuals and communal activists were forced to respond, both of which maintained that Jews were parasitical. The first prong was directed at the mass of poor Jews, who were characterized as savage, unscrupulous, and dangerous. The second was directed at the small but salient minority of privileged (in the legal sense), rich Jewish bankers, factors, and financiers, who were feared as a cabal of astonishing acumen and vast, if obscure, power.

Jews, as Penslar points out, were in many respects the paradigmatic middleman minority, concentrated in commercial occupations considered by the dominant pre-capitalist elites to be too low in status and too high in risk. With the spread of the liberal state, which offered Jews greater equality of opportunity, they prospered disproportionately in the realms of commerce and the free professions. Yet for the losers in the process of capitalist modernization, the Jew was the symbol of the revolutionary and transformative capitalist process that was destroying their traditional livelihood, thus reforging the link between anti-Semitism and economic resentment.

Some Jewish leaders and activists, as Penslar shows, responded by taking this analysis to heart, and trying to transform the occupational structure of Jewry. Their object was the Jewish poor who emigrated from the Russian empire into central and western Europe. As Penslar demonstrates, philanthropy, oriented towards alleviating the plight of these Jews, became central to modern Jewish identity in the course of the nineteenth century, leading to the 'associational Judaism' of the twentieth. Plans were hatched to move them out of petty commerce and the professions and into crafts and agriculture, which were seen (first by anti-Semitic critics of capitalism and then by some Jewish activists) as creating a healthier mind and body. The great irony here is that these fields were in fact in relative economic decline. Nevertheless, such was that lure of this vision of professional transformation that in the early twentieth century there were schemes of large-scale social engineering to turn Jews into farmers not only in the land of Israel, but in the Soviet Union, United States, and Latin America as well.

And yet, as the book documents, there was also a counter-trend, one which took pride in Jewish contributions to commerce and the professions, and sought to explain this element of Jewish distinctiveness without treating it (as did anti-Semites) as abnormal or reprehensible. Jewish self-understanding based upon such assumptions led to philanthropic efforts to transform the Jewish poor not into a docile working class, but into an entrepreneurial, socially mobile, Jewish bourgeoisie.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

The final irony, as Penslar notes, is that the labour Zionist project of creating a nation of agricultural workers has given way in contemporary Israel to an occupational structure replicating that of Diaspora Jewry, one in which commercial and professional pursuits are dominant, in keeping with the economic incentives of the Western world.

Penslar's book not only interweaves hitherto scattered strands of Jewish history, but also suggests new avenues of research for historians of modern Jewry. Social scientists from a variety of disciplines may profit from applying Penslar's questions about the links between collective identity and economic issues to other ethnic and religious groups. (JERRY Z. MULLER)

Elizabeth Rapley. *A Social History of the Cloister: Daily Life in the Teaching Monasteries of the Old Regime*
McGill-Queen's University Press. xiv, 386. $49.95

Elizabeth Rapley is one of a select group of married women academics who study the social history of nuns. Her acknowledgment and introduction to this book thank her husband and point out that she does not derive from Roman Catholic antecedents. She has produced a splendid study of French teaching nuns from the 1630s to 1790, with an afterword about the post-revolutionary situation. There are numerous quotations translated into English from French original documents. The book is divided into two parts, the first sketching in the main developments among teaching nuns considered as a countrywide group of women over two centuries, and the second looking in more detail at the life of cloistered nuns from different orders. She has assembled statistics in a valuable appendix entitled 'Demographics of the Cloister.' She poses many hypotheses which will stimulate others doing research. She tries to get away from, or perhaps better tries to read from a fresh perspective, the uplifting and edifying chronologies produced by nuns writing about their individual communities and notable instances of piety. Rapley describes this as 'drawing a large picture with material that was originally intended for small pictures.'

One original aspect of the book is attention to the economics of the nunneries. Rapley provides detail on the crisis of 1689 brought about by demands from the Crown for delayed taxation. That was followed by the serious losses suffered by convents as a result of the collapse of the John Law experiment in credit. Many houses were in debt. She also has interesting information about the decline in the number of postulants who brought in big dowries, and a decline in the levels of generosity on the part of the wealthiest sectors of French society.

The obsessive insistence on *clausura* (the obligation to remain within the cloister) and on keeping nuns away from men has always given rise to sexual fantasies on the part of some of the latter about the former. Diderot's

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

novel *La religieuse*, first published in 1783, and Peter Mullen's film *The Magdalene Sisters* reveal some of the lesbian undercurrents imagined by men to flourish in the relationships both within the hierarchy of the monastery and also among the girls being taught there. Rapley gives no consideration to such topics. She has more to say about the way in which some widows made arrangements to live in convents. There is an excellent discussion of social inequality inside communities in the chapter dealing with the servants of the brides of Christ. The ideal lay sister was a strong, healthy countrywoman in her twenties who accepted celibacy. Rapley rightly observes that the *converses*, or lay sisters, have often been overlooked in monastic history despite their importance to the cooking and housekeeping for the teaching nuns.

The book offers a great deal for the history of Old Regime French women and for a social history of religion that is gendered. In particular Rapley provides evidence of changing patterns of vocations over time and of the way in which the social hierarchies of the outside world were sometimes replicated within the walls of the convents. (DAVID HIGGS)

Lynda Lange, editor. *Feminist Interpretations of Jean-Jacques Rousseau*
Pennsylvania State University Press. xii, 410. US $85.00, $36.50

Lynda Lange has collected in a single volume fifteen scholarly essays illustrating that feminist theory can offer a wide range of interpretations of Rousseau's thought. Some of these essays have been published previously, one as long ago as 1979; some have been presented as conference papers; some are entirely new. Thus, the volume serves the double purpose of providing both a history of feminist approaches to Rousseau's work over the past quarter-century and a snapshot of the current state of feminist research on Rousseau.

Not surprisingly, the majority of these essays focus mainly on those of Rousseau's works in which he writes explicitly about women and the family, that is, *Emile* and *La nouvelle Héloïse*. The *Confessions* are also a source of material concerning his thoughts on women, as well as his personal relationships with them. Several essayists also draw on the *Contrat social*, in which, as they point out, women and domestic life are conspicuous by their absence, and one contributor offers a probing analysis of *Le Lévite d'Ephraïm* in the context of the question of consent.

Most of the debate centres on the questions of the differentation between the sexes, the relation between the family and civil society and the distinction between public and private spheres, the relationship between male and female power, the ideological shift to consent as, ideally, the necessary characteristic of all relations – social, political, and sexual – in modernity. On all of these questions, feminist analysis of Rousseau's

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

thought comes to a wide variety of differing conclusions, as indeed do all other avenues of approach. The one point of general agreement over Rousseau has always been his capacity to stimulate vigorous debate.

What are Rousseau's views on the differences between men and women? Are these differences biologically determined, hence natural, or are the identities of all men, women, and citizens an unstable social construction in which the difference is merely one of assigned roles and functions? Not only do opinions on this question differ, but some commentators believe that Rousseau's views on the matter are self-contradictory, while others believe that his views are consistent, and still others believe that he presents an argument that is deliberately ambiguous. Given the diversity of views on this fundamental question, it follows inevitably that the analyses of all the subsequent issues deriving from it differ in many ways. Rousseau's confinement of female power to the private sphere of the family, while male power operates in the public sphere of civic life, is variously interpreted as the mere repetition of ancient phallocratic discourses associated with male hysteria, or as a balancing of roles that allows masculine and feminine powers, operating in different spheres, to supplement and maintain each other, or as a radically new view of the political importance of domestic life. Several scholars refer to the ultimate fate of both Sophie and Julie as evidence either of Rousseau's awareness that his theories could not work in practice or of his own serious doubts about the human cost of his ideal community.

Whether Rousseau is seen as a phallocratic tyrant, a proto-feminist philosopher, or situated somewhere between the two, the fifteen essays collected in this volume demonstrate not only the richness and diversity of his thought, but also the exciting debates which his writings continue to inspire in the twenty-first century. (JO-ANN MCEACHERN)

Kenneth J. Banks. *Chasing Empire across the Sea: Communications and the State in the French Atlantic, 1713–1763*
McGill-Queen's University Press. xxii, 320. $65.00

This is very much a book inspired by communications theory and at the same time, very much a historian's book, written with a relish for concrete details about people and events. The eighteenth century French Empire as here portrayed puts one in mind of a strong signal beamed from a central point, but weakening quite abruptly at the edge of its coverage, its message becoming lost in 'noise,' shut out by other signals bearing competing messages. The metaphor is anachronistic, but then the Ancien Régime was a stranger to communications theory too.

Kenneth J. Banks tells us that the message that the old monarchy wished to convey was both unified and all-encompassing and so sometimes ill fitted to global diversity. It was the message of a single authority (the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

French bureaucratic monarchy) conveyed in a single language (French to the exclusion of regional competitors), and supported by a single religion (the Gallican Church, as intolerant of ultramontane tendencies as of Protestantism), a single legal framework (the Code Noir and the Coutume de Paris, banishing other codes such as that of Normandy), and a single economic system (state-focused mercantilism). Its single rationale was that colonies existed only for the benefit of the mother country and the best judge of benefit was the state. French business beamed out its own message, and the claims of colonials were at times at odds with both these signals. Whose message prevailed in a given time, place, or situation depended upon who commanded the means of communication.

Certainly, the monarchy's message did not always prevail at the periphery. For example, while the single entry-way to Canada, the St Lawrence, gave the state considerable control over Canada's connection with the Atlantic, the interior beyond Montreal was difficult to police. Geography was only part of the problem. An equally important part was that the royal message was conveyed by what Banks calls 'Authority's Fragmented Voice.' Local authorities had an interest in maintaining a Canadian presence in the West, which brought with it fur trade profits and military appointments and which constituted a bulwark against Canada's enemies. They were able 'to spin' the flow of information from Canada back to the centre to support their view at a time when Versailles tended to a different view. Versailles wanted as desperately as the modern undergraduate to know 'the true facts.' Did those with 'local knowledge' have a surer grasp on the truth of local situations or did those from outside see with clarity what local people could not see? 'Within this dilemma of determining truth in transatlantic information lay the problem of bureaucratic confusion and inertia,' Banks writes, ' the key weakness in the administration of the French Atlantic in the eighteenth century.' This is one example of the many he draws from West Indian, Canadian, and Louisianan history.

Paper and ink, horse and rider, sail and paddle, all were the media of empire. People with their own ideas, values, and interests and who conveyed the messages by these diverse means could themselves be

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

considered media of transmission. By these faltering means, the messages passed back and forth. No wonder eighteenth-century people preferred to deal with relatives and clients, not independent strangers. The messages did not always travel well, especially at the margins among *coureurs de bois* and slaves, and not at all among Indians, to whom Banks gives little attention. We could simply say of the French colonies before 1763 that local officials and colonists looked to their own interests, that there was a lot of smuggling, and that the colonies were not sufficiently important to retain the attention they needed. Or we could accept Banks's invitation to a new way of seeing. Either way, we may conclude that the *vieilles colonies* came into being, and mostly passed into history, well before adequate instruments of empire had been forged.

I have only one quibble: the dozens of intratextual references to historians and theorists get in the way of many fine stories and of the author's exposition of his thesis. What are footnotes for? (DALE MIQUELON)

Frances Burney. *The Witlings and The Woman-Hater*.
Edited by Peter Sabor and Geoffrey Sill
Broadview. 330. $18.95

With this very fine addition to the Broadview Literary Text series, Peter Sabor and Geoffrey Sill carefully usher Frances Burney, playwright, into the classrooms and libraries (private as well as public) of the twenty-first century. In doing so, they continue work they themselves began in 1995 with the publication of a two-volume edition of Burney's complete dramatic works, which they edited along with Stewart J. Cooke for Pickering and Chatto. This edition was followed in the late 1990s by critical attention from other scholars who produced several significant essays and a book-length study on Burney's achievement as a dramatist. Maybe most tellingly, in the summer of 2000, Burney's *A Busy Day* enjoyed a successful West End London run.

For the most part, the plays Burney wrote, revised, and planned to stage were not produced in her own time. Theatre managers, actors, fellow writers, friends, and family acknowledged and even encouraged Burney's dramatic talent, but for various reasons the plays she wrote remained the property of her circle of intimates who discussed, debated, and finally defeated the urge to nurse the productions into being. The plays, though, remain preserved in manuscripts, in Burney's hand, currently housed in the Berg Collection of the New York Public Library.

The copy-texts of this edition of *The Witlings* and *The Woman-Hater* are from these manuscripts and, therefore, represent Burney's last say on the plays as she envisioned them. But, as Sabor and Sill judiciously observe,

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

dramatic texts are just the beginning of a play's life. Production would have occasioned changes – revisions of language, enhancements of dialogue, sharpening of wit. Certainly that was the case in the 2000 production of *A Busy Day*, hence a 2000 edition of the play as 'adapted' by Alan Coveney. It is and will be a matter of lasting regret that Burney herself never had the chance to 'adapt' her own texts in light of the collaboration of performance. What we will inevitably be reading and discussing when we read and discuss her plays are possibilities, potential, promise. Though the words are on the page, we read them with an aching awareness that they were not brought to the stage in Burney's lifetime.

That being said, it is nevertheless important that we know the texts and that they be available in well-edited, attractive, teachable formats such as the one under review. These plays round out our view of Burney as a literary artist in command of narrative form and depiction of character. Sabor and Sill are to be commended for the decision to pair *The Witlings*, Burney's first play, with a later comedy, *The Woman Hater*, for in doing so they illustrate the maturing of Burney's artistic vision. The plays are yoked by a common character, Lady Smatter, who is a satiric portrait of the (not so) learned lady, and who seemed to Burney's contemporaries a scathing satiric comment on the bluestocking, Elizabeth Montagu and others of her ilk. The plays offer significant commentary on gender roles, cultural authority (both male and female), the interplay of sentiment and satire in an age struggling to come to terms with the source of moral and ethical behaviour. All of these topics will be of interest to students and cultural critics alike.

Sabor and Sill have provided an introduction that situates Burney's plays in the dramatic canon of her time. In the chronology they provide, they take great pains to record the 'theatrical' events in Burney's life, a welcome variation on the typical lifeline we are used to reading for Burney. Particularly intriguing is the record of private, family theatrical production, a feature of the late eighteenth- and nineteenth-century home that would bear further investigation and critical remark. Appendices offer an interesting mix of contextual material and critical insight. They include relevant passages from Burney's diaries and letters, a discussion and illustration of similarities between *The Witlings* and Molière's *Les femmes savantes*, a list of literary allusions in both plays, and a brief essay on similarities between *The Woman-Hater* and Burney's novels. There is a comprehensive bibliography that should prove useful to anyone undertaking research or study of Burney as dramatist.

In sum, then, this edition is a credit to the editors as well as to the playwright herself. The volume offers a compelling argument on several fronts as to the importance of Burney as a dramatist. (ELIZABETH KRAFT)

J. David Black. *The Politics of Enchantment: Romanticism, Media, and Cultural Studies*
Wilfrid Laurier University Press. x, 200. $34.95

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

David Black's goal in this study is to revitalize contemporary cultural studies by renewing its connection with Romantic social theory. More strident critics of cultural studies may see this as unnecessary in a field that seems to many already as being too inclined towards highly subjective analyses of social realities. Black, however, is not interested in the popular understanding of Romanticism as either intensely idealistic or sentimental, nor does he accept the view, put forward most notably by Colin Campbell, that Romanticism is essentially the ideological expression of consumerism. Instead, he wants to recover the more radically materialistic, more technologically savvy, and more socially progressive cultural and social theories that were characteristic, he believes, of early German Romanticism. These writers were the first to confront modernization and its contradictions. They developed a flexible and extensive critique of capitalism that too easily has been dismissed as sentimental, self-oriented, or nostalgic. Black seeks to recover a substantial body of thought on language, imagination, human agency, technology, and modernization which can be used to address the theoretical weaknesses and impasses of contemporary cultural studies.

The Politics of Enchantment provides a good general introduction to the history and many of the primary issues shaping cultural studies as a discipline through its focus on the major figures in media and cultural studies. British and American approaches to cultural studies are compared, particularly with regard to debates about mass media and whether they can be an authentic mode of communication. There follows a discussion of 'post-industrial' and poststructuralist ideas about the 'information society,' particularly with reference, respectively, to the ideas of Daniel Bell and Mark Poster. In one chapter, Black seeks to develop a romantic theory of contemporary media; in another, he provides a cultural studies of political economy.

One of the great values of this book is that it seeks to replace the caricature of Romanticism that has become popular in political economy and in critiques of cultural studies as being too 'romantic,' with a more positive understanding of the ways in which Romantic thought can revitalize contemporary accounts of media, communication, and economy. Black values Romanticism for its ideas about human agency, its reflection on language as mediation, its emphasis upon the importance of aesthetics to critical analysis, and its flexible and dynamic ideas about the production of culture. Most important, he values it as an alternative to Enlightenment

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

rationalism and to the instrumental rationality that has developed from it. The return to Romanticism is thus a return to a 'politics of enchantment,' a term that is used quite vaguely throughout the study.

A major weakness of this study is that most of what Black knows about Romanticism has come from secondary sources, particularly Andrew Bowie's *From Romanticism to Critical Theory* (1997). A more thoroughgoing acquaintance with the writers that he would have us value would have prevented some egregious errors, such as the confusion of Erasmus Darwin with his grandson Charles. Perhaps, it would have prevented such banalities as referring to John Keats as 'the precocious nightingale.' More important, Black's limited understanding of this literature prevents him from employing the writers' theoretical work to maximum effect. Romanticism remains more a fairly selective set of ideas in this book than a complex, theoretically informed practice. Black admits that his book is 'at best a prologue to the development and application of a full-fledged romantic theory of media.' The book is a good start in that direction, which I hope will be more fully realized in subsequent work. (ALAN BEWELL)

Ina Ferris. *The Romantic National Tale and the Question of Ireland*
Cambridge University Press. x, 210. £40, US $55.00

'A National Tale' was the subtitle of Sydney Owenson, Lady Morgan's successful novel, *The Wild Irish Girl* (1806). The story Ina Ferris tells is about the genre it provoked, and the cultural work it performed in the early years of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Ireland. This union, a shotgun wedding if ever there was one, formalized in 1801 after bribery and chicane, theoretically made the underdeveloped and exploited counties of Ireland the equal of those of England and Scotland. But by moving the centre of Irish political life from Dublin to London, and by the continued exclusion of the vast majority of its inhabitants from any participation in civic life, it was not clear what, if anything, had been gained by Ireland's changed status from colony to partner. That Ireland had grievances was clear. But whether those grievances would find a ready ear depended, at least in part, upon changing the image of Ireland from a land of subhuman peasants and savage rebels to a fertile country with its own rich culture, picturesque and poetic, different from but not inferior to that of the island to the east.

To effect that transformation was the work of the 'national tale,' a genre visibly based upon previous non-fictional genres, like the traveller's tour of Ireland, but using as its mythic basis the romantic bildungsroman, in which a hero's education consists primarily in his re-evaluation of his ideas, his picture of the world, through a set of new and enlarging experiences. As Ferris defines it, the 'romantic national tale' operates in terms of the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

International Theme. In its most typical form an Englishman, one with roots and lands in Ireland, travels into that kingdom by necessity rather than by design, motivated by parental dictate or the need to improve the productivity of his Irish estates. At first he misinterprets Ireland through the national stereotypes current in England. But after meeting an Irish woman whose enlightened education vanquishes his prejudices and whose local cultural knowledge helps him understand his surroundings, he begins to value Ireland correctly. In doing so he begins to 'belong' to that nation, a ratification of the Act of Union that is symbolized in their marriage. Versions of this genre, defiant or ingratiating in tone, appear in Morgan's *The Wild Irish Girl*, *O'Donnel* (1814), Maria Edgeworth's *Ennui* (1809) and *The Absentee* (1812). And one can see a tragic inversion of the same myth, with the sexes transposed as well, in Charles Robert Maturin's *The Milesian Chief* (1812). As Ferris puts it, the national tale did not so much eliminate the cultural stereotypes of Ireland as it changed them.

By the 1820s, however, the 'national tale' had a different job of cultural work to perform. It had become clear that the United Kingdom could never be truly united so long as Catholics were excluded from the rights of citizenship, but English politicians resisted change until Daniel O'Connell's Catholic Association organized Ireland around the issue. It is just then that novels about Ireland begin to return to the topic of the Wexford rising of 1798, with texts like Thomas Moore's *Memoirs of Captain Rock* (1824), Morgan's *The O'Briens and the O'Flahertys* (1827), and Michael Banim's *The Croppy* (1828). These texts about the Year of the French, Ferris says, 'thus *summon* the past, specifically the insurrection, to enforce a present demand.' In effect the British public was being warned to remember the past lest they repeat it. The demand was heard, and it was the Duke of Wellington, not noted for embracing his own Irish origins ('being born in a stable doesn't make one a horse'), who as prime minister in 1829 persuaded George IV to sign the bill granting Catholic Emancipation.

Given its emancipatory politics, the story Ferris tells needs to present Lady Morgan as the precursor of the genre, and to valorize her militant attitudes over the more emollient Horatian satire of Edgeworth. Possibly it was the desire to present Edgeworth as following in Morgan's footsteps that led Ferris to exclude from her 'national tale' the Anglo-Irish novel everyone knows, *Castle Rackrent* (1800). Sir Condy Rackrent, though, is precisely the sort of naïve Englishman turned Irish squireen through which Morgan was to focalize *The Wild Irish Girl*, and *Castle Rackrent* is at least equally important as a moment in the prehistory of postcolonialism.

Scholars of the period will be more challenged by the greater reach of Katie Trumpener's *Bardic Nationalism* (1997), which wrestles magisterially with larger questions – the dialectical interrelationship of historical novel, national tale, and Gothic romance – over the entire English-speaking world during the early nineteenth century. But for those interested in a close focus

on the unique case of Ireland at a key moment in its history, Ina Ferris's study will well repay attention. (DAVID H. RICHTER)

Heather Murray. *Come, Bright Improvement! The Literary Societies of Nineteenth-Century Ontario*
University of Toronto Press. xx, 338. $60.00

In his 1982 foundational essay, 'What Is the History of Books?' Robert Darnton identified lack of scholarly attention to reading as the weakest point in the circuit of authorship, publication, distribution, and reception whose study sustains the developing field of book history. Many scholars are now filling that gap in such undertakings as the Reading Experience Database (restricted to British readers) directed by Simon Eliot, and Jonathan Rose's recent tome, *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Class* (2001). It was once assumed that historical study of the literary activities of 'common' readers was impeded by a lack of resources, but as scholars expand their frames of reference, they discover new repositories of primary material. Heather Murray's current study demonstrates that even in Canada, where the archival collection of cultural history has been sporadic, fascinating primary resources await the determined researcher.

Murray focuses less on reading per se than on the social, political, and educational culture of free-standing self-study groups and clubs that defined their activities as 'literary.' In late nineteenth-century Canada, during the era before CBC radio and university extension programs offered opportunities for intellectual enhancement to the general public, these societies thrived, often under the encouragement of the Chatauqua movement. The heart of Murray's study is to be found in her eighty-page appendix, which describes more than three hundred literary societies known to have existed in Upper Canada/Canada West/Ontario before 1901, in tiny hamlets as well as larger cities. Their activities were reported in local newspapers and documented in their own scrapbooks and minute books, some of which survive in the collections of local historical societies, public libraries, and civic archives. While most societies dissolved under the pressures of new media and broader opportunities, several endured well into the later twentieth century.

Contrary to the prevailing notion that pre-modern Canada was a cultural wasteland, Murray documents groups of men and women striving towards intellectual betterment by engaging with the books and authors they valued. Those who organized clubs and lecture series tended to belong to (or aspire to) the middle class and, like the British working-class autodidacts described by Rose, shared a taste for canonical European and American works. While Murray theorizes that these societies provided cultural infrastructure for nascent Canadian writers, there is little evidence that

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Canadian authors received much attention (the Society for Canadian Literature, founded in Montreal in 1889 by W.D. Lighthall, seems to have had no Ontario equivalent). In some groups, entertainment and socializing prevailed as members gathered to listen to prepared speeches; the last decades of the century saw the development of a new participant model in which members prepared a common text in advance. Although not all groups named for a particular writer maintained their implied focus, the Browning Club of Toronto (1897–1905), whose programs appear as appendix C, sought to unravel the obscurities of their favourite author through a strenuous plan of group study.

Within the larger field that she maps (with the assistance of three helpful cartographic illustrations), Murray selects several demographic sectors for specific attention. Women are noted throughout, from the role of female immigrants like Mary Gapper O'Brien in organizing early backwoods libraries, to a full chapter on the rise of women's societies. In addition to the Toronto Women's Literary Club, now more famous for its promotion of female suffrage than for its titular activities, we learn about the Angelica Shakespeare Club of Owen Sound, whose dedication to the Bard reflected growing popular adulation of Shakespeare in the second half of the nineteenth century in England and the United States (see Lawrence Levine's *Highbrow/Lowbrow: The Emergence of Cultural Hierarchy in America*). The literary societies formed by Black communities in Chatham, Windsor, Amherstburg, and Toronto also receive detailed attention.

Revelations about previously unknown aspects of Canada's cultural history abound. These include the pervasiveness of the Chatauqua movement in Canada and the agency of women in Ontario's African-Canadian communities, as evidenced in the Windsor Ladies' Club, founded in 1854, and the Ladies' Literary Society of Chatham, which appear to be the first women's literary societies in Ontario. The book's wealth of information (with many details presented parenthetically) confirms that understanding of the past requires assiduous research into its detritus. Heather Murray is to be congratulated for providing a methodological model for further studies into Canada's community culture. While at one level her account may be only the 'tip of a cultural iceberg,' icebergs matter in this country. (CAROLE GERSON)

Susan Neylan. *The Heavens Are Changing:*
Nineteenth-Century Protestant Missions and Tsimshian Christianity
McGill-Queen's University Press. xvii, 402.

Susan Neylan has written a superb book. The book is no doubt important for aboriginal history in Canada and the history of Euro-Canadian culture in the nineteenth century, but an equally significant achievement is the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

model it offers for other subjects. We can, for example, use Neylan's approach to reconstruct the history of Christianity throughout the world for the last two thousand years. She has sought to reverse the analytic perspective usually taken by historians on religious conversion, intercultural contact, and whole-culture modification, and to a very large extent she has succeeded.

The ordinary view is to see the encounter of Christians with non-Christian peoples across the world as chiefly a matter involving outsiders who enter a new region, introduce the new religion, and by their activity induce the new peoples, or some of them, to take on Christianity. The view is the same no matter whether the subject is conversion to Christianity during the Roman empire, during the Tang dynasty in China, or during British rule in India. In Neylan's period, the outsiders are typically foreign missionaries, colonial military, legal, and political personnel, European settlers, and overseas commercial traders. More specifically, if the focus is upon the expansion of Christianity regarded as a thing about religion, and not merely as a question of economics, status, and politics, the study typically boils down to a history of missionaries. The term 'world Christianity' then refers to the history of Christian missions in the 'third world.' It takes a monumental act of the transformation of consciousness to think differently, and to see 'world Christianity' as 'Christianity throughout the world.'

Neylan's subject is the Tsimshian peoples who inhabit the region around what we call Prince Rupert where the Skeena River empties into the Pacific Ocean on the northwest coast of Canada. Her interest is the period between the 1857 and 1901 when most of the Tsimshian population of several thousand became Christians. She seeks to understand their conversion and what they subsequently made of Christianity during five decades of religious-cultural transformation. She takes notice of the Roman Catholics, but concentrates on Anglicans, Methodists, Salvation Army, and non-denominational Protestants. Her research is impressive, and so is her use of the language of the Tsimshian when handling the subtleties of her subject.

Reversing the perspective requires her to place the focus on the Tsimshian and to keep it there. This is not easy to do, since most of the sources available to her were produced either by the Euro-Canadian missionaries or, what is nearly the same thing, by Tsimshian for Euro-Canadian readers. In any case, reversing one's perspective can seem counter-normal, and there are whole realms of things that turn up viewed according to the old perspective in spite of good intentions. The effect is that Neylan spends far more time detailing things about Euro-Canadian missionaries and missions than she needs to.

Neylan is at her best when she develops the notions of Tsimshian Christians and Tsimshian Christianity. Tsimshian Christians emerge as the agents of their own authentic conversion, and the authors of their own genuine forms and expressions of Christianity. Tsimshian evangelists,

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

preachers, exhorters, missionaries, catechists, teachers, and other religious leaders as well as Tsimshian chiefs and numerous ordinary clan members all occupy primary positions in her analysis. Tsimshian rituals, organizations, beliefs, symbols, and material culture, suitably adapted, screened, and blended with Christianity originating elsewhere, transform into elements of what she calls Tsimshian Christianity. This indigenous form of Christianity reflects undoubted continuity with Christianity throughout the world even as it exhibits significant differences traceable to the particularity of the Tsimshian peoples.

Understanding the Tsimshian character of this Christianization has demanded a feat of original historical analysis, and Neylan has risen to the occasion. The changing of the heavens that she depicts is subtle, yet recognizably similar to religious changes throughout the long and varied history of Christianity, including, for instance, the extraordinary case of the Christianization of tens of millions of people in China since 1980. Her accomplishment warrants recommending the book to scholars dealing with subjects and time periods seemingly far removed from the Skeena River in the late nineteenth century. (C.T. MCINTIRE)

Kevin Hutchings. *Imagining Nature: Blake's Environmental Politics*
McGill-Queen's University Press. xiv, 258. $75.00

Kevin Hutchings's *Imagining Nature,* a sophisticated and detailed examination of William Blake's mediations of nature, is a welcome addition to the growing body of eco-criticism. Indeed, the book signals that 'green' criticism is now a part of the mainstream rather than working at the vanguard or margins. This is perhaps a mixed blessing, however, for even as Hutchings continues the work of showing how environmental concerns can inform the production, reception, and interpretation of literature, one also feels here that eco-criticism is in danger of becoming merely a set of interpretive manoeuvres, a methodology of finely tuned moralities that allows one to say new things about old texts.

Both for readers very familiar with Blake (for whom the book is primarily intended) and those familiar only with his shorter and more accessible works, Hutchings's argument is striking. While it may seem obvious that Blake, as a poet who celebrates the power of consciousness, imagination, and symbol over materiality, perception, and the literal, would be hostile to nature as an end in itself, and thus perhaps have little to say about environmental issues, Hutchings successfully undermines this view. He does so by finding in Blake's relentless dialectics both an acknowledgment of nature's reality and significance and, more important, a grounding of sorts for an ethical regard for the natural environment. A committed Foucauldian critic, Hutchings argues that because actual material nature is inaccessible to human consciousness, and so is always a matter of

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

'discursivity,' all ethical, open representations of it must be self-consciously deconstructing. Accordingly, Hutchings finds everywhere in Blake a 'pre-deconstructive double vision' when it comes to representations of nature. Much of this is very subtle, and it is especially interesting when it points to deep ambiguity in Blake's contemporaries (such as Newton, for instance), who are also shown to be open to both material and spiritual conceptions of the universe. Hutchings persuasively argues as well how Blake is committed to the doubleness of anthropomorphism, a humanization of the natural world that simultaneously reveals the inherent falseness of this process and incorporates nature into a system of ethical regard.

Imagining Nature is certainly an important contribution to Romantic studies, offering highly nuanced and informed readings of difficult poems. And it offers great insight into the problems of representing nature. Yet this work seems to push eco-criticism into a realm of nearly pure theory, in which nature is always-already discourse and symbol. What, after all, do literature or criticism have to offer our understanding of the natural world if we begin with the assumption, as Hutchings clearly does, that in observing animals, trees, or clouds, it is 'virtually impossible ... to catch even a fleeting glimpse of something "other" than ourselves'? Hutchings's version of Blake seems to have almost nothing to say about actually being in nature, of perceiving it and actually knowing something about it; there seems no possibility for what Lawrence Buell in *The Environmental Imagination* describes as the desire to produce 'thick description of the external world,' which Wordsworth and Shelley, for instance, at least occasionally reveal. Even violence and destruction are here only 'discursive practices,' and Hutchings is ever cautious about the myriad ways in which discourses of nature serve the purposes of governmental power.

It should be possible to present Blake as a poet more interested in the *physical*, even while stressing his overwhelming commitment to the symbolic, with nature not as a 'blank,' as Hutchings repeatedly says, but as real and infinitely intricate. Sexuality and the body, our most immediate connections to nature and important themes in Blake, are given scant attention, though the concept of gender is frequently explored. Perhaps most surprising is that Blake's interest in London as an urban environment is overlooked. For it might be here that we find Blake offering the most radical insight for contemporary environmental thinking, since he suggests that the city and architecture are the means through which human consciousness becomes material discourse, and in which boundaries between the natural and the unnatural, the human and the non-human, are blurred. What is lovelier than the idea, expressed in Blake's *Jerusalem*, that 'Houses are Thoughts'? (ONNO OERLEMANS)

Carol Shields. *Jane Austen*
Penguin 2001. 185. $28.99

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Carol Shields, author of ten novels and recipient of the Pulitzer Prize for her *Stone Diaries* in 1993, was an ideal writer to essay that most difficult of biographical subjects, Jane Austen. 'Almost as soon as I began to read Jane Austen's novels I became curious about her life,' she states. But Shields acknowledges the challenges to a biographer of Austen with characteristic honesty. The temptations to enliven 'the opacity of her life,' a life that is often called 'uneventful,' by speculations gleaned from her novels are great, but Shields manages to avoid them. She does, however, focus on the novels and their basis in the life: 'This is, in the end, what matters: the novels themselves and not the day-to-day life of the author,' for, as George Gissing asserted, 'the only good biographies are to be found in novels.' She addresses the Austen paradox: 'What is known of Jane Austen's life will never be enough to account for the greatness of her novels, but the point of literary biography is to throw light on a writer's works, rather than combing the works to recreate the author. The two 'accounts' – the life and the work – will always lack congruency and will sometimes appear to be in complete contradiction.'

Shields takes a sensibly chronological approach, and each of her twenty-three chapters focuses on a topic appropriate for that stage of Austen's life, with one chapter devoted to the circumstances surrounding each of her major works, from her juvenilia – where Shields poses the question, 'What makes a child of twelve or thirteen a satirist?' – to her final novel, *Persuasion* – to demonstrate how Austen developed her novelist's craft.

Shields supplies the known facts of Austen's sadly short life, but avoids the assumption that fiction flows directly from a novelist's own experience – as evidenced by the fact that, 'A writer of "marriage novels," Austen did not marry.' As a novelist, Shields takes a literary approach, asking, 'How does art come from common clay, in this case a vicar's self-educated daughter, all but buried in rural Hampshire? Who was she, really? And who exactly is her work designed to please?' Her answers are interesting: regarding 'the Tom Lefroy debacle,' she notes, 'the episode multiplied itself again and again in her novels, embedded in the theme of thwarted love and loss of nerve. In the novels, happily, there is often a second or third chance, a triumphant overriding of class difference.'

Shields is a profound admirer of Austen's art, praising her 'moral sensibility,' psychological realism and comic genius: 'Jane Austen's work presents a consummate artistry that is almost impossible to deconstruct, but which revolves around the fusing of moral seriousness with comic drama.' Shields notes 'a ferocious and insistent moral anger ... artfully concealed by the mechanism of an arch, incontrovertible amiability.' Given

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

to 'sparkling subversion' (*The Stone Diaries*) herself, she focuses on Austen's use of irony and the subversive 'politics of the glance.'

Raising the often-asked question 'How could a novelist who writes so astutely about her own immediate society fail to have mentioned the Napoleonic wars?' Shields says, '[Austen's] novels show her to be a citizen, and certainly a spectator, of a far wider world.' While her brothers were admirals of the British Navy, Jane 'brought to the page the only kind of combat a woman was allowed: the conquest of hearts and the overturning of domestic arrangements.' Shields argues, 'Here, in fact, was all that was immediately knowable: families, love affairs, birth and death, boredom and passion, the texture of the quotidian set side by side with the extremities of the human spirit.'

Rather than finding sources for her fiction in her life, Shields opines that Austen 'saw novel making as an excursion to an invented world rather than a meditation on her own.' Austen's fiction compensated for deficiencies in her real life: 'Her heroines claimed their lives through ideal marriages, while she found her own sense of arrival through her novels.' Shields argues that '*Pride and Prejudice*, that happiest of novels, erupted from a period of sadness, of personal disappointment,' and, in *Persuasion*, Austen may be 'rewriting the trajectory of her own life and giving it the gift of a happy ending.'

The Penguin Lives Series is casual to a fault: entirely lacking scholarly paraphernalia, such as a bibliography or index, or even such standard signposts as a table of contents or chapter headings, it appeals to a broader readership. The craft of Carol Shields ensures that the book will be immensely readable and insightful. Shields's scholarly preparation and critical acumen, however, ensure that the book will also be valuable to Austen scholars. (NORA FOSTER STOVEL)

Bruce Stovel and Lynn Wenlos Gregg, editors. *The Talk in Jane Austen*
University of Alberta Press. xxiii, 269. $29.95

This collection of essays is the by-product of a three-day conference on 'The Talk in Jane Austen,' held at a regional meeting of the Jane Austen Society of North America (JASNA) in Jasper, Alberta in May, 1999. The collection consists of fifteen conference papers submitted by university professors, graduate students, and independent scholars.

In many respects, the essays in this collection resemble the essays usually published in *Persuasions*, the journal published annually by JASNA. Couched in graceful and limpid prose, they represent an admirable kind of academic New Criticism in its most distilled form. Confined exclusively to the six canonical novels, with primary emphasis given to *Pride and Prejudice* and *Emma,* they eschew historical contextualization outside the world of the novels for the most part and, with one important exception, avoid any kind

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

of theoretical underpinning, even when that might help to clarify an argument. Perhaps as a result, the authors overlook a number of recent general studies of conversation – e.g., Leah Kedar's *Power through Discourse* (1987), Jennifer Coates's *Women Talk* (1996), and Martin Malone's *Worlds of Talk* (1997) – not to speak of John Dussinger's penetrating section on conversation in Austen's novels in *In the Pride of the Moment* (1990).

In spite of these limitations, the essays offer a variety of perspectives towards their chosen subject. Jocelyn Harris examines the ways Austen seeks to subvert the stereotypes of the silent, submissive woman and the shrew, while Bruce Stovel traces a shift from telling to asking questions in Austen's heroines. In separate essays, Isobel Grundy and Jeffrey Herrle study Austen's excessive talkers, while Kay Young makes an effective distinction betwen word-work, which occurs at crucial turning points in the novels, and word-play, which creates texture in the sections between these crucial moments. Juliet McMaster offers an analysis of the grammatical patterns of the novels' verbal aggressors, especially Mrs Elton and Isabella Thorpe, while Jan Fergus notes that laughter is the language of the disempowered. In the most ambitious and original essay in the volume, Gary Kelly draws upon Benedict Anderson's *Imagined Communities* to show how Austen, through the convention of free indirect speech, participates in the formation of the modern British state. Deserving more extended treatment, Kelly's argument confirms one's impression that Austen's novels performed a cultural role in the nineteenth century analogous to that of the *Spectator* papers in the eighteenth.

In other essays, Ronald Hall draws attention to the extent to which Austen denies her characters voice, while Linda Bree points out the difference between the conventions of conversation in Austen's time and our own. Sarah S.G. Frantz surveys the proposal scenes, drawing attention to the way they contribute to the moral education of Austen's heroes; by contrast, Nora Foster Stovel offers a perceptive reading of Austen's best-known novel, *Pride and Prejudice*. In more speculative essays, Elizabeth Newark imagines what Austen's seducers might have said, had they been granted the power of speech; and Steven D. Scott proffers the off-the-wall suggestion that the learned Mary Bennet, not Elizabeth, 'stands in' for Jane Austen in *Pride and Prejudice*. It is unlikely that Scott's proposal will find many takers, but, like the other essays in this volume, it will succeed if it provokes the reader to re-examine commonly held opinions of these familiar works.

I conclude by commenting on the singular inappropriateness of the cover illustration to a volume of essays of this nature. The illustration displays a full-frontal, half-length portrait of a young woman staring glassy-eyed at the beholder, her mouth wide open with her tongue almost protruding, and the sash of her garment drooping in front, all the better to reveal the fullness of her breasts. Elizabeth Newark observes that George Wickham

'doubtless seduced [Lydia Bennet] by raising one eyebrow or lifting a finger.' In this context, the cover illustration, far from evoking an Emma Woodhouse or Elizabeth Bennet, suggests nothing so much as Lydia Bennet eagerly awaiting Wickham's arrival. (CHARLES H. HINNANT)

George Nelson. *My First Years in the Fur Trade: The Journals of 1802–1804.*
Edited by Laura Peers and Theresa M. Schenck
McGill-Queen's University Press. viii, 236. $44.95

The writings of George Nelson deserve to be more widely known. Hired in 1802 at age fifteen by Alexander Mackenzie's XY Company and let go by the Hudson's Bay Company in 1823, Nelson spent the bulk of his career with the North West Company in the region of Lake Winnipeg. Nelson was somewhat of a marginal figure in all three firms, but while he lacked the savvy (or ambition) to grasp his way up the fur trade ladder, as an observer and chronicler of this world, and particularly of its Native peoples, he is almost without equal. An edition of his writings on Ojibwa cosmology appeared in 1988, and the present edition provides us with Nelson's story of his beginnings in the trade; there remain several unpublished works, and it is to be hoped that more volumes will follow.

Laura Peers and Theresa Schenck present three texts in this edition, all drawn from manuscripts housed at the Baldwin Room of the Toronto Reference Library. The works are retrospective: Nelson's journal for 1802–3 was written at an unknown date, his journal for 1803–4 was composed in 1811, and a broader autobiographical narrative dates from 1836. The first two works are presented as primary texts, while passages from the third are employed in a supplementary fashion.

The narrative begins with Nelson's engagement by the upstart XY Company in February 1802 and describes his activities over the succeeding two years at trading posts among the Ojibwa of the Folle Avoine district of the upper Mississippi (present-day Wisconsin). The historical context is one of cutthroat rivalry between the XYC and the more established NWC, and of almost constant warfare between the Ojibwa and Dakota.

Keeping in mind that these are the recollections of an older man, Nelson comes across as a highly sensitive and self-reflective person. At one level this narrative is a coming-of-age story, as the naïve and impressionable young man is thrust suddenly into a world of violence and licence. Nelson is by turns sympathetic and harsh towards his younger self; he sees his distressing situation reflected in the lines of Psalms 119 and 120, yet when a rival trader attempts to stab him with a fish spear he concedes, 'I deserved all this for my weakness.' Coerced into a trading-alliance marriage with the daughter of an Ojibwa chief, Nelson seems to have felt remorse for the shabby treatment this woman received, and parts of the narrative have the feel of an examination of conscience.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Nelson claims that he writes 'not to charm but to inform,' but in the end he does both. His journals are culturally literate, readable, and engaging, and many passages benefit from being read aloud. Nelson's descriptions of some fur traders' attempt to replicate a Native 'conjuring' ceremony, the castration of an abusive Ojibwa man by the women of his community, and the compelling tale of the haunting of Nelson's post on the Chippewa River are tales deserving of speedy anthologization. Nelson is an acute observer of society, fascinated by the ways of the Native peoples among whom he lives, and finely attuned to the politics of the fur trade, with its patron-client relationships, family ties, jealousies, hatreds, and rampant gossip.

Peers and Schenck are to be commended for their fine and careful editorial work, which is a model of how these kinds of documents ought to be presented. The editors provide a full bibliographic description of the manuscripts and an account of editorial decisions made, and the edition is supported by excellent historical contextualization and helpful annotations and biographical sketches. The presentation of the 1836 journal ruptures the coherence of that text, but this loss is compensated for by the effective juxtaposition of multiple accounts of certain events. (BILL MOREAU)

Christopher A. Thomas. *The Lincoln Memorial and American Life*
Princeton University Press. xxxii, 214. US $35.00

The Civil War had barely ended, and Lincoln just recently buried, when the Radical Reconstructionists of the Fortieth Congress sought to memorialize Lincoln through a national monument. As Christopher A. Thomas demonstrates in this cogently written study, it took Lincoln boosters fifty-five years, from 1867 to 1922, to dedicate a national memorial to Lincoln's ambiguous legacy.

The core of this first extensive investigation of the memorial is Thomas's detailed discussion of the monument and its architect, Henry Bacon. Bacon refined his early interest in Greek and Roman architecture through six years of work for McKim, Mead and White, for whom he applied classical vocabularies to modern building designs in the 1890s. Thomas focuses on Bacon and the memorial's architecture, leaving a discussion of Daniel Chester French's sculpture and Jules Guèrin's murals, as well as the memorial's landscaping (including reflecting pool), to other scholars. Most of the book concerns the planning, design, and construction of the memorial, a period that spans from 1901, when the memorial was proposed as part of the larger McMillan Plan for Washington, through 1922, when the building of the memorial was finally complete. Thomas's strength is in describing not only the memorial's design and construction, but also in situating the design and approval process in the complex climate of Washington political manoeuvring. In one of the book's more persuasive analyses, Thomas demonstrates how the memorial became a site of political

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

contestation between an older, congressionally centred Democratic party and the Republican party of Teddy Roosevelt and William Howard Taft, which featured a new emphasis on a centralized federal government led by a powerful president.

The first and last chapters historicize the memorial more broadly in 'American life.' Here Thomas adds to recent studies of both Lincoln and memorial architecture, such as Kirk Savage's important *Standing Soldiers, Kneeling Slaves* (1997). Thomas cogently argues that in the ongoing debate over Lincoln's legacy (Lincoln as emancipator of the slaves, or Lincoln as saviour of the Union?), the memorial was 'built to celebrate and foster consensus and reconciliation.' Over time, what had begun as a decidedly partisan monument to a Northern president was transformed into an icon of 'universal' American ideals that knitted together North and South. Finally, in the civil rights era of the mid-twentieth century, activists such as Marian Anderson and the organizers of the 1963 March on Washington reappropriated Lincoln's long-buried legacy as Emancipator by using the monument as a site of vernacular civic ritual.

Although Thomas does suggest that Lincoln's legacy as 'Savior of the Union' was a political compromise that came at the expense of African Americans, the question of race does not generally animate his research. Because the project memorializes Lincoln, however, I found myself at times wishing for a broader analytic mandate. For example, in discussing the extensive press coverage of the memorial designs' public presentations in 1911/12, Thomas relies exclusively on Bacon's scrapbook from the period. In 1912, W.E.B. Du Bois was editing the *Crisis*, the organ of the NAACP, and James Weldon Johnson published the opening volley of the Harlem Renaissance (*Autobiography of an Ex-Colored Man*); one wonders if the African-American press or the 'talented tenth' had any comment on the design of the memorial. Similarly, Thomas skips over his one observation that one of Guèrin's murals, entitled *Emancipation of a Race*, metaphorically narrates the emancipation of the slaves. Given what we know about the whitewashing of history in the age of Jim Crow memorial making, Guèrin's mural seems a vocal political intervention; one wishes for further analysis here.

Fortunately, however, given the skilled contributions accumulating in the history of American public memory, including the role of race, Thomas doesn't have to do everything in one book. His tight focus on Bacon and the memorial design makes his book the definitive treatment of the memorial's architectural history. More broadly, however, Thomas's persuasive analysis of the memorial's relation to the partisan political culture of a rapidly industrializing society makes the book a must-read for students of American public memory and Progressive Era cultural history. (ELSPETH H. BROWN)

William Barr, editor. *From Barrow to Boothia: The Arctic Journal of Chief Factor Peter*

Warren Dease, 1836–1839
McGill-Queen's University Press. xxiv, 332. $49.95

In 1836 the Hudson's Bay Company resolved to complete the chart of the Arctic coastline of North America, of which some 760 kilometres remained unsurveyed after almost a century of exploration. George Simpson, the HBC's governor in North America, entrusted the leadership of the Arctic Discovery Expedition to his young cousin and private secretary, Thomas, and the veteran HBC factor Peter Warren Dease. Simpson and Dease were assigned five tasks: to produce a narrative of the voyage, to draw up charts of the coastline, to take formal possession of the land for Great Britain, to name geographical features, and to collect 'specimens of natural history.'

The first of these tasks was accomplished in 1843 with the posthumous publication of Thomas Simpson's *Narrative of the Discoveries on the North Coast of America*, which describes the complete success of the small-boat expedition. Efficient work in the summer of 1837 covered the western gap to Point Barrow; after faltering in 1838, the explorers completed the chart of the coast eastwards to the Boothia Peninsula in the summer of 1839.

And yet half the tale remained untold, for in his narrative Simpson arrogated credit for the mission's success to himself and effaced the contribution of his elder partner. Now, some 150 years later, Dease's version of events has at last appeared. The text, edited by William Barr, is drawn from a journal housed at the McCord Museum in Montreal, and covers activities of the expedition from its departure from Norway House in July 1836 to its return to Fort Simpson in October 1839.

This edition is very much a work of rehabilitation, and the injustice of Simpson's treatment of Dease soon becomes clear. 'I [was] hampered with an old man on my back,' Simpson wrote to a cousin, but without Dease's intimate knowledge of the terrain (he had participated in the second Franklin expedition), his good relationship with the Native peoples through whose land they travelled, and his rapport with the engaged men of the expedition, the mission would surely have failed.

Each of the edition's eleven chapters consists of a historical introduction, passages from Dease's journal, and supporting documents such as post journals and correspondence to and from the expedition's leaders. Dease's journal proper takes up just under half of the text. Many of the supplementary documents are letters by Simpson, and one is struck by the contrast between Dease's bare daily entries and Simpson's lively style and witty turns of phrase. Early on in the volume the protagonist is in danger of being upstaged by his detractor, but as the expedition unfolds Dease becomes increasingly sympathetic, while Simpson's arrogance deepens, and we begin to appreciate the simple, unselfconscious prose of Dease and

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

to cringe at Simpson's florid tropes. Indeed, much of the attraction of Dease's narrative lies in its very monotony, which must convey something of the day-to-day tedium of the expedition (but which nonetheless is punctuated by scores of picturesque vignettes, such as the taking of a litter of wolf pups at the Dismal Lakes and the finding of George Back's cache at Montreal Island).

The introduction, notes, and biographical sketches bespeak meticulous historical research, much of which was undertaken by Barr's colleague Ian MacLaren. One wishes for a fuller treatment of the manuscript; neither a bibliographic description nor an account of the principles employed in its transcription is provided. Some discussion of the relationship between Dease's journal and the field notebooks on which it is based would also have been welcome. (BILL MOREAU)

Kieran Egan. *Getting It Wrong from the Beginning: Our Progressivist Inheritance from Herbert Spencer, John Dewey, and Jean Piaget*
Yale University Press. x, 204. US $39.50

Since the publication of John Dewey's *Democracy and Education* in 1916, educational theorists in North America have been consumed with the question of its importance. There are essentially two schools of thought: one which agrees with Dewey that education should be something like a mirror of nature; the other which argues that it should be more a reflection of culture. In his latest book, Kieran Egan insists that for theoretical reasons educators place no confidence in 'nature' for teaching them anything about learning. In fact, for Egan, it is a faith in nature that educators have got 'wrong from the beginning.'

Theories which 'biologize' the mind, treating it as an object of natural science like a tree or the body, have encouraged educators to organize learning materials around imaginary laws they find implicit in children's nature, according to Egan. Hence, Dewey's creed that an educator 'has to find ways of doing consciously and deliberately what "nature" accomplishes in the early years,' before a child arrives at school, has led formal schooling astray. For Egan, this belief 'continues to undermine our attempts to make schooling more effective.' Pedagogies like Dewey's 'child-centeredness' or Piaget's 'psychological developmentalism' have guided North American systems of education towards low international test scores and a generally tuned out student body because they have no connection to how students learn.

Interestingly, Egan locates the source of this naturalist distortion in a largely forgotten theorist of education. In the mid-nineteenth century, Herbert Spencer declared assiduously that progress was 'a beneficent

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

necessity,' the inexorable march of 'man.' If progress could be predicted, then, science would teach us how. 'The biographies of monarchs,' wrote Spencer, 'throw scarcely any light upon the science of society.' The content of curriculum should be selected for its obvious 'utility in the projected life of the student.' Like water for the tree, students require only those subjects which directly assist them to grow in and with their societies, subjects like social science and 'utilitarian' activities (i.e., sewing) rather than history, classics, and the arts. Skills trump 'irrelevant' knowledge every time.

In contrast, Egan argues that we treat the mind as something altogether different from a 'mirror' while resisting traditionalist projects of directly transferring culture. The mind for him is a collection of cognitive tools which are useful in particular ways in different cultural environments. There is no naturally preferred form of human intellectual maturity, according to Egan. Rather, intellectual life is a product of 'inmindating' specific cultural devices (like abstract thought) invented within a particular cultural history.

One can comfortably agree that it takes a generous interpretation of history to believe in the inevitable 'progress' of humankind and that science can help us predict it. We've just emerged from probably the most violent century in our history, with every sort of atrocity committed by Spencer's 'man' upon man, in our most scientifically 'advanced' era. Nevertheless, the notion of what constitutes good progressivist practices based on 'scientific principles' is a hotly debated topic.

Education that assumes as its purpose winning wars or improving trade is neither 'scientific' as a means of discovering anything 'natural' nor scientific in the Deweyan sense. Dewey's vision encompassed simultaneous moral, social, *and* intellectual development in its practice and not submitting rigidly to the *status quo* of society *or* nature, even. He believed it the responsibility of education to prepare children for an unknowable future and not some predictable outcome of play or biology. Children should be the focus not the architects of curriculum; they may pose a particular question but it's up to society to help them answer it. For example, in 1887 Dewey denied that 'nature, as natural, can give birth to an ideal.' Morals are learned not simply from learning 'moral' situations, but also their opposite. Teaching children about tyrannical leaders of history teaches them something about cruelty.

As well, when Egan claims that Spencer's social Darwinism 'is shared almost universally among educators,' he is setting up a 'straw man.' Most educators (including Dewey) wouldn't locate many of Spencer's principles in their practice, and the connection is somewhat specious. While Egan's book is interesting for what it teaches educators about the hazards of schooling based on false beliefs about nature, most educators, including progressivists, would agree. (JOHN LEWIS)

F. Murray Greenwood and Barry Wright, editors. *Rebellion and Invasion in the Canadas, 1837–1839: Canadian State Trials, Vol II*
University of Toronto Press for the Osgoode Society for Canadian Legal History.
xix, 499. $75.00

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

The rebellions in Lower and Upper Canada confirmed the colonial governments' worst fears of armed insurrection and revolution and presented 'what is arguably the most serious state-security crisis in Canadian history.' More than 350 individuals were tried for treason and other related offences punishable by death. Most, as Barry Wright concludes in his examination of 'The Kingston and London Courts Martial,' received only 'summary justice, with the thinnest veneer of legality.' Indeed, despite authorities' public pronouncements that they intended to preserve the rule of law and exercise judicious mercy, for most justice was often, as Colin Read concludes, withheld or dispensed in a 'niggardly way.'

This second volume of the Canadian State Trial Series examines how authorities in both colonies used and often bent the rule of law to meet what they considered were the extraordinary circumstances of 1837–39. Most of the authors who contributed to the collection conclude that officials 'clearly breached the norms of common law.' As Barry Wright and the late F. Murray Greenwood explain in their very fine introduction, when the courts become a political battlefield, the legal and constitutional issues become complex. Moreover, both colonial governments 'were acutely mindful ... of the danger that obvious manipulation of legal process would compromise' their legitimacy and popular support. The six articles in part 1 examine some of these issues as they emerged in Upper Canada. Rainer Baehre's clearly written explanation of the legislation and 'Overall Legal Strategy' of Upper Canadian authorities is followed by detailed examinations of the treason trials in Toronto, Kingston, London, western Upper Canada, and Windsor and the dilemma the patriot exiles faced with a 'cruel and capricious convict system.' As various authors highlight, two central problems confronting authorities were whether civilians could be court-martialled and what to do with non-British subject-'bandits' who, by definition could not be charged with treason, but who were also not prisoners of war (since Great Britain and the United States were not at war). The consequences of what became heated debates over these issues came together, as Greenwood eloquently discusses in the 'Prince Affair,' when government ambivalence (both at the colonial and imperial level), a highly charged and vengeful border community, and the violent predilections of one magistrate-militia officer culminated in the summary shooting of American 'bandits' in a clear and successful breach of the rule of law.

Part 2 opens with a fascinating discussion by Jean-Marie Fecteau of the contradiction between the right to revolt often violently and government's determination to maintain order. In Lower Canada between 1837 and 1839,

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

'distinctions among law, power and politics became very much blurred.' In the end, 'the establishment of the rule of law' became 'the veil behind which arbitrary power' was exercised. Also intriguing is Greenwood's evaluation of the General Court Martial of Montreal in light of British justice in Ireland at the end of the previous century and the discussion by Beverly Boissery and Clara Paterson about why women who actively supported 'treasonous' activities were not brought before the courts. The volume concludes with extensive appendices that include very useful discussion of sources in the National Archives and the Quebec and Ontario Archives, together with selected supporting documents including the enabling acts passed to deal with those involved in the rebellions and how some leading jurists interpreted and intended to implement them.

All of the articles of *Rebellion and Invasion in the Canadas, 1837–1839* rest on a careful reading of the rich legal sources of the period and an appreciation of the current debates about the nature and the legacy of the rebellions. And this is a welcome and overdue addition to our ongoing understanding of a critical period in colonial development. (E. JANE ERRINGTON)

Kate Lawson and Lynn Shakinovsky. *The Marked Body: Domestic Violence in Mid-Nineteenth-Century Literature*
SUNY Press. vii, 204. US $19.95

In *The Marked Body*, Kate Lawson and Lynn Shakinovsky argue that the abused bodies of women reveal the otherwise-unrepresentable acts of domestic violence that permeate the middle-class home, and that the marks borne on women's bodies 'point beyond the violence that begets them to broader areas of female experience, sexuality, and consciousness.' Employing a psychoanalytic framework to examine denial, repression, and diversion in a range of nineteenth-century texts, the authors explore both the psychic reality of intimate violence and the social constructs that shape and silence it. Though they use theory deftly, they do so without losing the consistent gracefulness of their prose. This important study demonstrates that women's struggle to speak about domestic violence is figured by social limitations, as well as personal ones, and that when voice is suppressed, the marked body speaks volumes.

Lawson and Shakinovsky are sharp readers, and they cover a wide range of texts, from the realist to the sensational, the short story to the novel; they read Hawthorne, Barrett Browning, Gaskell, Trollope, Eliot, and Collins. Their exploration of fiction is subtle and complex. Most impressive are their discussions that break down the binaries used to shore up violence. For example, in a fascinating analysis, they foreground Eliot's deconstruction of 'opposing' medical models and turn, instead, to a hermeneutic model, using this as a means of reading violence in 'Janet's Repentance.' They argue that, in this way, Eliot renders Dempster's violence visible – through Janet's body

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

– 'but "unreadable," morally incoherent.' In *Barchester Towers*, they explore the relationship between Signora Neroni and Eleanor Bold, which allows one to appear pure and the other abject, while expressing the social interdependence of the two figures. Similarly, in their discussion of *Aurora Leigh*, they emphasize the significance of Marian in Aurora's struggles, finding the 'blanks, absences, illegibilities, and contradictions [of Aurora's development] largely figured in the body of Marian.' In 'The Poor Clare' and *Man and Wife*, they point to the ways that the bodies of Lucy's ghostly double and Anne's working-class double, Hester, bespeak the bourgeois violence that can find its way into the narrative by no other means. In these chapters, they reveal that the walls surrounding the 'comfortable, customary domestic middle-class environment' are breached by the 'spectral manifestations of what may not be mentioned,' even if readers are returned to that normative space in the tale's close.

Though their arguments are quite persuasive, it is when they *reproduce* the strict boundaries that they tackle elsewhere – between the public and private, between body and speech – that the study falters. In 'The Poor Clare,' the authors read Bridget's 'unrepresentable' confession as inefficacious and sensational, dismissing her engagement in the very bodily (starvation, feeding, nursing) and the lasting social effects of her behaviour (the termination of a war) – a reading that negatively colours their interpretation of the whole text. In 'Janet's Repentance,' it is the complex histories of all three figures, histories that disrupt simple characterizations – Dempster is not simply aggressive and 'evil' or Janet simply 'blank' – that make the tale compelling. Tryan offers confession as a way to relieve pain, but the suggestion that 'The Christian model of confession makes the past a blank slate' flattens out the tensions in the narrative. Confession and forgiveness *rely* upon the persistence of sin; in fact, they makes no sense without it; just as Janet's crippling anguish makes sense in part because her tragically violent marriage emerges out of tender love. When the authors argue that 'all of the crucial events in Marian's life occur through her body,' they fail to register Marian's choice to flee her mother's abuse and her remarkable ability to critique the social codes that would have made her simply a victim as a daughter and a mother. The outcome of such readings is the authors' frequent reference to violence (such as the rape Marian ultimately suffers) as 'inevitable,' as 'a matrix from which escape is essentially impossible.'

While their movement through each text is filled with insight and they make a strong case for the role of women's bodies as the index of unspeakable violence, I see much of the disruption and haunting that the authors highlight as potentially effective critique – critique that undermines the monolithic quality of the social matrix they seem to read as impervious to change. (MARLENE TROMP)

Gerard Curtis. *Visual Words: Art and the Material Book in Victorian England*

Ashgate. xii, 306. US $94.95

From his curiosity about why authors' portraits often show them holding pens, and why the old British Museum Reading Room had false bookcases for doors, Gerard Curtis aims to offer a perspective on the relationship between what he calls the textual and the visual. By textual he means printed texts, and not texts in the wider definition usually used in history of the book studies. His aim is to examine portraits and paintings, books and other written texts as containers of discourse. He says that pen and pencil – his textual and visual – were united in the Victorian mind. My main objection to this, apart from the narrow definition of text, is that the Victorian period was long and ever-changing. But through his examples Curtis himself in fact demonstrates his recognition of that fact. The chapter endnotes and the extensive secondary bibliography illustrate the research and scholarship of this wide-ranging book.

Chapter 1 looks at the Victorian connection between pen and pencil. Writing was dominant in the nineteenth century, and although it was sometimes accompanied by illustration, the word was the thing. Through a series of complex examples, including hieroglyphics, copy books, and calligraphy, Curtis explores visual and textual literacy, penmanship and draftsmanship, in what he describes as the history of intellect.

Chapter 2 analyses three paintings in detail: William Powell Frith's *Derby Day* (1858), Ford Madox Brown's *Work* (1852–65), and John Orlando Parry's *A London Street Scene* (1835). Curtis says they exemplify the tensions, relationships, and barriers between the pictorial and the textual. The chapter is, as he admits, an excursion. It's a good, well-written, and highly perceptive study. The paintings may well be a reflection of early Victorian life, a commentary on modernity, and may even have been inspired by Dickens, but they are a long way from the material book.

Chapters 3 and 4 on Dickens are useful contributions to material book history. Curtis gives good, detailed examples of advertising and publicity techniques. This is familiar territory, the world of capitalism, commerce, and commodity that sponsored and was at least in part responsible for the Victorian text in all its forms. The chapter on portraits of Dickens emphasizes his role as cultural icon, his deliberate cultivation of a public persona, and ways in which his image was exploited, aspects of fame and fortune that we can recognize even in today's society.

Chapter 5, 'The Empty Biscuit Tin,' looks at a few material images of books. The title refers to the famous Huntley and Palmers 1901 biscuit tin in the form of a strap of books. Curtis identifies some of them, though seemingly fails to recognize Samuel Smiles – 'a book called *Self Help*.' His interpretation is perhaps a little over the top, 'the biscuit tin ... a signifier of the act of consumption, of reading as an ephemeral action which leaves permanent remains in the form of the book (the trace of consumption).'

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Further, he identifies 'the ephemeral abstract nature of the text (the biscuit), and the permanent physical nature represented by the book ... Text is biscuit but book is tin and object.' Then we're off on another excursion, to the British Museum's old Reading Room for a potted history and another empty biscuit tin, the dummy bookshelf doors. What perhaps should have been a separate chapter on bindings is appended to the biscuits. There is the perhaps inevitable emphasis on ornate, decorative bindings, to the exclusion of mass market covers that of course had a far more wide-reaching role in culture, society, and literacy. The closing sections of this chapter, including images of women readers and the Bible, are interesting, but the subjects are all too briefly explored.

This appears to be a book about the relationship between books and art, word and image. Without doubt, Curtis is strong on Dickens: his book comes to life in the Dickens chapters. Elsewhere it is at times a good and, as it advertises itself, interdisciplinary study, as far as it goes. But it has limitations, and its title promises more: so there's a mere nod in the direction of William Thackeray, a brief mention of William Morris, and nothing on the Brontës. There are glances back to the eighteenth century and a conclusion mostly about the twentieth, although in the introduction Curtis suggests that the textual-visual relationship was a peculiarly nineteenth-century phenomenon. There's a lot about Victorian periodicals, and a fair dose of Europe. It is perhaps unfortunate that the illustration on the back of the dust jacket is neither Victorian nor English. Perhaps it's just the title of the book that's wrong. (GILLIAN FENWICK)

Kathryn Carter, editor. *The Small Details of Life: Twenty Diaries by Women in Canada, 1830–1996*
University of Toronto Press. xi, 486. $65.00, $34.95

As the editor notes in her introduction, 'diaries' appear in a variety of forms. Excerpts here range from drafts for future completed works (Frances Ramsay Simpson), to *aides-mémoires* for housewives charged with the ongoing management of complicated households (numerous), to explorations of how one is living one's life in ways that one may or may not wish to change (Marian Engel). In the twenty examples here, one finds plenty of tedious details, but among them are some real zingers. Constance Kerr Sissons quits writing for a space after (probably) meeting her new husband's unsuspected long-term lover. During entries covering eighteen months, Sarah Welch Hill notes several serious instances of domestic assault on her by a husband who claims to have married her 'for spite,' though it's more likely he married her for her small inheritance. And the simplicity of Elsie Rogstad Jones's notations about her second child during a fateful week in October 1943 conceals raw despair behind the common elements of diary

style:

> October 16, 1943 – Phyllis sat on the kitchen floor by herself & watched me work.
> October 17, 1943 – Sun. Phyllis was sick this A.M. I thought it was flu but we took her to Islay Dr. Sweet had to operate. Started to rain.
> October 18, 1943 – Phyllis passed away at noon, – oh why – she was so healthy, sweet & good maybe someday we will understand.
> October 19, 1943 – [No entry]
> October 20, 1943 – [No entry]
> October 21, 1943 – Has rained for days Mom is with me to day. we washed clothes Mrs Ennis was up. Jimmy has a terrible cold.
> October 22, 1943 – Snowed last nite. It is so hard to take. It gets worse I miss my baby so Pat went to school to day I had 3 kids for dinner at noon.
> October 23, 1943 – Cold out feels like winter Pat stayed over last nite. I was busy all day baked 3 pumpkin pies Roy Doris & Elmer came in in the evening.

The operative five-word phrase – 'I miss my baby so' – might be lost in the details.

This raises the question of how we read such diaries in terms of how these women engaged with the act of living. The collection here contains only two examples where the writers appear up-front and earthy in their approach to life. One is a diary discovered during a house renovation decades after it was written. The excerpt by Mary Dulhanty covers three months at Mount Saint Vincent, where Mary laments her sinfulness but plans a lively life, nonetheless. It is not surprising that she emblazons the cover with 'S.W.A.K.' (Sealed with a Kiss), or that ten years later (1936) she had the nerve to end a Roman Catholic marriage with a Reno divorce! The other 'lively' example is Marian Engel's few pages on two months in Prince Edward Island in 1976, where she ponders the opposite problems of too much drink and too little sex.

In contrast to these two, primness rules the day in the excerpts chosen for this book and, I suspect, in the materials available for selection. This can't only be chalked up to Dorothy Duncan MacLennan's epigraph to her own diary, that 'No one ever keeps a diary who doesn't expect it to be read by someone else – unless it is purely a reference for his own future use.' In the case of MacLennan and most of the other entries, fear of discovery may explain the cult of pure womanhood that holds their entries in thrall, but one suspects that Dulhanty and Engel simply didn't give a damn, not that they were inordinately secretive or naïve.

It is always difficult to do justice to long compilations in a short review. At first glance, nearly five hundred pages of this sort of material seemed daunting. Moments of raw emotion, however, such as the one quoted above, rewarded close reading. The fine introductions to each of the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

chapters were in general a joy. I would, however, have liked an index (not least of all because I think this could serve as a course book), and I could not help but be struck by the inordinate number of typos. This is possibly explained by the fact that errors were kept as original in the excerpts themselves, so perhaps the eye of the editor slid too easily over the rest of the text. (JANICE DICKEN)

Gisela Argyle. *Germany as Model and Monster: Allusions in English Fiction, 1830s–1930s*
McGill-Queen's University Press. x, 257. $70.00

Beginning with Carlyle's 'Germanizing' efforts of the 1830s and concluding with a brief examination of changing attitudes towards Germany during the Third Reich, Gisela Argyle 'focuses on selected major topics of German allusion that function in the community of author and reader as criticism of English culture.' In nine chapters, she canvases the works, influences, and allusive interplay between numerous English and German writers whose names include Goethe, Herder, Schiller, von Humboldt, J.S. Mill, Arnold, Bulwer-Lytton, Meredith, Eliot, Mrs Ward, Froude, Rutherford, Gissing, Schopenhauer, Nietzsche, Conrad, Lawrence, Disraeli, Madox Ford, and Isherwood. This is a long list, and, ultimately, Argyle's chief ambition – to trace what she at one point calls the 'important borrowings, direct and indirect' of English authors from their German counterparts – is not achieved in a really meaningful way. The book lacks argumentative force and overall cohesion, a result of losing sight of the forest for the trees: Argyle is evidently well read and knowledgeable about her material, but might have stood back from the myriad texts touched upon to assess, in more comprehensive terms, the significance of German cultural authority in post-1930s England. More might have been said, for example, about *why* English 'indebtedness to various German thinkers' in the post-Romantic period is a compelling subject, and a more sophisticated inquiry into the nature of literary influence – its workings and forms, but, more important, its relevance as an investigative tool – would have benefited this study.

After outlining the major characteristics of the German *Bildungsroman* as improvised in *Wilhelm Meister* and imaginatively transliterated for an English audience by Carlyle, Argyle considers Bulwer's attraction to Schiller and Goethe in the novels *Ernest Maltravers* and *Alice*, which melded German ideas with English ones 'to fashion for English fiction a heterodox idealist aesthetics and an influential plot model.' Similarly, Meredith's 'highbrow' novels, *The Ordeal of Richard Feverel* and *The Adventures of Harry Richmond*, each reveal a critical variant of a central *Bildungsroman* feature: Richard and Harry are forced to create their identity by rejecting their fathers. Eliot's *Middlemarch* and *Daniel Deronda*, in turn, adopt the 'German perspective' in

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

their concern with the conflicts between individual aspirations and the social medium in order to critique English philistinism and insularity. Unsurprisingly, Argyle finds that the 'main qualities of culture [in these late novels] – internal, becoming, harmonious, aesthetic, disinterested – all derive from the German idea of *Bildung*.'

The pace of the study picks up slightly in chapter 7, which examines various fictional narratives of a crisis of faith (Froude's *The Nemesis of Faith*, Rutherford's *Autobiography* and *Deliverance*, Gissing's *Workers in the Dawn*, and Ward's *Robert Elsmere*) to argue that German biblical criticism and scientific knowledge were cited as keys to religious doubt in nineteenth-century England. The penultimate chapter examines the reception of Schopenhauer's and Nietzsche's philosophical systems by several novelists, focusing in particular on Gissing's *The Whirlpool* as an 'all-inclusive example' of Schopenhauerian pessimism. The book concludes with a consideration of Trollope's and Disraeli's attitudes towards the German Reich and allusions to Weimar Germany in the works of Meredith, Conrad, Forster, and Lawrence, among others.

Argyle tends to digress into quotation-heavy synopses of topics as arcane (and arguably fusty) as the distinction between Jean Paul's and Goethe's editorial modes of recollection in their relation to the tone and structure of *Sartor Resartus*. Too frequently, she lapses into prolonged itemizing of people and books, a kind of name-dropping that isn't taken anywhere interesting and fails to contribute to a theoretically acute engagement with concepts as central to this work as cultural transmission and intertextuality. But if *Germany as Model and Monster* labours to escape the monotonous cataloguing of allusions, understood broadly to include references to 'biographical material about the authors as their own first readers, contemporary literary works, periodical articles, and other documentation,' it nevertheless demonstrates an appreciation for the particularities of texts and the potential subtleties of cultural influence, a virtue evident in Argyle's scrupulous attention to the plots and structures of individual works and her occasional ability to contextualize these against a broader intellectual and literary background (a skill enhanced by her apparent facility with German). (PETER W. SINNEMA)

William Westfall. *The Founding Moment: Church, Society, and the Construction of Trinity College* McGill-Queen's University Press. xiv, 160. $49.95

According to Bishop John Strachan, the passing of the University Act in 1849 turned King's College from a place of godly worship into a 'nursery of infidelity.' The secularization of his cherished institution threatened not

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

only the position of the established church, but the role of religion in forming the character of society's educated elite. Strachan responded with the creation of Trinity College in 1851, a private Anglican institution that would shoulder the mantle of what King's should have become, if not for the imposition of the godless University of Toronto. This narrative of continuity between the demise of King's and Trinity's emergence is skilfully dismantled by William Westfall's *The Founding Moment*, a slim but engaging monograph that slices deeply into the social and cultural world of mid-nineteenth-century Canada West. Instead of providing a standard institutional history of Trinity, Westfall positions the college's 'founding moment' as the point of disruption between the old colonial order and the Anglican church's search to redefine a new sense of private religion with a public influence in the wake of disestablishment.

The Founding Moment opens with Strachan's procession down Toronto's Queen Street to a field on the west side of the city where the new college would be built. Despite the bishop's rhetoric at this event, Westfall deftly undermines his assertions of continuity by observing who participated in the celebration and the social geography of the procession. The picture that emerges is one of contrast between the privileged position of King's, built with public money and latitudinarian principles, and that of Trinity, which was privately funded and distinctively Anglican, requiring strict religious requirements for both faculty and students. Set apart from the temptations of the city (but located conveniently close to local breweries), Trinity marked Strachan's attempt to build an Anglican preserve, a hierarchical microcosm of society that resembled an eighteenth-century aristocratic household. A domestic, and practically monastic, haven from material concerns, the college was envisioned as the conduit for the church to continue its role in shaping and moulding the character of Canada's professional gentlemen.

By following Strachan's procession, examining Trinity's architectural design, and peering into the educational and social world within the walls of this Anglican sanctum, Westfall weaves together the intellectual and the cultural in a luscious narrative style. These intersections, placed within the shifting (and gendered) domains of public life and private practice, provide a fascinating perspective on the role of religion in Canada West. Strachan's vision, however, fell short of its lofty goals, in no small part because many resisted the bishop's clarion call for moral and financial support. Some Anglicans remained committed to the University of Toronto, while evangelicals denounced Trinity's high church style and founded their own competing institution. These specific points of contention, which engage wide debates over the nature of education, the definition of 'professional gentlemen,' and the rise of the laity, provide depth to Westfall's insightful analysis, but it is not quite clear how critics offered a competing worldview of the proper relationship between religion, education, and society. Given

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

the limited appeal of Strachan's vision and its quick collapse in 1881 when Trinity was refounded with a broader religious curriculum and no religious tests, a more comprehensive picture of dissenting voices would be welcome. It is a testament to the profundity and range of this concise volume that the reader wants to explore these threads beyond the walls of Trinity, and one can only hope that such avenues will be pursued in the future.

The Founding Moment, which opens with a procession to mark the founding of Trinity College, is itself the product of commemoration, a celebration of Trinity's 150th anniversary originally delivered in 2001 through the college's endowed Larkin-Stuart Lectures. When Bishop Strachan stood on the platform to rail against the abomination of the University of Toronto in April 1851, he probably never suspected that Trinity would one day sponsor a work that so effectively undermines his own founding narrative. (JAMES OPP)

Wayne Dowler. *Classroom and Empire: The Politics of Schooling Russia's Eastern Nationalities, 1860–1917*
McGill-Queen's University Press 2001. xiv, 296. $65.00

In many ways the history of the Russian Empire – as empire – is just beginning to be written. The central, top-down focus of earlier accounts has in recent years been broadened to include not only archivally based accounts of the non-Russian peripheries but also theoretically informed, empirically grounded investigations of metropolitan institutions and policies. Wayne Dowler's excellent book on education in the eastern reaches of the empire, from the Volga through Central Asia, is a beautifully written treatment of the very contact point where the visions of imperial agents and the resistant cultures of indigenous peoples met.

The central figure of Dowler's story is the pious Christian reformer and pedagogue Nikolai Ivanovich Il'minskii (1822–1891), who set out to 'russify' the native peoples of the Volga through primary education in their own languages. For Il'minskii and others the central task was to prevent the apostasy of baptized Tatars from Orthodoxy and to promote the religious moral values that the educators associated with Russian nationality. Religion, rather than Russian language, was, in their view, the essence of what it meant to be Russian, and through moral education the benighted peoples of the East would enter the fold of European/Russian civilization. As Dowler puts it, 'The Il'minskii schools were primarily missionary in intent; they were conceived as part of a larger strategy that also included church services in native languages by native priests as a means of preventing baptised non-Russians and animists from becoming Tatarized and Islamized.'

Although it was primarily a phenomenon of the Volga region, the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Il'minskii system became a model for non-Russian education elsewhere in the empire and was supported by the powerful minister of education, D.A. Tolstoi, and the tsar, Alexander II, himself. Dowler demonstrates the deeply conservative impulse behind the system, while appreciating that in many ways promoting native languages worked to enhance the diverse cultures of the empire. Here, despite the russifying intentions of its advocates, was a practical, if ultimately flawed, way of managing a multinational country and securing a degree of integration. The author points out the parallels to Lenin's later strategy of supporting cultural and linguistic differentiation, while prohibiting political nationalism. Ultimately Il'minskii's innovations met resistance both from Muslim modernizers, like the Jadids, who favoured a unifying Islamic language and identity, and Russian chauvinists, who opposed concessions to native-language learning. Almost all major Russian imperial actors favoured assimilation of non-Russians. What they differed over was the most practical and least painful way to achieve a single Russian 'nation.'

Dowler uses the term 'nationalism' loosely to describe a number of different phenomena, from a kind of cultural awareness or national self-consciousness to the racial chauvinism of late nineteenth-century Russian rightists. What is clear is that none of the eastern peoples had a fully developed political program of separation and statehood. Rather than political nationalism, the Muslim intelligentsias of the Volga and Central Asia adopted modernizing strategies to blend Islamic values with Western knowledge in the hope that they would be able to flourish in a more tolerant empire. But to the very end of the imperial regime, influential Russians looked upon Muslims as inferior peoples to be cultivated, perhaps converted, who at the same time presented a potential internal danger to the Christian world. The tropes of alterity of Il'minskii's day, the language of inferiority and difference, that made empire possible and justified the rule of one people over others have had a very long shelf-life and remain current in our own time. (RONALD GRIGOR SUNY)

Margaret Derry. *Ontario's Cattle Kingdom: Purebred Breeders and Their World, 1870–1920*
University of Toronto Press, 2001. xv, 222. $50.00

Not a great deal of scholarly work has dealt with the historical development of the Canadian cattle industry. Within this narrow context, the purebred sector has received even shorter shrift. If for no other reason, Margaret Derry's account of the purebred cattle industry in Ontario is a welcome contribution to a largely neglected field. Derry sees purebred breeding as focusing on the biological capability of cattle to produce a desired product. Her arguments address the strategies, processes, successes, and problems

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

associated with this quest.

Derry's account follows a thematic framework. After integrating Ontario into the wider national and international agricultural context, she discusses the emergence of the purebred breeders in the province, and the development of the regulations that defined and guided their operations. She then analyses the impact of the purebred breeders on the beef and dairy industries, and discusses the relationship between live cattle operations and the meat business. Derry ends her account by placing purebred breeders in a modern context.

The book offers a balanced analysis of the overall influence of the purebred breeders. Derry argues strongly that they heavily influenced the national beef and dairy cattle industries. Purebred breeding in Ontario began in response to market opportunities in the Unites States, and, through time, continued to be a major influence on Midwest American breeding practices. The purebred groups, whether elitist-amateur, farmer-expert, or specialized farmer, all contributed to the development of breeding by importing pedigree animals, presenting a powerful lobby to government, and supplying quality stock to the farming communities across the country. Derry observes that purebred breeders saw their work as of great national importance. She goes further by arguing that financial rewards were secondary to the need to produce quality purebred stock for the nation.

Derry also shows another side of purebred breeding development. In a fascinating discussion, she documents the various obsessions that guided breeding philosophy and practice. The association of breeding and aesthetics led to the idealized form of the quality animal. This point is emphasized through Derry's use of 'idealized' but distorted engravings alongside actual photographs. Extreme notions about the primacy of pedigree and proper colour type led to what Derry called 'breeding crazes.' To her, these 'crazes' exemplified the lack of correlation between purebred practices and breeding for agricultural improvement. Derry also discusses the tensions that existed between the purebred breeders and the farming community. For example, by emphasizing dual type animals, purebred breeders were at odds with the majority of farmers who wanted specific dairy or beef type cattle. This delayed integration within the industry.

The wider points that Derry makes about the cattle industry provide a real strength to the book. Her observations apply as much to western Canada as they do to Ontario. Both in Ontario and on the prairies, the use of dairy stock in the beef industry served to diminish meat quality. One sees where and why corn gained its unquestioned pre-eminence as a feed grain, and, by extension, why its absence influenced negative beliefs about feeding practices in western Canada. The importance of the export market is another dominant theme in the Canadian cattle industry. Derry discusses its enormous significance and argues that producers acquiesced to the export market by producing an animal not popular with Canadian consumers.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Finally, Derry shows how the intervention of drovers, commission agents, railways, and packing houses in the marketing chain blurred demand factors. Producers increasingly became out of touch with consumer preferences.

Derry's argument about breeding for the American market is unclear, and needs more elaboration. She seems to imply that a lighter animal bred for Canadian consumers would have been as profitable as a heavier one bred for the American market. I doubt it. The price differential was too great. In order to take advantage of significantly higher American prices, producers exported their very best, and kept the inferior stock for the home market. Similarly, the uniformly low prices offered in Canadian markets regardless of quality led mixed farmers to use dairy strains to grow the biggest animals they could. More commentary on the diffusion of the three major breeds and some observations on their respective merits would have added to the discussion. Did the purebred breeders have any influence on the fixation among farmers for certain breed types?

The above minor points notwithstanding, Derry has produced a valuable and informative work. Her primary sources and bibliography reflect the meticulous research that has resulted in a meaningful and thought-provoking analysis. This book should be read by anyone interested in Canadian agricultural history. (MAX FORAN)

Karl B. Koth. *Waking the Dictator: Veracruz, the Struggle for Federalism, and the Mexican Revolution, 1870–1927*
University of Calgary Press. xiii, 362. $24.95

Recent books on the Mexican Revolution tend to fall into three rather broad categories: those that focus on the leaders of the events; those that take a regional approach, examining the impact of the revolution on a particular state and its inhabitants; and those that tie the various monographs and articles into synthetic overviews. Karl Koth's book falls into the second school, exploring the developments in the state of Veracruz from the late nineteenth century through to 1927, a period when centralizing forces increasingly sought to reduce states' rights. This confrontation, according to Koth, explains the state's involvement in the revolutionary struggle, a struggle that also included a social component as urban and rural workers sought to improve their respective situations. However, they, like the proponents of state autonomy, were ultimately unsuccessful, factors that help to explain Mexico's slowness in establishing a democratic system of government.

Because of its geographical position, Veracruz was fated to play a pivotal role in Mexican developments. Stretching along the central Caribbean coast, this narrow finger of a state is the home to the country's most important port, which bears the same name as the state and links Mexico City to the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

world. The state's northern reaches contained substantial oil deposits, while at its centre lay the core of the nation's textile mills. With its solid agricultural base, the state had the financial and economic wherewithal to support political endeavours. These became increasingly complex from the late nineteenth century during the dictatorship of Porfirio Díaz, whose centralizing efforts at the behest of the white, conservative, social Darwinistic coterie around him, known as the 'Científicos' (Scientists), helped foster the growing animosity that exploded in 1910. Koth follows the convoluted progress of the subsequent revolutionary struggle through the careers of its successive leaders from Madero to Calles, and the attempts of the *veracruzano* leaders to maintain their influence in the face of the ever-growing violence that threatened political turmoil as well as social transformation. Sympathetic to the federalist cause, he presents the defenders of states' rights almost as white knights, particularly those who opposed the extreme centralists of the científico mould. This is understandable in the case of Teodoro Dehesa, the socially progressive governor during the Porfirian years, but less so in the case of Félix Díaz, the brutal and self-centred nephew of the ex-dictator. The struggles of the underprivileged also attract the author's attention, as those struggles often supported the federalist cause, but they remain secondary to the political relationships and developments of the era.

The product of several years of research, Koth's study tries to unravel the multitudinous and intersecting layers that were part of the Mexican Revolution, but the results are not always satisfactory. The detail is at times overwhelming, and the reader can begin to flounder in a sea of names of participants, places, and organizations. Keen to underscore his own views of the events as well as his differences from other writers, the author frequently interjects himself into the narrative rather than letting his historical details make his point. His open sympathies also mean that the untied adverbs 'fortunately' and 'unfortunately' appear almost as often as the first person singular pronoun. Perhaps it is these biases that prevent him from considering the possibility that centralism might have benefited Veracruz, especially in the years following 1920 as the country sought to recover from the disintegrative chaos of the preceding decade.

This book is the first publication in a new series on Latin America and the Caribbean by the University of Calgary Press, as its editor, Christon Archer, explains in an elegantly written introduction. The initiative is to be much commended in view of Canada's growing links with Latin America. However, one hopes that the publishers will employ more rigorous copy editors in the future to eliminate the numerous typographical errors that mar this work. It is an important study that broadens our knowledge of Veracruz's involvement in the Mexican Revolution, although it is unlikely to be the final word on the subject. (PETER BLANCHARD)

Andrew Horrall. *Popular Culture in London c. 1890–1918: The Transformation of Entertainment*
Manchester University Press. xiv, 267. us $39.95

In this fascinating account of late-Victorian and Edwardian London, Andrew Horrall reconstructs the development of the music hall, and its interplay with transportation and sport, as home to an 'up-to-date' culture. In other words, he suggests that 'rampant topicality,' similar to Peter Bailey's concept of 'knowingness,' was the outstanding feature of popular culture. However, whereas Bailey was hinting at the complicity between performer and audience, Horrall is highlighting the superficiality of a music-hall culture that, derivative as it was, played to a level of local knowledge, rather than understanding, common to virtually every member of the community. Indeed, it was this up-to-dateness, built on the exploitation of the various crazes or fads of the period, that spawned the celebrity; in other words, a celebrity was someone whose fame was by definition ephemeral because their ability was less to do with their talent than with their ability to master a sensation that would, in turn, soon be overtaken by a new craze.

An important element of Horrall's argument is that so much of the entertainment of the period was rooted in public, meaning street, performance. While many could only rarely afford to buy tickets to the music hall, or the variety of sporting events on offer, everyone could experience London's exciting and remarkably vital street culture. In a series of short chapters the author introduces London's traditional, and entertaining, culture of street performance. Such public traditions were exploited by music-hall entrepreneurs who transported performers from hall to hall in carriages adorned with advertising hoardings. Similarly parades, incorporating American spectacle and British pomp, became popular fixtures on London's street life.

At the heart of this new popular culture was its topicality, born of its ability to co-opt the newest crazes. This tendency can be seen with the bicycle fad of the 1890s, which provided rich content for the variety stage. Given the nature of up-to-date culture, bicycles were soon replaced by the motorcar. However, whereas the general public could participate fully in bicycle culture, few could experience the expensive pleasures of motoring. Horrall suggests that the public could enjoy the pleasure of car ownership vicariously – but it is not quite the same thing! No matter, by 1913 aviation melodrama had replaced earlier transportation fads on the London variety stages. Within two decades, three major transportational trends had been variously incorporated and/or discarded by music-hall culture.

Spectator sports, particularly baseball, cricket, boxing, and football, were also intimately associated with music hall's fickle demand for up-to-dateness. Music-hall football drew London's football teams and players into

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

the 'realms of modern celebrity' and confirmed that by the early twentieth century sport truly had become entertainment. Ultimately, Horrall's case for the transformation of entertainment in the period lies with his suggestion that commodified music-hall culture spawned the modern celebrity. Yet, while between 1890 and 1918 this topical culture was innovative it was also unoriginal. Indeed, given the fact that the industry had not evolved structurally, and remained dominated by the entrepreneurs who had developed the industry, the implication might be that big business was happy to allow the audience to believe that it nurtured the fads of the day, while the industry remained, by Horrall's own admission, a conservative institution. Horrall concludes by examining the development of popular culture during the Great War. His examination of trench culture is particularly rich, drawing upon the fragility of life in the trenches and the mingling of music hall and sport culture to create a unique trench culture that served to unite men from around the globe. The up-to-dateness and immediacy of this new culture provided these men with the ability to survive, emotionally and psychologically, in a world of death and horror, a world where the ephemeral took on new meaning. (CHRISTOPHER P. HOSGOOD)

Lynn McDonald, editor. *Collected Works of Florence Nightingale. Volume 1. Florence Nightingale: An Introduction to her Life and Family*
Wilfrid Laurier University Press. xii, 908. $95.00

Lynn McDonald, editor. *Collected Works of Florence Nightingale. Volume 2. Florence Nightingale's Spiritual Journey*
Wilfrid Laurier University Press. xii, 586. $95.00

Lynn McDonald, editor. *Collected Works of Florence Nightingale. Volume 3. Florence Nightingale's Theology*
Wilfrid Laurier University Press. xii, 678. $95.00

The dust-cover of the first volume in Lynn McDonald's projected sixteen volumes of the *Collected Works of Florence Nightingale* pictures a marble sculpture of Nightingale on a small drawing-room chair, book in hand, looking intently out past the spectator. Nightingale's name and dates, 1820–1910, are the only inscription. The sculpture is arresting, conveying a sense of the intellectual and physical intensity of a woman more frequently imagined bedridden in her home after the Crimean War. That impression of concentrated presence is so palpable that the reader can nearly miss the larger setting of the piece. A stray glance catches first the bottle of what looks to be orange juice on the pedestal next to Nightingale's right foot; next comes awareness of the large orange traffic cone; next the appearance of

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

tubular scaffolding; finally the slightly mouldy plywood and dampish walls surrounding the piece. Nightingale is in storage.

The dust-cover speaks to the motivating spirit behind the *Collected Works of Florence Nightingale* project. It is, as the editors say, an astonishing fact that there is no Collected Works of such an important figure. Committed to publishing all of Nightingale's vast outpouring of essays, commentaries, diaries, letters, memos, notes – published and unpublished – the project seeks to return Nightingale, in all her energy, vigour, and importance, to a public consciousness that the project understands to have faltered or gone astray. Like the sculpture, Nightingale waits patiently and intently for reclamation or, perhaps more accurately, rehabilitation.

The introduction to the first printed volume in the series usefully notes the trends in historical assessments of Nightingale's importance, setting the terms for that rehabilitation as it does so. To traditional applause for Nightingale's work as the founder of the modern profession of nursing, a major hospital reformer, and an advocate for public health in India, late twentieth-century scholarship has added her contributions to the development of social science, her spirituality, and her importance as a community health pioneer. But the introduction also argues that much work remains to be done in integrating Nightingale into mainstream textbooks and curricula in these areas. Furthermore, the introduction insists that, where she is part of those curricula, she is often misrepresented. She remains absent from the mainstream history of social science and from literature on peace, war, and militarism. In nursing, she is seldom if ever treated as a serious theoretical contributor to that field. Similarly, in women's history, where she has gained a substantial place, Nightingale's relationship to the history of the women's movement is misunderstood. Citing F.B. Smith's *Florence Nightingale: Reputation and Power* (1982) as the source of this misunderstanding, McDonald clears the historical record, showing that Nightingale declined to work for women's suffrage only because she thought economic rights more important than political ones. McDonald corrects Smith's contention that Nightingale signed an infamous anti-suffrage petition, pointing to her signature on the first suffrage petition of 1866. If Nightingale's suffrage politics have been treated rather ham-fistedly, her views on women and the medical profession have been similarly reduced to a simplistic antagonism which obscures her engagement with the Victorian Woman Question. If her suffrage views have been misconstrued, her liberal views on prostitution and sexually transmitted diseases remain unknown.

These are important corrections to highlight, not just to wipe the tarnish from Nightingale's name, but also to point to the complexities of political engagement and action in this period. McDonald rightly seeks to reconstitute the heft and texture of these political questions in her presentation of Nightingale's stance and, in doing so, restore Nightingale to history as an

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

vitally engaged social and political agent, not a stereotype of past scholarly assessments. The project's editorial stance is unambiguous: 'Those who denigrate Nightingale have been, in the opinion of the editors of this *Collected Works*, ill-informed. We, too, have had enough of the stereotyped heroine, and we want her to be understood in all her complexity.' To that end, the project's commitment to publish all of Nightingale's writing will disclose 'warts, errors of judgment and ill temper ... [as well as] a woman of extraordinary intellect, utter dedication to her calling, a prodigious appetite for work and touching human qualities, especially fierce loyalty to her co-workers.' The goal is nothing less than to insist on Nightingale's importance as a 'scholar, theorist, intellectual, an original thinker and practical reformer in a diverse range of subjects.'

With this overall goal in mind, the project has two forms: the electronic publication will provide all known Nightingale writing, published and archival; the printed volumes will offer substantial selections from these complete works. The three printed volumes, under review here, are organized thematically rather than chronologically. The editors realistically envisage a wide array of readers who will come to these volumes to pursue very different, often very discrete, research agendas. Each printed volume offers a selection of letters, diary entries, published writings, memos, and notes, depending upon the larger theme addressed, as well as the historical information relevant to the events of that volume and an introduction to the key participants. The first volume, on Nightingale's life and family, also offers a thematic guide to reading all of the projected volumes, alerting readers to issues that crop up regularly in Nightingale's writing. Such themes include Positivism and Idealism; Theology; Government and Politics; Family; Social Class; Gender Roles; Empire and Imperialism. Each such section provides a quick orientation to the issues and Nightingale's overall critique of the subject. These are useful sketches, though occasionally over-generous in their reading of Nightingale's perspective on an issue. The brief outline on Empire and Imperialism, for example, suggests that imperialism as such was never assessed by Nightingale as a good or evil. Rather, McDonald asserts, the 'empire was a fact.' Yet shortly after, we read that in 1863 Nightingale considered 'one of the most important of social questions, [to be] how the British race is to hold possession of India, and to bestow upon its vast population the benefit of a higher civilization,' a position that seems as clearly pro-Empire as one could get. Similarly, this guide to themes in Nightingale's writing seems unwilling to assess the fit between what the editors recognize as her technocratic impulse and the causes she took up. As Theodore Parker's work on the rise of statistics and the bureaucratic state tells us, the kind of work Nightingale undertook so passionately was central to the formation of a new kind of administrative state apparatus. But here the editors insist, on the topic of war for example, that Nightingale's impulses were purely pragmatic: 'Wars there were, and

someone had to look after the wounded and sick that resulted from them.' There is a faint sniff here of editorial worry that to tackle the fit between Nightingale's extraordinary organizational abilities and the causes to which she harnessed them would leave her once again vulnerable to charges of despotism and arrogance. But surely the complex Nightingale we encounter in these vast volumes is more than enough to make such easy disparagements impossible to sustain.

The Nightingale of these volumes is the complex, compelling figure McDonald claims her to be: learning 'intrigue' at her Harley Street Institute for Sick Gentlewomen; fending off her family; instructing new owners of her treasured 'thoroughbred' cats in cat care; suggesting the content of a Children's Bible; mourning Herbert's death; reminding her mother that 'No woman ever before directed the labour of a Government office.' This is a prodigious undertaking. McDonald and her editorial team are to be commended for so ambitious and successfully realized a project. (SUSAN HAMILTON)

Terrie M. Romano. *Making Medicine Scientific: John Burdon Sanderson and the Culture of Victorian Science*
Johns Hopkins University Press xiv, 226. US $39.95

In this first scholarly study of John Scott Burdon Sanderson (1828–1905), Oxford University's inaugural Waynflete professor of physiology (1882–93), Terrie Romano held an enviable opportunity to explore some of the profound philosophical dilemmas that accompanied the growth of science in Victorian culture. Situating Burdon Sanderson not only at the intersection of medical practice and scientific research but also on the historical watershed between classical and modern educational streams, Romano undertook the important task of assessing the professional career of a complex (and highly ambivalent) transitional figure.

Instead of the full-scale biography for which there surely exists sufficient documentation, the author bases an inexplicably truncated tripartite narration ('From Evangelical to Medical Officer of Health'; 'Making a Career in Medical Research'; and 'The Medical Sciences: Critics and Allies') almost exclusively upon research in Burdon Sanderson's personal papers and publications, heavily supplemented by secondary sources. Burdon Sanderson's overall historical significance is only hinted at in the resulting work, as is the intriguing role of his wife, Ghetal Herschell. One has to go elsewhere to learn of crucial details that suggest still deeper connections.

Romano does well to root her subject's world-view in his strongly evangelical upbringing. Burdon Sanderson's family background urged upon him the driving combination of community service and critical dissidence that inspired his medical training at Edinburgh; his advanced

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

experimental training in physiology with Claude Bernard at Paris; and his pioneering work in public health in London during the 1850s–60s. Yet she makes no mention (outside of the appendix) that, as professor of practical physiology and histology at University College, London (1870); superintendent of the Brown Institution, Lambeth, England's first pathology laboratory (1871–78); and Jodrell Professor of human physiology at University College (1874–82), Burdon Sanderson attracted a succession of impressionable medical apprentices, including a young William Osler, to his physiology laboratory. Romano does show that Burdon Sanderson cemented his reputation as a pioneering British experimental physiologist through his *Handbook for the Physiological Laboratory* (1873); that his earlier experiments with French and German graphing instruments inspired Charles Darwin to ask him during the 1870s to confirm that electrical activity accompanied movement in Venus flytraps; and that his conclusions incited responses from continental and British scientists, including severe criticism. But she never divulges J.D. Hooker's special mention of these experiments in his presidential address to the Royal Society of London (1878), or that various research programs in the United States followed up his work in subsequent decades.

Romano's interpretation hinges on Burdon Sanderson's 'failure' to establish Oxford's school of physiology, for which she faults his chronically depressive personality, his fundamentally 'derivative' work, and his anachronistic abhorrence of scientific explanation as self-indulgent theorizing. Yet she clearly recognizes the class- and tradition-bound vested interests who resisted Oxford's transition to a modern medical curriculum because they stood to lose their long-standing social hegemony as London's medical gentry. One might have wished, at this crucial interpretive juncture, for a more persuasive elucidation of 'The Philosophical Context' in which Romano dichotomizes 'Empiricism and Idealism,' with Burdon Sanderson clinging to what might be seen as the Baconian inductive ideal, which practising scientists had qualified even during his own formative years.

Instead one is left to marvel, without much help from the author, at the anti-vivisectionist movement's power to expose deep ethical contradictions between science's research ideal and medicine's Hippocratic oath – and, thereby, to splinter the community of the evangelical faithful. With Oxford the contested site for this decisive battle, and victory already claimed at Cambridge by medical modernity, Burdon Sanderson faced nothing less than a last stand of the dying classical heritage defended by the formidable likes of John Ruskin, who, although Romano does not mention it, resigned his Slade professorship of art in protest against Oxford's appointment of an experimental physiologist. Romano leaves one wondering, finally, why Burdon Sanderson did not defend himself more effectively by advocating publicly the policy on anaesthetics for laboratory animals which, according to other sources, he helped the British Association for the Advancement of

Science to define. While this book thus enhances one's fascination with Burdon Sanderson, it also feeds the hope that Romano will one day give him the fuller analytical and contextualized treatment to which he remains entitled. (SUZANNE ZELLER)

Charles Taylor. *Varieties of Religion Today: William James Revisited*
Harvard University Press. 127. US $19.95

The subtitle of Charles Taylor's new book, *William James Revisited*, resonates with one of the touchstones of English Romanticism, Wordsworth's 'Lines Composed a Few Miles above Tintern Abbey, on revisiting the Banks of the Wye during a Tour. July 13, 1798.' Revisiting and reviewing James's book of 1902, *The Varieties of Religious Experience: A Study in Human Nature*, Taylor comes to it 'with a very specific agenda, asking what it can tell us about the place of religion today.'

James remarks (and Taylor cites): 'At the outset we are struck by one great partition which divides the religious field. On the one side of it lies institutional, on the other personal religion.' James defines 'institutional' religion (worship, sacrifice, ceremony, priests, sacraments) as 'an external art, the art of winning the favor of the gods'; in 'personal religion,' on the other hand, it is 'the inner dispositions of man himself which form the centre of interest, his conscience, his deserts, his helplessness, his incompleteness.'

I am struck by James's word 'partition' with its echo of Paul's letter to the Ephesians: 'For he is our peace, who hath made both one, and hath broken down the middle wall of partition [Greek *phragmou*] between us' (Ephesians 2:14, AV). Addressed to 'Gentiles in the flesh,' Paul's letter makes a fateful distinction between salvation by works (ritual, food laws, ordinances, circumcision, feasts, and sacrifices – metonymies for 'the commonwealth of Israel'), and faith: 'For by grace [*chariti*] are ye saved through faith; and in that not of yourselves: it is the gift of God: Not of works, lest any man should boast' (Ephesians 2:8–9, 12).

Taylor revises James's model of the 'great partition' between inner and outer religion: 'The point of declaring that salvation comes through faith was radically to devalue ritual and external practice in favor or inward adherence to Christ as Savior.' It's an easy ride, tracing the historical development of 'personal religion' in antithetical terms: faith and works, flesh and spirit, intellect and intuition, expression and doctrine, inner and outer, heart and head, intuition and reason, enchantment and disenchantment, and so forth. But as Taylor suggests, 'personal' and 'institutional' religion might be combined in one religious life. One might even claim that they ought ideally to complement each other. I myself certainly lean in this direction, if I may step for a moment beyond the role of neutral commenta-

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

tor. But the fact is that they have frequently been polarized, and opposed to each other.

Taylor's second chapter focuses on melancholy and James's 'religion of the twice-born,' the religion of 'sick souls, who must be twice-born in order to be happy.' Acquainted with evil, some people (Tolstoy and Bunyan, for example) go through hell and, in Taylor's words, 'come out the other side.' In contrast to the 'sick souls,' James invokes the cheerful 'healthy-minded,' for whom (I quote James), 'the way of the sick soul seems unmanly and diseased. With their grubbing in rat-holes instead of living in the light; with their manufacture of fears, and preoccupation with every unwholesome kind of misery, there is something almost obscene about these children of wrath and cravers of a second birth.'

Prompted by Taylor's vigorous little book, a series of lectures delivered in 2000 at the Institute for Human Sciences in Vienna, I turn again to James. Buddhism and Christianity 'are essentially religions of deliverance: the man must die to an unreal life before he can be born into the real life.' Is James's 'real life' related to Taylor's idea of 'authentic' life? Jesus says to Nicodemus, 'except a man be born again [*gennethe anothen*, literally 'born from above'], he cannot see the kingdom of God' (John 3:3). Nicodemus doesn't get is; so Jesus says, 'Except a man be born of water and of the Spirit [*pneumatos*], he cannot enter into the kingdom of God.'

'People go on feeling a sense of unease at the world of unbelief,' Taylor writes: 'some sense that something big, something important has been left out, some level of profound desire has been ignored, some greater reality outside us has been closed off.' If by a leap of faith someone does establish a 'collective connecton' to 'some greater reality,' can he or she be 'authentic'? By 'the culture of authenticity' Taylor means 'the understanding of life tht emerged with the Romantic expressivism of the late eighteenth century, that each of us has his or her won way of realizing one's own humanity, and that it is important to find and live out one's own, as against surrendering to conformity with a model imposed from outside, by society, or the previous generation, or religious or political authority.'

William James stands on the threshold, 'the flip-over point' between belief and unbelief. Taylor regards him as 'our great philosopher of the cusp. He tells us more than anyone else about what it's like to stand in that open space and feel the winds pulling you now here, now there. He describes a crucial site of modernity. (LINDA MUNK)

David Beasley. *McKee Rankin and the Heyday of the American Theater*
Wilfrid Laurier University Press. xvii, 520. $39.95

To be a prominent man-of-the-theatre in America between the Civil War and the First World War was to be at both the heart and the margins of a burgeoning public culture. The life of Canadian-born McKee Rankin,

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

matinee idol, character actor, director, playwright, entrepreneur, provides a fascinating model of this duality. Born in 1844 on a border, near Windsor, Ontario, facing Detroit, while his father was in England promoting a Wild West show, Rankin straddled geographical, national, and ethnic borders as well as turning points in social and political history. Part Shawnee, Rankin played not only ethnic roles (Native, Irish, Arab, Jewish, Chinese) in burlesque houses and vaudeville but also romantic leads in Westerns such as his principal vehicle, *The Danites*. Rankin turned to theatre instead of enlisting in the Union Army in 1863. Three years later he ran into the actor John Wilkes Booth shortly before Booth assassinated President Lincoln in a theatre. After the murder Rankin became possessed of Booth's wardrobe.

David Beasley's biography presents the intense, if self-sabotaging, Rankin in copiously detailed terms. Yet despite lists of nearly every performance, and legal and financial imbroglio, and speculations about a wide range of personal experiences, Rankin himself remains a curiously elusive figure. Beasley is consistently sympathetic to, if not apologetic for, his subject, though he provides both flattering and unflattering accounts of Rankin's character. But Rankin was embroiled in one court case after another, one financial disaster (or scam) after another. 'I have met many deadbeats in the world,' said one of his business partners, 'but Rankin is the biggest of the lot.'

Rankin's life with women was similarly fraught. Though it was often unclear when he was married or to whom, he and his wife and fellow-actor Kitty Blanchard 'would come to symbolize to Americans the ideal married couple in the theater.' That Rankin would come to be such a symbol was especially ironic given that, as the critic Amy Leslie wrote in 1914, 'He was constantly in trouble with one woman or another. Not that he ever ... let any of them worry him in the least, but he seemed to have a faculty of making grief and mourning and misery for them.' The fourth chapter of the book is devoted to Rankin's protégée Nance O'Neil, to whom he was, many contemporaries claimed, a Svengali. Together they toured not just the United States but also Australia, New Zealand, South Africa during the Boer War, Egypt, and the East African Coast, where they played not only *La dame aux camélias* but also *Hedda Gabler*. The nature and reasons for Rankin's hold over O'Neil are murky. And though the chapter is titled 'The Reign of Nance O'Neil' with melodramatic subtitles, such as 'Star Rising,' it is also unclear just how great O'Neil's stardom was or to what degree she was handicapped by Rankin's possessiveness.

What kind of actor was Rankin? Beaseley acknowledges that Rankin was 'not a great actor.' Yet, he says, Rankin 'initiated the quiet, restrained quality of acting on the American stage, which soon took over the New York theaters,' a claim that is later contradicted, for Rankin was commonly said to have played 'in the old demonstrative style.' The trouble is that it is difficult for a reader to steer through the evidence to form an accurate

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

assessment of various aspects of Rankin's life and work. Indeed, it is hard to tell just what audience this book is intended for. Academics will not find it a work of sophisticated historiography, but the causal reader will not find in the book a clear and compelling narrative. Oddly, the most authoritative voice on Rankin to emerge from these pages is that of Amy Leslie, who is given the book's last word.

The value of Beasley's work is that it is a mine of information about an extraordinary person. Rankin was connected with most of the major names of American popular culture of his day, working with Forrest, Boucicault, Jefferson, Daly. He was especially intimate with the Barrymores (his daughter married Lionel) and embroiled with Belasco and the Shuberts, with whom he feuded financially. D.W. Griffith, who began as a young actor in Rankin's company, made one movie from a play, *Judith of Bethulia*, that he saw staged by Rankin, who was expert in directing crowd scenes. Rankin's plays were attended by the likes of Brigham Young (surrounded by forty of his children). And Rankin performed around the globe for cosmopolitan audiences and audiences who brought their guns into the theatre. The book never explicitly justifies its title *The Heyday of the American Theater*, which appears again only in the book's epigraph, but McKee Rankin justified it in his life. A hard-living huckster, who made his living by the force of his personality in a historical moment when actors had to face their audiences, he died in 1914 with the dawn of motion pictures. (ALAN ACKERMAN)

Annabel Robinson. *The Life and Work of Jane Ellen Harrison*
Oxford University Press. xvi, 332. us $135.00

Jane Ellen Harrison has many claims to fame: as a member of the small cohort of women students who completed the requirements for Cambridge undergraduate degrees in the 1870s; as one of the first women to obtain a fellowship at a Cambridge college; as an early and energetic champion of the fruitful confrontation between traditional text-based scholarship and the results of the new archaeological research; and as a pioneer in the application of the developing social-science disciplines of anthropology, sociology, and psychology to the study of classical antiquity. Her life and career have drawn much attention over the past two decades, owing to the confluence of two streams of interest: in the recent history of classical scholarship, and in the contribution of women to every field of achievement.

Annabel Robinson's book is the most recent in a sequence of major works published over the last twenty years that have focused significant attention on Jane Harrison. Her predecessors have divided (somewhat along gender lines) in their major focus roughly between Harrison as a member of the group of scholars often labelled 'The Cambridge Ritualists' (e.g., Hugh Lloyd-Jones, *Blood for the Ghosts* [1982] and the portrait of Harrison in

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Cambridge Women: Twelve Portraits, edited by E. Shils and C. Blacker [1996]; William Calder III, *The Cambridge Ritualists Reconsidered* [1991]) and Harrison as 'a woman in a man's world' (e.g., Sandra Peacock, *Jane Ellen Harrison, the Mask and the Self* [1988]; Mary Beard, *The Invention of Jane Harrison* [2000]).

Robinson's biography has been long in the making. She traces its genesis to two coincident events of 1981; its composition has run parallel to, and been fertilized by, the works just mentioned. She argues in her introduction that in addition to the more general reasons cited above for the growing interest in Harrison's life, '[her] passionate commitment to the importance of what we *feel* in religion, as opposed to what we *believe*, and elevation of the irrational over the rational is of increasing relevance in a post-modern world.' In other words, late twentieth-century ways of thinking send us back with renewed interest to the work of scholar a century ago who seems suddenly in tune with our times. Her biography attempts to weave together the two streams of work on Harrison roughly labelled above: the 'history of classical scholarship' and the 'woman succeeding in a man's world' stream. She offers a very full narrative of every period of her subject's life, which manages to do justice to both the external context (social, cultural, and intellectual) and Harrison's inner struggles and delights. The reader learns along the way an enormous amount about upper-middle-class Victorian family life, women's education in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the new archaeological discoveries of this period and the effects of their dissemination, the rigours of travel in Greece at this period, and the excitement of intellectual and cultural life throughout Europe both before and after the First World War. The network of friends and colleagues who contributed to the working out of Harrison's ideas included not only luminaries of classical scholarship, both in England (Gilbert Murray, Francis Cornford, Albert Cook, James Frazer, William Ridgeway) and elsewhere (Heinrich Brunn, Wilhelm Dörpfeld), but also intellectual leaders in other fields (Bertrand Russell, Leonard and Virginia Woolf). Robinson's book is enriched by two special features: the great wealth of quotations reproduced from the writings (both public and private) of Harrison herself and these many friends and colleagues, with whom she carried on a frequent, voluminous, and animated correspondence, and the very thorough summaries and analyses of her scholarly works, which provide the intellectual framework for the life.

This biography will not likely be the last word on Jane Harrison. A genius so multifaceted and so controversial will surely continue to attract the attention of new biographers. But Robinson has done an excellent job of presenting the complexity of a very remarkable woman and scholar in terms that keep a salutary balance between the claims of various ideologies.
(CATHERINE RUBINCAM)

L.W. Conolly, editor. *Bernard Shaw and Barry Jackson*

University of Toronto Press. xliv, 218. $60.00

Alex C. Michalos and Deborah C. Poff, editors. *Bernard Shaw and the Webbs*
University of Toronto Press. xxxi, 312. $60.00

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Notoriously, even diaries seldom reflect the inner personality of the writer. Letters tend to be even less revealing, particularly when a correspondent has a very public personality to cultivate – as here, where Shaw sometimes signs himself G.B.S. and is addressed as such not only by his secretary, but also by others. Yet these two collections of correspondence are in many ways a revelation.

This is largely due to the way these volumes give (as far as possible) both sides of the conversation; and to the degree they represent the two central facets of Shaw's work. Sir Barry Jackson – knighted at Shaw's urging – was the person most closely associated with his theatre since Granville-Barker, while Sidney and Beatrice Webb were the major socialist figures in his highly political life. Both volumes also include letters from Shaw's all to often critically dismissed wife, Charlotte, and from his long-time secretary Blanche Patch, which add significantly to the relationships of the primary correspondents (particularly with Blanche's attractive acerbity in her comments on G.B.S. and 'this literary house where the ordinary sort of life that I am accustomed to is quite unknown').

One thing that comes across quite strikingly, precisely because of (as the editor puts it) this 'attempt to capture Shaw's *dialogue* with friends and colleagues,' is how extremely unequal those conversations were. To be a recipient of Shaw's correspondence must have seemed like being overwhelmed by an epistolary tidal wave. This is even true where the Webbs were concerned – two extremely articulate writers to Shaw's single-handed pen, and ones who as politicians would have been careful to preserve copies of their own letters (including one from 1926 that Sidney headed 'private – not for publication on any account'). Yet Shaw outpaces them by almost three to one, and outweighs them too, his letters being significantly longer. The same is true for the correspondence with Barry Jackson. There the imbalance seems more understandable, if only because Shaw was very much older and more famous. But Shaw and Sidney Webb were contemporaries: as Shaw somewhat tongue-in-cheek points out to him, 'The balancing instinct in Nature is remarkable. Alarmed at her work [Shaw's birth] in 1856 she produced you three years later as my complement.' So – just like feminist analyses of male/female interaction, in which dominance is demonstrated by relative silence – here the impression is of someone trying to win an undeserved importance, or even simply attention, through sheer volume of words.

And indeed, however central politics might have been to Shaw, it becomes clear in these letters that for all his urging, cajoling, even berating, he was hardly central to either the Fabian movement, the new Labour party,

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

or the London School of Economics – all of which Sidney and Beatrice were so instrumental in helping to found – or even to the *New Statesman*, which at first he looked on as his own personal newspaper.

The letters give essential and illuminating background to Shaw's more political publications: the notoriously inflammatory pamphlet *Commonsense about the War* (published in the *New Statesman*) and *The Intelligent Woman's Guide to Socialism and Capitalism*. At the same time they show that for Shaw personalities trumped principles in politics – which he sees in terms of individuals, as a typical artist, whereas the Webbs (according to St John Ervine) thought art 'insignificant and unimportant in comparison with tables of mortality and statistics in general.' And when he comments on the Fabian essays written by Beatrice, or the political actions of Sidney, it is typically style that concerns Shaw, not substance. So for instance, in one of the newly published letters he remarks: 'When you have to do a thing, make a feature of it ... It is our business to make people stop and look at us, especially when we are doing something that does not really make any difference and therefore requires a "violent & fantastic" air.'

Indeed, Shaw was fully aware of his peripheral status in the political world he so obviously longed to inhabit. As he ruefully remarked in another of the until-now unpublished letters discussing his book on *Everybody's Political What's What*, 'In the biographical dictionaries I shall figure as "SHAW G.B. Twentieth century playwright, remembered only as a friend of the Webbs."'

Certainly Sidney and Beatrice count as heavyweights on the British political and socialist scene at the beginning of the modern era. The *New Statesman* proved one of the most influential newspapers of the twentieth century; the LSE continues to have a worldwide reputation; and the Webbs are the only couple to both be buried in Westminster Abbey. And the difference in political impact can be summed up in a simple comparison: where Sidney stood for Parliament, became a cabinet minister, and was elevated to the House of Lords, Shaw had only been elected a mere Vestryman in the London parish of St Pancras. Yet one of the striking facts to emerge from this correspondence is that to get subscribers for the *New Statesman* the Webbs drew almost exclusively on the lists of Stage Society members and those who had bought tickets for Granville-Barker's Court and Kingsway Theatre seasons. The readers of the *New Statesman* were precisely Shaw's audience. And indeed over the long term the artistic gadfly wins out.

Shaw's plays still hold the stage. There is a major annual festival showcasing his drama, as well as an academic society and a journal devoted solely to his work, plus scholarly conferences every few years – while the only reason the Webbs' letters are now being published is because of the light they throw on Shaw. Plays ultimately outshine politics. It is a neat demonstration that even the most transient and ephemeral of the arts has

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

lasting value, and dramatic characters continue to live long after real public figures are largely forgotten.

This underlines the importance of the correspondence between Shaw and Barry Jackson – founder of the Birmingham Repertory Theatre and the Malvern Festival, who directed the first English productions of almost all Shaw's later plays from the visionary *Back to Methuselah* on. The letters are full of insights: on Shaw's preference for 'heroic acting,' his reaction to laughter from audiences (disapproving!), his concept of drama and the importance of dialogue, the characterization in various plays, the effect he intended in the prologue for *Caesar and Cleopatra*. They also provide informative detail on more general topics – particularly censorship or the economics of theatre between the wars. And there are some surprises: Shaw's appreciation that Ibsen 'was wholly a poet,' or his firm sense that while Jackson's modern-dress *Hamlet* was a viable experiment, 'Hamlet in a period that is not either Hamlet's period nor Shakespeare's is indefensible.'

Then there is a running gag, in which 'The Celebrated St Lawrence Acorn' pops up over a whole decade – as future battleship timber, a squirrel's joy, the arboreal equal to a bulldog, or consumed by a voracious pheasant – showing Shaw not only taking unexpected pleasure in simple joking, but also capable of poking fun at his own habits (in this case planting endless acorns all around the countryside near his house at Ayot in holes made by his walking stick). And this humanization of the 'great man' underlines the extent to which Jackson came to fill in for Granville-Barker – missing in marriage – as the theatrical son that Shaw never had, even though the relationship also occasioned at least one classic exchange on the rights of Dramatists versus the Director.

In short, these – the fourth and fifth volumes in a series now being edited by Len Conolly after the untimely death of J. Percy Smith – add immensely to the field of Shaw scholarship. Despite Dan Laurence's four mammoth and magisterial volumes of *Collected Letters*, in fact just 3 of the 183 letters in the Barry Jackson volume have ever appeared in print before – and since less than one-fifth of these are from Jackson, here is a trove of well over a hundred up-to-now completely unknown letters by Shaw. And much the same is true in the Webbs volume.

In addition to presenting so much new material, the explanatory notes – both introducing the topics of each letter and giving thumbnail details of the people mentioned – are exemplary. Both these books are essential reading, and should be on every library's shelves. (CHRISTOPHER INNES)

Sara Jeannette Duncan. *The Pool in the Desert (1903).*
Edited by Gillian Siddall with an introduction by Rosemary Sullivan
Broadview. 244. $18.95

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Sara Jeannette Duncan is best known in English Canada for *The Imperialist*, her 1904 novel set in a fictionalized version of her birthplace, Brantford, Ontario. *The Pool in the Desert*, first published one year before this novel appeared, is a collection of stories that, like *The Imperialist* and so much of Duncan's writing, considers the implication in imperial ideology and colonization of white Anglo-imperial 'agents' of empire in the contact zone. Like much of Duncan's fiction, however, *The Pool in the Desert* is also specifically Anglo-Indian. Duncan left Canada in the late 1880s and remained in India from 1890 for some three decades, marrying museum official and journalist Everard Cotes. Her Anglo-Indian works compellingly engage with the performance of imperialist ideology on the colonial frontier: not romantic or idealist in their imperialism, however, her novels are complex in their representation of relationships across boundaries of race, gender, and class in the space of India under British rule. The same is true, as *The Pool in the Desert* demonstrates, of her short fiction.

Edited by Gillian Siddall and with an introduction by Rosemary Sullivan, *The Pool in the Desert* is the second work by Duncan to have been reissued by Broadview Press: Germaine Warketin's superb edition of the 1906 novel *Set in Authority* made available an important text whose narrative is engaged with the nature and the effects of British rule in India at a point of crisis in the first decade of the twentieth century. Unlike *Set in Authority*, however, *The Pool in the Desert* has been reissued in recent years, in facsimile edition by University of Toronto Press in 1978, and in a Penguin edition first published in 1984, now out of print. This new Broadview edition reproduces the introduction that appeared in the Penguin text, but it is otherwise quite a different product. The text of the collection follows the first American edition by D. Appleton, and the original order has been restored here. This edition, moreover, also presents numerous useful and unobtrusive notes that do not accompany the earlier text, and a range of related material in appendices: the four appendices include material from Duncan's first published work, *A Social Departure* (1890); from *The Crow's Nest* (1901), her autobiographical account of a summer in India spent outside to treat tuberculosis; a short piece she wrote for the *Indian Daily News* in 1896; and half a dozen contemporary reviews of the collection. This material usefully supplements the stories' position with regard to Anglo-India and, in particular, of white Anglo-imperial women.

These stories are among Duncan's most interesting studies of Anglo-imperial culture, representing as they do a displaced, hermetic, and profoundly anxious colonial society, and focusing on questions of gender, sexuality, class, and race, as well as of authority and agency in colonial flux.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Although written and published after the 1890s, *The Pool in the Desert* is recognizable in relation to earlier *fin de siècle* 'New Woman' fiction – Duncan's own, as well as others' – in the degree to which it problematizes normative conceptions of marriage, relationships, and motherhood within the frameworks of national and imperial identity. The story 'A Mother in India' critiques the imperial ideology of biological imperative and reproductive duty. The title story, 'The Pool in the Desert,' draws attention to the circumstances of desire in conflict with social pressures of the same kinds that are evident in 'A Mother in India' – wifely duty, social acceptability, economic necessity. 'The Hesitation of Miss Anderson' pivots on the same idea of potential lawlessness on the imperial frontier that in part underpins the narrative of the later novel, *Set in Authority*, as well as focusing on white women in motion in the space of empire. 'An Impossible Ideal' is less clearly engaged with questions of movement and agency: this is the story of an American artist of 'mongrel' identity who is taken up by a middle-class young British woman in Simla because she perceives his representations of India to be more 'authentic.' There are only four stories in this collection, all almost more like novellas than stories in their density, length (with chapter divisions), and narrative complexity – all important texts of Duncan's and of Anglo-imperial literature. (CECILY DEVEREUX)

Carole Gerson and Veronica Strong-Boag, editors. *E. Pauline Johnson, Tekahionwake: Collected Poems and Selected Prose*
University of Toronto Press. xliv, 344. $65.00, $25.95

E. Pauline Johnson (a.k.a. Tekahionwake) was a part-Mohawk, part-English writer and stage performer who captivated Canadian, British, and American audiences in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. While the editing of any writer is mediated by the editor's cultural assumptions, Johnson's work has been more heavily mediated than most because of her status as a self-identified Native woman writer. A virtue of Carole Gerson and Veronica Strong-Boag's book over earlier collections of Johnson's work is their self-reflective openness about their sociopolitical agenda. They not only promote Johnson (as earlier editors did), but do so from an overtly feminist, postcolonial, and contemporary nationalist perspective. Their selections reflect their view of Johnson as a mixed-race advocate of the First Nations, of the New Woman, and of a more inclusive definition of Canadian identity. Whereas previous non-Native editors often reduced Johnson to non-threatening stereotypes, Gerson and Strong-Boag try to present her as a complex woman who tested boundaries of race and gender in a racist, patriarchal, and imperialist culture.

The collection falls into two parts: poetry and prose. A strength of the book is the unique comprehensiveness of the poetry section. *Flint and Feather* (1912) – the only other edition of Johnson's poetry to claim

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

completeness – contains only slightly more than half of her poetic output. For example, the editors of *Flint and Feather* omitted a number of love lyrics as being 'too personal.' Gerson and Strong-Boag not only restore these poems, but also include hard-to-find published and unpublished ones recovered from obscure periodicals and Johnson's personal papers. The result is a broader, more complicated picture of a poet often stereotyped as either an 'exotic Indian maiden' or a 'nice Victorian lady who wrote sentimental nature poems.' In particular, Johnson's radical portrayal of passionate, female sexuality comes through in this new collection.

The poems are presented chronologically and divided into three major sections: 'The Early Years: Beginnings to 1888,' 'The Prolific Years: 1889–1898,' and 'Later Years: 1899–1913.' By not grouping the poems according to subject matter, the editors avoid reducing Johnson's work to simplistic stereotypes, but make more sophisticated thematic comparisons a little bit harder. The chronological approach also makes it easier to see certain developments in Johnson's work (e.g., changes in tone or quality) and to consider possible biographical influences.

The treatment of the prose is different, and most strongly reflects the editors' political agenda. Although they complain that the range and extent of Johnson's non-poetic output remains unappreciated in Canada, they could only include nineteen of her numerous short works because of space limitations. Ironically, this may reproduce the very tendency that the editors deplore: to see Johnson primarily as a poet whose prose is less worthy of attention. Also unfortunate is the editors' decision not to include a comprehensive list of Johnson's prose work – something they do in their previous, analytical book about Johnson: *Paddling Her Own Canoe: The Time and Texts of E. Pauline Johnson (Tekahionwake)* (2000). Instead, they refer collection readers to this earlier book.

However, Gerson and Strong-Boag do attempt what editors of previous prose collections did not: they offer a more representative sample of Johnson's prose, both in terms of genre (short stories, legends, literary criticism, non-fiction articles, etc) and political stance. They not only include some classic pieces – such as 'A Strong Race Opinion: On the Indian Girl in Modern Fiction' – but also previously hard to find articles, like 'The Stings of Civilization.' While aiming for representativeness, the editors nevertheless emphasize works that raise 'questions about the survival of Native and Mixed-race peoples in an imperial world, and the role of women in patriarchy.' This practical edition will interest both informed general readers and scholars. It is the best collection of Johnson's poetry and the best one-volume overview of her work published so far, and is suitable for use as a textbook. While it complements Gerson and Strong-Boag's earlier, analytical work on Johnson, even standing alone it makes a significant contribution to current academic and popular attempts to restore Johnson's reputation as a significant early Canadian and Native writer. (MELANIE

STEVENSON)

Eunice M.L. Harrison. *The Judge's Wife: Memoirs of A British Columbia Pioneer* Ronsdale. 288. $19.95

Eunice M.L. Harrison started to construct her memoirs when she was eighty-five years of age in 1945. She consulted her diaries and other written materials to assure some degree of accuracy. The finished product consists of forty short chapters with a very useful introduction by British Columbia historian Jean Barman. The book concerns the period from 1880 to 1906, but is not necessarily a chronological narrative. Rather it is a set of short vignettes mainly about Harrison's travels and the people she met both in Victoria and in her periodic trips around British Columbia and beyond. As such Harrison does not provide much depth, but rather touches on, or moves in and out of, landscapes and lives.

We learn that Harrison's father, like hundreds of others, was lured by the prospect of gold and convinced that it was possible to strike it rich by the charming Captain Lewis Agassiz. After her father's first sojourn he decided that he would return to Ontario to fetch his wife and daughter. They eventually all settled in Victoria. And like others, as his daughter recalled, he did not quite strike it rich: 'he tried prospecting, and a bit of ranching on the mainland, and without the timely arrival of remittance from Stowe or relatives in England, he would have been in a bad way.'

Despite her father's financial concerns, Harrison seemed to get on with life, and after she completed her years at finishing school she took trips to visit friends in Granville, where she not only enjoyed dancing and parties but also, much to the later chagrin of her parents, was crowned the first bathing suit contest winner on the coast. At one of many social outings, this time a Masonic ball, Eunice met her future husband, crown prosecutor of New Westminster, Eli Harrison. They eventually had six children, all of whom attended private schools in Victoria and Yale. Harrison himself appeared to be preoccupied by his work, for which he frequently travelled throughout the interior of the province. His opinions on the various communities and characters he encountered are also included in this memoir.

But the intricate details of home life are not provided here. Rather, Harrison is much more interested in her husband's legal cases and his travels as well as the social connections that her husband's job provided her. She was delighted with the company of men like Matthew Bailie Begbie and Gordon Sproat, and claimed to have just missed Sir John A. Macdonald's visit to their home in Victoria: she was out for a walk. At the same time, she wrote in blatantly derogatory terms about the Chinese house boys hired by her family and constructed cardboard images of British Columbia's Aboriginal inhabitants.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Apart from being introduced to her social acquaintances, we also glean some information on the social life of Victoria. Sports, particularly cricket and rounders, occupied many hours, as did the dramatic societies of the city. Another leisurely pursuit enjoyed by some Victorians during summer was to set up camp at the local beaches: 'It was an old Victoria custom, until about the start of the first Great War, for a great summer exodus of residents to beach camps in the long vacation. Some of the beaches were practically under canvas for the summer months, so numerous were the parties of campers.'

In the end we are left with a rather lighthearted account of the social life and travels of a judge's wife in Edwardian Victoria. We do not discover Eunice Harrison's personal views on social issues. Instead we learn much about the politics of social visiting and card leaving. (MYRA RUTHERDALE)

Jo Fraser Jones, editor. *Hobnobbing with a Countess and Other Okanagan Adventures: The Diaries of Alice Barrett Parke 1891–1900*
University of British Columbia Press. xiv, 349. $85.00

Historians and scholars interested in women's issues have been fortunate recently, since there have been a number of new publications that shed light on the experiences of women in British Columbia. Thanks to the fine eye of archivist Jo Fraser Jones, who recognized, in the course of indexing this journal, just what a gem it is, we now have a deeper understanding of not just gender relations but the day-to-day routines of one woman, Alice Barrett Parke, who lived at an important moment in the history of the Okanagan valley. Jo Fraser Jones and the University of British Columbia Press are to be congratulated for producing such a valuable source. Fraser's insightful introduction, along with the fine illustrations, contextualized comments throughout the text, and remarkably detailed footnotes, provide the reader with just the right blend of primary and secondary material.

At age twenty-nine, Alice Butler Barrett hailed from Port Dover, Ontario, and like many women of her time found herself a sojourner travelling in the spring of 1891 to the west coast to take up domestic duties for her uncle and brother, then engaged in operating a ranch in the Spallumcheen Valley. Her brother convinced her to keep journals to send home to her relatives to inform them of her comings and goings. After only a few short months at the ranch, she met Harold Parke, another Ontario refugee, whom she herself described as a bit of a 'rover' and whom she eventually agreed to marry. Her original intentions to stay for just one year quickly changed after marriage. She and Harold went on to work at a large ranch and as the postmasters in Vernon, and she ultimately stayed thirteen years longer than

she planned.

While the text is specific to the observations and life of Alice Barrett Parke, it is rich in flavour and detail and provides a remarkable social history of the area and the characters who inhabited Parke's social landscape, as well as many of the social issues of the day, ranging from feminism and religion to race relations and the politics of British Columbia. Parke was a witty and keen observer. She commented endlessly on the apparent gender imbalance and was much impressed by the 'rough' bachelors she frequently rubbed shoulders with: 'Men who talk atrociously ungrammatically, who have dirty hands, and dirtier clothes seem to take quite a courtly air, and more real chivalry of manner than many so-called polished gentlemen.' Her friend, however, who came to work as a school teacher, was not so impressed: 'To tell the truth I don't care to give up a sixty dollar school for a forty dollar man.' Parke did not see herself as quite as independent as that, yet ironically she was. She had profound insight at times on just how independent she had become: 'I believe being much alone makes me more courageous. I have been wondering if it [is] simply from force of habit – or if the spirit really grows stronger in solitude.' She did not see herself as a 'New Woman,' and in fact spoke out against woman's suffrage, yet she was involved in the creation of the Woman's Council and took a certain amount of delight in 'hobnobbing' with Ishbel, Countess of Aberdeen. Not only was she instrumental in the formation of Vernon's first Woman's Council, but she was also active in her community. On a volunteer basis she nursed sick patients and taught English to members of the Chinese community, including the house boy who lived at the ranch where her husband was employed. She saw herself as a 'tremendous gadabout' with a busy social life of visiting and entertaining. Her contemplative moments were spent with her diary, and in the garden. She also took time to keep up with popular literature, especially Charles Dickens. Her Christian faith was also critical in giving shape to her life. She was willing to shop around to find just the right religious home: she attended Salvation Army meetings and also went to the Presbyterian and Anglican churches, although she had little time for Roman Catholics. Indeed, like others of her time, she, at times, could be rather closed-minded in regard to her own superiority and that of her race, but this did not define her in her entirety by any means.

Taken together with Adele Perry's *On the Edge of Empire* and Jean Barman's recently published *Sojourning Sisters*, this book will enhance our understanding of British Columbia's past and the role women played within it. Scholars and students alike will benefit greatly from the efforts made by Jo Fraser to bring this richly detailed account of Okanagan life to light. (MYRA RUTHERDALE)

Jean O'Grady. *Margaret Addison: A Biography*
McGill-Queen's University Press. xiv, 270. $49.95

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Even though a University of Toronto–Victoria residence building is named after Margaret Addison, few people know of its namesake or what she accomplished. Jean O'Grady rectifies this situation with the publication of her densely academic biography of Addison. Following the publication of *Diary of a European Tour* by Margaret Addison in 2000, O'Grady draws on archival research and family history to compile Addison's biography.

Margaret Addison lived from 1868 to 1940. In her lifetime, she witnessed many social and cultural changes, and she instigated some, especially with regard to the development of post-secondary education for women in Canada. Addison grew up in a strong Methodist family, the eldest child of Peter, a preacher, and Mary, a Sunday school teacher. O'Grady dwells on the family history of the Addisons, even preceding Margaret's birth, presumably to give context for the determined, stern, influential woman Addison became. For the most part, O'Grady's biography reads as a chronological, historical narrative of the life of an intellectual woman striving to make changes within the boundaries of a more patriarchal time. She manages to hold her reader's interest despite the prudish attitudes she describes as typical of a Methodist spinster in Victorian times. Addison was a stalwart, intelligent figure who trained as a teacher and worked steadfastly to achieve good teaching positions first in Stratford and later in Lindsay, Ontario.

Through her work, Addison developed an interest in advancing intellectual possibilities for women. On a sojourn to England in 1900, she visited St Anne's College, Oxford and Newnham and Girton Colleges, Cambridge, the women's university residences. She returned to Canada with many progressive ideas for the initiation of such a residence here. She proceeded to help raise funds for the building of Annesley Hall, and in 1903 she was persuaded to let her name stand as the dean of the women's residence. She accepted the position and took a cut in salary to do so. Once in place as the dean, Addison held a twenty-eight-year tenure until 1931, and she tenaciously advocated for more and better housing, and educational options for female students.

O'Grady portrays Addison's strong moral fibre as she faced the politics of working against the grain in a male-dominated environment. In 1922, Addison reached an impasse with her friends and colleagues, the Masseys, who sought more lenient rules for women students in order to create a more uniform, unisex student presence on campus. As Addison wrote in her diary, 'they cannot remember that women wish to develop their own personalities in their own way, and according to their own genius.' While Addison sought to open doors for women, she also sought to preserve a high moral code, even at the risk of seeming eccentric or old-fashioned. Addison focused on women's ability to create a co-operative, harmonious environment, and she eventually won the battle to maintain curfews and

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

restrictions on the social lives of the women of Annesley Hall. Addison had a vision for her residents, and she was proud to see many of them sought after for employment they earned degrees at the university.

O'Grady focuses on Addison's achievements in the public and professional realms, but there is very little exploration of her social or personal life. Perhaps little evidence of it remains. There are glimpses of Addison's friendship with Helena Coleman, a Canadian poet who lived in Toronto and who trained as a teacher with Addison. There are interesting details, such as the following description dated 1916: 'A little club of friends centred around Helena Coleman met regularly to have dinner together and to discuss learned topics such as Hillaire Belloc's writings or Bergson's philosophy.' More information or explanations of how Addison spent her leisure time–such as it was, for O'Grady writes about the laborious letter-writing, secretarial work, decision-making, and rule-enforcing entailed in Addison's job at Annesley – to counter the historical stoicism of the study would make the portrayal of Addison more well-rounded.

In the end, O'Grady assesses that Addison is best remembered as a 'transitional figure' from today's perspective: 'If on the one hand she brought the values of an earlier era into the twentieth century, on the other she brought into the university some of the ideals articulated in the twentieth century: a woman's right to develop her intellect and study any subject on the college curriculum; careers for women in new spheres; a religion freed from narrowly moralistic prohibitions; and free choice and responsibility for college students within practicable limits.' In her study of Margaret Addison, Jean O'Grady intertwines Canada's women's history, educational history, and cultural history. This study marks the continuation of serious, academic recovery work of early Canada and its long-forgotten foremothers. (JENNIFER CHAMBERS)

Stephen Leacock. *Leacock on Life*. Edited by Gerald Lynch
University of Toronto Press. xxviii, 210. $24.95

Whether engaging in verbal sleight of hand or voicing a provocative opinion on a social and political question, Stephen Leacock – professor, social critic, amateur historian, platform entertainer, and humorist – was a master of drollery and incisive commentary. Most of his books are still worth reading today in spite of the passage of nearly a hundred years since the publication of his two most famous works of humour, *Sunshine Sketches of a Little Town* (1912) and *Arcadian Adventures with the Idle Rich* (1914). It was not just what Leacock said that stands the test of time but the brilliant, effervescent way in which he said it. Admittedly, we may not always agree with Leacock's sentiments, reflecting the cultural bias of an earlier age, but that is no matter. His captivating expression, 'riding madly off in all

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

directions' (from 'Gertrude the Governess' in *Nonsense Novel*), for example, has been used so often that it is the name of a comedy show and the title of a book by Ronald Bell. We forget that the Mariposa Folk Festival, first held in Orillia, Ontario in July 1960, has its origins in Leacock's fictional town in *Sunshine Sketches*. In short, Leacock's legacy – his centrality as a pre-eminent humorist and insightful essayist – is perhaps stronger now than ever as new generations of readers discover his works.

Leacock on Life is a fascinating compendium of Leacock's wit and humour. It is a selection of his aphorisms, parodies, and anecdotes and excerpts of his views on a variety of topics from the serious to the farcical. Similar anthologies of the writings of other authors and thinkers can be found under the generic titles of *The Wit and Wisdom of* ... or *The Sayings of* ... The editor of this volume of Leacockiana, Gerald Lynch, is an able critic and interpreter of Leacock's work and an accomplished novelist in his own right. Lynch is certainly a keen reader of Leacock's books, finding literary nuggets in Leacock's vast canon. But like Leacock, Lynch is quite capable of discarding his professorial mantle in order to appreciate Leacock's whimsical sense of fun and the pure, unadulterated pleasure that Leacock took in the delight of writing. Consequently, this anthology not only contains Leacock's kindly quips and biting satire, but we also see the autobiographical side of Leacock's writing, displaying an element of pathos and humanity.

Leacock on Life begins with a section entitled 'His Life,' and in particular Leacock's charming preface to *Sunshine Sketches*, which includes the wonderful, classic line: 'Personally, I would sooner have written "Alice in Wonderland" than the whole Encyclopaedia Britannica.' Quite appropriately, the book concludes with a section aptly entitled 'The End,' and Leacock's sad reflection on old age, 'Three Score and Ten: The Business of Growing Old.' In between these opening and closing frames, there are slightly more than forty other sections, alphabetically arranged, containing snippets from Leacock's work under topics such as Business, Education, Food and Drink, Love, Sporting, and Women.

With respect to his criteria of inclusion, Lynch is quite candid: 'I chose whatever I most liked,' he states in his introduction, 'if with a determination to entertain readers and to represent Leacock's wide range of interests.' Lynch's selections from Leacock's writing are intelligently made, and there is indeed a nice variation and blending of excerpts. Lynch's introduction makes it quite clear that notwithstanding Leacock's occasional lapses, Lynch is an unabashed admirer of Leacock's work. In an era when it is fashionable to destroy our literary heroes for their peccadillos, this is a refreshing change. On the one hand it may appear odd that Canada's premier scholarly press should publish a book of this kind. On the other hand Leacock believed that learning, even when it is profound, should be as light as a feather. *Leacock on Life* sparkles with Leacock's laughter and repartee.

This book needs no further justification except for the caveat that even though it contains vintage selections, it is no substitute for reading the real thing, that is to say, Leacock's books in their entirety along with the many other literary creations from his magic pen. (CARL SPADONI)

Stephen Leacock. *Sunshine Sketches of a Little Town*. Edited by Carl Spadoni
Broadview. lxxxv, 322. $12.95

The contents of this new edition of *Sunshine Sketches of a Little Town*, in the Broadview Literary Texts series, are as follows (my numbering):

Section 1 is an eighty-five-page introduction, divided into sections (my lettering): a. 'Biographical Information about Leacock'; b. 'The Writing and Publication of *Sunshine Sketches*'; c. 'The Social and Political Context of Mariposa'; d. 'Literary Reception and Criticism'; e. 'Orillia and Mariposa'; f. 'The Choice of Copy-Text.' Sections c and d break little new ground, and throughout the introduction Spadoni's strength is rather in the information that he adduces, especially in his account of the circumstances of publication and the textual history of *Sunshine Sketches*, than in his interpretations of Leacock's work and its relation to its times.

Sections 2 and 3 are 'A Brief Chronology' of Leacock's life and work, useful in this condensed form, and the editor's text of *Sunshine Sketches of a Little Town*, based on the first London edition.

Section 4 is some ten pages of notes, which Spadoni acknowledges are reprinted 'in revised and expanded form,' from D.H. Carr's explanatory notes to the educational edition of *Sunshine Sketches* (McClelland and Stewart, 1960). University and college students and instructors alike are in need of good annotated editions of important Canadian texts, and this volume does well to make these helpful notes widely available.

Nevertheless, this edition is a case of overkill when considered as a text for students and instructors, although its low price will be appealing. The rest of the volume is made up of some 150 pages of appendices (lettering in the original). Appendix A ('Leacock's Outline and Tables of Contents') is of limited usefulness, partly because it seems that Leacock wrote quickly and was not a very radical or meticulous reviser of his work. Apppendices B ('Leacock's Correspondence with His Publishers') and C ('*Sunshine Sketches* and Orillia' – a brief list of people and places in Orillia that provided Leacock with models) add little to our knowledge of the work itself. Appendix D, 'Contemporary Reviews,' is of historical-critical interest, even if not all the selections merit inclusion. Such material, carefully culled, would be better collected in a volume of selected criticism on the model of the Casebook or Critical Heritage series; if criticism is to be included in an edition, it would be preferable to select the best, early and late, as the Norton Critical editions and the Tecumseh Press 'Canadian Critical

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Editions' set out to do. To limit the selection to contemporary reviews smacks of historical pedantry, although it does reprint material not otherwise easily available. Appendix E, 'Sunshine in Mariposa: A Play in Four Acts,' is the script of an unperformed play by Leacock ('hardly a masterpiece of any kind,' in Spadoni's words), based on material from *Sunshine Sketches of a Little Town*. This seventy-two-page appendix does not belong in such an edition and certainly cannot tell us much about the earlier prose work. Appendices F and G deal with textual variants in the manuscript and in the *Montreal Daily Star* versions; these sections are a step towards a 'Variorum' edition, but suggest that there is not much to learn from Leacock's variants. Appendix H is a list of a few changes made by Spadoni to his copy-text. The volume ends with a select bibliography; the list of primary texts duplicates entries in Spadoni's *A Bibliography of Stephen Leacock* (ECW 1998), and the comprehensive listing of secondary literature will be useful to students, instructors, and scholars alike.

Although a good deal of useful information, some of it new or not otherwise easily accessible, is made available here, this lengthy volume creates the impression of a certain amount of busy-work. A more rigorous distinction between the significant and the incidental, and between the new and the familiar, in this edition would have allowed its contribution to our understanding of Leacock's work to stand out more clearly. (FRANCIS ZICHY)

Irene Gammel, editor. *Making Avonlea: L.M. Montgomery and Popular Culture*
University of Toronto Press. xii, 348. $70.00, $27.50

Today's child is more likely initially to encounter L.M. Montgomery's characters through films and TV series – not to mention dolls and licence plates – than through the witty prose of their creator. *Making Avonlea: L.M. Montgomery and Popular Culture*, a collection of well-written essays edited by Irene Gammel, addresses how multimedia has transformed Montgomery's world, allowing for various interpretations. This volume would primarily interest teachers of children's literature, as it provides many interesting details and perspectives in language that does not exclude the upper-level undergraduate, and yet remains sophisticated scholarship. It complements Gammel and Elizabeth Epperly's former volume, *L.M. Montgomery and Canadian Culture* (1999), the third section of which discusses Anne as a cultural icon. *Making Avonlea* does what studies of popular culture should do: show how communities are formed through the mutual enjoyment of art.

Gammel's collection arises from a community of scholars interested in Montgomery and popular culture, most of whom participated in the International L.M. Montgomery and Popular Culture Symposium (2000).

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Contributors read each other's papers, and this cross-pollination and debate is everywhere evident in the volume. It makes it the work of a community rather than a number of essays thrown together. This is impressive when dealing with twenty-four authors.

Making Avonlea is divided into three sections. The first, 'Mapping Avonlea: Cultural Value and Iconography,' ranges from the traditional English essay to the personal essay. The feeling of an academic community working on Montgomery is given statistical treatment by Carole Gerson. Cecily Devereux analyses how the media reported on an essay dealing with lesbian desire in the Anne books, revealing their attitudes about homosexuality, iconography, and academia. Juliet McMaster's essay on hair is, as expected, a delight to read.

The second section, 'Viewing Avonlea: Film, Television, Drama and Musical,' contains the most debate. Kevin Sullivan is a touchstone for this section: in his films and TV series, is he defiling Montgomery's works, or offering a valid, progressive spin on them? The writers in this section tend to view film and TV as texts in their own right. Particularly interesting in this section are two essays dealing with nationalism. Benjamin Lefebvre discusses how Disney erases the Canadian identity of Montgomery's works. By contrast, Christopher Gittings shows how Marlene Matthews has emphasized the setting of *Emily of New Moon*, changing the story to incorporate groups such as the Micmacs, ignored by Montgomery.

The focus on different media interpretations of L.M. Montgomery's works emphasizes how the proliferation of ways to experience Montgomery's world has in turn increased the number of communities inspired by it. In the third section, 'Touring Avonlea: Landscape, Tourism, and Spin-Off Products,' fans meet in cyberspace, real-life 'Kindred' tea parties, stores, and in Prince Edward Island itself. The community of Anne-lovers is also a community of buyers that has influenced the community of PEI. Janice Fiamengo writes an interesting essay on how Montgomery's writing coincided with, and was influenced by, early PEI tourism.

The community of fans is an international community. In discussing Anne Clubs in Japan, Danièle Allard reveals how the Japanese have no translation for popular culture because their concept of culture does not distinguish between 'high' and 'low.' The international community of Montgomery fans suggests that the books are, despite their Canadian roots and academic distrust of the concept, universal in scope. (When I taught *Anne* in rural Alabama, students had no conception of PEI, but they all knew a Rachel Lynde!)

This collection is often personal in its approach, as writers frequently refer to their childhood impressions of Anne and company. This tendency can be sentimental (Weber, Nock) or illuminating (Allard, Van Der Klei). The innovative use of 'snapshots' along with formal essays allows for neatly focused personal views of the Montgomery phenomenon, such as Tara

Nogler's experience of *being* Anne in Japan's 'Canadian World.' Whether or not the personal approach appeals to the reader, it does further illustrate how tightly Montgomery's works have woven communities. Indeed, Avonlea is created over and over again by all who visit there. (ELAINE OSTRY)

Lita-Rose Betcherman. *Ernest Lapointe: Mackenzie King's Quebec Lieutenant*
University of Toronto Press. xi, 426. $60.00

I strongly suspect that if one canvassed a statistically relevant slice of Canadians, almost none of the respondents would be able to identify Ernest Lapointe. Indeed, if one were to do the same thing in Lapointe's beloved home province of Quebec, I doubt the results would be any more favourable. As a strongly federalist politician from a province whose recent political heroes bear a distinctly nationalist stamp, Monsieur Lapointe has all but vanished from modern Québécois consciousness. Countless Quebec towns and cities have named streets after controversial figures such as Abbé Groulx and René Levesque, but outside of his home town of Rivière-du-Loup, Lapointe remains quite unrecognized and mostly unknown, a sad state of affairs for a man who played a key role in Canadian and Quebec politics prior to his tragic death from cancer in late 1941.

But in Canadian historical circles at least, Lapointe's political life has undergone a recent, and perhaps surprising, rebirth. First, in 1999 John MacFarlane published a fine and well-received account of Lapointe's influence on the formulation of Canadian foreign policy for over two decades. And then in 2002, Lita-Rose Betcherman, a historian and labour activist whose previous studies have focused on communism and fascism in Canada prior to the Second World War, offered up this lengthy monograph dealing with Lapointe's political career in its entirety.

Betcherman's book is a mixed success. While MacFarlane's focus was, by design, fairly narrow, Betcherman has tried to give us a fuller measure of the man. Thus, there are many, and often quite fascinating, glimpses of Ernest Lapointe as a devoted family man and ambitious politician. Lapointe had strong views on a variety of issues; for example, he viewed Abbé Groulx's strident attempts to link a burgeoning French Canadian nationalism to religion as 'monstrous.' Furthermore, Lapointe, who had entertained vain hopes of occupying the post of secretary of state of external affairs (a post King would not relinquish until after the end of the Second World War), was quite isolationist and suspicious of Britain in the 1930s, but then in March 1939, as another global war seemed all too likely, made it clear to Quebec that Canada could not remain on the sidelines if Britain was threatened by German military might. It was, perhaps, his finest political moment, with Lapointe appealing to French Canadians for their

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

understanding while assuring English Canadians that Quebec would answer the trumpet's call if Britain faced attack.

But there are problems with this monograph. While Lapointe's tenure as minister of justice is well handled (he declined, for example, to overrule Quebec's controversial Padlock Law of 1937 while declaring as ultra vires various legislative acts put forward by Alberta's Social Credit government), Betcherman's treatment of Lapointe's foreign policy interests is far less sure. There are numerous errors of fact, such as the misnaming of the CCF – the Co-operative Commonwealth Federation, not the Canadian Cooperative Federation – while Japan invaded Manchuria in 1931, not 1932. Indeed, much of the secondary research for this book dates back to the period prior to the 1980s, leading one to suspect that this manuscript may well have been completed a good many years ago, only to be pulled more recently, perhaps half-forgotten, from a desk drawer. Much better use could have been made of MacFarlane's work, as well as Paul Bychok's 1995 MA thesis from Queen's University. There are a handful of references made to these works, but they seem to have been rather clumsily added to a dated work that was already substantially complete. Additionally, the notion of Neville Chamberlain as a naïve appeaser fooled by a more clever Adolf Hitler, a view that Betcherman feels compelled to repeat, in recent years has undergone a dramatic reworking with the revelation that the German dictator regarded the Munich agreement as a German diplomatic defeat that Chamberlain had adroitly foisted upon him.

In short, Betcheman's book, while often a very good read, should be used carefully, and in matters of foreign affairs, should defer to John MacFarlane's superior study. (GALEN PERRAS)

Jean Barman. *Constance Lindsay Skinner: Writing on the Frontier*
University of Toronto Press. viii, 360. $50.00

Barman's book struggles with a common problem of literary biographies in a post-canonical time: how to justify the writing (and the reading) of the life of a writer who never quite made it, 'never experienced any single moment of greatness.' Born in British Columbia's Cariboo region in 1877, Constance Lindsay Skinner doggedly pursued a professional writing career for over forty years as a poet, a journalist, a dramatist, a novelist, a children's author, a historian, and pretty much anything else the market would support. She spent almost all of these years in the United States, moving to Los Angeles in 1900, Chicago in 1908, and New York from 1912 to her death – still writing – in 1939. According to Barman, Skinner carried the memory of the western Canada of her childhood with her throughout her life, resulting in a body of work generically disparate but unified by its fascination with frontiers real and imagined and with the Native and 'hybrid' peoples that

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

occupied those frontiers. Best known in her day for conceiving and editing a series of popular histories of the rivers of North America that continued after her death and reached sixty-five volumes (many still in print), Skinner in her last years edged towards fame in her adopted country and is remembered by a medal in her name issued annually by the Women's National Book Association and, more recently, by the Library of Congress for being one of the first women to rise to a position of power in the American book publishing industry. In Canada, Skinner was and is mostly unknown, forgotten by even such basic reference works as the *Oxford Companion to Canadian Literature* until resurrected by Barman.

The implicit and by its final sentence explicit claim of Barman's biography is that Skinner 'deserves the recognition of posterity.' If that's so, it's not for her literary merits. Barman's chapter on Skinner's fiction is repetitive because the stories it discusses are repetitive, the kind of market-driven writing that prompts phrases like 'another of Constance's stock frontier heroes' and 'the requisite happy ending.' The chapters on her other genres are wisely less engaged with the product than with the process, less with art or even craft than with Skinner's considerable grit and business sense. If Skinner does merit resurrection, it's not because of *what* she wrote but because of her determination to support herself as a writer in a society unaccustomed to professional women writers or non-professional historians: the sections on Skinner's run-ins with Canadian canon-keeper William Arthur Deacon and with the increasingly university-dominated historians of her time are the most interesting in the book.

Barman's account of Skinner's life is perceptive, sensitive, and meticulously researched. But in this case it's not the life that matters so much as the forces (to use a word Skinner hated) that created and constrained that life. Barman knows this, even if she doesn't always remember it. Because a writer has been marginalized by her gender, genre, or place of residence doesn't necessarily make her interesting: what makes a literary life interesting is either an exceptional individual or exceptional circumstances. For Skinner, meeting the challenge of the latter exhausted any potential for the former. As she wrote in a brutally honest moment, 'I've never wanted anything in my life with a single-hearted desire, but writing – i.e. writing developed into art and it seems I can't have that.' (NICK MOUNT)

Adrian Shubert. *Death and Money in the Afternoon: A History of the Spanish Bullfight*
Oxford University Press 1999. x, 270. US $24.95

In eighteenth-century Spain a doctoral examination offered one of the customary occasions for a bullfight. An elaborate ceremony surrounded the event, including an equestrian procession by members of the university, and the successful candidate painted his symbol in bull's blood on the wall

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

of his college. This university custom continued to assert its presence even after the bullfights were no longer held, with red paint taking the place of blood. Like many of the striking historical details in Adrian Shubert's excellent study, this account of the bullfight's place in university life calls into question accepted interpretations of the bullfight as a vehicle for timeless values (such as bravery and honour) or conflicts (between nature and culture or male and female) inherent in Spanish culture. The doctoral examination is simply one of a large number of occasions for bullfights that Shubert records, and the shift to red paint indicates that the customs associated with bullfighting underwent changes and adaptations over time. In keeping with such questioning, Shubert's central argument is that the Spanish bullfight is a 'social institution' that has changed in response to shifting historical circumstances. His study places the bullfight in a complex and illuminating relationship to the general history of Spain.

Shubert's introduction reviews the three main theories that trace the origins of the bullfight to Arabic culture, Roman games, and prehistoric Iberian rituals. After commenting on the slender historical evidence for any of these views, Shubert focuses his analysis on the modern bullfight as it emerged in the early eighteenth century, through a combination of popular rituals, such as bull-running and wedding games, and an aristocratic entertainment similar to jousting. In its aristocratic variant the fighters rode on horseback; the modern bullfight took shape when non-aristocratic participants began to assist the mounted riders and to engage the bulls on foot. By the middle of the eighteenth century, large crowds were paying to attend bullfights, individual bullfighters had won fame, and a bullring had been built in Madrid. The bullfight had established itself 'as a commercialized spectator spectacle,' analogous to other modern sports staged before large audiences for commercial gain.

The body of the book examines the bullfight under a series of general headings: 'Business,' 'Bullfighters,' 'Gender,' Crowds,' Regulation,' and 'Politics.' Each of these six chapters is detailed and well documented, and each addresses recurring factors that informed and shaped the bullfight throughout its history. First among these is the sustained importance of commercial interest. Tied from its beginnings to fundraising for charitable causes, the bullfight became a source of income for various parties – bullfighters, breeders, promoters – and generated a series of business practices. Bulls were bred for the aggressive traits demanded by the ring; the training of bullfighters shifted from an 'artisanal' form of apprenticeship to an 'industrial' system controlled by influential promoters; successful bullfighters became stars whose commercial influence extended well beyond the ring; women bullfighters, although unsettling in relation to traditional hierarchies of genre, won acceptance because they brought in crowds and profit. Perhaps above all, the fortunes of the bullfight responded to the overall cycles of the Spanish economy.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Other developments examined by Shubert elucidate the relationship between the bullfight and Spanish society in general. The crowds attracted to the bullring confirmed its function as the site of a modern spectacle and engaged social anxieties about the mixing of classes and the potential for disorder and rebellion considered to be inherent in large groups. As part of the response to its novelty, the bullfight drew detractors and defenders who conducted a civil debate over its significance and its social impact, articulating their arguments in both economic and moral terms. Finally, in its political uses the bullfight traced the complex succession of regimes since the eighteenth century, from celebrations of royal authority and manifestations of nationalist sentiment to the 'Liberation Bullfights' of the Franco government in the 1950s. Throughout, Shubert elucidates the emergence and development of the bullfight as a commercial spectator sport, in the larger context of Spain's economic, social, and political history.

Given the many excellent qualities of this study, it seems unfortunate that Shubert records no case of a bullfight held to celebrate the publication of a scholarly book. Rich in detail and pleasurable to read, *Death and Money in the Afternoon* marks a red-letter day for Spanish historical and cultural studies. (STEPHEN RUPP)

Donald Wetherell and Irene R.A. Kent. *Alberta's North: A History, 1890–1950*
University of Alberta Press 2000. $34.95

One of the great truisms of Canadian letters is that this country is fascinated by its northern districts. Canadian art galleries display countless paintings of northern landscape. Our nation's poets and fiction writers speak eloquently of the trauma, challenges, and triumphs of northern life. Politicians from John A. Macdonald to Jean Chrétien have spoken with passion about the possibilities of northern development. Much of the celebration of the North, however, has focused on the territorial North – the 'true' North. The vast expanse of the provincial North has attracted far less attention than it should. *Alberta's North* is a major step forward in addressing this gap, for it is one of the very best historical studies of regionalism in the provincial North.

Giving only brief attention to the development of the region before the 1890s, the authors devote the early chapters to the northward extension of federal government control into the area. They describe the early efforts by government officials to document and map the geological resources of the country and cover the debates about the need to extend treaty negotiations into the region. In one of the book's most important chapters, 'A Foundation for Development,' the authors trace the transition associated with the transfer of control from the federal to the provincial government and to the initial impact of government policies on northern Alberta. Considerable

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

attention is devoted to the evolution of northern life and, following the First World War, the informal division of northern Alberta into two sub-regions, one centred around the Peace River country and the other focused on developments around Fort McMurray. Because the book only covers the period to 1950, it does not discuss in detail the major expansion of the resource economy in the last half of the century. The chapters on the interwar years, however, describe the changing dynamics of an expanding resource sector and, in particular, document the impact of these changes on both the non-Aboriginal and the Aboriginal people in the region.

Alberta's North is, in many ways, a fine piece of work. Well-selected (if often too small) photographs illustrate the diversity and changing nature of regional life. The maps are useful and well presented. While a few topics, such as the Alaska Highway and CANOL projects in the Second World War, are dealt with in a perfunctory fashion, the authors have generally covered the main issues and events in appropriate detail. Particularly pleasing in a geographically focused work of this nature, *Alberta's North* places regional developments in a national and thematic context. The book is written more as a foundational study than as a piece of popular history, and so the narrative is stronger on detail than on carefully selected stories or engaging anecdote.

Donald Wetherell and Irene Kent have accomplished their main goal. They have provided a tightly written account of the evolution of northern Alberta, with attention to Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal contributions and experiences. By describing the formation and subsequent division of the regional society, they have moved beyond simplistic geographically deterministic notions of identity and have portrayed a vibrant, changing, and important part of Alberta and western Canada. *Alberta's North* is a fitting and carefully crafted narrative of the development of a region that has, over the last fifty years, played an increasingly important place in the country's economic and political development. (KENNETH COATES)

Judith Williams. *Two Wolves at the Dawn of Time: Kingcome Inlet Pictographs, 1893–1998*
New Star Books 2001. 240. $29.00

In 1998 Dzawada'enuxw artist Marianne Nicolson painted a new twelve-metre-high red iron ochre pictograph on a rock face in British Columbia's Kingcome Inlet, four miles upriver from Gwa'yi vilage. The painting is in the form of a shield-shaped copper that was used traditionally as a form of exchange to signify family and economic power. The art work depicts the mythical Dzawada'enuxw wolf ancestor Kawadilikala and is a symbol of cultural continuity.

Nicolson's pictograph is a hundred metres from a significant rock art work painted in 1927 by Mollie Wilson at Petley Point. The Petley Point

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

rock painting shows traditional coppers together with cows. It documents George Scow's 1927 potlatch, one of the last major illegal feasting and gifting ceremonies that was held following the 1921 confiscation of potlatch regalia by the federal government. The cows that were consumed at Scow's potlatch were purchased from local farmer Ernest Halliday. Ironically, at the same time Ernest's brother, William Halliday, a federal Indian agent, was actively prosecuting all of the Kwakwaka' wakw for potlatching to comply with the federal government's policy to enforce Native assimilation.

Visual artist and writer Judith Williams examines the history of the potlatch and the negative effect of its ban on the Aboriginal community. She records how winning local soccer teams used trophy giving and feasting as a mechanism for an underground continuation of the potlatch gifting ceremony. The federal government eventually returned the ritual objects to Native-directed museums in Alert Bay and Cape Mudge in 1979/80. Williams's account is interwoven with the history of the homesteaders who arrived in Gwa'yi village in 1893 to establish European-style farming. The Halliday family came from Scotland and were 'the longest enduring inlet homesteaders.' The engaging history of this family included memoirs of events such as Ernest rowing a boat for four days to Alert Bay to find a market for his beef and butter. The author discusses the impact of farming on the delta ecology, such as the cutting of crabapple trees and introduction of animal husbandry, which adversely effected Native food fathering practices.

The Hallidays farmed until 1986 when the land was acquired by the non-profit conservation organization Nature Trust. The Halliday farmhouse, where the author stayed, has fallen into disrepair, and the carefully tended fields have reverted to the biology of the past – spring bank clover and silverweed. Williams also interweaves the history of the logging industry and discusses how its influx of transient workers disrupted Aboriginal social systems. The construction of logging roads interfered with tidal flows, causing flooding in the village.

The author contends that the 1927 copper/cow pictograph at Petley Point is a pivotal work in the evolution of North West Coast rock art and 'could be seen as more authentic than a great deal of what is considered iconographically pure "native art," frozen in reproduction of past work.' The painting records a time when the indigenous culture was seriously threatened by the loss of territory and ritual and the replacement of their traditional system of exchange and valuation by a new cash economy. Williams provides a compelling argument that pictographs should have the same status as oral testimony in Native land claims. With her massive rock painting, Marianne Nicolson continues the Dzawada'enuxw pictograph tradition creating a bold statement of cultural renewal.

This book is not a preachy revisionist tract but a balanced history of Native-white relations in Kingcome since 1893. Williams presents a

fascinating account of an evolving contemporary Native culture based on credible sources, interviews, and personal visits to the site written to appeal to both a general and scholarly audience. (JUDITH NASBY)

George Colpitts. *Game in the Garden: A Human History of Wildlife in Western Canada to 1940*
University of British Columbia Press. 205. $75.00, $29.95

We might accept that First Nations see the world differently from the continent's post-contact arrivals, but George Colpitts presents a more complex pattern in *Game in the Garden*. Colpitts never plays on his title, although he clearly interprets game species and the 'games' played with them. Colpitts's work derives in part from his master's and doctoral research and is as meticulously researched and comprehensively indexed as that would imply. His thesis is social: humans imbue nature with symbolic meanings that change at critical environmental or economic junctures.

The story opens in 1774 as competition forces Hudson's Bay Company fur traders to journey inland. Amerindian fur-trading 'middlemen' have discovered that the voyageurs are willing to come to them, obviating a trek to the coast. So the games begin. HBC traders' reputations may be based on their ability to return skins, but employee journals tell of the degree to which the search for food dominates 'day to day life in the fur trade.' Colpitts makes it clear that traders' pocketbooks may depend on skins but their lives depend on finding food. HBC records point to millions of animals killed during the fur trade years and Colpitts uses journals and letters to describe an interdependent business model grounded in the realities of survival. Uncounted in the company skin numbers are the millions of pounds of meat needed to sustain the fur competition with its concomitant over-exploitation of animals.

Demise of wildlife is a perception well suited to the players of the next game: the promoters touting the riches awaiting settlers in the West. A land that once flourished with wildlife can now deliver that wealth to the farmer: a region 'teeming not with fauna but with flora, not with wild animals, but wheat.' Colpitt argues that mid-Victorian liberalism and Darwinian notations of improvement promise the West God intended. Food reciprocation (now one way to make Amerindians destitute) is transmogrified into 'fur paternalism,' a convenient denigration fitting comfortably with governments lacking money.

Describing the period of western domestication is challenging. Its beginning is clear: the 1870 transfer of Rupert's Land. Its manifestations are similar: the demise of the buffalo is 'good,' the past is unsavoury, 'outsiders' are pre-empting local resources. Yet the tensions – between ranchers and farmers, between both and First Nations or among established social elites

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

and immigrants – play out at time scales ranging from the 1870s to the First World War and back to the election of Laurier and over the broad spatial scale of the West.

The domestication game is also inextricable from the early conservation/sport shooting movement and it's difficult to know whether Colpitts's use of separate chapters hinders or helps our comprehension. In the final analysis however, his take-home message is clear: homogenous pockets of society, each with perceptions of wildlife, advance that perception to an end, often one that marginalizes an 'other.' Colpitts argues, for example, that early fish and game 'protective' societies were motivated not by an environmental ethic but by social concerns: an attempt to conserve core British values in the face of 'eastern European settlers, papist sodbusters, Asian labourers and Native hunters.'

Colpitts's final period comes after the First World War. He credits newly available cold storage with finally breaking the link between wild meats and the diets of the majority of westerners. Sport hunting comes into its own with wide-ranging attempts to make Nature more efficient: the purging of 'unwanted, coarse fish,' from streams and their replacement with hatchery fry; elimination of predators from parks; ranching of fox, mink, and other furbearers: a sad wish that 'bringing Nature under control offers hope of bringing society under control' after the tragedy of the war to end all wars.

Colpitts leaves us on the cusp of the Second World War in a utilitarian world where 'westerners do not see wildlife as part of the world in which they live.' Colpitts seems to recognize this as an over-generalization, and though he continues to talk about the 'west,' his articulation of the next view of the garden – ecologists advancing a complex argument for the natural capital value of wildlife – points to involvement of all humanity. (ANN ZIMMERMAN)

Patricia K. Wood. *Nationalism from the Margins: Italians in Alberta and British Columbia*
McGill-Queen's University Press. xx, 180. $65.00

Despite all their best efforts, Canadian historians who 'do' immigration and ethnic history still have a hard time convincing many people that immigration and ethnic history *is* Canadian history, and profoundly so. Patricia Wood's *Nationalism from the Margins* is a laudable attempt to make this very case by using the history of Italians in Alberta and British Columbia to say something new about the nature of Canadian national identity. Yet, despite its good intentions, *Nationalism from the Margins* promises more than it delivers, and misses an opportunity to connect the history of immigration to broader themes in the Canadian story.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Wood wants readers to approach this book as a study in the construction of Canadian identity. In fact, *Nationalism from the Margins* wants to tell the story of Canadian national identity in a way that moves us beyond what Wood calls the familiar 'battle lines' of English/French and Native/non-Native. 'Canadian nationalism,' Wood insists, 'has a diverse history.' And, according to Wood, the story of how Italians in Alberta and British Columbia constructed an identity for themselves as individuals and groups in their new home is an important part of the diverse history of Canadian nationalism.

Put simply, *Nationalism from the Margins* is 'a history of one idea of what it means to be Canadian.' The Italians of western Canada, Wood argues, had a 'different construction of the Canadian nation.' Their idea of what it means to be Canadian was formed by a 'different historical reading' from that of English or French Canadians; it was shaped by a 'different experience of race and class, different goals for their lives in this nation, and different expectations for how this idea was supposed to work.'

So far, so good. Wood also invites her readers to explore a neglected theme in historical scholarship: *landscape*. To the various matrices of identity which scholars have been toying with over the past few decades – class, ethnicity, region, and gender – Wood explores how the physical landscape of Alberta and British Columbia contributed to the evolution of a distinct Canadian identity among Italians in western Canada. As Wood puts it, 'located in the far west, somewhat isolated from the powerful centre of the country, [Italians in western Canada] shaped their national identity within a regional context.' In effect, Wood is saying that there is such a thing as a distinct western-Italian-Canadian identity, and this identity is invariably shaped, in part, by geography.

This sounds plausible enough, and offers exciting new possibilities for studying the processes by which immigrants become Canadian. But this is where the book promises more than it delivers. Wood seems to talk around her central premise without ever articulating it in a clear way. Surely, it should be possible to articulate the essential features of this western-Italian-Canadian identity?

To be fair, Wood does present original and insightful research to substantiate her argument. She points out, for example, that the Italian populations of western Canada were, and are, relatively small as compared to Toronto or Montreal; in other words, the Italians of western Canada are more isolated *as Italians*, and therefore open to experiences of Canada that differ in degree and in kind. But how did this actually influence the formation of a distinct sense of Canadian identity among the Italians of the West?

Wood's arguments in this regard are less than convincing. For example, we read, 'Western Canada was also a place in which it was possible to earn money, own land, and feel at home, while still keeping one's ethnic

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

identity.' This makes perfect sense, of course, but was it any different in Toronto or Montreal? Further on we read that 'Italians found work on the CPR, in city maintenance, and in a couple of local businesses. While it was not the centre, the Church played an important role in gathering the community.' Students of immigration history won't be surprised to learn that Italians in Lethbridge had a mutual benefit society, or that Italians in Calgary joined the *Giovanni Caboto Lodge*, named after the Italian 'discoverer' of Canada's east coast. Nor will students of immigration history be surprised to learn that there were Fascist clubs, the so-called *fascio* throughout Italian communities of the West in the 1920s and 1930s. All of these features of Italian life in western Canada were mirrored in Ontario and Quebec.

Granted, there were differences of degree and kind, but one struggles to see a uniquely western-Italian-Canadian perspective in all this. Only near the end of the book does the reader get a glimpse of how a distinct sense of place influences the way Italians in western Canada see themselves in relation to others – be they Italians or Canadians. In her many interviews with Italians in the West, Wood noted that their conversations are 'littered with modifying phrases such as "out here in the West," or "speaking from a West Coast perspective."' Here, we are also introduced to real Italian immigrants who speak to us directly of their first impressions of western Canada upon arrival from Italy. One woman who arrived in Vancouver in 1952 remembered a place '"bathed in those azure waters that I had already crossed from another part of the globe, with its mountains ... its green meadows, its multicoloured gardens."' The beauty of the new landscape left this newcomer with '"a feeling of sweetness ... I no longer felt so far from my homeland and my loved ones."'

Now we're getting somewhere. Here, after all, is a comment that speaks to how an individual's sense of identity in a new land was conditioned by the physical landscape. Insights such as these should have been at the heart of *Nationalism from the Margins*. Indeed, such insights are central to understanding how Italians in Canada negotiated the tricky process of being Italian while becoming Canadian. Patricia Wood's *Nationalism from the Margins* deserves credit for showing us the possibility of this avenue of research. Yes, the book raises more questions than it answers. Perhaps that is not such a bad thing. (ROBERT VENTRESCA)

James Doyle. *Progressive Heritage:*
The Evolution of a Politically Radical Literary Tradition in Canada
Wilfrid Laurier University Press. viii, 322. $39.95

In studying a radical, mostly Communist, literary tradition in Canada, James Doyle knows that he is swimming upstream. He has undertaken a tremendous amount of work in researching archives, scouring back issues

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

of little magazines, and reading forgotten reviews of neglected novels – some unjustly neglected, some not. His purpose is to prove that there is a strong tradition of political dissent in Canada extending from nineteenth-century radicals to the New Left, that many of its authors were perceptive social critics, and some were accomplished writers overlooked by the bourgeois public and ignored by the academy. In both respects he is successful, although his successes are hard won.

To prove his case he surveys masses of writing, much of it notable for its earnestness rather than its skill. The book's heroes, such as Margaret Fairley, Stanley Ryerson, and Joe Wallace, are praised for their dedication as much as for their literary craft. Doyle's task is all the harder because almost any work expressing social concern falls under his gaze – Leacock and Callaghan as well as agitprop and socialist realism – and the result is an avalanche of material, which he withstands by focusing on 'Canadian literary Communism,' and by advancing from decade to decade, briefly establishing the social setting, identifying authors, and assessing their achievements. Inevitably there is some clutter. Since many of the works are unfamiliar, he is obliged to summarize them quickly, and this produces stodgy passages that occasionally sink into bathos, as in this story by Mary Quayle Innis: 'A male high-school teacher, oppressed by a sense of the meaninglessness of his life and work, achieves a moment of mystical awakening as he hears the honking of Canada geese overhead in the autumn dusk.' Elsewhere Doyle's tone grows apologetic or exasperated when his literary taste and political sympathies collided: 'The main character of [Trevor] Maguire's novel, in spite of his numbingly redundant exposure to the injustice of the capitalist system, fails to achieve political awareness, for reasons that are by no means clear.' On the other hand, he writes sensitively when treating more substantial writers like Dorothy Livesay and Milton Acorn. His main achievement, however, is his workmanlike devotion to the job of unearthing a neglected history, giving some shape to it, and providing materials for further study.

In this respect he faces two larger challenges. One is to trace a pattern through the decades, not necessarily a rigorous line of development, but some sense that Canadian writers grew in literary and political sophistication as they devised 'a distinctive and aesthetically valuable Canadian progressive cultural tradition.' Here he is partly successful, if only through the weight of evidence, but the sheer mass of material and his reluctance to celebrate a few exemplary authors ensure that *Progressive Heritage* will remain amorphous. There is continuity in writers' indignation at social injustice and, in varying degrees, their commitment to socialist principles; but it is hard to see a coherent history emerging from all the evidence, and Doyle is not concerned to propose a dialectical model that might reconcile the rival claims of socialist principle, Canadian nationalism, and various forms of rhetorical experimentation.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

The second challenge is to describe, however briefly, a theory explaining the successful interweaving of aesthetic and social values. How do we assess the artistry of didactic or partisan art? What makes literature progressive? This is not Doyle's main duty, but it is implicit in his desire to distinguish a radical tradition. In this respect, he is more reserved. He is well informed about the history of communist literary ideology, its mistrust of modernism as practised by brilliant but reactionary writers like Eliot and Pound, and its attempts to articulate a critical aesthetic which could be both brilliant and progressive. These attempts evidently did not translate well to Canada. Here, earlier efforts to combine doggerel and dogma do justice to neither; while more accomplished writers poignantly evoked the agonies of poverty and alienation, yet often retained an individualistic bias that led to escapism, introspection, romantic anti-capitalism, or anarchist individualism, rather than to effective social action. Too often, aesthetics and politics remain at odds. (JON KERTZER)

David Damas. *Arctic Migrants /Arctic Villagers: The Transformation of Inuit Settlement in the Central Arctic*
McGill-Queen's University Press. 278. $75.00

The author has done extensive archival research and provided a book that describes what happened in the central Arctic from the 1940s to the 1970s. The earlier chapters deal with a period of great change in the Arctic, a time of depleting game resources, declining fur prices, and the ravages of virgin soil diseases. They contain some memorable images of small clusters of Ottawa bureaucrats making decisions that greatly affected life in the central Arctic without giving any thought to consulting the Inuit, and often with little substantive knowledge of the conditions the people faced in trying to stay alive.

Aided and abetted by the HBC and the RCMP, the bureaucracy, until the 1950s, pursued a policy of keeping the people dispersed and out of the growing number of Arctic settlements until it became obvious that life on the land was no longer sustainable. Practically, the Ottawa bureaucracy had to keep the costs of administering the far North down. The region produced little of value except furs, hardly essential to national well-being. It was remote and out of sight, and until the postwar era, the official preference was that it should remain that way. It was in the HBC's interests that the people continue to trap white fox instead of hanging around the settlements. Moreover, keeping Inuit on the land was seen as cultural

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

preservation and as necessary to maintaining what work ethic they might possess.

Mostly unaware of these views and the manipulations that followed from them, the Inuit behaved as impoverished people have always behaved. By harvesting and trapping fox, they tried to keep themselves alive. If land resources proved insufficient where they were, they tried other locations. And if that failed, they would see what was available at the trading post or mission. Yet, while they may have been welcomed by the missionary who needed a flock, the trader and the government did not want them there, and, by one means or another, persuaded them to move back to the land. The Inuit operated out of the mistaken belief that they might find sustenance in the settlements and the bureaucrats out of the equally mistaken belief that the Inuit would find it on the land.

What permanently changed this two-way delusional pattern were instances of starvation and their widespread publication. In the mid-1950s, people starved to death. While their numbers were not high, they received national attention when their story, properly embellished, was told by Farley Mowat and the media. At the same time, the national perception of the North was changing. Increasingly, it was seen as having enormous mineral and hydrocarbon potentials. The question of what to do with the Inuit shifted from how to preserve their way of life to how to include them in northern development. A rescue effort, which the author entitles 'The Welfare State Policy,' was implemented. Steps were taken to provide services via northern service officers, area administrators and 'welfare teachers.' Area economic surveys were undertaken to determine what the Arctic might produce. Inuit were put to work in mines at Rankin Inlet, Yellowknife, and Lynn Lake, though not very successfully. Construction of the DEW line provided work for wages. All of this, plus the provision of local services, led to a concentration of people in the present Arctic communities.

What I like about the book is its detail – almost extreme at times. The author has patiently combed through aging files to develop a sense of what happened where and what decisions were made. At the same time, the detail tends to obscure the larger picture. The Inuit of the 1950s and 1960s were caught in an oscillating web consisting of changing land resources and fur prices, the introduction of more comfortable modes of living, a nascent wage economy, and government decisions about who they were and how they should live. Perceptions of the North were undergoing substantive change, as was the place of Aboriginal peoples in the Canadian fabric. Subsequently, with the recognition of land and other Aboriginal rights, the Inuit acquired the power to negotiate their own future. How all of these factors may have interacted is not always apparent in the book. (ED WEICK)

John Zucchi, translator and editor. *The View from Rome:*

Archbishop Stagni's 1915 Reports on the Ontario Bilingual Schools Question
McGill-Queen's University Press. xlx, 131. $65.00

There is a surprisingly contemporary tone to the events chronicled in this volume, despite the fact that they occurred almost a century ago. John Zucchi presents two reports that the Apostolic Delegate of the Holy See to Canada, Archbishop Pellegrino Stagni, sent to Rome in 1915 on the problems confronting French-English bilingual schools in the province of Ontario. Zucchi's Introduction places the dispute in historical context and elucidates the roots of the animosity that pitted francophone and anglophone Catholics against each other in a bitter fight for control of the separate school system. This dispute was of concern to the Vatican because it potentially threatened the existence of the separate school system in a province dominated by a strong Protestant majority. The appendices include letters to Archbishop Stagni from prominent advocates of each position. All together, the collection provides an insightful and fascinating case study of the identity politics that have characterized (and continue to characterize) Canada since confederation.

The immediate catalyst for the dispute was Regulation 17, promulgated by the Ontario government in June 1912. This regulation prohibited francophone students who could function in English from receiving instruction in French. Students who were judged to be unable to function in English could be instructed in French only in the first form (grades 1 to 3). Not surprisingly, Regulation 17 generated enormous resistance from francophone educators and community leaders who argued that French-medium instruction in the schools was crucial to the preservation both of francophone identity and religious commitment. The dispute pitted the English-speaking Irish-origin Catholic clergy against their francophone counterparts in a fight for control of the language of instruction within the separate school system. Prominent members of the 'Irish' Catholic hierarchy argued that if language was more important than religion for francophone parents, they should 'petition the government for bilingual school boards distinct from those of the separate schools.' William Macdonnell, Bishop of Alexandria in Ontario, wrote in 1914 to Archbishop Stagni to debunk the 'preposterous demands of the French Educational Association.' He argued that 'notwithstanding all the cant we hear about "la langue et la religion" ... the agitation is purely racial.' The francophone claim 'Il faut garder notre langue pour conserver notre religion' was dismissed on the grounds that if these demands for French-language schooling were granted, 'the English-speaking Catholics would quit our schools and join public schools. English-speaking rate-payers know that if the bilingual agitators have their way it will be practically impossible for children from our schools to pass the high school entrance examination.'

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

These arguments were reinforced by D. J. Scollard, Bishop of Sault Saint Marie, who suggested to Archbishop Stagni that 'Our French-Canadian friends do not understand Ontario; they fail to realize that five-sixths of the population of Ontario firmly believes that the education of the children belongs wholly to the state, and there should be only the national school system and one national school programme, that the legalized existence of separate schools is a deplorable mistake, and that the separate system militates against national unity and the coalescing of races.' The opposing perspective, supported strongly by the Quebec hierarchy, was expressed to Archbishop Stagni in an equally forceful manner by Senator P. Landry, president of the Association canadienne-française d'éducation d'Ontario: 'What we know is that a most unjust persecution against the French element is being led by highly placed ecclesiastics in the Catholic hierarchy ... the leaders of the flock, the shepherds of souls, denounce the use of French, do not allow the faithful in their charge to have French-Canadian priests teach the word of God to French-Canadian audiences, order the banishment of French in those dioceses and persecute in an odious and scandalous manner those priests of theirs who do not want to bend to the demands.' Stagni viewed the division as sufficiently serious and intractable that he requested an intervention from the Holy See. In September 1916 Pope Benedict XV released his letter *Commisso divinatus* to Canadian bishops urging them to meet and reach a common position. The discussions that ensued resulted eventually in a détente that safeguarded religious instruction through French but did little to reverse the broader linguistic restrictions imposed by Regulation 17. (JIM CUMMINS)

Evelyn Cobley. *Temptations of Faust:*
The Logic of Fascism and Postmodern Archaeologies of Modernity
University of Toronto Press. xi, 306. $55.00

Fleeing from Nazi persecution in Germany, Theodor Adorno and Thomas Mann found themselves living as exiles in California. Politically very different, Adorno and Mann both devoted considerable energy to reflecting on the rise of fascism, even sharing ideas, most notably over the fate of modern music. This collaboration is the topic of Evelyn Cobley's *Temptations of Faust*, a work that explores the genesis of Mann's novel *Doctor Faustus* and situates it as part of the 'cognitive shift' towards a postmodern self-understanding. Cobley calls *Doctor Faustus* a 'parable of fascism' that teaches us to recognize how fascism was not an aberration from modernity, but 'an implicit possibility within modernity.' Reading Leverkühn's musical development as the unfolding of ideological positions in Germany during the interwar period, Cobley decodes the twelve-tone system as an 'uncanny combination of total integration and unchecked dissemination.' Though it

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

liberates the individual note from tonal hierarchies, twelve-tone music subjects the note to domination by a more far-reaching, decentred (and fascist) totality. The novel dramatizes, therefore, another version of the dialectic of Enlightenment whereby, instead of liberation, the subject experiences increased domination at the hands of reason itself. Adorno's *Philosophy of Modern Music* not only provides Cobley with the deeper understanding of socio-historical conditions, but supplies her with the theoretical connective tissue for linking the emergence of fascism with postmodernity. Interpreting Adorno as a postmodernist *avant la lettre*, she holds negative dialectics equivalent to Derridean deconstruction, arguing that both are aimed at undermining 'foundational categories' and responding to the needs of the 'decentred subject.' The result is that Cobley can tack back and forth between her reading of the novel, which teaches that fascism is the incarnation of a postmodern logic, and postmodernist theories as a set of mutually complementary diagnoses of this new historical situation.

The author's claim that Adorno unwittingly 'co-authored' the novel, by providing its sociohistorical diagnosis of the relationship between fascism and music, is substantiated by compelling analyses of the characters' theoretical ruminations, and grounded in Cobley's reading of Leverkühn's musical development in the context of German history. Though her historical frame of reference is limited (being restricted to Gordon Craig and George Mosse), she makes a good case for the way fascism exploited tendencies within modernity, and was not merely an irrational suspension of modern values in the name of a romantic, *völkisch* ideology. In addition to her solid analysis of the novel, Cobley is strongest in her provocative reading of Hitler as a postmodern *bricoleur*, deconstructing both the state apparatus (*Gleichschaltung*) and the metanarratives of German history for the purpose of creating a decentralized and disorienting totality for the exercise of power. It is this aspect of her book that does the most to advance the idea that the Nazi revolution was the culmination of processes in modernity (Baumann).

Readers will find in Cobley's treatment a tendency to treat all thinkers (from A-dorno to Ž-ižek) with the same postmodern brush. This is all the more frustrating since the synopses she provides of individual theorists prove that she has a keen understanding of the differences separating them. What is at stake here is not the question of whether Adorno can, or should, be read as a postmodernist, but whether Cobley really takes a stand on important concerns framing debates over postmodernism as she promises. If postmodernist celebrations of counter-hegemonic fragmentation and play share in the logic of fascism, as she states, her affirmative reading of everyone leaves the reader wondering if the problems are as serious as she claims, and what, if anything, one should do. Derrida's dubious defence of Paul de Man's wartime journalism has raised serious questions about the

limits of deconstructive readings when confronted with explicit issues of culpability and the demands of good judgment. Cobley's own preference for pastiche in dealing with modern/postmodern theory means she forgoes this kind of historical criticism, the kind characterized most forcefully by Habermas's confrontation with his Frankfurt School forefathers and the problems of modernity in his *Philosophical Discourse of Modernity*. Though her egalitarian and fair treatment is a welcome relief from some of the more tired polemics, it is also the Achilles heel of a very challenging argument. (RICHARD SCHAEFER)

Glenn Wilmott. *Unreal Country: Modernity in the Canadian Novel in English*
McGill-Queen's University Press. viii, 236. $65.00

This is a valuable study of modernist fiction in Canada. It provides a series of illuminating lenses for reassessing our novels and offers fine close readings of well- and less-known texts. Glenn Wilmott's central argument is that modernism existed in the English-Canadian novel from the turn of the last century, but it was not the high modernism of Joyce, Eliot, and Pound. Rather than debate the evolution of modernist critical thought, however, Wilmott provides ways of looking at what we have always had and, thereby, helping us to see it anew. He takes the aesthetics of expressionism, the gendering of history, and the concretely situated specifics of regional location as instructive frameworks for his readings of selected texts, which range from *Think of the Earth* by Bertram Brooker, to familiar novels by F.P. Grove, Sinclair Ross, and Ethel Wilson, to the now neglected *The Nymph and the Lamp* and several other Maritime novels unknown to me.

Of these three frameworks, the one I find most interesting is that of expressionist aesthetics. True, I have argued that any understanding of modernism must include expressionism, so I guess that, with me, Wilmott is preaching to the converted. However, he explores the expressionist aspects of his chosen texts with care and nuance and leaves a reader with an increased awareness of the complexity and richness of the modernist moment – a moment that has been greatly oversimplified by scholars. When he turns his attention to matters of gender, with the binary of masculinized transcendence grounded on a feminization of history, I find his readings of Grove and Wilson especially exciting. My only complaint here is that I would have liked more: how about Watson's *The Double Hook*? Or MacLennan's *Two Solitudes*? I also wish Wilmott had introduced the visual arts into his frame of reference because this analogy works nicely in the chapter on expressionism. For example, as we grapple with the hierarchy enshrined in visual modernism, which values abstract above representational (figural) art and defines the former as serious, masculine, and transcendent, but the latter as trivial, feminine, and sentimental, it helps

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

to know that similar oppositions are at work in literature. This hierarchy exists in Canada with the valorization of *automatisme*, the colour-field work of Jack Bush, or the aggressive technique and rhetoric of Harold Town over the more representional work of women contemporaries such as Prudence Heward, Kathleen Munn, and Molly Lamb Bobak.

In his final chapter Wilmott tackles that other Achilles heel of Canadian modernism: regionalism. Here he argues that the invisible modern cities in rural (and regional) Canadian novels are present, even if we don't see them, and I think he is absolutely spot on. Surely that is exactly what presses in on the stories in Grove, Wilson, Watson, Raddall, Buckler, and many others! Put simply, Wilmott reminds us that just because the setting is rural does not mean that modernity is not a force to be reckoned with or that the narrative and stylistic resources of the writer are not modernist, even as they express what Wilmott calls an anti-modernist agenda. Although I would argue with Wilmott's term anti-modernist (I prefer categories of modernisms that include the realist and the expressionist), he explains his term and uses it consistently to describe the resistance to modernity pressing in on regional spaces.

In *Unreal Country* Wilmott reopens a debate about the relationship between modernism and national identity that was once fiercely joined by our poets. With his study to build on we can now re-examine the role of the novel – that form most congenial to nation-building ideology – in the delineation of a modern nation state. As we engage in this discussion, we may also question the (to my mind) suspect term postcolonial, which crops up several times in this study. Just as Wilmott has demonstrated the complexity of Canadian modernism, so it remains to unpack the contradictions inherent in Canadian postcoloniality. We were, I am convinced, modernist, and we also have been postmodern, but have we ever been postcolonial? Perhaps that's a subject for Wilmott's next book. (SHERRILL GRACE)

Mark Moss. *Manliness and Militarism: Educating Young Boys in Ontario for War*
Oxford University Press 2001. viii, 222. $21.95

The theme evident throughout Mark Moss's book is that 'manliness and militarism' are foreign to Canada. Specifically, the work agruges these constructs are products of the pernicious influence of the United States and Great Britain.

The work discusses the social conditioning of boys for war through youth organizations, drill practice, hunting, the Baden-Powell movement, sports, and toys. In doing so, *Manliness and Militarism* attempts to fill a large gap in the Canadian historiography. Although much has been written about the origins of the First World War and of Canada's initial response to it, the role of militarism in Canadian society in the years directly preceding the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

war has heretofore been ignored. The book features exhaustive research from wide-ranging primary sources and well-chosen quotations from international writers on the period. Yet there is a pervasive presentism that reduces much of the argument to hindsight, portraying Ontarians in the first decade of the 1900s as actively anticipating the coming of war.

Evidence does not bear this out. In his conclusion, Moss states, 'It is not too much to claim that, by 1914, most aspects of young men's lives were oriented towards the military.' Why, then, were so few serving before the outbreak of the war? In reality, the total August 1914 strength of the Canadian military surely speaks to a long tradition of neglect rather than a veneration of militarism. What about widespread opposition to national military service in Canada from 1867 to 1914? In fact, Colonel W.H. Merritt and other proponents of compulsory military service mentioned in the narrative were widely ignored. The conscription crisis surely reveals some dissent. Although beyond the chronological scope of the work, the analysis does not help explain the fact that there were more votes in the 1917 federal election against conscription in Ontario than anywhere else.

Furthermore, the writer provides no evidence to suggest why generalizations about Ontario are applicable to Canada as a whole. Indeed, contrasts and comparisons made between Ontario and the eastern United States or between Ontario and Great Britain, while ignoring the rest of Canada, are the norm. Certainly, the work's focus is Ontario, yet Moss's most common sentence is 'in Canada, especially in Ontario.' Ontario is not a synonym for English Canada, and as a result one might question whether his findings have relevance outside of the province. There are areas where this need not be so; comparisons with other parts of Canada in the main narrative, as in references to the 'Loyalist Cult,' could strengthen the work while keeping the focus firmly set on Ontario.

By the same token, Moss's conclusion that, with 43 per cent of enlistments in the Canadian Expeditionary Force coming from Ontario, the province was a hotbed of militarism must be questioned. Even when taking into account the numbers of migrants from other provinces enlisting in Ontario, the British-born constituted 65 per cent of the First Canadian Contingent, and virtually half of the entire CEF. British birth was the single most important factor behind the decision to enlist. This point could certainly have been used to build the work's thesis that militarism was a foreign introduction to Canada. Yet any other factors besides manliness and militarism which might possibly have had a role in a young man's decision to enlist are de-emphasized.

Moss's argument has merit, but the evidence does not sustain the weight of the conclusions being built upon it. The work is a useful test case and will hopefully foster further interest, however, this reviewer remains unconvinced that manliness and militarism, foreign or otherwise, played such a large role in Canada's response to the Great War. (ANDREW

THEOBALD)

John Griffith Armstrong. *The Halifax Explosion and the Royal Canadian Navy*
University of British Columbia Press. x, 248. $39.95

This book explores a hitherto neglected topic, namely the impact of the Halifax disaster of 6 December 1917 on the Royal Canadian Navy. Drawing upon source material held at the National Archives of Canada, the author provides a gripping account of the devastation wrought in the navy's facilities by the shock wave released when the munitions-laden *Mont Blanc* exploded after being rammed by the *Imo* in the 'narrows' of Halifax harbour. Then came a second crisis, when a muckraking local newspaper, backed by paranoid public opinion, claimed that massive death and destruction in the Nova Scotian capital had derived largely from blundering by the Canadian naval officers.

Denunciation focused on Commander Frederick Wyatt, the man nominally in charge of vessel movement in Halifax harbour. At the inquiry ordered to probe the causes of the disaster, Wyatt, flustered by aggressive cross-examination, lashed out with accusations which suggested that Canada's naval high command had condoned inefficiency and confusion within the local pilotage authority such as to make vessel collisions a virtual inevitability. That revelation culminated in Wyatt's being charged with manslaughter, and, as Armstrong sees it, led to the RCN's being saddled with an enduring image of 'incompetence and poor leadership,' one that possibly contributed to the V-E Day riots in 1945, when naval ratings trashed much of downtown Halifax in retaliation for what they saw as civilian disrespect and exploitation of 'Jack Tar.'

Despite serious personality flaws, Wyatt ultimately was acquitted of criminal wrongdoing. The disaster of 1917 essentially had derived from a complex array of tragic miscalculations brought about by the escalating pressures of war. But the scandal ended his naval career, in large measure because his superiors opted to make him a scapegoat for their own transgressions. Armstrong effectively demonstrates that Ottawa officials, both civilian and military, were often out of touch with conditions in Halifax, displayed a chronic reluctance to challenge the patronage game down east, and when challenged accused their critics of being unpatriotic. In a revealing anecdote, the author describes a flying visit paid to Halifax shortly after the explosion by Admiral Charles Kingsmill. Far from providing inspirational leadership, this director of the naval service kept a low profile and concentrated his efforts on relocating of the Naval College from Halifax to Kingston (it later moved to Esquimalt).

Clearly then, the top brass of the RCN emerge with tarnished reputations in this book. And yet one has to question whether their poor performance at

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

a time of crisis really was the defining moment for the navy that Armstrong claims. His analysis pays too little attention to the larger picture coming from works such as Marc Milner's *Canada's Navy, the First Century*. There we learn that Canada's 'tin-pot' fleet, created in 1910 and then isolated a year later when the anti-navy Conservatives came to power, remained marginalized through most of the war. Only in 1918, when the Royal Navy reneged on its promise to defend Canadian waters against German submarines, did the Borden government become convinced of the need for a 'made-in Canada' navy.

At that point and despite negative reverberations emerging from the Halifax disaster, the RCN began to overcome its orphan status. But then came peace, an isolationist government under Mackenzie King, chronic hostility from French Canada over the persistently unilingual state of the service, plus economic hard times during the 1930s. The net effect was neglect of a military role at sea for Canada until another war loomed in Europe. Amid this litany of adversity, while bitter memories of the Halifax disaster of 1917 persisted in the minds of individuals (including the author's battle-scarred grandfather), they likely had little impact on the larger pattern of events. Overall then, while this book is not entirely convincing, it's a good read, with haunting photographs, and adds important detail to our knowledge of early twentieth-century Canadian history. (DAVID A. SUTHERLAND)

Shelagh D. Grant. *Arctic Justice: On Trial for Murder, Pond Inlet, 1923*
McGill-Queen's University Press. xx, 342. $39.95

The title of Shelagh Grant's book is deeply ironic. Though the book is a penetrating account of Canada's first efforts to bring its form of justice to the Arctic, it tells the story of a tragic injustice.

The murder trial which forms the centre-piece of this book took place at Pond Inlet on Baffin Island in 1923. From 1880, when Great Britain transferred the Arctic Islands to Canada, until the 1920s, Canada had done very little to 'show the flag' or take any responsibility for governing the area. As Grant points out, all through this period the Inuit were technically, from the perspective of Canadian law, full-fledged Canadian citizens, but with none of the privileges of Canadian citizens such as health or educational services or the opportunity to vote. An informal 'frontier justice' had developed, 'allowing for an easy coexistence between Inuit and the whalers,' but the Canadian state had not established any formal system of law and order.

In the summer of 1923, the King government decided to send a judge, a prosecuting lawyer, a defence counsel, and an RCMP inspector in charge of nine officers and constables on the *CGS Arctic* to conduct the trial of Aatitaaq, Naqallaq and Ululijarnaat for the murder of Robert Janes. This

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

decision was prompted by much more than an interest in the administration of justice. In effect this was a 'show trial' with two political objectives. First, the trial would show the world, especially the Americans, the Danes, and the Norwegians, whose nationals were showing an increasing interest in the Arctic Islands' resources, that Canada really was in charge up there. Though, typical of Mackenzie King's caution and cunning, until it was all over the trial was a very hush-hush affair, an experienced cinematographer from the Fox Century studio went along to produce the kind of show Canada could give the world. The trial was also intended to show the Inuit the firmness and fairness of Canadian justice at a time when there was increasing violence along an advancing frontier of settlement and development in the Canadian North.

In the Inuit system of justice, the killing of Robert Janes was not a 'murder' but a communal execution. In March 1920, Janes, a Newfoundland fur-trader who had run out of trade goods and had become increasingly desperate, threatened to kill the Inuit he was living with near Cape Crauford at the top of Baffin Island, unless they handed over their fox skins. The Inuit families took council together and decided that the *quallunaaq* would have to be killed before he killed them. Janes was lured out of an igloo onto the ice and shot and killed in cold blood. Afterwards, those responsible took Janes's personal effects to the nearest trading post and placed his frozen corpse in a wooden box in a high rocky crevice to be safe from animals.

Through interviews with many eyewitnesses of the dramatic scene that took place on the Arctic ice off Cape Crauford, diaries of many others who were involved, and meticulous examination of police and court records, Grant fleshes out the story in great detail. Despite the rigidities and biases of the alien justice system imposed on these events, the basic story of how and why Janes died filtered into the trial. The prosecutor recommended a conviction for manslaughter. The jury (consisting of six crewmen from *CGS Arctic*, five of whom were francophones) found Aatitaaq not guilty for lack of evidence. They found both Ululijarnaat and Naqallaq guilty. But while they recommended leniency for Ululijarnaat they did not do so for Naqallaq, who had pulled the trigger and was clearly a respected leader in the community. Naqallaq was sentenced to ten years in Stony Mountain Penitentiary in Manitoba.

The real tragedy was yet to come. At Stony Mountain Naqallaq fell gravely ill with tuberculosis. In September 1925, he was returned to Pond Inlet, sleeping on the deck so as not to infect the white folks down below. His own people were not so fortunate. On arriving at Pond Inlet he was reunited with his people and allowed to live in close quarters with them. He soon died, as did many others infected by his disease – an epidemic, which Grant shows the Canadian government tried to cover up rather than treat. Such was Arctic justice.

We are much in Shelagh Grant's debt for the resolute research, skilful writing, and compassionate nature that have brought us this sad and telling story. (PETER H. RUSSELL)

Barbara Clow. *Negotiating Disease: Power and Cancer Care, 1900–1950*
McGill-Queen's University Press 2001. xviii, 238. $65.00, $27.95

The act of negotiation suggests exchange, discussion, and communal resolution among involved participants. It implies the exercise of power, albeit to varying degrees, by the various parties. In this book, *Negotiating Disease: Power and Cancer Care, 1900–1950*, Barbara Clow presents the history of cancer within this framework of negotiation, exploring the dynamics between the sufferers, healers, even politicians in their search for understanding and treatment of this dreaded disease in the first half of the twentieth century. Conventional medicine struggled to understand the cause of the disease, endorsing surgery, radiation, and radium therapies as the best treatment of the day, but they could not profess a cure for cancer. Using Ontario as a case study, Clow argues that many patients found alternative medicine practices for cancer care to be credible and beneficial. She contends that 'the health culture of North America during the first half of the twentieth century was pluralistic, rather than monopolistic,' thus leading to contested terrain in terms of 'whose views of health, illness and healing prevailed in medical encounters, in health care policy, in health culture.' Patients and practitioners, as well as politicians and legislators, were negotiating the boundaries of medical authority in cancer care. Contrary to our assumptions concerning medical authority in this period, power did not rest solely with conventional medical practitioners.

The opening chapters of the book describe lay perceptions of illness and treatment as well as the medical profession's understanding of cancer and their search for a cure. This is essential groundwork for Clow's discussion of alternative medicine's challenge to conventional cancer care in the remainder of the book. In chapters 3, 4, and 5, she presents the alternative cancer treatments advocated by Hendry Connell, John Hett, and Rene Caisse, and ensuing responses from patients, the medical community, and politicians. Hendry Connell, a medical doctor, administered 'Ensol,' an enzyme solution as a treatment for cancer to several patients and published his findings in the *Canadian Medical Association Journal* in the mid-1930s. His work was not without problems, yet he received the support of the medical profession and provincial politicians who were excited by the possibilities of this research. John Hett, another medical doctor, advocated a cancer serum therapy to correct endocrine imbalances and to stimulate antibodies in cancer patients to combat the disease. His treatment raised greater professional criticism than Connell's, yet was tolerated by the medical

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

community as a result of his status as a doctor presenting a treatment based on scientific factors of irritation, endocrine imbalance, and viral infection. Rene Caisse offered a herbal tea, a combination of burdock root, sheep sorrel, rhubarb root, and slippery elm bark, called 'Essiac' ('Caisse' spelled backwards), to destroy cancer cells and to remove toxins from the body. A nurse by training, Caisse did not enjoy similar professional support. Despite her popularity among the laity, her work drew much opposition and outright scepticism from the medical community. Moreover, Hett and Caisse kept their remedies secret, further raising the eyebrows of the profession. According to Clow, 'Connell was described as an experimenter ... Hett was depicted as maverick ... Caisse was considered a quack.' In the final chapter, we learn that the cancer treatments of Connell, Hett and Caisse did not survive the post–Second World War era when the authority of scientific medicine left no room for alternative practices.

What makes this story of power and cancer care particularly gripping is the patient experience, a surprisingly overlooked component in many historical studies of disease and treatment. Clow describes how Beatrix Leacock, wife of Canadian humorist Stephen Leacock, more calmly accepted the fate of her breast cancer than her husband did, dying only weeks after her diagnosis. In contrast, M.A.M. sought out Rene Caisse in hopes that this alternative treatment would cure what surgery and radiation had not. Dorothy Morrow pleaded with physicians to be more alert to cancer symptoms after she was misdiagnosed. I want to see, as I think Clow does, patients exercising 'power' within the professional and political context of cancer care treatments of the period. Instead their stories saddened me.

In the end, it seemed to me that the disease itself held the most power. Despite the plurality of medical treatments offered for this dreaded disease in the first half of the twentieth century, no one – conventional or alternative medical practitioner – provided the decisive cure for cancer. Twenty-first-century medicine continues to look for a cure – conventional or otherwise – and in the process pays more attention to patient decision-making practices. Clow reminds us that personal decisions about disease and healing have long been exercised, particularly in the case of a disease that has claimed, and continues to claim, so many lives. (SHELLEY MCKELLAR)

Stephen L. Endicott. *Bienfait: The Saskatchewan Miners' Struggle of 31*
University of Toronto Press. xi, 180. $21.95

A slender volume of well-written prose, Stephen Endicott's book focuses on a tumultuous strike of Saskatchewan miners in 1931, during the Great Depression. The incident is remembered in Canadian working-class history for its brutality, as three strikers, participating in a motorcade in support of the miners' demands, were shot by the RCMP.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

The book is yet another celebration of the role of the Communists in the labour history of Canada, for the miners sought support from the Workers' Unity League (WUL), a creature of the Communist party of Canada, a supporter of its policies, and an affiliate of the Red International. Endicott's perspective causes him to minimize the ultimate failure of the strike to win union recognition. He leaves unexplained why WUL leaders briefly left the scene after the disastrous motorcade ended in police violence and repression of citizens' civil liberties. He implies that the WUL ended its affiliation with the Red International, without at the same time mentioning that in 1935 the WUL disbanded itself as a result of a directive from the Soviet Union's Comintern, so that contact remained close throughout that union's existence. He also infers incorrectly that the WUL was a precursor of post–Second World War social unionism, which was actually the outcome of the CIO industrial union movement in Canada associated politically with the democratic socialist party, the CCF, and not the Marxist, theoretically revolutionary Communist party of Canada. Readers will enjoy this book so long as they are aware of the author's perspective.

The book nonetheless is good social history, and its best features are the result of considerable oral history research, which portrays citizens of the community in considerable personal detail, at a time of general economic stress, made worse by arbitrary, exploitive actions of the mine operators, who espoused discriminatory attitudes towards the 'foreign' workers in Bienfait and Estevan. A result of Endicott's visits with citizens who participated in the strike is many wonderful photographs of the town, strikers' families, the RCMP in action, and WUL leaders. The books conveys the dreadful conditions in which the miners lived and worked, the ruthlessness of arbitrary employers, the failure of many politicians and judges to be even-handed when dealing with the parties in the dispute because of a class divide that was very clear in the 1930s, and the complicity of the RCMP (with the exception of one interesting, independent officer), with the employers. The book reveals new information about the two trials of WUL leader Annie Buller, which were an outcome of the dispute, and succeeds in bringing to life this remarkable woman.

It would take decades before the miners had a viable union to protect them, as Endicott reveals in his conclusion. He ends on an optimistic note by discussing a moving ceremony in May 1997, when the Saskatchewan Federation of Labour and the Estevan Labour Committee hosted an event to honour the three men killed while trying to win basic rights for working people in Canada. The martyrs were vindicated: a new tombstone repeated the original phrase on their first grave marker (later erased), which stated that they were 'murdered by the RCMP.' The participants in this ceremony then 'completed the ill-fated motorcade of 1931 ... in a solemn automobile procession, escorted this time by the RCMP at their own request.' It was a fitting and moving conclusion to this monograph about one of the most

disastrous events in Canadian working-class history. (LAUREL SEFTON MACDOWELL)

Karen Ferguson. *Black Politics in New Deal Atlanta*
University of North Carolina Press. xvi, 336. US $19.95

Recent debates around affirmative action and welfare reform in the United States have directed renewed attention upon the growing gap between middle-class African-Americans and the much larger mass of the black population. While the division between an educated, articulate elite and a largely disempowered working class has been a salient feature of black history since emancipation, most studies of social life, politics, and civil rights struggles have tended to treat the African-American community as an undifferentiated whole. Karen Ferguson's splendid book joins a short but distinguished list of titles that explore the ways in which class dynamics shaped the movement for black equality, allowing certain African Americans to find a voice in local politics and to access federal programs for advancement while other blacks remained invisible and excluded from the state's largesse.

Ferguson focuses her study on Atlanta, a city that supported an unusually accomplished black professional class in the early twentieth century and one that served as a showcase for many of the New Deal's southern relief, housing, and public works projects. By attaching themselves to the growing federal bureaucracy, black social workers and educators were able to make significant strides towards inclusion in the mainstream. Yet, black reformers' use of the state had long-term negative consequences – time and again they used their new found power to pursue a 'politics of respectability' that defined only a minority of Atlanta's working poor as deserving of benefits and excluded the majority of the black population from social welfare opportunities. Although the strict segregation of the day firmly tied the fate of the black elite to the community as a whole, the reformers' selective definition of citizenship accentuated economic stratification and relegated much of the African-American working class to the margins of civic life.

Ferguson is at her best when demonstrating how the black elite positioned itself for incorporation into specific policy-making processes. She shows, for instance, how social workers associated with Atlanta University secured jobs in the welfare programs ushered in by Federal Emergency Relief Administration (FERA), and how they utilized these prize white-collar positions to expand employment opportunities for other black professionals. Similarly, black educators successfully lobbied for inclusion in National Youth Administration (NYA) civic education projects, pressuring local New Deal officials to channel scarce resources to young African

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Americans previously excluded from such initiatives. Faced with both racist hostility and, from white liberals, condescending paternalism, the black elite sought to consolidate its precarious position by acting as gatekeepers, allowing only 'respectable' and 'morally upright' members of the community the chance to participate in New Deal programs.

The costs of this strategy are made dramatically clear in Ferguson's chapter on slum clearance and urban renewal. Allying themselves with white housing authority officials, black leaders were party to the depiction of vibrant African-American working-class neighborhoods as 'slums,' the demolition of black districts that threatened developers' plans for a revitalized downtown core, and the creation of a concentrated west side ghetto. Moreover, the concessions that black leaders wrung from city and federal authorities emerge as paltry at best in Ferguson's account: the relatively small number of places reserved for blacks in Atlanta area public housing came at the cost of increased state scrutiny of the African-American population.

Despite Ferguson's many achievements, *Black Politics in New Deal Atlanta* is not without some small flaws. Although an early chapter considers radical alternatives to the black elite's incorporationist strategy, Ferguson omits any sustained discussion of organized African-American workers. She observes that Atlanta largely lacked the heavy industrial base that allowed black workers in other southern cities to use the new CIO unions as vehicles to combat discrimination, but nonetheless she might have followed the leads of historians Bruce Nelson and Judith Stein, who have charted the ambiguous racial record of the industrial union upsurge in the region. Similarly, while Ferguson explores the role of the Atlanta NAACP in furthering the aims of the black middle class, she is silent on the working class turn the Association took during the Second World War. All things considered, though, these are minor quibbles that do not significantly detract from a very fine book. (RICK HALPERN)

Steve Hewitt. *Spying 101: The RCMP's Secret Activities at Canadian Universities, 1917–1997*
University of Toronto Press. xvi, 296. $30.00

In the 1960s I attended a meeting of the Canadian Civil Liberties Union in Toronto, mainly because I wanted to hear the guest speaker, the McGill University law professor Frank R. Scott. What exactly his topic was I can't recall, but I remember him saying that, although the RCMP had originally been founded to keep a watchful eye on the aboriginal peoples of the western plains, by the 1960s it was keeping a watchful eye on Canadians everywhere: 'We are all Indians now.'

Reading Steve Hewitt's fine book about the activities of the RCMP on

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Canadian campuses since 1917, I wondered how thick the file was that they put together on Scott over the years. From my own research in the McGill University Archives I know that in 1932 Principal Arthur Currie's assistant, Colonel Wilfrid Bovey, assured the commissioner of the RCMP, J.H. MacBrien, that Scott and his associates in left-wing activity, Eugene Forsey and the United Theological College's King Gordon, were no danger to their students or to Canada, since they believed in political change by constitutional means. As Hewitt shows, however, information that some individual or group did not represent any threat did not mean that the RCMP lost interest in them. Once opened, files were rarely closed.

The story that Hewitt tells is both entertaining and cautionary. It is entertaining because for years the RCMP's Security Service operatives on Canadian campuses were usually out of their depth. Relatively ill-educated into the 1960s, with a simple-minded view of subversion, of Canadian society, and of universities, their reports often piled irrelevancy on inaccuracy. The tale is cautionary because Hewitt shows how ready the RCMP was to waste money while playing fast and loose with civil rights when it came to monitoring perceived threats from the political left.

Security Service efforts on campus needed to be secret for several reasons. Subversives worked below the surface almost by definition and therefore could not be tracked by agents or informants working out in the open. As well, university people objected to the presence of undercover Security Service agents on campus; so, from time to time, did politicians and journalists. But, as happened in 1963, when the government of the day made a deal with the Canadian Association of University Teachers and got the RCMP to agree not to carry out anti-subversive surveillance except with the knowledge of responsible university officials, the Security Service often managed to ignore the agreement.

Hewitt's book is highly informative as well as entertaining. In these days of heightened awareness of security issues, *Spying 101* is essential reading for university people and civil libertarians both. This does not mean that the book is free of flaws. Hewitt states that the RCMP remained in contact with Sir Arthur Currie throughout the 1930s. This was a neat trick, since Currie died at the end of 1933. Hewitt's account of the 1949 dismissal of the biochemist George Hunter from the University of Alberta is misleading; his account of the troubles of the theoretical physicist Leopold Infeld at the University of Toronto in 1950 is inaccurate.

But minor cavils like this do not detract from Hewitt's very important achievement. By means of diligent and focused inquiry he has shown how eager the RCMP was to keep tabs on those (almost invariably) left-wing faculty members and students from whom the Security Service feared the worst. The information thus collected was generally of little or no value, but the collection went on all the same. Admitting that it all was rather pointless would have led to reduced budgets and blighted careers.

Ironically, on an occasion that Canadians with university links were involved in leaking classified information to foreign agents, the RCMP needed Igor Gouzenko, a cipher clerk in the Soviet embassy in Ottawa who defected in 1945, to tell them. Either the Security Service had been looking at the wrong people, or the information-gathering had not led anywhere. Either way, it is hard to escape the conclusion that the RCMP had been wasting time and money. (MICHIEL HORN)

Douglas Reimer. *Surplus at the Border: Mennonite Writing in Canada*
Turnstone Press. 206. $22.00

This book begins with a quotation from Deleuze and Guattari. Literature written by a minority in the language of the majority, they argue, is 'affected with a high coefficient of deterritorialization.' Douglas Reimer attempts to apply this theory to the writing of Mennonites in Canada. The spatial metaphor seems apt, since Mennonites have been called 'the people apart' and since language has been the main method of separation. Various literary issues might conceivably be related to the particularities of the experience of immigrants relocated from the territory of the Russian steppe to the Manitoba prairie. What are the conditions that have favoured an explosion of writing among Russian Mennonites in western Canada? Reimer reflects on the work of many of these writers: Rudy Wiebe, Sandra Birdsell, Patrick Friesen, Di Brandt, Armin Wiebe, and others.

A little theory, alas, is a dangerous thing and Reimer does not allow the facts of history and geography to get in the way of his theory. Territory, he notes, 'is not so much an actual space as a set of codes and rules that regulate behaviour.' These codes are in some tantalizing way related to the conventions of literature. In the absence, however, of any clear definition of these conventions, the territory in question soon becomes a swamp in which the language spoken is bafflegab. Here is a sample, chosen at random: 'This thinking the minor poem of death is not an emptiness in the sense of the "nothing there" but an emptiness (if it is an emptiness) of the everything there, the surplus, the multiple, waiting for us to write "the emptiness" of death as we wish.'

Reimer attempts to shed some light on this bleak territory with a series of dichotomies. Minor literature is to major literature as the communal is to the individual. The kernel of truth in such generalizations, however, is soon lost as the false dichotomies pile up on each other. Minor literature is open and non-lyrical and accepts the material. Major literature, by contrast, is closed, lyrical, and rejects materiality. This comes with a matching list of authors who are judged as either good guys or bad guys. The good guys are minor and earthy and defy the conventions of patriarchy. The bad guys are – well, let's just say, the opposite. Writers of realist fiction, of course, are bad

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

guys – an assumption that leads to absurd generalizations such as the following: 'in realist fiction women must not love but be loved.' In realist fiction, sex is not enjoyable, but in the non-realist fiction of a 'minor' writer like Armin Wiebe, the characters 'enjoy sex despite the strict Mennonite mores against it.' Mennonite mores against sex? One has to wonder where all those large families come from.

Reimer picks up terms with a long history of standard usage and torments them like silly putty. Take, for example, the word *lyric*. 'The lyrical might be said to be the "official,"' he writes. The 'lyrical tradition of the colossal restraint of allusion,' he claims, is what limits the poetry of Patrick Friesen. To restrain the material by using few words is to 'wish to control the new space by being "frigid" and doling out the body in snippets.'

There is something bizarrely perverse and self-defeating about all this. Like a spiralling circle of dominoes that fall in on themselves, Reimer's false dichotomies collapse, taking the specious argument of the book along with them. (MAGDALENE REDEKOP)

Marie Carrière. *Writing in the Feminine in French and English Canada: A Question of Ethics*
University of Toronto Press. viii, 244. $55.00

This study of five women writers, two from Quebec and three from English Canada, provides a valuable contribution to the assessment, almost thirty years after its first appearance, of what is known in Canada as 'writing in the feminine.' The original term 'écriture au féminin' served to distinguish the formal experimentation practised by Nicole Brossard and a number of other women writers in Quebec in the 1970s and 1980s from the problematic 'écriture féminine' promulgated in France by Hélène Cixous. These writers defined themselves as feminist (with North American connotations) rather than 'feminine' (as deployed in the French context), although like Cixous they acknowledged the influence on their work of French post-structuralist theorists, especially Derrida. Most previous studies of this type of writing (such as those by Louise Dupré or Karen Gould) have focused on a group of francophone women authors who, initially at least, made collaboration part of their project. The fact that Brossard and others (particularly Louky Berianik and France Théoret) chose to share their work and their feminist theorizing with writers and academics in English Canada led to a unique effort at communication and cross-fertilization across the country (as illustrated by the bilingual review *Tessera*), and the production of a body of texts in English that lend themselves to the kind of comparisons undertaken by Marie Carrière.

All of the writers discussed are preoccupied by issues of language in relation to a problematic female subjectivity and relationship to writing, and some specifically address those raised by translation and interference

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

between French and English. Carrière chooses to concentrate on poetry rather than prose fiction (although such generic distinctions break down), and concentrates on Brossard and Théoret to illustrate writing in French. This choice is not surprising, whereas the selection of English-language writers is less obvious. In particular, it excludes Daphne Marlatt, whose work has often been compared with that of Brossard (see Susan Knutson, *Narrative in the Feminine*, 2000). The three represented here include two who have connections to French (Erin Mouré and Lola Lemire Tostevin) and one who has none (Di Brandt). The work of all five authors is assessed in relation to 'feminine' imagery and themes, primarily based on the mother-daughter relationship, which has different functions in the case of the three (Brossard, Mouré, and Brandt) who incorporate a lesbian subjectivity into their texts.

The study is framed by a general theoretical discussion of the ethics of intersubjectivity, as elaborated by Levinas and Ricoeur as well as Irigaray and Kristeva. The rapport to the maternal-feminine as same and other, and its varied effects on and in these writers' poetic use of language, provide a common basis for a closer look at a range of individual texts. Skilful detailed analysis demonstrates the sophistication and literary value of the works concerned. Ambivalence and tension emerge as central to the dynamics of a variety of writings that claim to be 'in the feminine,' with overtones of an essentialism deemed to be dangerous, while deploying the techniques and motifs of postmodern instability where subjectivity is concerned. This ambivalence is reflected in Carrière's own vacillation between admiration for these writers' literary achievements and a somewhat suspicious attitude towards their 'utopian/idealist' feminist or feminine agenda(s). Her thought-provoking study draws attention to the limits and the possibilities of 'strategic essentialism,' in the context of an ethics of alterity that seeks to recognize the other without recourse to mirror images. (VALERIE RAOUL)

Angela Nairne Grigor. *Arthur Lismer: Visionary Art Educator*
McGill-Queen's University Press. xv, 447. $65.00

In *Arthur Lismer: Visionary Art Educator,* Angela Nairne Grigor provides us with an insightful look into Lismer's little-known career in art education. He was better known as a member of the Group of Seven and, to a lesser extent, as principal of the Victoria School of Art and Design in Halifax (now the Nova Scotia College of Art and Design) and later vice-principal of the Ontario College of Art, but Lismer's work in art education spanned more than thirty years. His work with children, teachers, and lay art audiences across the country and internationally, promoting the value of the arts in daily life, has generally been minimized or excluded altogether in the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

historical record. Grigor sets out to remedy this by demonstrating Lismer's 'seminal importance to the development of modern methods of art education in this country.'

The book is a valuable contribution to an emerging body of literature in art education history which seeks to chart the links among the arts, education, and social and cultural imperatives. Significantly, it also offers us the possibility of a more critical and integrative way in which to reconceptualize the relatively bounded disciplinary paridigms that constitute our ways of knowing. Grigor has amassed a wide array of historical evidence collecting Lismer's writing and speeches and conducting interviews with Lismer's family, friends, and colleagues, in order to demonstrate Lismer's contribution to the art education practices and theories in pre- and postwar Canada. While the archival literature is ample and fascinating, the book is completely under-researched in regard to secondary literature. The secondary sources cited are often out of date, their interpretations long since reconsidered. More troubling is Grigor's decision to omit contemporary literature which speaks to Arts and Crafts influences in Canadian schools prior to Lismer's emigration to Canada in 1911, and this has critical ramifications for Grigor's overall thesis.

Grigor's argument is shaped around two problematic assumptions. First, she argues that 'today, art education as a school system is out of favour and, in general, is not considered valuable or affordable.' Second, she notes, 'as in Lismer's day, beneficial art education is most often found in museums and community centres or in groups unconnected with formal education.' While both of these assertions are naïve in their non-contextualized analyses (education is a provincial jurisdictional issue, after all, and systems across Canada vary in policy), I am much more interested in how these two relatively misguided suppositions serve to situate and narrate Lismer's accomplishments and contributions. Not surprisingly, Grigor's notion that 'beneficial art education' was 'found in museums and community centres' is used to explain away Lismer's troubling relations with educational officials, his colleagues, and even his own staff. Grigor hagiographically constructs Lismer as an artistic and forward-thinking rebel who was out to 'free' individuals, particularly children, from the strictures of academic formal art education. Lismer's detractors (an usually large number, I might add!) are portrayed as conservative dullards unable or unwilling to take up contemporary educational theories on the artists. Inadvertently, in the margins of this two-dimensional account, Lismer emerges as a man burdened with ongoing concerns over control, his position within the art education communities, and his eventual legacy, outside of his involvement with the Group of Seven. Provocative questions are also invoked with regard to the meanings of art in educational contexts, the link among artists, teachers, and students, and the professional and academic rivalries which serve to propel, hinder, and name what counts as art, who shall teach it, and

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

how they will do it.

Lastly, the editing, rife with spelling and grammatical mistakes, and the choice to forge a two-part division, separating Lismer's 'Life in Art' and 'Arthur Lismer's Ideas in Education,' did not serve the book well. The curious redundant organization of the book seems to be derived a bit too closely from the finished work of Grigor's master's and doctoral theses on Lismer rather than from a conceptual longitudinal reflection of integrative analysis and contextual framing of the argument. Sadly, further and more in-depth consideration of this important topic would have made for a much stronger work. (E. LISA PANAYOTIDIS)

Tim S. Perry. *Radical Difference: A Defence of Hendrik Kraemer's Theology of Religions*
Wilfrid Laurier University Press. x, 170. $29.95

Mainline scholarship in religious studies and theology has generally judged the thought of the Dutch phenomenologist and theologian Hendrik Kraemer (1888–1965) to be largely irrelevant, given the concerns of a complex, pluralistic world. Since Kraemer has generally been taken to be excessively conservative theologically, insufficiently sympathetic in his evaluation of non-Christian religions, and an outright hindrance to progress in the areas of ecumenicity and dialogue, his defenders have not been abundant. Therefore, the project signalled in this volume's subtitle is a bold and intriguing one. The author is evidently not easily deterred, and he gives his reader good reasons for thinking that his case is an important one.

Originally submitted to the University of Durham as a dissertation, Tim S. Perry's important study attempts not just 'to understand ... [and] to assess' Kraemer's contribution to the theology of religions but 'to redeem' it. The author, like Kraemer himself, is decidedly up front about his point of departure in the book: 'Explicitly and unapologetically confessional in nature, it is written by a Christian and intended for Christians.'

The book contains two parts: 'Preliminary Matters' and 'Radical Difference.' One of the book's most useful contributions occurs early on in the preliminary material, where Perry examines the terms of the debate about religious plurality in contemporary philosophical and theological scholarship. His argument runs as follows: The commonly employed exclusivism-inclusivism-pluralism triad is itself a product of the pluralist camp (i.e., the British-American philosopher John Hick and his epigones). This now *de rigueur* triad casts pluralists in a most favourable light and is manifestly unfair to exclusivists, such as Kraemer. Especially in this part of the book, Perry shows that he is philosophically and theologically knowledgeable and sure-footed.

With the completion of the preliminaries, Perry turns to an exposition of

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Kraemer's theology of religions, focusing on a handful of key works. On the whole, he undertakes this project carefully and accurately. *Inter alia*, he rightly and helpfully points out what the vast majority of Kraemer's commentators have missed, owing to either incompetence or maliciousness, namely, that Kraemer was *not* a Dutch puppet of Karl Barth. For that matter, Kraemer was not really a Barthian at all, as Perry rightly notes, although the Dutch scholar did receive some fundamental theological inspiration from the Swiss colossus.

Appreciative as one might be of Perry's good work in interpreting Kraemer, however, one cannot suppress a nagging reservation about one aspect of it, for the book makes minimal reference to Kraemer's native context. Granted, Kraemer was a pronounced international figure who composed his key treatises in English. But he was born and trained in The Netherlands. While he learned much from his famous University of Leiden mentor, W.B. Kristensen, the two also differed fundamentally in approach – a matter about which Perry is insufficiently nuanced. Moreover, the reader does not find discussion or even acknowledgment of important texts composed by Kraemer in his native tongue. There is also no engagement of Kraemer's Dutch commentators, leaving the reader in the dark about the reception of Kraemer's work in his home country and thereby not helping the reader understand the relative silence that has fallen over Kraemer's name and corpus. Perhaps symbolic of this seeming *agnosis* about matters native and contextual (but perhaps just a publisher's error), Kraemer's place of residence in The Netherlands late in his life is misspelled in the text ('Dreibergen' instead of 'Driebergen').

Radical Difference is the first book to appear about Hendrik Kraemer in decades. Whether or not all will be persuaded by Perry's defence of Kraemer's position is up for debate. There is, however, much in what he argues. His published commitment to furthering conversation about a very important and much undervalued Christian thinker should be applauded. (RICHARD J. PLANTINGA)

Nancy Cunard. *Essays on Race and Empire*. Edited by Maureen Moynagh
Broadview. 306. $24.95

This is bound to be a valuable volume for any scholar or lay reader of Anglo-American modernism searching for a source book that exemplifies an intersection of the issues of race, gender, and class, both in the materials and in the methodology. Nancy Cunard, an important figure in modernist social life and activism, undertook a publishing project, *Negro: An Anthology* (1930–34); this edition showcases its original essays 'Harlem Reviewed,' 'Jamaicathe Negro Island,' 'The American Moron' and the 'American of Sense,' 'Scottsboro and Other Scottsboros,' and 'A Reactionary Negro

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Organization' as well as the pamphlet *Black Man and White Ladyship*, published separately during this time. This edition by Maureen Moynagh highlights Cunard's political affiliations with leading Black thinkers of her time who were involved in pan-African national movements and communism, and active collaborations with prominent anti-imperial writers such as George Padmore on *The White Man's Duty*.

This well-researched fund of information is juxtaposed with an equally interesting range of documents from 1890–1940, to place Cunard's work in dialogue with other European and Euro-American writers on empire and race as well as with the work of African-American and Afro-Caribbean intellectuals. This juxtaposition is particularly important as a methodology. While modernist studies have moved towards an intersectional study of race, class, gender, and nationality, very few have directly positioned prominent (white) modernists in the context of their intellectual (minority) contemporaries. Occasionally, Moynagh slips into the usual separations prevalent to date in modernist studies, for example, when she describes the juxtaposition as a modernist transatlantic matrix alongside a Black transatlantic matrix. Recognition of the interconnections and the mutually formative influences would have corroborated the juxtapositions more solidly. Overall, however, this volume is a rare example of an admirable persistence in maintaining this interconnection in the choice of materials and in the introduction to the edition.

Moynagh is careful to read Cunard's experimentation with figurations of race, which can be taken as signs of solidarity with the oppressed, as gestures that become multivalent and risk reinstating the literal divisions she may be trying to erase. Cunard's familiarity with Harlem was one symbol of her negotiations with race and empire at the same time that she was confused by them. Moynagh maintains a good balance between the fetishisms of primitivism and the sincere critique of imperialism that Cunard negotiated, in observing that it is a matter of understanding the problematics rather than of lauding her efforts. Cunard's inevitable dilemma in being caught in the ambiguity of white lady helping Black people and the ambivalence of having politically conscious imperial eyes are consistently kept in view. Moynagh comments that Cunard's ambivalent position detracts from her reliability as a guide through imperial landscapes; the collection itself, however, demonstrates that a particular perspective such as Cunard's is more about positionality than about reliability.

Moynagh observes correctly that Cunard, in rejecting Marcus Garvey's decolonization strategy, positions herself against both imperialists and communists. It is not quite accurate to deduce, as the editor does, that this regains an imperial subject-position. Many Indian contemporaries like Cornelia Sorabji would have held a position similar to Cunard's, based primarily in class and education, while asking for self-determination. The introduction needs a lot more on Cunard's placement and significance than

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

the otherwise diligent explanation of the background of race, empire, gender, and class issues, often through long detours into other biographies and critical reviews of concepts like the harem. The background, and indeed the edition as a whole, will be important to a readership being introduced to such issues, and especially important in that Cunard (and not only Black artists) are being placed in that context. An exploration of Cunard's status in between England as an already-dominant nation-state and the United States as an emerging one, in her time, would have added another important dimension to the intersection of race, gender, and class otherwise analysed so well in the introduction. This is a particularly relevant one in Cunard's case and will perhaps become part of an analytical framework in modernist studies of the future that this collection has initiated to a great degree. (SONITA SARKER)

Sandra Djwa. *Professing English: A Life of Roy Daniells*
University of Toronto Press. 474. $55.00

'A teacher in a provincial university': so G.G. Sedgewick characterized himself with a modesty tinged with irony and impishness. Roy Daniells, his successor as head of English at the University of British Columbia, genuinely modest and not unimpish, might have used the same words of himself, as might this reviewer, like Daniells a scion of Sedgewick and of the Toronto graduate school. How then can a 450-page book emerge from a life of simply 'professing English'? Half an hour into reading Sandra Djwa's biography – which at the end I would not have wanted shorter by a hundredth part – I exclaimed 'Detraction avaunt! Celebration approach and sweep the strings!' It was indeed a memorable life, and is a memorable *Life*.

The poet Daniells is there, beginning with his legendary examination paper on Elizabethan verse forms, which he wrote in Elizabethan verse forms. Today any examiner, dumbfounded with delight, would photocopy it for the archives. We meet also the accomplished but ill-at-ease poet whose collection with the thrilling title *Deeper into the Forest* was the first in the famous Indian File series. The other collection, beautifully produced, characteristically Miltonic in its title, *The Chequered Shade*, contains these lines:

> I am so few that I am only me,
> Though I should like to think that I were more ...
> Only a man still smaller than his clothes.

So much for singing robes: the unheroic last line would have given Thomas Carlyle something more for his clothes philosophy. Daniells the scholar and humanist is more centrally present in the biography, as a rhetorician is a more public and accessible figure than a poet. His chief scholarly work,

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Milton, Mannerism and Baroque, repays a close second reading after forty years. How well and how considerately the author anticipated the possible objections to the application of period styles to different arts, and, as we see from the biography, with how much detailed attention and discernment did he embrace mannerist art and baroque architecture, with Milton always in mind.

He attempted a second *magnum opus* in his Alexander Lectures of 1972, on mannerism and the metaphysicals. I recall them as beautifully delivered and cordially received. Norman Endicott as the Donne specialist at Toronto had to thank his old friend: he tied himself in knots saying many things as true as they were kind without in any way endorsing the basic argument. Modernists (including 'postmodernists') know that they are modern; classicists and romantics know that they are so; but nobody knew he was baroque, still less a mannerist. In this second book the terminology could not bear the weight, and it did not achieve publication. Not a disgrace, just a disappointment.

Professor Daniells believed strongly that the humanities must be kept up, and gave many public lectures and radio talks in their cause, was active in the Royal Society of Canada and in the establishment of ACUTE. What good company he was at a conference, how cogent and effective his comments, what an honour to be introduced or thanked by him – in sinewy prose or light verse. The dust-jacket photography by Vlad catches this friendly public figure to perfection.

An academic statesman he was, with all the difficulties of a statesman. He became head of English when UBC had grown to well over ten times the size it was when he was an undergraduate. Sedgewick had run his department by the force of his personality, with an astute sobriety well hidden under legerdemain. On expansion, the administrative complications must have been enormous, and factions arose – a senatorial party of senior professors ranged against the *populares*, the vast plebeian mob of junior instructors. It is instructive to learn here how he did the best he could in an unmanageable situation, made the more acute by his clash with the poet Earle Birney. Their close friendship, their rivalry, their enmity were spread over a lifetime: the account here can be called gripping.

I am one of the few persons who knew Daniells but does not figure in the acknowledgments of this thoroughly researched book: by unhappy accident, Professor Djwa and I were not able to arrange a meeting. In 1957 Roy and I taught summer school at Toronto and having similar timetables met for coffee every morning. He always came prepared with a striking or amusing incident or observation, and (I'm glad to say, being a talker too) he was also a good listener. Sometimes a young priest in the process of secularization would join us, and I was struck by the attention Roy gave to what the unhappy man said and left unsaid and how helpful his oblique comments were. I was then unaware of Roy's upbringing among the

Plymouth Brethren and of the long agony of his leaving them. This is very fully treated in the biography, so well that I could hope for more. He exchanged letters on religious subjects with his friends Northrop Frye and Robert Finch, which might warrant collection. He was (like Frye) immersed in that old heathen Oswald Spengler, but he showed no interest in Karl Barth, the greatest Protestant theologian of the century, who might have resolved some of his perplexities. It is good to be left with unanswered questions at the end of this impressive biography. (WILLIAM BLISSETT)

Roberta Hamilton. *Setting the Agenda: Jean Royce and the Shaping of Queen's University*
University of Toronto Press. 354. $45.00

For many Queen's University students, Jean Royce, registrar from 1933 to 1968, 'was' the university. For thirty-five years she registered, advised, and admonished students; yet she receives only a few sentences in the official history of Queen's. In this biography Roberta Hamilton sets out to ascertain her contribution, at the same time casting light on the underreported working conditions, career options, and constraints faced by women during the period.

The author is well placed to evaluate Royce's career, being both a Queen's academic familiar with the institution and a sociologist wise to the ways of bureaucracy. She writes with verve in a breezy, colloquial style which should make this book appealing to a wide readership; and she has delved deeply into the records. Yet for all her ingenious readings of laconic official documents, she is not able to substantiate the contention, implied in her title, that Royce actually 'shaped' the direction of Queen's. Of course it depends what one considers vital in the history of institutions; spirit and values, which Royce certainly embodies, are just as important as programs and policies. But this is not Hamilton's point. She would like to credit Royce with influence over specific developments through her role as registrar, secretary and minute-taker to many committees, and drawer-up of agendas. However, nothing in the book shows her influencing, or even expressing opinions on, decisions regarding curriculum, the establishment of new departments and programs, governing structure (except for memos on the Senate and Board of Trustees), or criteria for admission and degrees. It is not convincing to argue that, given the workings of power structures, she 'must have' had this influence, even if the minutes are silent about it. Rather she seems to have played, as she herself believed, a 'housekeeping' and supportive role. Going far beyond the requirements of her position, as this biography amply demonstrates, she sought out good students through outreach work with high schools, guided them to suitable courses, encouraged them, and sometimes even helped them materially when they

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

risked failure. Then she steered them to further opportunities whether they thought they wanted them or not.

Such activities may be the stuff of legend (around the campus), but they are not the stuff of riveting biography. There is a whole thirty-four-page chapter of verbatim accounts by former students of their encounters with the registrar: one hundred and four variations on the theme of 'I came, I met Jean Royce, I registered.' The large number of reminiscences is evidence of Hamilton's thorough and accurate research, but otherwise could better have been drastically condensed. Particularly in the account of Royce's retirement years, nuggets such as the appreciative analysis of Royce's friendship with Margaret Hooey have to be extracted from a welter of less interesting details about her monthly grocery bills or payments to her cleaning lady.

Frequent reflections on the nature of biography, admirably postmodern though they are, also impede the flow of the narrative; there is much to be said for overcoming self-consciousness and getting on with the story. But Royce left little in the way of personal revelation, so that the author is left to supply it herself with surmises, suggestions, and hypotheses. This is, then, as much an encounter with Hamilton as with Royce. Luckily she is a perceptive and sympathetic biographer, dealing with a subject who was complex, humane, and intelligent. Their interaction is interesting as an illumination of one of the myriad ways in which women's history is developing. (JEAN O'GRADY)

Boris Stoicheff. *Gerhard Herzberg: An Illustrious Life in Science*
NRC Press and McGill-Queen's University Press. xiii, 468. $49.95

In the early 1930s, Gerhard Herzberg was a brilliant young physicist in Darmstadt, making his name internationally in the exciting new field of spectroscopy – the study of atoms and molecules by observing the light they absorb or emit. At that time, Germany was the world's centre for mathematics and physics. Then, in 1933, the Nazis came to power, and within a few months the German scientific edifice began to crumble. Within two years, more than seventeen hundred 'non-Aryan' and 'politically unreliable' scholars and scientists were dismissed from their positions and dispersed throughout the world. Physics, which was disproportionately Jewish, was especially hard hit, with a loss of at least 25 per cent of its personnel (including a number of Nobel laureates). Gerhard Herzberg was not Jewish (although his wife was), and he thought at first he might ride out the storm; but he couldn't. In 1935, he was deemed unfit to teach German youth because his wife's ancestry made him 'one of the Jewish clan.' Despite his renown, his search for a new position outside of Germany met with no initial success: it was the heart of the Depression, and the few positions in

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

the major centres available to foreigners were already filled by the first wave of emigrants. Thus, when he was offered a position at the University of Saskatchewan (a scientific and cultural wilderness for a person of his background), he accepted. This was the beginning of an extraordinary love affair between the immigrant and his adopted country. Herzberg's impressive talent was welcomed by far-sighted individuals who allowed him to thrive, first in Saskatchewan, then in Ottawa. There he built up the Division of Physics at the National Research Council into a laboratory of international repute, which became a Mecca for the foremost scientists of the day, and performed the research which earned him the 1971 Nobel Prize in Chemistry.

The author of this history, Boris Stoicheff, was a colleague and friend of Herzberg's for almost fifty years. He was personally selected by Herzberg to write his official biography and enjoyed unparalleled co-operation from him and his family, as well as access to all of his scientific and personal papers. While the resulting book is clearly a labour of love, it involved an abundance of labour: in the 1920s, Herzberg formed the (lifelong) habit of keeping copies of all letters he wrote and received – and he was a steady and prolific correspondent. This resulted in stacks of documents piling up to a total of about sixteen metres, in addition to a scientific legacy comprising six books and 275 articles. Stoicheff has skilfully organized this wealth of information into interwoven stories chronicling Herzberg's personal and professional life. His style is simple, direct, and undramatic; nevertheless, the book contains numerous revealing anecdotes which paint vivid pictures of Herzberg's early life, and of the exciting atmosphere and ferment of ideas that existed during the 'golden age' of molecular spectroscopy in which he lived and to which he contributed so significantly. For the scientist, the images provided of this era are fascinating: Herzberg interacted with the giants of his day. The non-scientist will want to skip sections describing detailed scientific problems, but will nevertheless catch a glimpse of the exhilaration of scientific research.

This book should appeal to many audiences. For the Canadian scientific community, it contains a detailed account of our rich heritage (which, like many aspects of Canadian history, is quickly being forgotten). For scientists in general, it describes Herzberg's manner of running a laboratory that was so nurturing, collegial, and stimulating that it could well serve as a role model for all. (There is also a secondary, cautionary tale presented, of the danger of government mismanagement of science.) For the general public, the book describes a glorious chapter in Canadian culture: basic science is indeed a high form of culture, no less so than music or literature because it is also useful. For the public and for those who set its science policy, the book argues (once again) that it is ineffective to attempt to direct discovery or to micro-manage science. Numerous examples exist of 'curiosity-driven' basic research which unexpectedly led to major material benefit, from the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

semi-conductor chip made possible the personal computer to the laser was developed for spectroscopic purposes but is now ubiquitous in our lives. Best of all, this is the inspirational story of a man of warmth, generosity, dedication, self-discipline, accomplishment, and above all optimism, who lived his life to the full. He loved his profession, and was active in it for seventy years, completing his first book by the age of thirty (it has sold over a hundred thousand copies) and his last article at the age of ninety-two. This biography is an academic publication of the highest quality. (HELEN FREEDHOFF)

Richard S. Warren. *Begins with the Oboe: A History of the Toronto Symphony Orchestra*
University of Toronto Press. xiv, 288. $60.00

The late Richard S. Warren, the author of *Begins with the Oboe: A History of the Toronto Symphony Orchestra*, was the volunteer archivist of the TSO. He devoted much time and energy to both his work and his book, but that he was neither a historian nor a writer shows on every page of this maladroit publication.

The book is organized around the orchestra's conductors – although two of the most interesting, Ozawa and Ancerl, are made to share a chapter – but the chronicle is a relentless march through each season. Admittedly, it is difficult to organize the material about a performing organization to present an overall picture as well as the defining aspects of each season, but here there is never any attempt at a comprehensive examination of anything. The most glaring example of the problem is the treatment of finances throughout the history of the orchestra, but especially in recent years. The past fifteen years have been crucial to the orchestra's current strained circumstances, but it is impossible to gain a coherent sense of what happened. Pieces of information are scattered through the pages, but the disastrous financial position is never fully discussed, nor are the reasons for or the consequences of having four managers and two management consultants in the decade following the resignation of Wray Armstrong as managing director in 1991. There is no mention of the tensions among individuals, orchestra players, and the Board of Directors, or of the one or two administrators who held the management together during these years.

The prose is inelegant, and Warren's judgments are frequently naïve and uninformed by any wider knowledge of repertoire and musicians. The book abounds in curious oversights, confusions, and plain error. Kathleen Parlow and Pierre Monteux each make two 'debut' performances in different seasons; Boyd Neel is identified as the conductor of an English chamber orchestra but not as dean of music at the University of Toronto; John Boyden was a baritone, not a tenor; Stravinsky's notable appearance with

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

the orchestra in 1937 is passed over in a short sentence; Klemperer made a 'first visit' but in fact he never returned; *Ah! perfido* is a concert aria by Beethoven, not an aria from *Fidelio*; the conductors Stokowski and Rilling are mentioned but not their eccentric seating of the performers; we learn that Alberto Guerrero was a 'well-known Chilean pianist' in 1932 but not that he had lived in Toronto since 1918; Canadian Music Associates is not identified as the concert committee of the Canadian League of Composers; misspellings abound – not Neil Cory but Crory, not *Jean d'Arc* but *Jeanne d'Arc*, not Velery Gergiev but Valery, not Emmanuel Kirvine but Krivine. The list is endless.

There are five appendices. There is a list of every player in the orchestra since its inception, and lists of music directors and appointed (not guest) conductors, conductors of the Youth Orchestra, and composers-in-residence. A list of Canadian works commissioned since 1960 includes the surprising name of the Italian Luciano Berio and makes one wonder what foreign commissions the orchestra might have made. The discography includes many recordings the unidentified labels of which must be a mystery to many who consult it: the recordings for RCI (Radio Canada International) were for broadcast and government distribution, not for commercial release; the small and short-lived Beaver and Hallmark labels would be known only to Canadian connoisseurs. Of the eleven titles that make up the 'Select Bibliography,' only six relate directly to Canadian music, and only one can be said to have any reference to the TSO. Not included are collections in the National Library – papers of the conductors von Kunits, MacMillan, Mazzoleni, and Unger, among others – presumably because they were not consulted.

The University of Toronto Press published this inadequate book in a handsome format with many photographs. I can only wonder why. (CARL MOREY)

Marylu Walters. *CKUA Radio Worth Fighting For*
University of Alberta Press.
xix, 390. $29.95

This is a lively, well-researched account of the life and times of an unusual radio station. CKUA began in 1927 as an arm of the University of Alberta's extension department to contribute to the educational and cultural life of the community. Today, with a network that spans the province and a weekly audience of 150,000, it is run by an independent non-profit board. It has a limited commercial licence and draws its income from advertising, corporate sponsorships, and listener donations.

CKUA's early programming was ambitious: lectures in literature and history, live classical concerts by the station's own orchestra, drama, farm

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

programs, music appreciation, and educational broadcasts to over five hundred schools. The university's electrical engineering department maintained the station's equipment.

In time the university found CKUA's costs harder to sustain and, in 1944, agreed that the provincial Social Credit administration should take it over. The government funded it reasonably generously and without political interference for the next fifty years. Thus relieved of undue financial worries, and free from the ratings pressure of commercial stations, CKUA staff were free to indulge their programming preferences, attracting a growing audience grateful for an idiosyncratic mix of fare they could not find elsewhere.

In 1994 the picture changed dramatically when the Klein government, engaged in heavy budget cutbacks, determined it could no longer justify supporting a radio station. It turned CKUA over to a non-profit foundation. Business plans drawn up by directors with no experience in radio, whose ambitions vastly exceeded their competence, proved unable to raise the necessary revenue. A $4.7 million one-time transitional grant was quickly dissipated, with all four directors awarding themselves or their companies $770 thousand worth of contracts. After three years, deeply in the red, they threw in the towel and took the station off the air.

CKUA's loyal and province-wide audience was outraged. A new board was formed, staff agreed to work without pay for a month, the transmitter was turned on again, and a two-week on-air campaign raised a million dollars in pledges. The corner was turned, and today CKUA operates carefully, if not affluently, in the black.

Was it, in fact, worth fighting for? Clearly its 150,000 weekly audience across Alberta think so. This may say as much about what is available on other stations as it does about CKUA's own programming, which seems unexceptional enough to this listener: eclectic; heavy on folk, pop, world beat, jazz; only a modest amount of classical; not much education or public affairs.

Woven through the book is the story of the evolution of Canadian broadcasting policy, the tension between commercial and 'public' broadcasting, and the constitutional jurisdiction over broadcasting. CKUA predated the Canadian Radio Broadcasting Commission 1932 and the subsequent creation of the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation in 1936. The CBC was both broadcaster and national regulatory authority, a much-resented dual role which was only relinquished in 1958 to the Board of Broadcast Governors, and to the CRTC in 1968.

So strong was the federal government's determination to retain constitutional authority over this now-universal medium of communication that it banned provincial governments and agencies from holding broadcasting licences. Where educational broadcasting was concerned, the issue was particularly difficult, education being a provincial responsibility. The dilemma was resolved in 1972 when Ottawa agreed to allow licences for

educational programming to be awarded to independent provincial corporations like Alberta's ACCESS and Ontario's TVO.

This book will appeal to all who resent the formulaic blandness of mass broadcasting and are prepared to support more imaginative or thoughtful alternatives. It is they who keep PBS and National Public Radio and TVO going, who provide CBC radio with its loyal and demanding following. It explains why Toronto's CJRT-FM was able to survive its own sudden loss of government funding in 1996 and carry on successfully as JAZZ-FM. And even if you're not a world beat fan, or a devotee of Zoot Sims, it's hard not to admire the slightly zany courage with which CKUA has, against heavy odds, succeeded in sticking to the road less travelled. (TERENCE GRIER)

Gerd Horten. *Radio Goes to War:*
The Cultural Politics of Propaganda during World War II
University of California Press. xiv, 218. US $45.00

Strangely, the deeply commercial nature of the American broadcasting system has been in recent years a source of perpetual astonishment to scholars of broadcasting, the latest round probably beginning with Robert McChesney's pioneering 1993 study of the period from the late 1920s to the mid-1930s. This astonishment may be surprising to us in this country, where we do, for various reasons, benefit from some slight remove from the full onslaught of American commercialism. This is by no means to impugn United States broadcasting scholarship; on the contrary, the work of McChesney, Susan Douglas, Michelle Himes, Susan Smulyan, and others deserves full credit for their accomplishments. In this sense, Gerd Horten's *Radio Goes to War* also fully merits a worthy place amid these contemporary pioneers of broadcasting history.

Still, as he points out, this work has hardly scratched the surface, for one because no other medium changed the everyday lives of Americans as quickly as radio did. Radio was America's primary medium until the end of the Second World War: 90 per cent of American families owned at least one radio set and listened to it for three to four hours a day. During the war years, radio made Americans as a people as well informed as they would ever be. The extensive reach of radio, however, led to what Horten terms a 'cultural politics,' and it is analysing this that is the focus of his study, which first began as his dissertation at Berkeley ten years ago; Horten currently teaches history at Concordia University in Montreal.

In the process of radio's rise to media dominance, a process accelerated by its contribution to the American war effort and the use of radio for propaganda purposes, Horten argues that it created 'an increasingly narrow consensus that dominated the cultural sphere.' The key transformation that he focuses on is the reaffirmation of corporate dominance over the civic sphere, a reaffirmation that began with the New Deal and intensified with

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

the American entry into the war and the waning of the New Deal by 1942–43. Perhaps Horten's most interesting set of claims is that this new corporate dominance translated into what he terms 'the privatization of war.' In this light, United States wartime propaganda predominantly took the form of an appeal to American soldiers 'to defend private interests and discharge private obligations.' This can be seen, for example, in the widespread dissemination of the famed Betty Grable pin-up, whose appeal typified for white soldiers an image of American womanhood as model girlfriend, wife, and ultimately mother. Even more strongly stated, American wartime propaganda, in the hands of the advertising industry types and other members of the corporate elite who ran the show, became less an idea of national sacrifice, say, than a sensational, privatized consumerist defence of the American system of free enterprise. By intertwining wartime sacrifice with the self-interest of American business, the free enterprise system promised that the postwar era would richly make up for hardship and deprivation. In short, the drive towards privatization and commercialization provided the ideological foundations for the rapid expansion of the postwar American cornucopia.

Rich as this may be, there is nonetheless a kind of pat leftish predictability to it all. What does the 'privatization of war' really mean? Is it enough to reply 'corporate domination of the media'? Or is this instead a mantra that obscures more interesting possible explanations having to do with the role of wartime psychology or 'psykwar' in the reconfiguration of the postwar psyche? One clue that Horten suggests along these lines (but does not develop) is the fact that as of the fall of 1943, the War Department increasingly began to release previously censored photographs graphically depicting the horrors and brutality of modern high-tech warfare. Think for instance of those famous *Life* magazine photos, particularly of the Pacific theatre, that were also taken up in newsreels and war movies of the final years of the war. The Pacific War, of course, comes to an end with the atomic bombing of Hiroshima and Nagasaki, and the onset of an entire new epoch of Mass Terror symbolized by the mushroom cloud. This is a very far cry from shopping and domesticity.

On the contrary, as a number of other scholars have argued, the rewiring of the psyche by wartime propaganda and the increasing fusion of military and corporate interests helped create a far stranger psychic universe than Horten's book would have us believe. 'Privatization' yes, but in the form that Paul Edwards for instance has termed the 'closed worlds' of postwar, Cold War discourse, or – long before – what McLuhan meant by the 'outering' of the private human nervous system into a cybernetic keyboard for psychological manipulation on a scale never before experienced by humankind. In this sense, Horten is absolutely right that there remains much still to be learned about the cultural politics of radio. (MICHAEL DORLAND)

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Eric T. Jennings. *Vichy in the Tropics: Pétain's National Revolution in Madagascar, Guadeloupe, and Indochina, 1940–1944*
Stanford University Press. vii, 312. US$55.00

Vichy beyond the French hexagon is the subject of Eric Jennings's prize-winning study. Arguing that the purest form of Vichy's National Revolution can be found where there was no German occupation to influence Vichy's program, Jennings examines three colonies as examples of true Vichy applied to the subjects of the French Empire. Vichy in the tropics displayed the characteristics of the regime that have been examined in recent historiography: authoritarianism, the cult of Marshal Pétain, anti-republicanism, anti-democracy, anti-Semitism, renewal through physical education and discipline, and an emphasis on community over individualism. As in metropolitan France, Vichy in the empire sought to reverse the 'false' policies and values of the fallen and discredited Third Republic.

Although the National Revolution in the three colonies reflected a common ideology, the impact and consequences of the project produced different outcomes in each example. Using local archives in Guadeloupe, Madagascar, and Vietnam, along with the documentation at the Archives for Overseas France in Aix-en-Provence, Jennings has written an impressive comparative study in contrasts. He has structured his analysis in sets of two parallel chapters for each example. One chapter establishes the context for a subsequent analysis of the way in which the National Revolution played out in practice. Vichy rejected any idea of assimilating the peoples of these colonies. Instead, the new rulers claimed to respect indigenous traditions, particularly in Indochina, as a way of associating a conservative elite with Vichy's values of work, family, and country along with an emphasis upon a return to the soil and nostalgia for authentic traditions.

Reception of the National Revolution varied according to local circumstances, revealing a diversity among the colonies of the French Empire. In the short-lived (1940–42) regime in Madagascar, Vichy governors promoted the cult of Marshal Pétain and harshly repressed dissidence to the satisfaction of hard-line French colonists. They purged the educational system of republican ideas and favoured the simple coastal peoples over the dominant Merina of the central highlands. They also brought back a brutal system of forced labour. The memory of harsh measures contributed to a bitter resistance to the French colonial system that culminated in a bloody uprising and repression in 1947. Independence, not association, was the long-term consequence of Vichy's rule in Madagascar.

In Indochina, Admiral Decoux enthusiastically applied the National Revolution and praised 'authentic' Vietnamese traditions that could be

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

related to Vichy preferences for authority, hierarchy, and the wisdom of elders, seen in pervasive portraits of Marshal Pétain. But praise of tradition could backfire. By praising national Vietnamese resisters to the foreigner, such as comparing the Trung sisters' opposition to Chinese domination to Joan of Arc's resistance to the British, the seeds of a postwar Vietnamese nationalist resistance were inadvertently planted only to be harvested later by Ho Chi Minh.

In Guadeloupe, Vichy confronted a firmly established republicanism. Citizenship had been granted to adult males, which meant that 'Liberty, Equality, and Fraternity' meant something to the people of Guadeloupe. Jennings describes the way in which the 'dismantling of the republic' had to be accomplished before imposing the National Revolution. Again, a nascent resistance to Vichy was firmly put down with the leaders jailed or driven into exile. The people of Guadeloupe feared that the National Revolution meant racism and a destruction of rights that had been won. In this example, the attack upon republicanism and the repression association with Vichy brought a postwar rally to the republic. A form of assimilation, not separation, marked the island's postwar history when Guadeloupe opted to become a department of France.

Eric Jennings is to be congratulated on a fine monograph that expands our understanding of Vichy and opens new perspectives on the postwar process of decolonization in the French Empire. (KIM MUNHOLLAND)

Adrienne Kertzer. *My Mother's Voice: Children, Literature and the Holocaust*
Broadview. 384. $29.95

This lucid, intelligent consideration of children's literature about the Holocaust raises questions that have long needed airing. 'How do we tell children about the Holocaust without terrifying them, and what kind of knowledge do we convey when we are determined not to frighten?' Kertzer points out that the (predominantly American) requirement that children's stories offer hopeful 'lessons' is at odds with the historical and moral truth of the subject matter; for example, while children's books almost always feature young protagonists who miraculously survive, only 11 per cent (175,000) of the European Jews under the age of sixteen in 1939 (1.6 million) were living at the end of the war. And, while the fragmented, tortured memoirs of survivors are testament to a horror that remains impossible to understand, children's stories usually skirt the horror, and instead present coherent, resolved narratives which suggest a unified meaning that is both reductive and deceiving.

In part 1, 'Maternal Voices,' Kertzer analyses how children represent the voices of mothers in Holocaust narratives, and claims that 'aesthetic choices and pedagogical beliefs intersect to make the stories that we give children

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

very different from the stories given to adults.' She discusses her own reception of her mother's memories of surviving Auschwitz, which she heard as a child and in the context of a happy, safe family life. She offers cogent, sensitive readings of the memoirs of Aranka Siegal, Jane Yolen's fictional *Briar Rose,* and Isabella Leitner's memoirs.

In part 2, 'The Voices of Children,' she discusses the dominance of the voice of Anne Frank, and its adoption as *the* child's voice of the Holocaust by American readers and writers. How 'adults imagine the voice of a Holocaust child' leads into a discussion of the public reaction to Binjamin Wilkomirski's spurious *Fragments: Memories of a Wartime Childhood,* as well as an extensive, and illuminating, examination of the correspondence between Carol Matas and her advisors from the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, who commissioned the writing of *Daniel's Story.*

Film, illustration, and photographs, and especially the child's view, become the focus of discussion in part 3, 'The Child in the Picture,' in which Kertzer analyses the ironies between the child narrator and the adult viewer's knowledge in Roberto Benigni's *Life Is Beautiful.* She contrasts this with the much less innocent voice of Anita Lobel in *No Pretty Pictures: A Child of War* and discusses the role of photographs and drawings in picture books about the Holocaust.

In part 4, 'History and Pedagogy,' Kertzer uses the novels of Carol Matas and others to show how children's historical fiction often dodges representation of the realities of Auschwitz (and other killing centres) and how it tends to valorize choice – a feature that belies the reality the books attempt to describe (the allusion to *Escape from the Holocaust.* 'Do-it-yourself Adventure Series' is unforgettable). She argues that sometimes speculative (Matas) and horror (King) fiction addresses, in more sophisticated and open-ended manner, the ambiguities and unanswerable questions that the study of the Holocaust must raise.

Kertzer's use of historical and interpretive literature about the Holocaust is particularly effective in pointing out the ironies and inadequacies of adult assumptions about what's appropriate in children's literature on the subject. Her extended analysis of the editorial notes and alterations in Matas's *Daniel's Story* makes absolutely clear the disjunction between an experienced writer's knowledge of what her readers can handle, the protective attitude in many adults, and the Americanization of 'the Holocaust child.' Curiously, while she brings a deep scepticism to Katherine Paterson's claim that children's literature must offer hope, she never seems

to question the partner assumption that the primary goal of that literature is to teach 'lessons' and instil knowledge – an aim she implies is not inherent in comparable literature for adults. But don't we all read to learn? Can't some of those works read by children – Aranka Siegal's memoirs, for example – be understood to be born of the need to express, to tell the story, rather than of the overt aim to educate? Thus, as it should, this study raises more questions. At the same time, it offers incisive, provoking analysis which, one hopes, will become familiar reading among teachers, librarians, and all adults who bring the literature of the Holocaust to children. (DEIRDRE BAKER)

Hanna Spencer. *Hanna's Diary, 1938–1941: Czechoslovakia to Canada*
McGill-Queen's University Press 2001. xviii, 190. $32.95

In 1938, Hanna Fischl, a young Jewish Czech woman, began a diary. Forced a few months later to leave her post as a schoolteacher at a German school in Olmütz, a small town on the border between the Czech- and German-speaking parts of Moravia, Fischl left Czechoslovakia for England in March 1939. A PhD in Germanic and Slavonic languages and literatures, she was allowed to work only 'as a resident in service in a private household.' In June 1939, she reached Prescott, Ontario; here her permit allowed her to make gloves at the factory established by her uncle, Louis Fischl.

The restrictions upon her terms of employment are only part of her story. Although other family members were also refugees employed at the factory and working at a nearby farm, Hanna Fischl soon became a much-talked-about and sought-after oddity, the educated female refugee. After one local newspaper article featured her with the headline, 'PhD Happy Making Gloves,' many others followed. These, in turn, led to speaking engagements in which Fischl, precisely because she did not fit Canadian expectations regarding the gender and class of refugees, was a great success. Her ability to speak about Europe in the terms demanded by her hosts ensured that they regarded her as a 'First rate specimen'; they little suspected that in her diary Fischl was wittily deconstructing their own behaviour.

Fischl stopped writing in December 1941; the last diary entry refers to the forthcoming visit of Elvins Spencer, the man she married six months later. The seven diary notebooks were deposited in a locked wooden box that she did not open for forty-five years. Continuing the diary made no sense, for she had begun it as a 'one-sided dialogue' addressed to Hans Feiertag, her lover, confidant, and inspiration. Viewing the Christian Feiertag as an immensely talented composer and artist, whose budding career would be destroyed if anyone were to know of his relationship with

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

her, Fischl agreed to their separation. The diary became a substitute, a way of informing him of all of her thoughts and experiences during what they hoped would be a brief interruption to their relationship.

The diary thus becomes a fascinating account of the intersection of war and gender, of how a woman gives up a relationship that for eight years has meant everything to her and attempts through writing to hold on to her sense of self. An intellectual who believes that she is capable of handling any pedagogical challenge, Fischl is horrified that at her first position in England she is unable to deal with her five-year-old charge. Not identifying herself as Jewish and reluctant to pursue Zionist possibilities, given that Feiertag is not Jewish, she recites Goethe as a reminder that the Germany that rejects her is not the German culture that she loves.

In her introduction, Hanna Spencer, now professor emerita, University of Western Ontario, addresses not just Czech history but also the powerful hold Hans Feiertag exerted upon her. She analyses why she 'never questioned or resented' the decision to take their relationship underground. There is only the briefest hint that perhaps this decision was not the right one: 'And being involved with him, loving him, I became infected and affected by his sense of the importance of his work. He seemed to have no choice.' Given that her choices (and luck) may have helped her to survive, how can we say what was the right thing to do at that time? The diary often foregrounds this question. At one point, no longer allowed to teach in Czechoslovakia, Fischl seriously considers whether she should find employment in Germany. At another, she wonders whether a close friend is 'one of the good guys or one of the bad guys' and wishes that life had the clarity of a novel.

Hanna's Diary is organized into four chapters: the first two on Czechoslovakia are divided by the date when Fischl learns that she can no longer teach; the final two chapters contain her compelling entries for England and Canada. In addition to the diary entries and historical introduction, Spencer includes a map of Czechoslovakia, an appendix outlining familial relationships, and excellent notes (imagine Anne Frank today explaining the context for a specific entry). Among the twenty-seven illustrations are letters from F.C. Blair, Canadian director of immigration, including one in which Blair grudgingly grants Fischl permission to become a teacher at a private girls' school so long as she promises not to take any other immigrants away from her uncle's business.

Hans Feiertag did not survive the war. His musical manuscripts remain in limbo, 'safely housed in the Mahler-Rosé room in the University of Western Ontario's Music Library' awaiting someone to study them and ensure that the music composed by the man Hanna Fischl loved will not be forgotten. The one-sided dialogue could not save his life, but like the dialogue, the music remains, testimony to the fragmentation of lives and art produced by war. (ADRIENNE KERTZER)

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Michael D. Stevenson. *Canada's Greatest Wartime Muddle: National Selective Service and the Mobilization of Human Resources during World War II*
McGill-Queen's University Press. xii, 236. $55.00

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade Researcher Michael D. Stevenson's *Canada's Greatest Wartime Muddle: National Selective Service and the Mobilization of Human Resources during World War II* is a notable, albeit unexceptional contribution to the social and military history of Canada during the Second World War.

The book, based on Stevenson's doctoral work at the University of Western Ontario, uses eight case studies to evaluate the success of the National Selective Service (NSS), the organization primarily responsible for mobilizing Canadian civilians in wartime. Stevenson seeks to prove that 'there was no effective coordination among government offices and agencies directly responsible for the efficient mobilization of human resources in Canada during the war.' This argument, based on a detailed analysis of the wartime records of the Department of Labour and selected references to other government departments and newspapers, challenges some of the more conventional, laudatory interpretations of Canada's war effort still prevalent in the contemporary literature. Stevenson joins a growing number of younger scholars who have been finding 'a decidedly mediocre record of military and civilian endeavours during World War II.'

The book's strengths are threefold. Stevenson bridges the conceptual and technical differences between social and military history effectively, making this study accessible to historians of either genre. The well-written and comprehensive analysis of the previously neglected wartime records of the Department of Labour is also impressive. Finally, the first case study, on Canada's Native peoples, and the final two, on female textile workers and nurses, are valuable contributions to Canadian historiography.

The book is not as consistent either methodologically or analytically. Stevenson never provides the reader with the criteria he used to select the case studies. In a footnote, having conceded that there were approximately fifteen detailed cases from which to choose, he writes vaguely: 'most case studies deal with large sectors of the workforce or highlight specific features or characteristics of the NSS regulatory effort.' Moreover, in his analysis of both student deferment policies and the labour stabilization plan for the Halifax docks, Stevenson rejects his own argument, and concludes that government policy was indeed effective.

Unlike the work on Natives and women, the research on general male labourers is surprisingly sparse. The book makes it clear that the conflict between the Department of Labour and C.D. Howe's more powerful Department of Munitions and Supply (DMS) had a significant impact on the policies of the NSS leadership, but to ascertain the perspective of DMS, Stevenson has consulted neither the collection of C.D. Howe Papers at the

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

National Archives nor his biography by Robert Bothwell and William Kilbourn.

Furthermore, a book that challenges traditional interpretations of Mackenzie King's governance during the Second World War, and particularly one which seems surprised by Canada's 'cautious, deliberate, flexible' policy, based on a 'fundamental belief in conciliation, voluntarism, and compromise,' should have examined King's extensive personal papers and, even more important given the subject matter, the prime minister's own 1918 publication, *Industry and Humanity*. King's conciliatory approach to labour negotiations is mentioned by Stevenson in passing, but the author does not provide adequate detail about how the prime minister's personal beliefs influenced his limited support for some of the more authoritarian NSS initiatives and the development of a national mobilization policy in general.

In sum, this book is important for providing the first detailed analysis of the NSS from the perspective of the Department of Labour, but it is probably not a sufficiently comprehensive assessment of the interdepartmental dynamics and the bureaucratic politics of Canada's wartime civilian mobilization policies. (ADAM CHAPNICK)

Bohdan S. Kordan. *Canada and the Ukrainian Question 1939–1945: A Study in Statecraft*
McGill-Queen's University Press 2001. xiv, 258. $75.00, $27.95

In August 1991, as the Soviet Union collapsed, a free and democratic Ukrainian state, independent of Moscow, emerged, essentially putting to rest 'the Ukrainian Question' that had so bedevilled Western governments in the twentieth century. Bohdan S. Kordan's monograph is a meticulous study of the issue's impact on the Canadian state during the Second World War, covering ground familiar from Thomas Prymak's equally fine *Maple Leaf and Trident: The Ukrainian Canadians during the Second World War* (1988). Besides North American and British materials, Kordan had the benefit of recent access to the Archives of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Although himself a strong Ukrainian nationalist, Kordan does recognize the many dilemmas that Soviet foreign policy posed for Canada's Liberal government under pressure from Ukrainian-Canadian organizations. Support by Canada of an independent Ukrainian nation was difficult enough before Hitler's attack on the Soviet Union in June 1941; once the latter became a Western ally, the idea of separating Ukraine from the Union became impossible, even ludicrous, in the eyes of most in Canada's Department of External Affairs. While yielding little to the latter, Kordan is judicious in his criticism of a Canadian government obliged to thread a thin

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

line between support for and distrust of a beleaguered former enemy, one forced to bear the brunt of the European land war before June 1944.

Of the book's bureaucratic knaves, Norman Robertson, the undersecretary of state for external affairs, heads the list, though Dana Wilgress, Canada's ambassador to the Soviet Union, and John Grierson, director of Canada's Wartime Information Board, also consistently frustrated Ukrainian-Canadian nationalist ambitions. Concerned to explain the state's failure to pursue the 'liberal justice' for Ukraine inherent in the Atlantic Charter (1941), Kordan embraces Harvard historian Theda Skocpal's thesis in *States and Social Revolution* (1979) that 'in responding to international pressures and opportunities' government officials, 'as de facto trustees of the state,' follow a realpolitik concerned primarily with securing the state's interests (and thus their own), rather than the aspirations of any particular group or community.

Of Kordan's political heroes, Tracy Philipps tops the list. A well-born British adventurer/soldier/civil servant/journalist of independent means, Philipps served in eastern Europe (and Ukraine) as a relief officer for the Nansen Commission after the First World War. After a tour of labour ethnic groups in Canada in 1940, he targeted the Ukrainians, important in agriculture and the war industries but deemed a threat to the country's war effort because of seemingly irreconcilable internal ideological differences. In November 1940 his diplomatic efforts helped to create the Ukrainian Canadian Committee, an umbrella organization for non-communist Ukrainians, and early in 1942 he became the 'European adviser' to the new Nationalities Branch in the federal Bureau of Public Information, through which he hoped to reconcile 'the contradictions between the liberal principles guiding the war and actual policy.'

To him, the branch's main function was to secure the state through a Canadianization process that addressed immigrant concerns and nurtured a sense of ethnic trust, connecting it to the government. In the Ukrainian-Canadian case (according to Kordan, paraphrasing Philipps), 'some acknowledgment of the legitimacy of their claim that the Ukrainian nation has a right to self-determination' was necessary, 'a claim that fell squarely within the liberal parameters defining Canada's public stand on the war.' Philipps was exceptional in his interest in a Canadianization that respected the ethnic hyphen, a position then opposed by most in and out of government. In pointing to contradictions in official policy, however, he failed to indicate what the same officials might have told Ukrainian Canadians in light of Canada's newly acquired strange (but very important) Soviet ally on the Eastern Front – an omission Kordan ignores. Robertson accused Philipps of a 'weakness for mysticism,' which Kordan merely reports without comment.

In the end one is left with the uncomfortable feeling that both sides – the Canadian state and the Ukrainians – were rather naïve. While it is true that

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

the Canadian state's liberal principles were overwhelmed by both the 'emerging global power structure' and by a trust of the Soviets that Igor Gouzenko's revelations soon undermined, equally unrealistic was the Ukrainian-Canadian assumption that the Western powers might somehow press for Ukraine's self-determination through the United Nations. But in concentrating on the state's naïveté, Kordan largely overlooks the equally credulous Ukrainian Canadian Committee.

Even so, the book is a competent and valuable piece of work. It places the familiar material within an interesting theoretical framework and allows the principal actors ample scope to explain themselves. A scholarly quirk that defies explanation, however, is the frequent repetition in the footnotes of official titles already noted in the text. Such deference to authority is rare in today's scholarly world. (MANOLY R. LUPUL)

Richard Cavell. *McLuhan in Space: A Cultural Geography*
University of Toronto Press. xix, 322. $65.00

Describing Marshall McLuhan's collaboration with Wilfred Watson, and in particular the extent to which their *From Cliche to Archetype* included McLuhan's fullest response to Northrop Frye, Richard Cavell quotes McLuhan in *The Global Village*: 'There is absolutely no provision in Frye's statement for ground of any kind: the archetype is itself a figure minus a ground, floating around devoid of its original context.' For those familiar with the portrait of Frye that hangs in the Pratt Library at Victoria College – seated in space, resting during his assumption into heaven, or simply resting – McLuhan's comment does indeed provide a ground. But his comment leaves the reader of *McLuhan in Space* puzzled by the title Cavell has chosen for this book. His McLuhan does not float, groundless, even if Iain Baxter's striking dust-jacket photograph implies as much. 'Culture,' the author concludes, 'was a material phenomenon for McLuhan, not an abstract one, a position that set him off most sharply from Frye.' Any representation of McLuhan in space would necessarily show, like medieval paintings of the ascension, traces of his footprints left upon the earth.

Cavell's thoughtful consideration of the critical positions of Marshall McLuhan and Northrop Frye is only one facet of his exploration of 'the Canadian context of McLuhan's thought.' 'Contexts' more accurately describes his account of the grounds from which McLuhan developed, which he worked, and on which he left his traces. Cavell is intent on 'grounding' McLuhan in such Canadian thinkers as Richard Bucke and R.A. Fessenden and Bertram Brooker as well as in Harold Innis, at the same time establishing him as ground in which such Canadian artists of the 1960s and beyond as bp Nichol, Murray Schafer, and Glenn Gould came to figure.

In his preface, Cavell proposes that 'the concept of space is the prime category of [McLuhan's] thought,' and that 'the single most important

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

moment in [his] intellectual career was his *break* from Innis's notions of time and space.' These notions, including traditional distinctions between spatial and temporal arts and a belief that the blending of space and time was hypothetical only (i.e., groundless), gave way before McLuhan's view that space in an electric age was not exclusively visual and not static. It was his University of Toronto colleague, the psychologist Carleton Williams, drawing upon an earlier University of Toronto psychologist, E.A. Bott, who provided McLuhan with the possibility of 'acoustic' as distinct from visual space; in McLuhan's words, 'unenclosed space ... [which] has no centre and no margins since we hear from all directions simultaneously,' 'space whose centre is everywhere and whose margin is nowhere.' 'In contemporary culture (as in the Middle Ages),' Cavell observes, 'space is once again becoming multivalent, after the centuries of uniform, perspectival space produced by the dominance of print.'

Admittedly, Cavell is more concerned with making the case for McLuhan as 'spatial theorist' than with his Canadian credentials, or with him as student and teacher of literature or as cultural historian. His reference to the Middle Ages, for example, despite the Augustinian ring of McLuhan's definition of acoustic space, remains in parentheses, unrelated to McLuhan's Catholicism, to the milieu of St Michael's College, where he taught for many years, and its affiliated Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies with its library and faculty, including its founder, Etienne Gilson. Because it was a characteristic of medieval perception, McLuhan argued, which has been recovered in the concept of acoustic space, this seems a notable omission.

Cavell occasionally lapses into a type of clotted prose which betrays the vividness of what he would present. He can also slide over biographical details, such as the setting and circumstances of McLuhan's coming 'to know' Wyndham Lewis, or his supposed influence on Sheila Watson's *The Double Hook*, with a curious disregard for the biographical sources he has cited. Perhaps his assumption that McLuhan wrote 'from within a postmodernist (and poststructuralist) sensibility' is more contentious and less inevitable than he appears to believe. Cavils aside, this is a valuable book, less for its representation of Marshall McLuhan as a 'spatial theorist,' however, than for its exploration of the cultural/geographical space that made him like his country, in his words, 'a borderline case.' (F.T. FLAHIFF)

Michael Dolzani, editor. *The 'Third Book' Notebooks of Northrop Frye, 1964–1972: The Critical Comedy*. Volume 9 of *Collected Works of Northrop Frye*
University of Toronto Press. xiv, 480. $80.00

The 'Third Book' Notebooks is the ninth volume to appear in the Collected Works of Northrop Frye. The 'Third Book' of the title refers to a projected study of literature and society, a third large-scale work to follow *Fearful*

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Symmetry and *Anatomy of Criticism*. Some of the material in these notebooks eventually found its way into *Words with Power*, but the third book itself was never written.

Frye used his notebooks to work out the organizing structures which inform his essays and books. He writes in a kind of personal code, comprising elements from William Blake's mythological system and of categories of his own devising, notably the conceptual map of his mythological universe that he called 'the great doodle.' The following two sentences are typical of the style of a significant proportion of the notebooks: 'Eros & Adonis are both forms of Orc, the eniautos-daimon, and the Orc cycle underlies the Nomos-Nous encyclopedia. Oedipus & Prometheus run the other way, from death to birth, and are both, I think, forms of Urthona.' It is a relief to find that Frye sometimes makes an ironic comment at his own expense. For example, after relating a point to a childhood game, he writes, 'I record this because anyone reading these notes would assume that they were the work of a psychotic, so I may as well furnish the definitive proof of the fact.'

Given their nature, the notebooks are likely to be of interest primarily to scholars working on Frye; they lack the gossipy personal interest of Frye's letters to Helen Kemp or his diaries. However, there are rewards for the casual browser or the reader who works backwards from the index. Frye comments on a number of writers who do not figure prominently in his books; for example, Proust, Kierkegaard, and Dostoyevsky. Two surprisingly frequent reference points are the Alice books of Lewis Carroll and the poetry of Valéry. There are also some personal revelations. We learn that Frye finds it difficult to finish long works of fiction, and that he dislikes using library books 'partly because I work with marginalia in books I own, perhaps because every book out of sight is also out of mind.' We get an insight into his deepest personal ambitions: 'The present book, if I bring it off, may be much larger in scope than [*The Critical Path*] ... and it may even become prophetic, a sacred book like the ones it studies.'

As always in Frye's work, there is the pleasure of the well-sharpened aside or aphorism. He dislikes the 'dreary paranoid whine' of Rousseau's *Confessions* and refers to New Criticism as 'a half-assed development of Hopkinsian Scotism.' On the occasion of reading Wyndham Lewis's *Apes of God*, Frye notes, 'I felt an overmastering urge to transform it from the most boring book I never read into the most boring book I ever read, so that, at the age of sixty, I could be in a position to reflect that never, never, never, would I have to read that fucking book again.'

Michael Dolzani had a daunting task editing these densely allusive and often cryptic comments, and for the most part he has risen to the occasion admirably. My only reservation is that it is sometimes hard to track down the footnote explaining an allusion the first time that it occurs. Given the way that most people are likely to use this volume, some more cross-

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

referencing and a fuller index might have been helpful. I also noted one or two omissions in the index. Dolzani has a deep and empathetic understanding of Frye, and his introduction is an excellent guide to what he calls the 'secret imaginative background' to Frye's published books. According to Dolzani, the 'Third Book' notebooks have a special value in that they reveal the concealed mythological pattern which lies beneath all of Frye's work. Dolzani's discussion of this pattern makes a significant contribution to our understanding of the way that Frye's thought developed, especially during the latter part of his life. (J. RUSSELL PERKIN)

James Quandt, editor. *Kon Ichikawa*
Cinemateque Ontario. 446. $29.95

For anyone interested in Japanese cinema, *Kon Ichikawa* is essential. It offers a variety of perspectives on the life and works of an often neglected but extremely important Japanese filmmaker. Three major perspectives emerge. First, there is Ichikawa in his own terms, through a selection of his essays and interviews. Second, the volume includes discussions of Ichikawa by some of his collaborators, peers, and Japanese critics, which provide a sense of his reception in Japan. Third, the volume gives a broad sample of scholarly work on Ichikawa, bringing together previously published essays and recent criticism. The recent scholarly work on Ichikawa especially poses challenging questions about how to organize film history and commentary.

As James Quandt notes, at almost eighty films over sixty years in a variety of genres, Ichikawa's works defy an overall director-centred evaluation. This may explain why Ichikawa has never received the critical attention accorded to Kurosawa, Ozu, or Mizoguchi, in Japan or the West. Indeed, many commentators have dismissed him as a filmmaker who simply followed studio trends, opportunistically. As if in response to such negative assessments, most of these essays are appreciations of Ichikawa's work. One series of essays explores what makes him distinctive, stylistically, tonally, and thematically – particularly those by Audie Bock, Donald Richie, and Max Tessier. A portrait emerges of a master stylist whose initial training in animation encourages an emphasis on the graphic design or composition of filmic images, which produces a somewhat distant or detached relationship to his characters and stories – whence the distinctive Ichikawa tone, variously described as dark, ironic, macabre, wry, cool, witty, or, in Pauline Kael's memorable phrase, 'deadpan sophisticate.' Not surprisingly, many commentators then raise questions about Ichikawa's humanism, for his style relies on a humanistic centre that continually recedes. Generally, such essays stress Ichikawa's distinctive stylistic or tonal qualities, to establish Ichikawa as an innovator and creator of the highest calibre.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Other essays, however, begin to trouble this portrait of the artist, particularly those dealing with screen adaptation (the majority of his films are adaptations of novels). From the angle of adaptation, Ichikawa appears less as an innovator and creator, and more as a follower and collaborator. Screenwriter Natto Wada, for instance, adapted the novels for many of Ichikawa's renowned movies. One here gains the impression of a filmmaker who shadows the material, who follows it closely yet furtively, at a distance; who wishes to see through it. Ichikawa is the gumshoe stealthily pursuing his leads only to appear at the end to unmask the book's crime (as in his adaptation of Ishihara's *Punishment Room* or Tanizaki's *Kagi*) – Wada is the 'smart dame' with a thing or two to teach the detective about human nature. A complex image of filmmaking emerges here – an urban politics. This image of filmmaking is more in evidence in the numerous interviews with Ichikawa, but it is fellow director Yasuzo Masamura who sharply and insightfully hones it. His essay makes it easier to understand why more politically rebellious directors would see Ichikawa as one who, like the detective, remains on the side of law and order (the industry) while dubiously and cynically aware of their power of corruption.

Still other essays present thoughtful critiques of, and alternatives to, auteur-centred film criticism. All the fuss over establishing Ichikawa (rather belatedly) as an auteur affords an opportunity to rethink how film history and commentary have traditionally been organized – on the basis of author and works. Michael Raine resituates Ichikawa's distinctive visual style in *Punishment Room* within broader historical trends around the emergence of youth film. Eric Cazdyn sees a common problem with origins in adaptation and nationalism, which suggests to him a contradictory response to nationalism and capitalism in Ichikawa's approach to adaptation. David Desser reads *The Makioka Sisters* intertextually, as nostalgically referencing not only prewar Japan but also cinematic spaces (Ozu and Mizoguchi). Aaron Gerow's contribution brilliantly tracks Ichikawa's box-office success by showing how Ichikawa's procedures proved ideally suited to transformations in the film industry after 1976. Because it brings together so many perspectives on such a prolific and long-lived filmmaker, *Kon Ichikawa* provides many ways of thinking about the history of Japanese cinema. (THOMAS LAMARRE)

Arthur Davis, editor. *Collected Works of George Grant: Volume 2, 1951–59*
University of Toronto Press. xxxv1, 564. $125.00

This admirable volume, the second in a projected three-volume set of Grant's collected works, brings together Grant's writings from 1951 to 1959, the years he was professor of philosophy at Dalhousie University. Today George Grant is remembered as a champion of Canadian nationalism

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

and a critic of technological progress. Neither of these themes stands out in this volume: the one entry on Canada is a short article for the *Encyclopedia Canadiana*. Yet the later Grant is clearly emerging. At this stage he was a stormy oppositional figure within the academy, waging an intellectual guerilla war against academic philosophy from his bunker at Dalhousie.

Grant announced his opposition to contemporary philosophy in the opening sentence of his report to the Royal Commission study on the arts. He wrote: 'The study of philosophy is the analysis of the traditions of our society ... against our varying intuitions of the perfection of God.' The simple matter-of-factness and presumed self-evidence of this statement read to many like a pronouncement from the medieval papacy and threw Grant's fellow philosophers into a rage. In these postwar years, philosophy, and indeed the whole university system in Canada, were proudly emancipating themselves from religion. In the eye of his colleagues, especially F.H. Anderson at the University of Toronto, Grant's call came from the bowels of reaction.

But the volume shows that Grant is more complicated than this. He clearly thought of himself as a progressive. Today, his essays on Sartre and Dostoevsky can be cited to show that he was avant-garde – a continental philosopher before his time; his outspoken critiques of the academy and its mania for specialization resonate more today than when he first wrote them.

Grant was emerging as the the public philosopher par excellence. The material gathered in this collection, including his first published volume, *Philosophy in a Mass Age,* his lectures to the Ontario Teachers' Association and to the Couchiching Conference, and his radio broadcasts on the CBC, are all of a piece. All are intended as works of philosophy, addressed to the same audience of common readers. A number of the articles, notably the essay on Bertrand Russell, spell out his substantive philosophic disagreements with contemporary secular philosophy. Russell's argument, derived from Hume and championed in the 1950s by the logical positivists, who were riding high at that time, held that passion, not reason, was the seat of morality. This struck Grant as a treason of the intellectuals, destructive of philosophy and a step towards nihilism. Grant's response was that philosophy which is informed by religion sustains human reason more reliably than any secular philosophy. Grant's lifelong endeavour as a philosopher was to formulate and defend this very controversial proposition.

Arthur Davis has shown loving diligence in retrieving Grant's work. He reproduces for the first time, Grant's unpublished book-length manuscript 'Acceptance and Rebellion' and a long-lost CBC commentary entitled 'The Humanities in Soviet Education.' Even Grant's closest associates were unaware of his interest or expertise in this subject. Davis's introduction conjures up the world of Dalhousie in the 1950s, his and my alma mater, with splendid eloquence.

Davis also includes a number of Grant's later disavowals of some of these pieces – proof that the works are transitional so far as Grant was concerned – but many readers will find them of permanent interest. (LOUIS GREENSPAN)

Walter Pitman. *Louis Applebaum: A Passion for Culture*
Dundurn. 512. $39.99

Although he liked to think of himself primarily as a composer, Louis Applebaum (1918–2000) was probably best known to the public at large as the executive director of the Ontario Arts Council (1971–80) or as the co-chair of the Federal Cultural Policy Review Committee (which issued the Appelbaum-Hébert Report in 1982). Applebaum was indeed a composer, and a fine one at that, but he often reached beyond the confines of his own discipline and contributed his services to the wider cultural and creative community in Canada. He was well known in artistic, administrative, and government circles as a broad-minded, fair, and hard-working man who could get the job done, no matter whether the job involved writing a film score or assessing the cultural life of the entire country.

Educated at Harbord Collegiate, the University of Toronto, and the Juilliard School in New York, Applebaum was a staff composer at the National Film Board during the war years. Success at the NFB led him in 1946 to the USA, where his score for *The Story of G.I. Joe* (1945, rereleased in 2000) had already earned an Oscar nomination. But in 1949 he moved back to Toronto, his home town, motivated by a loyalty and dedication to Canada that were rewarded by his appointment as a Member of the Order of Canada in 1976 and elevation to the rank of Companion in 1995.

Applebaum continued to work part-time for the NFB and wrote dozens of film scores up to 1966, ending his career there with the delightful children's film *Paddle to the Sea*, directed and edited by Bill Mason (and narrated by NFB stalwart Stanley Jackson, not Bill Mason as Pitman states). Hundreds more background scores were done for CBC Television, the Stratford Festival, and the private film industry. At Stratford he also inaugurated a music wing of the festival and organized the International Conference of Composers in 1960. Other organizations that Applebaum helped to found and/or nurture include the Canadian League of Composers, the Canada Council, the National Arts Centre, and the Canadian performing rights society SOCAN. Somehow Applebaum also found time for his own work as an independent composer, culminating in the opera *Erewhon* to a libretto by Mavor Moore. The opera was premiered in Victoria two months before the composer's death.

Walter Pitman, the author of this painstakingly thorough biography, has had a varied career in politics, academia, and arts administration (he

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

succeeded Applebaum as director of the OAC). The biography is based on extensive interviews with Applebaum (referred to as 'Louis' throughout the book) during the last year of his life, and also with his family members, friends, and colleagues. Pitman has much insight into Applebaum's work as an administrator, but is less savvy about his work as a creative artist and has little or no detailed knowledge of his technical skills as a musician. The author was obviously loath to omit any of his research, for what did not get used in the body of the text was saved for filling out ninety pages of bloated endnotes. The book has an index (in ridiculously small six-point font) but no discography or works list.

While Pitman obviously respects and admires Applebaum, he also deals with his subject's inadequacies and shortcomings fully and fairly. Applebaum was, in the view of his son David, 'a terrible businessman,' and it is difficult to argue with that assessment. Group Four Productions, a private film company that Applebaum founded in 1961, was singularly inept in its choice of projects and went bankrupt by the end of the decade. He was later involved with a group called the Living Arts Management Board (LAMB for short), which was quickly led to the slaughter after launching the short-lived cultural pay-TV station C-Channel in 1983. Even the Applebaum-Hébert Report was a fiasco: its 101 recommendations were ignored for political reasons that Pitman outlines in detail. But Applebaum's successes and achievements greatly outweigh these failures. Pitman's biography, though more workmanlike than inspired, is a welcome tribute to a man who was a vital force in Canada's cultural life in the second half of the twentiethth century. (ROBIN ELLIOTT)

Frank Burke and Marguerite Waller, editors.
Federico Fellini. Contemporary Perspectives
University of Toronto Press. xxxii, 240. $65.00, $24.95

The publication of this exciting new volume of essays constitutes a significant contribution to film studies in general and to Fellini studies in particular. The editors, Frank Burke and Marguerite Waller, both eminent professors of film studies and noted North American authorities on Fellini, had marked new directions in this field with their own research. Burke's 1989 essay 'Realism/Representation/Signification' was pivotal in initiating the discussion of Fellini and postmodernity; Waller's 1990 essay on *La dolce vita* similarly established new ground in Fellini criticism in its study of this film's challenges to 'the regime of the written word and its attendant historiographies, notions of identity, and , inevitably, sexualities.'

While both these articles are reprinted in this collection, the other nine essays have been expressly solicited for this project, which aims to update the importance of Federico Fellini by 'bringing his work into relation with recent critical methodologies: semiotic/poststructuralist, psychoanalytical,

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

feminist,and deconstructionist.' The goal of revisiting the Fellini opus from contemporary perspectives is a concerted effort on the part of the editors to counteract prevailing assumptions of self-indulgence and lack of political value in Fellini's films. The essays are chosen, the editors note, to highlight Fellini's evolving self-reflexivity and the self-critical, analytical dimension of his work; the organization of the volume according to theoretical issues situates Fellini in the 'broader context of postwar signifying strategies.'

As the volume does not represent the proceedings of a specific conference on Fellini, the editors acknowledge the importance of the intergenerational critical debate fostered by three important events: the annual Purdue Conference on Romance Languages, Literatures and Film, the annual conference of the American Association of Italian Studies (AAIS), and the 1995 Indiana University conference 'European Cinemas, European Societies 1895–1995.'

The individual essays will appeal to a multiplicity of interests: Helen Stoddard analyses the performative mode of the circus in *I clowns*; William Van Watson provides a reading of Fellini's corpus as a comprehensive challenge to the normative authority of Lacanian subject construction; Virginia Picchietti offers a vision of Fellini as gender theorist; Christopher Sharrett studies the 1968 *Toby Dammit* in the context of the director's involvement with the genres and signification practices of popular culture; Dorothée Bonnigal, inspired by Millicent Marcus's concept of a Fellinian '*hypertext*' – a conceptual matrix for the reading of individual films – discusses *Amarcord* as the passageway to maturity of Fellini's cinematic subject; Cosetta Gaudenzi studies Fellini's anti-fascist exploitation of the gap between Standard Italian and dialect; Millicent Marcus's metaphor of the '*hyperfilm*' informs her discussion of the critique of postmodern culture in *Ginger and Fred;* Carlo Testa probes the analogy between Kafka and Fellini; Áine O'Healy examines Anita Ekberg as a signifier of ideal femininity in the West.

The essays are accompanied by a detailed chronology of Fellini's life, numerous black and white photographs, a selected bibliography, and a full filmography. The contributors are all actively involved in cinema teaching and research at North American institutions; indeed, scholars like Millicent Marcus are fundamentally shaping the discipline with their research.

A most welcome and eagerly anticipated addition to Fellini studies, this volume offers an important English-language alternative to existing studies which aim primarily to situate Fellini in the context of Italian cultural studies. The additional innovative insights offered into Fellini's individual films, and opus in general, will most assuredly promote intellectual debate and offer a contemporary reassessment of one of Italy's most beloved directors. In publishing this diverse collection of essays, the editors have articulated a heartfelt and most laudable exhortation to give Fellini (and Italian film) a more central role in academic film studies. (RACHELE LONGO

LAVORATO)

Liam Gearon. *Landscapes of Encounter: The Portrayal of Catholicism in the Novels of Brian Moore*
University of Calgary Press. xvi, 296. $49.95

Brian Moore's novels have always straddled the boundaries: between Irish, Canadian, and American; between popular and literary; between religious and secular fiction. As Liam Gearon's preface points out, however, despite the relative critical neglect Moore has suffered because of literary and national exclusions, there have been a number of studies that have treated his works primarily from a biocritical perspective. In contrast, Gearon's 'hermeneutical key' unlocks Moore's fictions as 'literary reflections on a Catholic world undergoing radical transformation' before and after the Second Vatican Council (1962–65). He discounts biographical debates about Moore's personal religious faith (or lack of it) to analyse the 'literary-theological intertextuality' and the importance of 'landscape' (as cultural representations of place) in his novels. Gearon thus combines theology and postcolonial theory to examine Moore's fictional 'landscapes of encounter' as portraying the modern movement of Roman Catholicism from cultural hegemony to sites of ideological plurality.

In five central chapters Gearon gives detailed close readings of Moore's nineteen novels (space limitations preclude mention of all their titles in this review), situating them within his developing argument about the particular convergence of Moore's (counter)narratives and the 'grandnarrative of Catholic tradition.' Both in his early novels set in Ireland (1955 to 1965) and in his early novels set in North America (1960 to 1971), the protagonists rebel against a dogmatic, authoritative, pre–Vatican II Catholic church within the respective sites of sectarian Catholicism in Belfast and secular materialism in Montreal, New York, and California.

Although Gearon recognizes that traces of Moore's boyhood pre–Vatican II Catholicism remain in his novels decades after the most massive transformation in the history of the Catholic church, the longest section of his book analyses the increasing complexity and plurality in Moore's portrayal of Catholicism after 1971. *Catholics* (1972) heralds the change with a futuristic revolution of the Irish church after an imaginary Vatican IV. Moore continues to revision an increasingly secularized, marginalized, and politicized Catholicism in four more novels set in Northern Ireland from 1976 to 1990. At the same time, according to Gearon, he portrays, within the secularity of North America, 'an increasingly sympathetic portrayal of Catholicism' from a postcolonial perspective in three novels from 1974 to 1985. Gearon identifies three commonalities between post–Vatican II theology and postcolonialism that he foregrounds in these fictions: 'an

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

emphasis on historical perspective in the analysis of social-structural inequality; an identity with the marginalized and oppressed "other"; and a radical, social interpretation of texts.'

Four of Moore's final novels (from 1987 to 1997) are set in neither Ireland nor North America. Gearon sees his enlargement of the 'landscapes of encounter' to include Eastern and Western Europe, the Caribbean, and North Africa, and relations between Catholicism and both Judaism and Islam, as evidence not only of postcolonial perspectives but also post–Vatican II radical doctrines of egalitarian ecclesiology, universalist soteriology, and liberation theology.

In this book Gearon makes a very convincing argument for the evolving portrayal of Catholic theology in the novels of Brian Moore, 'a committed non-believer.' He subjects Moore to a serious literary (as opposed to biocritical) analysis, balancing lucid, jargon-free theoretical contexts with careful close readings of the texts. His thesis is clearly organized and articulated, if somewhat repetitive (at least three times for each point). His bibliography and endnotes indicate a comprehensive background for his study. In the difficult congruence of Catholic doctrine and postcolonial diversity, Gearon makes a good case for Moore's liberation theology (although, in his reading of *The Magician's Wife*, stressing the coincidence of 1962 as the year marking both Algerian independence and Vatican II seems a bit far fetched). Somewhat surprisingly, Gearon does not use the expected terms 'metanarrative/counternarrative' or 'sites of resistance,' and his 'landscapes of encounter' do not mention the context (or criticisms) of Mircea Eliade's similar 'sacred spaces.' But these are minor quibbles with an otherwise exemplary analysis of religion and literature in the works of a relatively neglected but important novelist. (BARBARA PELL)

Bob Chodos and Jamie Swift. *Faith and Freedom: The Life and Times of Bill Ryan, SJ*
Novalis. 253. $34.95

William F. Ryan is a well-known Canadian Jesuit priest. Canadian historians remember him as the author of the ground-breaking *The Clergy and Economic Growth in Quebec* (1966), which definitively changed the traditional scholarly and popular view of clerical influence in French Canada. Catholic social activists in Canada and the United States recall him as the founder of a string of innovating social justice works: the Centre of Concern (1971), the influential Washington DC think-tank on questions of justice and peace; the Toronto-based Centre for Social Faith and Justice (1979), which focused on health issues, foreign policy in Latin America, refugees, and social problems in the inner city; the Ignatius Farm Community at Guelph (1979), an 'intentional' community of Jesuits, former prisoners, and people released from mental hospitals; the Anishinabe

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Spiritual Centre in Espanola (1980), which began formal training for Native deacons; the monthly periodical *COMPASS* (1983), a Jesuit journal of opinion, edited for a decade by Bob Chodos, the coauthor of this biography. Canadian churchmen and women think of his responsibilities at the Canadian Conference of Catholic Bishops both as co-director of the Social Action Department (1964–70) and as general secretary (1984–90), where he became the 'key player' in formulating the bishops' policies and/or statements on such critical questions as medicare (1964), birth control (1968), the 'omnibus bill' (1969), the Roman Synod on Justice (1971), the Papal Visit to Canada (1984), the work of the Bishops' Social Affairs Commission (1986), the Roman Synod on the laity (1987), and free trade (1988–89).

Finally – I think – international and Canadian public servants look back on Bill Ryan's remarkable participation in the work of the Canadian Institute for Peace and Security, the Society for Development and Peace, the Canadian International Development Agency, the International Centre for Human Rights and Democratic Development, the Toronto Human Rights Tribunal, and especially the Jesuit Project in Ethics and Politics, designed to promote dialogue on social ethics with members of Parliament and senior civil servants.

Researched and written by two elegant and experienced authors – 'a practising Jew and a lapsed Anglican,' as they tell us themselves – *Faith and Freedom* is a good read about a consummate insider and friendly achiever, a list of whose contacts make the book read like a *Who's Who* of Church and State, 1964–99.

It is also a wonderful window onto the Canadian Catholic Church's far from simple reaction both to the reforms of the Second Vatican Council, and to the development of the 'justice issue,' especially after the Synod of 1971, through observing the activities and experience over four decades of this articulate, highly intelligent, and shrewd loyal servant, well-placed at the heart of Canadian Church life. The book will be instructive and useful to scholars, to students, and certainly to all those interested in the Church's commitment to social justice. However, someone should have told Bob Chodos and Jamie Swift – if not the editors at Novalis – that a book of this nature with no index (!) certainly loses much of its value for scholars and much of its interest for the many readers who will want (and they will) to go back and reread about the people and the strategies in the back rooms during so many key events.

Someone ought also to have suggested to them that among the 'some sixty people' they interviewed one or two should have been asked to advise them on Jesuit spirituality. They might then have better understood why Bill Ryan wanted Jim McSheffrey mentioned. They would also have been much more nuanced in judging as a 'notable failure' Bill's conversing on political ethics for several hours each over the period of a year with fifty-

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

five senior public servants and sixty-three members of parliament. Especially, they would not have been puzzled by Bill making 'only a passing mention of the Blessed Virgin' in the homily he gave at Mass for his seventy-fifth birthday. Nor would they, I expect, have come to their general conclusion – that the Jesuits of Upper Canada in the 1990s have let go of Bill's social justice legacy. We have not, let me assure them; but that is another, probably long, discussion. In the fall of 1999 a group of Bill Ryan's friends, upon hearing the alarming news that he might soon die of cancer, decided that his story ought to be told while this major source of so much recent Church and Jesuit history was still accessible. The prediction proved to be happily and totally wrong. But Bob Chodos and Jamie Swift were perfectly right to do the book anyway. We are heavily in their debt. (PS: The foreword by Maurice Strong might seem overly laudatory. I have known Bill Ryan for almost fifty years. Let me tell you, every word Maurice Strong wrote is absolutely true.) (JACQUES MONET, SJ)

W.J. Keith. *Canadian Odyssey: A Reading of Hugh Hood's 'The New Age/Le nouveau siècle'*
McGill-Queen's University Press. x, 212. $65.00, 24.95

Bill Keith has had a passion for hard-to-sell, ego-driven writers. He once gave a course at Toronto on the daunting twosome of Frederick Philip Grove and Rudy Wiebe at a time when Grove had fallen out of fashion. Now comes a study of Hugh Hood's colossal 'The New Age/Le nouveau siècle,' a twelve-novel saga which few Canadians have read in full and which many gave up on as it unfolded. For Keith, however, there is no question of the project's worth. He calls it 'a masterpiece.' It is the 'major fictional expression of Canadian life and experience' that '[a]rtistically minded Canadians have been searching desperately [for] over the last half-century.' Why, then, is the completed project generating so limited a response in a country hyper-attentive to its literary practioners?.

First, a few observations. Hood himself was an outright egotist, yet in a polite, thoughtful (Canadian?) way. In 1984 (with five novels of 'The New Age' completed) he wrote to me, 'I think, as I have always thought, that I'm by far the best writer we have ever had in Canada in either language, and I will back my books against anybody you care to mention in that respect, provided that they are read with attention by mature and intelligent men and women.' The statement staggered me at the time, but it heightened my curiosity. I am inclined to think now (after *Near Water*) that his egotism, so pronounced and sturdy, and so evident in his often stodgy protagonist Matt Goderich, was in part a function of his literary and meditative Catholicism, and was bolstered by his conviction that he, like Matt, deserved to be greeted by the highest order of angels when he expired.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Still, no one in Canada has dared so remarkable a literary project. Attention must surely be paid to a writer deeply driven to dramatize and articulate the life of his country. He wanted to include 'everything' and 'he considered himself embarked on a national mission' for which he was particularly well prepared. *Canadian Odyssey* is a critical response that Hood would have welcomed. It is a tribute to the project and a sympathetic analysis by a mature, intelligent reader. It attends closely to purpose and result, design and structure, cultural nuance and documentary detail, and overt allusion and covert intertextuality.

For coherence and maximum readerly pleasure, Keith argues that the novels should be read consecutively with careful attention to the distinct structure of each and of the series as a whole. For Keith the result is 'an act of awesome ambition and stamina.' He studies Hood's debts to practitioners of the *roman fleuve,* especially Marcel Proust and Anthony Powell, noting similarities and crucial differences. He weighs Hood's special debt to Wordsworth. He praises his 'technical audacity' and the diversity of structures evident in the individual books. He peers into the 'kaleidoscopic patterns' of the series, locating early intimations of later actions and assessing the larger implications of themes and motifs. *Canadian Odyssey* is a first-rate and persuasive guidebook.

Keith alone cannot, however, counter the many lassitudes of 'The New Age.' He admits that only 'a small but loyal band' of supporters has followed Hood's grand effort to its conclusion. To other difficulties he offers modest defences or aplogies. He sees structural bones in 'novels' that are relentlessly digressive and episodic; he argues that Hood did pretty well in his attempt to be inclusive of twentieth-century Canadian experience (who, he asks, does better?) and he acknowledges Hood's inadequate attempts to realize the character of his homosexual actor, Adam Sinclair. But anyone who has taught *A New Athens* or *The Swing in the Garden* will know the frustration of trying to interest otherwise keen students in Hood's extraordinary undertaking. They miss a necessary narrative pull and energy. They resist Matt's perceptiveness and high-mindedness, often finding him tedious and didactic. Too little of Hood's richness of detail and thought holds their attention. They weary of excessive allusion and longish meditations. And so it goes. Bill Keith's study addresses the immediate need for a rich and sympathetic reading of Hood's grand project. Nevertheless, questions loom which he cannot answer. Will there be a rallying of the troops? How will 'The New Age' be seen in a few decades? And will Hood ever find an audience commensurate with his own self-estimation? (MICHAEL PETERMAN)

Avi Friedman and David Krawitz. *Peeking through the Keyhole: The Evolution of North American Homes*
McGill-Queen's University Press. xv, 212. $32.95

Avi Friedman. *Planning the New Suburbia: Flexibility by Design*
University of British Columbia Press. xii, 194. $85.00

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Dramatic statements made by heroic designers highlight the history of architecture. Approbation and commissions are won by renditions depicting original ideas, by masters making statements to flatter cities, institutions, corporations, and the affluent. In the past year, Toronto has hitched its quest for world prominence to designs by Frank Gehry and Daniel Liebeskind. The University of Toronto got Graduate House, winner of architectural prizes before its completion and arguably the ugliest and least functional new building on campus.

Avi Friedman is not that kind of architect. Director of the Affordable Homes Program at McGill University, Friedman devotes himself to the livability of housing and housing areas for ordinary people. Unique looks are less important to him than functionality. He has worked hands-on with such endeavours as multi-family buildings in which rooms can be traded from apartment to apartment as needs wax and wane. His work has been noticed and honoured for its potential contribution to humanity, not its looks.

In conjunction with colleagues and students, Friedman published two books in 2002 that communicate and demonstrate his approach and versatility. *Peeking through the Keyhole* highlights the increasingly diverse needs that housing might rightly fulfil to reflect accumulating waves of societal developments. Unlike giants like Wright and Corbusier, Friedman sees no Procrustean bed to solve all problems, but discusses both the variety and specificity of design solutions to support the demands of emerging segments of the population. In *Planning the New Suburbia*, he directs his attention to the texture and components of planning communities.

The two books are similar in that one size does not fit all, whether for dwellings or dwelling areas. Design is an important tool but not the be all and end all at the expense of functionality for different kinds of people and in different settings.

Yet, these are two very different books. *Keyhole* is a smooth-as-silk tour through the residential transformations that most North Americans have undergone since the middle of the twentieth century, highlighting challenges to the conception of various aspects of housing. An opening chapter spotlights the social transformations, and the remaining chapters deal in turn with food and kitchens, main rooms and their new uses, building technology and renovation, the needs of children and seniors, housing areas and locations, and housing production and affordability.

The originality of the book lies in Friedman and David Krawitz's organization of trends and their housing implications. If the architectural profession needed this message, it has it now in a clear, highly readable

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

form. Interested non-professionals may find this a stimulating and enjoyable read.

Nonetheless, the specific information drawn upon is widely known within the social sciences and professions. The authors give a number of representative references and provide useful quotations; but they are generally weak in their attribution of specific information. It is hard to tell, for example, from what population or studies many statistics and insights are drawn. Chapters vary greatly in the extent that they are analytic or narrowly normative and prescriptive. Many statements are specific, while others are exaggerated (e.g., prevalence of telework), unfounded (e.g., description of Irvine, California), or downright vacuous (e.g., conclusion of chapter 4). The book does not direct sufficient attention to previous scholarly books with similar intent.

The shortcomings of *Keyhole*'s popular approach to housing are not in evidence in *New Suburbia*, which is carefully stated and tightly documented. Friedman draws on his ideas and work carried out in McGill's ateliers to provide and apply 'an outlook that can encompass existing as well as new communities.' In three opening chapters, Friedman sets a framework for subsequent specific applications. First, he provides an excellent historical overview of schemes dealing with comprehensive planning and zoning, from Owen and Scottish urban philanthropy through city beautiful and garden city movements to Duany and Plater-Zyberk and the New Urbanism. Then, in chapter 2, he provides background about the forces influencing the emergence of the often sprawling suburbs as we know them today. In chapter 3, he discusses a few planners who have provided theoretical models that, if developed more explicitly, hold the keys to a more flexible, integrated suburban structure containing a greater measure of urban amenities and efficiencies. Accompanying the clear, detailed points in these chapters are copious illustrations.

Friedman then provides his recipe for controlling change in suburban areas. Besides following or modifying relatively common steps in planning, he urges the creation of a design code for future development in specific areas that provides a spirit behind co-ordinated development, rather than minimum standards to be met (or avoided by legal means). Three kinds of community development problems are addressed, respectively, in chapters 4–6: updating older suburbs, creating new suburban communities, and building new communities in interstitial spaces within old urban settings. Each of these is examined with a case study of what could be done to an existing area in the Montreal region. Friedman calls this simulation.

The case studies (simulations) detail in explicit steps what might be done in Notre Dame de Grâce, La Prairie, and the Atwater Market area, in ways that satisfy various theoretical, social, efficiency, and aesthetic concerns. They showcase the original, practical thinking of Friedman and his associates and students. They provide richly illustrated evidence of the

typical workings of instructional method in planning and design studios. What they don't provide is confrontation with the real world processes of real estate development and political decision-making. Nor is it possible to view any evidence of what would occur in the lives of residents were these planning solutions actually to be implemented.

A concluding chapter brings the strands together, almost resembling a bridge to and from *Keyhole*.

It is rewarding intellectually to find Avi Friedman's seminal thinking arise in the distinct applications of these two books: flexibility and changeability in housing; integrating housing, non-residential land uses, and transportation considerations at the community and suburban scales. His thoughts are worth serious attention. (WILLIAM MICHELSON)

Laurie Meijer Drees. *The Indian Association of Alberta: A History of Political Action*
University of British Columbia Press. xxiv, 248. $85.00, $29.95

Laurie Meijer Drees has written a thorough and sophisticated account of the emergence of the Indian Association of Alberta (IAA) from 1939 through to the end of the 1960s. As she notes in her introduction, historians have not analysed how the nature and diversity of Aboriginal political thought have informed Aboriginal political action. In *The Indian Association of Alberta*, Meijer Drees takes on this task in the context of a detailed historical account of a single aboriginal political organization, and her results are illuminating.

The IAA came into existence in 1939 largely as a result of the efforts of several bands in Alberta concerned about social and economic conditions in their communities and the impact of the federal Indian Act and the Department of Indian Affairs on reserve life. The Indian Act at the time prohibited bands from hiring lawyers to initiate claims against the government, so band leaders forged alliances with off-reserve Aboriginal political organizations, such as the Métis Association of Alberta, and, intriguingly, non-Aboriginal political organizations, such as the United Farmers of Alberta. Many Aboriginal people in reserve communities were farmers and shared a community of interest with farmers living in remote areas of the province.

One such Aboriginal farmer was Johnny Calihoo, a band councillor living on the Michel reserve. Calihoo's political vision was local and practical in focus; he was interested in addressing specific community problems within the existing political and legal framework of the province. From the outset, Calihoo – and the IAA's other major founder, a Métis leader named Malcolm Norris – sought to provide a stable organizational forum for the various reserve based political organizations in the province to voice local concerns.

Meijer Drees reveals the complexity of the IAA's history by examining the subsequent influence of John Laurie, a non-Aboriginal Calgary high school

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

teacher concerned about the plight of Aboriginal people in the province. Laurie served as the secretary to the IAA, in the 1940s and 1950s, and assiduously worked to cultivate and deepen alliances between the IAA and non-Aboriginal citizen groups. Laurie saw the IAA as an organization that encouraged engagement between Aboriginal peoples and the Canadian state. Meijer Drees notes astutely that the coexistence of the sometimes competing visions of Laurie and many IAA members, who sought to affirm their treaty rights and a measure of political autonomy within Canada, produced a creative tension within the IAA and affected its historical trajectory as a political organization. This tension came to a head with the publication of the federal government's White Paper in 1969. In response, the IAA published a document that has become known as the 'Red Paper' (produced with assistance from Preston and Ernest Manning's consulting firm!) and launched Aboriginal politics firmly on a path towards autonomy.

Towards the end of *The Indian Association of Alberta*, Meijer Drees compares the political thought of Calihoo and John Tootoosis, Calihoo's counterpart and arch-rival in neighbouring Saskatchewan. It is in this chapter where Meijer Drees's overall historical method becomes clear. The disagreements between Calihoo and Tootoosis are extensive and complex, but Meijer Drees identifies the differing political philosophies of the two men as a major source of conflict. Whereas Calihoo was practical and forward looking, Tootoosis was deeply rooted in the historical experiences of his people and their treaty relationships with the Crown.

In teasing out the diverse and complex political visions of Aboriginal political leaders on the prairies, *The Indian Association of Alberta* unearths an important factor in the evolution of Aboriginal politics: the intellectual voices of Aboriginal people themselves. Calihoo's ideas and orientation participated in the production of what Meijer Drees calls 'a particular language of citizenship and sovereignty.' This language was not the only language of citizenship and sovereignty; others vied for attention, producing an unpredictable dynamic between thought and action in Aboriginal politics. Attending to the elusive contours of this dynamic makes *The Indian Association of Alberta* an important contribution to Aboriginal political history in Canada. (PATRICK MACKLEM)

Richard Ouzonian. *Stratford Gold: 50 Years, 50 Stars, 50 Conversations*
McArthur. 398. $29.95

Robert Cushman. *Fifty Seasons at Stratford*
McClelland and Stewart. 224. $60.00

The fiftieth anniversary of the Stratford Festival inspired three books in celebration. Martin Hunter's *Romancing the Bard* pre-empted the others and was reviewed here last year; Richard Ouzonian's *Stratford Gold* is based on a series of interviews for CBC television; and Robert Cushman's *Fifty Seasons* is

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

the Festival's official commemorative volume.

Stratford Gold is a bright idea that transfers imperfectly from television to print. There is a certain showbiz cuteness in having fifty interviews because it was the theatre's golden anniversary (and then including oneself as the final person interviewed); and several of the interlocutors – e.g., Andrea Martin, William Shatner – have been chosen more because they would be familiar to viewers than because they were very important at Stratford. On the other hand, some central figures are missing, most lamentably and mysteriously Douglas Campbell, a member of the very first production who was acting admirably as Falstaff in both parts of *Henry IV* during the anniversary season. Moreover, well-known actors such as Christopher Plummer and Bill Hutt are given significantly more space than either Michael Langham or Robin Phillips, the Festival's most brilliant and influential artistic directors. The series is entertaining, occasionally illuminating, and obviously excellent publicity, but as a view of Stratford it is simplified and skewed for the television audience, and without their glamorous visuals the words seem flat.

Cushman's book is quite a different matter. To chronicle the more than 450 productions in Stratford's first fifty years is a staggeringly difficult undertaking, and I do not see how it could possibly have been done better. To start with, *Fifty Seasons* is visually a delight, with more than 250 illustrations, most of them in full colour. After Timothy Findley's foreword about early days in the tent and a short preface, the book is divided into eight sections following the tenure of the eight artistic directors that Stratford has had so far: Tyrone Guthrie, Michael Langham, Jean Gascon, Robin Phillips, John Hirsch, John Neville, David William, and the current incumbent, Richard Monette, the only one, so far, to have risen through the ranks. Cushman characterizes each of these directors but focuses not on personalities but on productions, performances, and administrative achievements in each era. This could easily have degenerated to a dull chronological list of names, overwhelming detail, and snap judgments, but flexibility and variety are achieved by arranging each chapter around several directors and actors – what shows the artistic director took personal responsibility for (with Robin Phillips doing a mind-boggling number himself, nearly always brilliantly); what other directors were brought in or, more frequently in later years, developed from the acting company itself; and what actors emerged during a particular period and what their main performances were. There are colour photographs of all the major productions, and every ten pages or so lavishly illustrated two-page spreads cover what Cushman calls the 'backstage cottage-industry' aspects of Stratford: the great tent and the Moiseiwitch stage, Robert Fairfield's astonishingly innovative building, the Avon theatre, early musical and film festivals, the Third Stage (now known as the Tom Patterson theatre), school visits, touring abroad, costume, wigs and makeup, armour, crowns, props,

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

etc; with similar special spreads for Bill Hutt and Martha Henry and for Brian MacDonald's groundbreaking production of *The Mikado*. And comments by the performers themselves are featured in frequent sidebars, many of them borrowed from the series that became *Stratford Gold*.

Inevitably, no one can expect always to agree with Cushman's judgments, and occasionally a section may seem a little bitsy; but Cushman is adept at varying his pace and can catch the essence of a particular performance with sharp and witty phrasing – Paul Scofield's 'haggard, crack-voice distinction' as Coriolanus, for example, or the 'taut, flexible, viola voice' of Hutt. Quite rightly, Cushman insists on Richard Monette's solid virtues as actor, director, and administrator, but *Fifty Seasons*, despite its official backing, has no trace of the wish-to-please that occasionally mars the other two books. Cushman can be quite critical of some programming decisions and productions, though he is always gentle with individual performers.

Fifty Seasons concludes with a protest against shabby treatment of the Stratford Festival in the recent *Oxford Companion to Shakespeare* (by an Ottawa academic, no less) and ringingly restates the great theatre's importance: 'For what it has achieved, for what it has engendered, and for what it has provoked, the Stratford Festival is the best thing ever to have happened to the Canadian theatre.' *Fifty Seasons* is both a valuable record and a thoroughly delightful entertainment. Every Canadian library and all Stratford habituees will want to own it. (BRIAN PARKER)

Diana Brydon and Irena R. Makaryk, editors. *Shakespeare in Canada: 'A World Elsewhere?*
University of Toronto Press. xii, 490. $65.00

Irena Makaryk's introduction to this excellent collection traces Canadian Shakespeare productions back to eighteenth-century garrison troupes. Makaryk examines the impact of the Massey Commission's call for a national theatre, discusses the hegemony of the Stratford Festival, and concludes, upon surveying the 'most common way of presenting Shakespeare in Canada: ... under a tent or in the park,' that 'the underlying message of most [summer] productions is that the plays are boring and therefore require gimmicks.'

To me the most powerful essays are Anthony Dawson's and Alexander Leggatt's. Dawson explores an impasse: while recent academic Shakespeare criticism deplores reducing plays to 'character,' for the actors and directors whom Dawson interviewed it is 'an unquestioned truth that what the actor does is create character.' While academic criticism scoffs at the notion that Shakespeare is timeless and taps into a 'human nature' transcending culture, actors and directors serenely accept Shakespeare's timelessness and

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

penetrating insight into human nature. In an even-handed attempt to mediate between conflicting camps, Dawson assesses the strengths and shortcomings of *both* views. Leggatt, venturing that in a country where 'the greatest fear is that the strains of diversity will tear us apart ... the enemy is decisiveness,' compares legendary Canadian indecision (exemplified in Mackenzie King's 'genius in refusing decisions') with that 'classic defence of indecisiveness in art,' Keats's negative capability, and aligns Canadian indecision with Shakespeare's famous 'refusal to take sides.' Extending this wonderful cultural insight, Leggatt offers a brilliant reading of *Cymbeline*. (Through such a lens, Dawson's generous refusal to take sides looks quintessentially Canadian.)

The essays do not flinch at acknowledging that Shakespeare's presence has sometimes been baleful. According to Marta Stroznicky, that this English writer has been assumed to be 'unproblematically part of Canada's cultural heritage' rebuffs the nation's other ethnicities. The Massey Report's 'vehemence concerning the classics' and the 'favouring of Shakespeare at the Stratford Festival' have, suggests Margaret Groome, undermined efforts to foster Canadian playwriting.

Stratford takes a pounding in this collection, for its 'automatic equation of quality with lushness and spectacle,' its treating Shakespeare 'as an antique ... [with] little relevance to present problems'; for being dominated by foreign directors and actors, for 'enshrining Canada's colonial dependence,' for being a 'consumerist, philistine festival.' As C.E. McGee notes, while 'a rhetoric of Canadian nationalism had been deployed from the very outset of the Stratford festival project in order to obtain the moral, political, and financial support necessary for the undertaking,' director Tyrone Guthrie soon gave up on distinctively Canadian productions.

The collection has a few blind spots. As Diana Brydon concedes, it neglects the teaching of Shakespeare. When discussing the desire for a national theatre, no one asks, why *theatre*? Why no call for a national novel or epic? The collection is heavily oriented towards the eastern half of Canada – seven contributors hail from the prairie provinces and British Columbia, twenty from Ontario/Quebec/the Maritimes. There are no Alberta contributors, and one of the few mentions of Alberta is of a racist - Klondike Days Melodrama in 1974 – sad neglect, for a province with a vigorous Shakespearean theatre scene and a strong contingent of Shakespeare scholars, including John Orrell, whose international renown (in locating the site of the original Globe Theatre and helping to found the new Globe) gets no mention. The book is much stronger on performance history than on scholarship and criticism, the latter going little beyond Frye.

But the collection brims with good stuff: Marta Straznicky on CBC radio Shakespeare; Karen Bamford on the Shakespeare Society of Toronto; Heather Murray on Henry Scadding's Shakespeareana exhibits; Jessica Schagerl on Stratford productions of *Hamlet*; Leonore Lieblein on franco-

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

phone Quebec; Peter Ayers on Newfoundland; Paul Yachnin and Brent Whitted on 'Canadian Bacon' (anti-Stratfordianism); Michael McKinnie on a 1995 *King Lear* whose cross-gender casting got entangled with affirmative action in Ontario. Daniel Fischlin, Mark Fortier, Lois Sherlow, and Ric Knowles discuss adaptations, beginning with *Shakespere's Skull and Falstaff's Nose* (1889) and proceeding through *Cruel Tears* (Humphrey and the Dumptrucks); Djanet Sears's *Harlem Duet*; a pidgin-English *MacBed*; *Hamlet, Prince du Québec*; *Goodnight Desdemona (Good Morning Juliet)*; *Mad Boy Chronicle* (*Hamlet*); *Cloning Miranda.*

This valuable book is a tribute to Canadian inventiveness. Canadians have taken an oppressive imperial author and located (with that fruitful Canadian/Shakespearean indecisiveness) delightful middle ground between worshiping him and throwing him overboard. (LINDA WOODBRIDGE)

Brent Bryon Watson. *Far Eastern Tour: The Canadian Infantry in Korea 1950–53*
McGill Queen's University Press. xvi, 238. $34.95

It is not uncommon for historians to lament the status of the Korean War in popular memory as the 'forgotten war.' After all, historians are in the memory business, and few conflicts as large and significant in world-historical terms as the Korean War have escaped the scrutiny of historians, whether abroad or in Canada. As Brent Bryon Watson argues, the Canadian military failed to learn the lessons of Korea, lessons that in the opinion of the author may have helped avoid the more recent 'difficulties' in Somalia. In this sense, *Far Eastern Tour* is designed to serve as an institutional memory for the military. Yet its appeal is far broader. Based on interviews with veterans, recently declassified documents, and research trips to Korea, *Far Eastern Tour* is a lively read that avoids grand military strategy or top-level decision-making to focus on the lowly infantrymen – the grunts that did the fighting.

It is not a happy story. *Far Eastern Tour*, unlike earlier research on the Canadian participation in the Korean War, does not revel in wartime spirit or victory. There are no accounts of the Montreal versus Toronto rivalry over which city could produce the most recruits. Nor are the deservingly lauded Canadian victories on hills such as Kap'yong given much attention. There is little to celebrate in this account. As the author himself admits, he was 'troubled by what seemed at times to be an endless catalogue of criticisms,' yet the realities of the soldier on the frontlines of Korea offer few other conclusions.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Indeed, as Watson is careful to point out, life as an infantryman is always one of hardship and drudgery punctuated by intense moments of battle. Korea was no different. But taking up the vantage point of the troops fighting in the hills of Korea, Watson argues that the Canadian leadership, both political and military, left the Canadian troops unprepared for the war, making the infantrymen's experiences 'far more difficult and unpleasant that they need have been.' Watson amply discusses these insufficiencies, showing how, even at the early point of recruitment, pressure to fill the roles quickly led normal vetting procedures to be abandoned, such that in one case even a man with a wooden leg was not turned away. Troops were suited in winter clothing with nylon shells that when rubbed together made loud noise, hardly amenable to the style of stealth patrol fighting at night that characterized much of the combat in the last two years of the war. Training had been designed for the European theatre, leaving the infantrymen, whether individually or collectively, without the proper preparation for the static, hill warfare. But perhaps most incredibly, the high command failed to provide appropriate weapons, leaving soldiers with rifles and hand grenades ill suited to the style of battle in Korea.

Watson explains how the lack of preparation extended into the Canadian army's incapability 'of attending to the needs of its men.' Making comparisons to other allied troops, in particular the Americans and British, Watson shows how in matters as simple as writing paper, food, and bivouac equipment the Canadian soldiers endured unnecessarily primitive conditions. Even medical precautions were insufficient. Efforts to contain venereal disease were minimal, leading Canadian soldiers to have a rate of infection unprecedented in Canadian military history, reaching a height of 611 infections per thousand. Fully 70 per cent of non-battle casualties fell into this category, proof of what one soldier described as a typical feeling among the troops, 'Why fight? ... drink and fuck instead.'

What was the upshot of this lack of training, ill-suited supplies, and lack of attention? In his answer to this question, Watson separates himself from most other authors on this subject, concluding that 'The Canadians did not perform particularly well in Korea.' Or more strongly, 'The reality was that Canadian patrols were routinely outgunned and outfought by a highly capable Chinese enemy.' Such observations are offered by the author in the spirit of constructive criticism, yet his rich account leaves a dismal impression of this particular moment in Canadian military history. (ANDRE SCHMID)

Jamie Glazov. *Canadian Policy toward Khrushchev's Soviet Union*
McGill-Queen's University Press. xxii, 252. $ 75.00

Canadian Policy toward Khrushchev's Soviet Union is the first study to detail Canada's Soviet policy in the immediate post-Stalin era, from 1953 to 1964.

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Jamie Glazov argues that Canada's policy was unique because it served to contain as well as to accommodate the Soviet Union. According to him, Canada wished to serve as an intermediary in the East-West conflict because its policy-makers, primarily Lester B. Pearson, believed that any kind of moderation within the Soviet Union would lead to its fragmentation and eventual collapse. In this connection, Glazov states that accommodation was a proactive policy devised and pursued by the St Laurent government and later obscured by the Diefenbaker government. In his opinion, the consequences of Gorbachev's reforms 'vindicated' Canada's Soviet policy, and therefore, the St Laurent government should be recognized for the important role its Soviet policy played in helping to win the Cold War.

By relying almost exclusively upon Canadian archival sources, Glazov fails to demonstrate how Canada's Soviet policy affected international relations, let alone the extent to which it helped win the Cold War. Although the Canadian documents reveal a fascinating story about the evolution of Canada's unique Soviet policy, they do not tell us a lot about the way in which the two superpowers waged the Cold War. It should be noted that Glazov uses some recently declassified Russian documents published in various collections, but his use of these sources is slight. Placing Canada at the centre of the debate is original and has the potential to provide a new and insightful way of looking at Cold War diplomacy, but Glazov's one-sided approach is unconvincing because of his failure to contextualize Canada's Soviet policy.

On the other hand, Glazov's study is valuable because it brings together information from a variety of definitive secondary sources pertaining to the St Laurent and Diefenbaker governments. He praises the St Laurent government for its innovative Cold War approach and shows how Diefenbaker damaged Canada's Soviet policy by following an inconsistent line that teetered between anti-communism and anti-Americanism.

Glazov's work is detailed and illuminating, but it is also repetitive. His awkward writing style tends to make his argument unclear. Better organization and more clarification would have led to a more coherent argument. Better editing would have helped as well. The book is laden with typos, it is not consistent when it comes to abbreviations, Russian newspapers used in the study have not been included in the bibliography, and the endnotes for the entire introduction have been left out. Furthermore, a number of the quotations do not coincide with their respective endnotes. Taken together, these problems detract from the quality of the study.

Canadian Policy toward Khrushchev's Soviet Union should be used as a starting point for historians studying this period in Canadian foreign policy. Although Glazov shows the evolution of Canada's Soviet policy, historians must expand on his work so as to put it into an international context. Canadian policy-makers viewed the policy of containment as restrictive and provocative and therefore believed that communication would lead to a

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

thaw in Cold War tensions. This explains why Pearson was the first NATO foreign minister to visit the Soviet Union and why Canada granted the USSR Most Favoured Nation status as early as 1955. Glazov's book leaves readers to ponder what might have happened if the Liberal policy of accommodation had not been distorted by Diefenbaker's incompetence. The St Laurent government and its chief mediator, Lester B. Pearson, played a critical role in the Suez Crisis in 1956 by demonstrating the significant impact a middle power could have on an international crisis. Further research may reveal the potential role Canada may have played in mediating and perhaps even ending the Cold War. Until this research is done, Canada cannot be given much credit for helping to win this war. (STACEY ZEMBRZYCKI)

Linda Ghan. *Gaston Petit – The Kimono and the Cross: Interview with an Artist in Japan*
Signature Editions. 142. $22.95

The fruit of one Canadian expatriate's fascination with another, this book consists of a constructed interview by Linda Ghan, author and current head of the Canadian Studies program at Japan's Ibaraki University, with artist Gaston Petit, born (1930) and raised in Shawinigan, Quebec, and ordained a Dominican priest in 1959. Petit has pursued his dual career as priest and artist in Tokyo since 1961, although world travel and extended stays in Quebec have also been part of his life pattern. Dealing as it does with cross-cultural experiences, *The Kimono and the Cross* fits well within Signature Editions' interests.

The literary interview as a genre for exploring personalities and ideas depends on the ability of the interviewer and subject to engage one another. There is no indication how Ghan and Petit came to make one another's acquaintance, but there is a rapport, the product of which is enhanced by Ghan's evident skill in shaping – distilling, editing, resequencing, and structuring – the varied exchanges (over two years) into a cogent form. Topics of discussion are diverse, encompassing (among others) Petit's childhood and family, friendships, collecting activities, philosophies, aesthetics, world religions, and cultural productions. There is some inevitable overlapping from chapter to chapter, but the unifying thread is his art.

While Ghan at times certainly asserts her presence, the stage by and large is left to Petit. His responses are often lengthy, expository here, anecdotal there (he is an engaging raconteur), often insightful and almost always revealing. One gets a good sense of Petit's integration of theology and aesthetics, of his understanding of the creative process, of the impact of Japanese aesthetics and sensibilities on his work. Ghan's willingness to let

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Petit expound, however, results in statements that some readers will find contentious. For example, Petit rejects the 'installation,' as an invalid form of 'art,' He is similarly dismissive of social and political issues of marginalization ('artists of colour, women artists, AIDS') and the artists that embrace them. Such perspectives beg for critical probing. In this and several other instances, the book fascinates almost as much for what it does not address as for what it does.

Petit's career as an artist – teaching, commissions, exhibitions, and collections – has been played out mainly in Japan (Quebec and Paris are satellite sites). In Canada he is perhaps best appreciated for his role as a cultural ambassador in Japanese/Canadian ventures in the visual arts. At one point in the interview, Ghan promises Petit that a discussion about the Canadian influences in his work will take place, but, alas, no such exchange materializes. Ghan does include a final section that comprises colour reproductions of a representative selection of Petit's art (his oeuvre – prints, paintings, mixed media, sculpture, stained glass – is inspired by a wide range of cultural currents, among them Eastern, Western, modernist and traditional, embracing both abstract and figurative imagery). However, although discursive references are made in the interview to works reproduced in this pictorial essay, no figure numbers (or index) are provided to negotiate between text and image. There is also an unfortunate lack of sharpness to the reproductions; in too many cases the texture of the medium – a significant aspect of the artist's approach to his material – has been neutralized. But the images are sufficient to pique one's curiosity. For instance, how might Petit, with his incorporation into his work of cultural symbols of Japan (the kimono, for example), see himself in relation to the work of contemporary Japanese artist Yasumasa Morimura, who plays with Western imagery?

Suitable for a broad readership, *The Kimono and the Cross* nevertheless will be considered by art historians as a welcome complement to Guy Robert's monograph (*Petit: Gaston Petit en mission itinérante dans l'art*, 1990), and as well to the essay by Paul-Henri Girard, OP ('Exposition de Gaston Petit, OP: L'œuvre au religieux,' www.spiritualite2000.com/Archives/Arts/2002/Petit/girard1.html). The book offers a window, at once fascinating and questioning, into a rich life and an exceptionally diverse oeuvre. (ARLENE GEHMACHER)

JoAnn McCaig. *Reading In: Alice Munro's Archives*
Wilfrid Laurier University Press. xvi, 194. $24.95

Reading In is a highly self-conscious book, and not merely because it originated as a doctoral thesis. It scrupulously and metacritically monitors McCaig's own construction and analysis of Alice Munro's papers,

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

paralleling the work of Munro and her archivists in creating this legible fiction that is 'Alice Munro.' As with any archive, its gaps and omissions raise lively questions, all of which McCaig asks, but the potential gossipy pseudo-biographical project is swept aside in favour of a much more rigorous socio-historical analysis of the many factors that combine to help situate (in fact, create) Alice Munro as a 'Canadian' 'Woman' 'Short Story' 'Writer.'

But *Reading In* is also an interesting artifact in that Munro is the void at the book's core. McCaig must also 'read in' the missing author, since Munro withheld her permission to quote from the very archives that form the basis of analysis. While this would certainly have been the death of any other kind of reading, it is a coup de grace for this one; the book thereby performs its subject matter. As Munro is 'an active but not sovereign protagonist' in the production of her 'author function,' so her 'sovereign' gesture of withholding permission simply removes any residual temptation McCaig might have had to retain her as coauthor, in a sense, of this project. (To say that there is ample Munro material available in published form for McCaig to quote from is to belie my argument that her project does not depend on it; the project doesn't, but perhaps some of McCaig's readers might, so I offer this point to them.)

Comparing McCaig's book chapter focusing on the 'gender' strand of the author formation web ('Woman') with her essay published in the ECW collection *The Rest of the Story* (for which permission to quote from the Alice Munro papers *had* been received from both Munro and her American agent, Virginia Barber) becomes an interesting exercise in what might have been, with permission, and what is, without it. (Presumably, McCaig's doctoral thesis would also be.) The anecdotal evidence from the archives that scrupulously supports every one of the scholar's interpretive statements about those papers in the essay makes for animated reading. But it is actually Virginia Barber who is summoned into textual being through quotation from her letters to Munro rather than the other way around, and while the centrality of Barber's role in Munro's career, and in McCaig's own reading of gender/genre/nationality/class, is unquestionable, the book does not suffer from this loss of characterization.

More interesting are the 'gaps and omissions' that appear in the transition between essay to book that do *not* appear to depend on supporting statements from the Munro papers (and therefore could have survived republication), giving rise to speculation as to why those particular statements were edited out. In this sense, McCaig's own endeavours resemble the archives (edited for reasons equally unknowable) and fuel my own desire to 'read in' to McCaig's threatened project. For instance, in the essay, McCaig is able to state: 'For [Munro], the prospect of foreign sales and possibly the economic problems of leaving her marriage eventually tipped the scales in Barber's favour [as her prospective agent].' Is this a statement

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

that exceeds the critic's now legally circumscribed bounds? A more qualified version of it could surely have passed muster. Is it this kind of statement that Munro criticizes (and McCaig's prefatory material cites) as one of the 'bizarre assumptions' of the essay? To pursue this angle is to wish for the pseudo-biographical rather than the academic and, despite Munro's apparent fears, this is not what McCaig's book is about.

'Alice Munro' as she is (de)constructed by McCaig's reading is no less authoritative for being literally a product – of her times, her gender, her nationality, her mentors, her marketing, her generic 'habitus,' her class and class-consciousness, her ambivalence about being a product, and so on. McCaig doesn't venerate or denigrate; she analyses intelligently, and her scope is truly masterful. If the archives exist to be read, it is this kind of reading that serves them best. (CASIE HERMANSSON)

James Patten and Diana Nemiroff. *Gerald Ferguson: Recent Paintings*
Winnipeg Art Gallery. 136. $20.00

In 1999, accomplished writer, teacher, and artist Gerald Ferguson began producing a series of large abstract paintings. As an artist who came to prominence in the late 1960s through his thoughtful and systematic experiments in minimalism and conceptualism, large-scale abstraction with touches of expressive flourish may seem like an odd turn – not odd in a sad way like Frank Stella's 'late style' of neon and glitter in the late 1980s, but odd nonetheless. However, Ferguson's primary medium has always been painting, even when he is interrogating it, demystifying it, and questioning its exalted place in commodity culture. The recent series was created by a process called frottage or rubbing in which Ferguson arranged various hardware store materials (clothesline, rods, hoses, rope) beneath his canvas and then ran a blackened paint roller over top.

Gerald Ferguson: Recent Paintings accompanied an exhibition of forty of these paintings organized by former Winnipeg Art Gallery curator James Patten. The catalogue does not so much fill a lacuna, as Ferguson has been blessed with several serious, if small, catalogues befitting his equally serious and engaging experiments with painting and its history. However, this catalogue offers a particularly lucid and accessible pair of essays, a complete set of decent reproductions of the paintings in the exhibition, and five illustrations of important examples of Ferguson's earlier paint and installation art.

Patten's essay, 'Like Painting,' is remarkable for avoiding the usual pitfall of heavy jargon that befalls those writing about conceptually based art. His primary concern is with the intricate and experimental process Ferguson used to produce the frottage paintings, thereby mirroring Ferguson's own priorities. Rather than simply pointing to Ferguson's painterly and critical

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

innovation of frottage and then proceeding with his own analysis, Patten patiently walks the reader through Ferguson's (rather obsessive) efforts to find materials with the properties he desires and to adjust them to meet his purposes by cutting and arranging them. In conveying, and then exhibiting, the physical and intellectual struggle of Ferguson's trial and error, Patten powerfully demonstrates, rather than alludes to, Ferguson's commitment to reveal painting as a practical medium full of life and deconstructionist potential. When, at the end of the essay, he addresses the way frottage complicates the already fraught relationship between the real and its referents, the analysis seems firmly grounded in the work.

The second and slightly longer essay, 'Late Style in the Work of Gerald Ferguson,' is by National Gallery curator Diana Nemiroff and was previously published in the *Journal of Canadian Art History*. Nemiroff sets out to consider the notion of a 'late style' and its theoretical problematics. However, in this context, her essay serves primarily as a counterpoint to Patten's. Nemiroff traces the long span of Ferguson's career and the larger artistic and social milieu in which he has functioned, stopping at precisely the historical moment in 1999 where Patten begins. Nemiroff's essay also ensures that the larger catalogue can function as both a comprehensive primer on Ferguson and a scholarly consideration of his recent practice.

If the texts fall short on any front, it is in offering a sense of Ferguson's place in wider current art practices. From art historical literature, it would seem this is a common problem in the consideration of senior artists. While it is most probably unintentional, the authors impart the sense that Ferguson responded extensively to external conditions and other artists when he rose to prominence in the late 1960s and even through the 1980s but that now he responds primarily to himself and to his own practice. Catalogues are not the obvious place for comparative criticism, but a notable absence in these discussions is another senior Canadian artist, Betty Goodwin, whose prints of clothing may not follow exactly the same method (stamping rather than frottage, print rather than paint) but whose process is not far off and produces a remarkably similar aesthetic. Moreover, taken together, a more nuanced discussion of the relations between the 'real' and the 'representation' might be possible. (SARAH PARSONS)

Margaret Atwood. *Negotiating with the Dead: A Writer on Writing*
Cambridge University Press. xxvii, 219. US $18.00

Based on her Empson Lectures for 2000, *Negotiating with the Dead* is Margaret Atwood's most recent collection of essays; it is also her most personal. With a glance at biography – there have been two recent biographies – she offers readers her most autobiographical narrative to date, which makes sense, given the topic of the lectures and this volume. At their

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

best, these six chapters, each one a meditation on the act of writing (or reading), display the irony and incisive wit that I find in *Second Words* or *Strange Things*. They also reveal a good deal about Margaret Atwood, the writer.

In revising her lectures for book form, Atwood has provided a number of relevant prefacing quotations from a wide range of writers who constitute her own great tradition; each one of these passages, like the works considered in each chapter, serves to enrich the points she makes about the writing life – its discipline, loneliness, rewards, dangers, and seductions. Writing, she argues in the title trope of the volume, is a negotiation with the dead, with writers who have gone before, and with figures (real ancestors, deep-seated fears, powerful images) who tempt and haunt our imaginations. To undertake this negotiation, the writer must enter the labyrinth, descend into the dark underworld to learn the secrets of the dead, and return, if possible, to tell us what they have found.

Atwood describes the writer as powerful but elusive. In her second chapter, she situates contemporary writers in a postromantic tradition of slippery doubles, split consciousness, and duplicity, all adjectives that describe Atwood-as-writer and that highlight a central theme and trope in her work since she first began to publish: remember *Double Persephone* and the 'violent duality' of Susannah Moodie? However, much as I enjoyed the second chapter, it is the final chapter that I found the most moving. In 'Descent: Negotiating with the Dead, *Who makes the trip to the Underworld, and why?*' Atwood claims that writing 'is motivated, deep down, by a fear of and a fascination with mortality,' that it is 'a reaction to the fear of death.' When she asks why writing, of all the arts, should be thus motivated, her answer is prompt and precise: 'it survives its own performance.' To prove her point she cites some familiar sources, from Hamlet's father to Rilke's *Sonnets to Orpheus,* from Odysseus to Ondaatje's *Anil's Ghost*, which demonstrate the seductive, irresistible desire to bring the dead back to life so we can hear their stories and write them down for posterity. Only by such writing down can the stories and the tellers defeat the silence of the grave. Lowry knew this very well, and *Under the Volcano* is based on that premise, but Atwood does not cite Lowry. Instead she turns to a minor Canadian poem – 'In Flanders Fields' – and her reading of its simple-seeming lines transforms it, makes me see and hear it anew.

So what, or who, is the writer? Atwood's answer is multifaceted, but some characteristics recur. She is, inevitably, a negotiator – with the dead, yes, but also with the living: publishers, editors, readers, reviewers, critics, fans. And she is a double. Writers, Atwood warns us, are not the actual people who sit across from us at the dinner table, who shop, bank, or walk the dog. No, writers are those other selves, those powerful, risk-taking doubles who, like Alice, slip through the looking-glass into another world where the act of writing takes place. If you try to seize them or make them

stay put they simply elude you. My best advice, after reading these essays, is to sit back and accept the gambit. Stop trying to pin writers to real people and let them lead you into realms where 'both writer and reader have all the time not in the world.' (SHERRILL GRACE)

Nancy Huston. *Losing North: Musings on Land, Tongue and Self*
McArthur and Company. 96. $19.95

'Dictionaries,' Nancy Huston says, 'confuse us, they lead us astray, they plunge us into that frightening magma *between languages*, in which words lose their meanings, refuse to mean, start out meaning one thing and end up meaning quite another.' In English, for example, the title of this collection of essays, *Losing North*, suggests the country, Canada – 'the North, the Great North, the True North Strong and Free' – that Huston lost, and feels she betrayed, after moving to France more than a quarter-century ago. In French, however, 'losing north' means 'forgetting what you were going to say. *Losing track of what's going on. Losing your marbles.* It is something you should avoid at all costs.' Paradoxically, when Huston loses her marbles – for instance, by 'letting off steam, freaking out, swearing, singing, yelling, surfing on the pure pleasure of verbal delirium' – she does so in her lost tongue, her first tongue, English, which, like the piano of her childhood, she regards as a motherly instrument, 'emotional, romantic, manipulative, sentimental and crude.' When she moved to Paris from Calgary in 1973, Huston abandoned the piano for French and the harpsichord, 'neutral, intellectual instruments. They require control, restraint and delicate mastery; their expressivity is infinitely more subtle, discreet and refined.' In retrospect, then, 'What I was running away from when I turned my back on English and the piano seems quite clear.'

If, in 1973, Huston was running away from the 'carmine lipstick and heavy Mexican silver-and-turquoise earrings' Alberta of her youth in favour of the sophistications of French literary theory and a master's thesis in semiology written under the supervision of Roland Barthes, what she has discovered by 1998, when these essays were written, is that expatriation is loss. The entries in this collection are compelling 'musings' on exile-as-loss and as being-split-in-two. The book is a rich meditation on memory and forgetting. It offers a subtle analysis of Huston's voluntary expatriation as a life 'involved in *theatre, imitation, make-believe.'* And not the least, *Losing North* is a convincing argument as to 'the absolutely unique nature of childhood.' No expatriate can be oblivious to the fact that, for all her losses and as a measure of them, childhood 'never leaves you.' It is her childhood language that renders Huston's adult bilingualism 'false' or asymmetrical. 'The words say it well: your native or "mother" tongue, the one you acquired in earliest childhood, enfolds and envelops you so that *you* belong to

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

it, whereas with the "adopted" tongue, it's the other way around – you're the one who needs to mother it, master it, and make *it* belong to *you*.' That being said, when Huston returns to childhood people and places, she realizes that she speaks with a foreign accent. Her book is a fascinating study of this frightening *between*. (DAWNE MCCANCE)

Judith Nasby. *Irene Avaalaaqiaq: Myth and Reality*
McGill-Queen's University and University of Washington Presses.
xi, 130. $32.95

This handsome book serves as a retrospective catalogue and celebratory tribute to Irene Avaalaaqiaq, renowned Inuit printmaker, carver, and needlewoman of Baker Lake, Nunavut. Although an accomplished artist in several media, Avaalaaqiaq is best known for her colourful wall hangings created from stroud, a lightweight wool fabric embellished with embroidery floss. Judith Nasby, director of the Macdonald Stewart Art Centre in Guelph, Ontario, skilfully interleaves information germane to situating Avaalaaqiaq's visual and verbal narratives within relevant cultural and historical contexts.

Irene Avaalaaqiaq was born sometime after the mid-1930s on the north shore of Tebesjuak Lake, about one hundred kilometres west of Baker Lake. Inuit residing in that region are often referred to as the Caribou Inuit of the Barren Grounds. Avaalaaqiaq was raised on the land by her widowed grandmother, since her parents had died during her early childhood. Her grandmother was a successful hunter and prolific storyteller, and inspired a love of Inuit legends and mythology in her granddaughter. Avaalaaqiaq's art works are informed by these richly evocative narratives, illustrating an epoch when humans and animals communicated with each other and even experienced co-transformation. Other facets of her past life also appear, imagery that evokes memories of fear, hunger, isolation, and animal/human interactions.

The artist's grandmother passed away during a time of great hardship in the North. By the mid-1950s, news of widespread starvation prompted the federal government to establish social services in Baker Lake and other Arctic communities. Many Inuit relocated to the settlements, and government-sponsored co-operatives encouraged the production of soapstone carvings, followed by printmaking and other media. By the 1970s Avaalaaqiaq had married and was raising nine children, including two adoptees. She became an active member of the Sanavik co-operative established by Jack Butler and Sheila Butler. Hallmarks of her 'style,' especially in her stroud pieces, incorporate quasi-abstract shapes often rendered in brilliant contrasting colours. The figure-ground oscillations that occur within the animated borders create remarkable visual effects. Her coloured pencil

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

drawings of human-animal metamorphoses provide a delicate contrast to the powerful transformative forms dramatized in her stroud wall-hangings. A prolific artist, Avaalaaqiaq has received many commissions from numerous Canadian and foreign institutions. She is a significant provider for a large extended family.

The book contains dozens of colourful illustrations highlighting Avaalaaqiaq's prolific creativity, and also featuring family, friends, and the community of Baker Lake. Black and white photographs depict historical scenes of Inuit life on the land. Three useful appendices conclude the volume. Appendix 1 contains descriptions of the colour plates; several entries include Avaalaaqiaq's explanation of the subjects. Appendix 2 lists her exhibitions and honours. Appendix 3 incorporates the address she gave at the University of Guelph in 1999, when she was awarded an honorary Doctor of Laws. Other helpful sections include a list of Inuit individuals who are mentioned in her narratives, a map, and an excellent bibliography.

Although Judith Nasby has incorporated a number of photographs depicting contemporary life in Baker Lake, including a recent picture of the artist dressed in her hunting attire astride her skidoo, the present remains conspicuously absent from Avaalaaqiaq's art work. Regardless of the medium of expression, Avaalaaqiaq's creations engender a richly evocative *past*. As she herself attests, 'I try to keep our culture alive through my art.' Her art serves as a significant tribute to her grandmother and represents great effort and willingness to transmit her cultural heritage. Although raised on the land, Avaalaaqiaq has experienced first hand the dramatic changes wrought by Christianity and the post–Second World War intensification of a cash economy, formal education, mass communication, and settlement life. However, the reality registered in the high-quality photographs and insightful text that portray her current life differs markedly from her art work. Thus the book's title, *Myth and Reality,* aptly reflects the subject matter. (KATHY M'CLOSKEY)

bpNichol. *Meanwhile: The Critical Writings of bpNichol*. Edited by Roy Miki
Talonbooks. 496. $34.95

bpNichol. *Comics*. Edited by Carl Peters
Talonbooks. 319. $29.95

Since his untimely death in 1988, the poet bp (Barrie Phillip) Nichol has become something of a cult figure: there is now a website devoted to his work, and his long collage poem *The Martyrology*, begun in 1972 and completed with the posthumous publications of its last three books in the early 1990s, is taught in courses at most Canadian universities. Even the role of numerology in his life has mythic overtones: he began writing when

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

he was twenty-two and died on the eve of his forty-fourth birthday in 1988. As one of the Four Horsemen, the Toronto sound poetry group he founded in the 1970s, as well as a leading 'post-concrete' poet, Nichol was at the cutting edge of avant-garde activity. Yet although some of the early concrete poetry appeared in international anthologies, the rest of his work never quite caught on outside Canada. There are, for example, no American or British editions of any of his poetry books.

Why should this be the case? Roy Miki's excellent collection of Nichol's critical writings – essays, reviews, letters to editors, many of them unpublished, as well as extracts from about a dozen interviews – inadvertently provides us with a clue. Nichol was, one might say, a 'natural' avant-gardist; he loved to experiment with sound, syntax, pun, and the 'defamiliarization' of the language, but there seems to be no particular perspective or rigorous aesthetic behind these varied and engaging exercises.

From the late 1960s to the time of his death, Nichol was closely associated with that other great Canadian avant-gardist and fellow Horseman, Steve McCaffery. Both experimented with sound and visual poetics as well as with hybrid literary forms like comic books. In 1973, they founded the Toronto Research Group (TRG), whose reports, many of them published in *Open Letter*, are reproduced in the McCaffery-Nichol collection *Rational Geomancy: The Kids of the Book-Machine*, edited for Talonbooks by McCaffery in 1992. Nichol may well have contributed much of the practical criticism and artwork found in this volume, but it is McCaffery who is the theorist of the TRG. Research Report 2, 'Narrative,' for example, with its fascinating discussion of optical significance (or lack thereof) in various poetries, has already become something of a classic.

Those accustomed to the intellectual rigor of the McCaffery-Nichol TRG may accordingly be disappointed by Nichol's own essays and interviews. Asked by Nicette Jukelevics to define the difference between poetry and prose – a subject much debated in *Rational Geomancy* –Nichol talks of the 'terminal points' provided by the left and right margins in poetry and adds, 'Then there are things like rhythm, intensity of image and so on. And then you get into the long poem. Now the long poem is very close to prose and very close to story. One tends to think of poetry as imagistic and prose as story, but I think those terms are arbitrary. And on the next page, he defines 'concrete' as based on 'sound' – a supposition that gives the reader no sense as to how the visual is in fact related to the aural.

Still, there are some excellent essays in the volume. The hitherto unpublished 'Sound and the Lung Wave' (1973) begins with a discussion of the basic human fear of intense vowel sound, as epitomized by the cry of wolves. Nichol longs to revive the oral aspect of poetry; the ascendancy of print, be believes, has been wholly counter-productive where poetry is concerned. The age of 'en*light*enment' has caused an unfortunate split between visual and oral disciplines: 'history is a visual phenomenon myth

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

is a sound one science is a visual phenomenon magic is a sound one.' And he adds: 'in the formation of the alphabet as a visual code (remember its base is pictorial & not phonic) we see an example of the ascendancy of the eye over the ear that lays the groundwork for the eventual domination by print (the eye) in our culture.' The ensuing discussion of verbal/visual contrasts and similarities is extremely interesting. A similarly useful discussion of verbal structure is found in 'Some Sentences, Paragraphs & Punctuations on Sentences, Paragraphs & Punctuation' (1982), which compares and contrasts kinds of prose from the most literal to the most abstract. In the same vein, Nichol's analyses of Gertrude Stein's prose, especially in *The Making of Americans*, remain impressive, as do his very generous essays on fellow poets like bill bissett and Earle Birney. All in all, Roy Miki, himself a poet-critic, has collected a set of writings that give us a valuable, if somewhat diffuse, account of what Canadian experimental poetry looked and sounded like from the late 1960s to the 1980s. Scholars can now begin to relate these experiments to those going on outside Canada.

Carl Peters's collection of Nichol's comics, from 1960 to 1980, is a labour of love: here, many of them previously unpublished, are 'stories' featuring such characters as Milt the Morph, Bob de Cat, Tommy Turk, and Rover Rawshanks, presented with all the ancillary apparatus Nichol made available so as to allow us to see how comics can explode conventional syntax and call into question what Charles Olson called 'the lyrical interference of the ego.' Throughout, Nichol's comics cleverly parody modernist conventions of art making. Such punning sequences as 'Bullsheets' are often very entertaining. Read against *The Martyrology* or *Meanwhile*, they appear slight, but they do round out the larger picture of an oeuvre that deserves a much wider audience. (MARJORIE PERLOFF)

Stephen Henighan. *When Words Deny the World: The Reshaping of Canadian Writing.* Porcupine's Quill. 211. $19.95

Stephen Henighan's *When Words Deny the World* is one of those often provocative and sometimes intelligent books that nevertheless somehow leave readers shaking their heads in irritation rather than in agreement. The problem begins, I suspect, with the inflated claims made by the front and back covers of this attractively designed paperback. The main title, to begin at the beginning, doesn't accurately reflect the book's contents: it's simply the title of the book's second section and points to its most tendentious and wrong-headed essay, 'Free Trade Fiction: The Victory of Metaphor over History.' The subtitle, 'The Reshaping of Canadian Writing,' is a bit closer to the book's general drift. The back cover offers a view of the writer-professor-critic as fearless gunslinger or provocateur: '*When Words Deny the*

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

World is a compelling report from the front lines of Canadian writing. In a series of maverick essays ... Stephen Henighan takes on the decade of the 1990s, when Canadian writing became, *before all else*, a commercial enterprise' (my italics). The first sentence gives us Henighan as war reporter, the second as a David taking on the Goliath of Canlit. When the smoke clears, what you'll really find is a very uneven, chronologically arranged collection of Henighan's reviews, speeches, and essays of the past fifteen years, several of which don't deserve a second life. The prize for the least notable entry goes to a brief newspaper review of two poetry books. The author's appended commentary on the review is almost as long as the original.

The overstatement in 'before all else' is the first of many similar comments and generalizations that distract one from the often perceptive and valid aspects of his arguments. Take his close analyses of *The English Patient* and *Fugitive Pieces*. He insists that both give priority to the word over the world, to metaphor over history. This is a point one can discuss even as one concedes that Ondaatje and Michaels, like García Márquez and Rushdie, often think in metaphors. But having established the point, Henighan then undermines it with the silly and modish assertion that 'the tactics' of *The English Patient* 'are identical to those of television commercials and rock videos, which destroy the past by recycling the familiar tunes or images severed from the historical context that lent them meaning.' Still on the same novels, he's also convinced that the non-Canadian settings of the two novels, and many others in the 1990s, can be understood 'as a reflection of our middle class's feelings of emptiness, or .. as evidence of the middle class's need to transform in order to belong to the evanescent globalized world.' I suppose you could call this pop sociocultural analysis or pop cultural theory but it's probably best described as sloppy thinking.

Throughout the book, Henighan needs the acquiescent, globalized middle class and imperceptive academic critics as badly as Harold Bloom needs cultural theory and Thomas Pynchon needs paranoia. Speaking of what might be called soft paranoia, he occasionally seems energized by the possibility that Canlit is run by 'the usual Toronto cabal.' Not only do the Toronto publishers dictate what gets published but they also control the reviewers and the prizes. The evidence for this lies in the fact that the Giller Prize demands an entry fee, something that works to the disadvantage of the small presses. This is one of several disagreements that many of us have with the Giller; unfortunately, none of the books of the past decade Henighan names as having prize potential have lasted, not even among the academics (myself included) whom Henighan, in an interesting gesture of self-hate, takes every opportunity to dismiss.

As I said, this is an irritating book, not least because Henighan writes energetically and, at his best, is capable of insights like the following: '*The Stone Diaries* is mediocre fiction but brilliant calculation. It plays to two

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

mutually hostile constituencies, charming the "just folks" market with its tale of a nice, simple, rich woman, complete with family photographs and easy to read letters, recipes and lists; these same photographs and lists thrill the academics and avant-garde critics, who see in them a postmodern questioning of traditional narrative techniques. Shields is taking both groups for a ride.' Couldn't have said it better myself. (SAM SOLECKI)

Chelva Kanaganayakam. *Counterrealism and Indo-Anglian Fiction*
Wilfrid Laurier University Press. 214. $34.95

Chelva Kanaganayakam's *Counterrealism and Indo-Anglian Fiction* offers a fresh perspective on the postcolonial Indo-Anglian novel's task of mediating a postmodern global-local nation, not so much by analysing the thematics as by calling attention to certain writers' use of what the author calls 'counterrealism,' a literary, aesthetic and narrative mode that departs from mimesis and verisimilitude and hence from the conventions of expressive realism. As a formal aesthetic, 'counterrealism' offers a recurrent pattern, or a 'basis of typology' to study the works of an influential group of Indo-Anglian writers.

Kanaganayakam first introduces and explains the term 'counterrealism,' and then devotes a chapter each to R.K. Narayan, G.V. Desani, Anita Desai, Zulfikar Ghose, Suniti Namjoshi, and Salman Rushdie, analysing these authors' use of 'counterrealism' in specific texts. The final section of the book offers a generalized critique of the post-Rushdie Indo-Anglian literary scene and writers.

Acknowledging the multiple dimensions of R.K. Narayan's art – from the mythic and religious to the secular-satiric, – Kanaganayakam shows that Narayan's mode of representation marks a delicate interweaving of the mimetic and the experimental, and it is this meshing of the modes that constitutes Narayan's 'counterrealism.' It becomes an 'enabling strategy' for Narayan to 'lay bare' that which is fictive (Malgudi/India), and defamiliarize the 'parallel' world of 'real' India touched by such issues as nationalism, communal violence, the politics of language, and gender. He sees G.V. Desani as a sort of pathbreaker who uses counterrealism to destabilize the grand narrative of Indian nationalism and nationhood by problematizing the ontological assumptions of the nation itself. The Indo-Anglian writers who came after Desani, including Salman Rushdie, have, to a greater or lesser extent, preoccupied themselves with similar issues.

The best of Anita Desai's fiction, according to Kanaganayakam, weaves the referential and the inaccessible together to give the works a 'counter-realistic' texture. Desai uses a number of anti-referential devices in her novels, such as intertextual allusions, allegories, myths, and symbols, to destabilize 'unutterable truth claims' surrounding nationalist and pat-

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

riarchal discourses, and, especially, the problematic space that women occupy in post-independence India. Desai's 'counterrealism' enables her to resist and unravel any 'monologic interpretation' of the Indian 'reality,' which she presents as being diverse and often intractable in its complexity.

Zulfikar Ghose, presents a complex mixture of narrative forms that are 'counterrealistic': stream-of-consciousness, the picaresque, metafiction, and fantasy and magic realism. However, perhaps alone among the Indo-Anglian writers of his generation, Ghose has been closer to the Latin American magic realists than he is to G.V. Desani or to Salman Rushdie. That said, Kanaganyakam convincingly argues that like those other Indo-Anglian counterrealists, Ghose explores the familiar postcolonial issues of nation, history, home, identity, power, language, and gender – but he almost always underscores the unstable nature of such social and cultural constructs.

Unlike Ghose, who claims that 'Literature concerns itself with language and never with empirical realities,' Suniti Namjoshi is openly engaged in social and political issues. Analysing Namjoshi's 'counterrealism' – her use of myths, allegories, fables (and fabulations), the traditional novel and science fiction forms, and satirical fantasies. Kanaganayakam posits that the author has removed myths and fables from the realm of the oral to the literary.

Kanaganayakam devotes the final sections of his book to a consideration of Salman Rushdie and the singular influence he has had on some of the more important Indo-Anglian writers – Shashi Tharoor, Amitav Ghose, and I. Allan Sealy, among others. Rushdie's linguistic innovations in *Midnight's Children* (1981) are dazzling. His use of parody, hyperbole, and satire, the importation of the vernacular into standard English, and the juxtaposition of the allegorical, the fantastic, and the referential put him at the head of an experimental ('counterrealistic') tradition in Indo-Anglian fiction. Rushdie's willingness to interrogate the nation and its history, the concepts of migrancy, borders, and identity, and, especially, those of 'home' and 'exile,' without nostalgia or regret, reinforces his pre-eminent position in that tradition.

As for the post-Rushdie generation of Indo-Anglian writers, Kanaganayakam says that they are, generally speaking, provisional and contingent in their attitude towards any kind of 'grand' or 'master' narratives or totalizing concepts and paradigms. For many of these 'newer' writers, the question of identity – indeed, the very notion of Indianness – is under scrutiny and contestation, as they refuse to highlight 'a particular reality' about India or about the fictional worlds they create. A counterrealistic aesthetic has helped the post-Rushdie Indo-Anglian writers test the limits of mimesis and referentiality in their search for innovative literary forms to match fresh perceptions.

Despite the intriguing omission of the questions of postmodernity and

the postmodern obsession with the anti-referential forms, which are germane to Kanaganayakam's argument, the strength of the book lies in its focus on a specific literary aesthetic of postcolonial Indo-Anglian fiction and in its ability to discuss, link, and contrast some influential Indo-Anglian writers without ignoring their individualized literary characters. Chelva Kanaganayakam's work is marked by erudition, analytical sophistication, and an informed critical sensibility, together with an admirable clarity and elegance of style, which makes the book a pleasure to read. (GAUTAM KUNDU)

Maggie Helwig. *Real Bodies*
Oberon. 172. $34.95, $17.95

If literature is, as Kafka says, the axe for the frozen sea within us, then writers who hope to have any impact must keep their blades bright. Maggie Helwig's latest collection of essays, *Real Bodies*, explores an impressive array of topics, including *The X-Files*, sex with robots, angels in movies, anorexia, Dr Seuss, violence against women, and the death of Princess Diana. These wide-ranging essays are unified by Helwig's long-standing concerns as a human rights worker and political activist, and are suffused by a keen spiritual yearning. This is a woman who unabashedly confesses to a 'lifelong and passionate desire to find a way to love God'; and, in the next breath, proclaims: 'I do not and will never understand anything at all about God (this is what you get from praying in a basement for years at a time).' Helwig is obsessed with a single question: 'How do we live in this world?' Unfortunately, although heartfelt, her answer, which can be summarized by the phrase 'All we need is love,' surfaces like a refrain and has grown dull through overuse.

By far the strongest essays focus on issues that Helwig herself has struggled with. In 'Another Look at Hunger,' for instance, Helwig examines 'Caraline's Story,' a short documentary about a woman suffering from severe bulimic anorexia. This very confusing and disturbing documentary becomes an occasion for Helwig to consider the language of anorexia, a disease she herself suffered for eight years, and to link the anorexic's refusal of food to other related political acts, including hunger strikes. Helwig's assessment of anorexia is penetrating, primarily because it eschews the medical establishment's desire to find the right pill that will 'cure' the patient's psychotic refusal of food. Instead, Helwig maintains that 'refusal is not always a bad thing. There are things in this world that it is better to reject. ... There are things about which we *should* be negative. The form of the refusal is part of the problem: having something to replace what is refused is another.'

Equally compelling is the essay 'Pictures at a Demonstration,' which

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

poignantly describes a film that will never be made, owing to the death of the cameraman, Helwig's friend David Maltby. By reviewing selected clips of the unedited video footage, Helwig vividly recreates the sights, sounds, and emotions that attended a protest march against ARMX, a weapons trade fair, held in Ottawa in the spring of 1989. The essay deftly cross-cuts between scenes of the protest march and of Helwig's final visit in the hospital with David, comatose and dying of bacterial meningitis. This juxtaposition underscores the jarring gulf between the death-brokers, who waltz past the barricades to purchase weapons of mass destruction, and individuals for whom real bodies are deserving of protection and care, and for whom each death is a tragic loss. The latter attitude is conveyed by Helwig's insistence throughout the collection on witnessing gestures of compassion, like those of David's sister Patty, who gently wipes the blood from her brother's ear with a piece of cotton wool.

Images such as this also demonstrate Helwig's awareness of the craft and power of language. In her essay about the value of poetry, she states: 'Poetry is the language of the centre – not necessarily the centre of a trauma, though that is sometimes the case; it may be the centre of a desire, a joy. It is the place where language is just beginning to break up and re-form.' And while some of the essays on pop culture offer few deep insights, others, particularly those documenting Helwig's political activism, are, indeed, sharp enough to cleave the frozen sea within. (MARLENE GOLDMAN)

Drew Hayden Taylor. *Furious Observations of a Blue-Eyed Ojibway: Funny, You Don't Look Like One ~~Two~~ Three*
Theytus. 173. $16.95

To be a Native academic reviewing Drew Hayden Taylor's most recent book of social commentary is to enter into a dangerous territory, and I have done so with equal parts caution and pleasurable anticipation. The caution arises from the knowledge that jargon-spouting academics – Native as much as non-Native – are rightly among Taylor's favourite targets for ridicule; the anticipation comes from knowing that Taylor's critical insight is deeply embedded in his unrelenting dedication to truth, good sense, and the necessary power of humour.

Taylor is perhaps best known as one of Canada's most popular Native playwrights – his works include *The Buz'Gem Blues* (2002), *alterNATIVES* (2000), and *Only Drunks and Indians Tell the Truth* (1998) – but his talents as both a social commentator and humorist should not be underestimated. *Furious Observations of a Blue-Eyed Ojibway*, the third instalment of his popular series *Funny, You Don't Look Like One*, collects forty-nine brief articles from various periodicals and public presentations, ranging widely over the complicated realities of contemporary Aboriginal life. With tongue

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

firmly in cheek and eyes trained for self-satisfied egotism, Taylor examines such diverse issues as vegetarianism, Native arts criticism, the desacralization and commodification of sacred medicines, urban and reserve cultures, intermarriage and multi-raciality, the politics of laughter, and the convolutions of his life as a slightly cynical Ojibway writer in an often absurd world.

As with most of his work, Taylor brings a sharp sense of irony and humour to these essays. Of particular note in this regard is his thought-provoking piece 'Culture by Association,' in which he questions the practice of non-Natives who assume Aboriginal identities when they begin intimate relationships with Native people. Taylor names this practice both 'spousal cultural appropriation' and, more playfully, 'being "Indian by ejaculation."' While toying with the humorous implications of such practices and terminology – 'God knows I've done my share of passing out citizenship' – he subsequently moves into the more troubling realities of appropriation, observing that the claim is most often done as an exercise in privilege and objectification of 'cool hair and funky pow wows,' but it rarely extends into the socio-economic realities of many Aboriginal people, which include a 'life expectancy rate [that] is substantially lower than the National average,' 'constant turmoil with the various levels of government,' 'standards of living on most Reserves [that] are a national disgrace,' and the corrosive losses of Indigenous languages throughout Canada.

Such mindful balance between humour and contemporary realities locates Taylor in the intellectual genealogy of Native social critics like Will Rogers (Cherokee), Alex Posey (Muskogee Creek), Susan Shown Harjo (Cheyenne/Muscogee), Tim Giago (Lakota), and Jim Northrup (Anishinaabe), for whom small- and large-scale periodicals serve as important and timely venues for disseminating Indigenous ideas. There is an energy and immediacy to the essays that assert the presence of Native people in the modern age, thus helping to dissolve the stereotype of Natives as museum pieces of a vanished era. For example, his commentaries on the current state of Native theatre and television are as enlightening as they are disturbing, especially in 'The Politics of Children,' which strips the veil from the corporate micro-management of children's television programming.

Like similar works by Rogers and Posey, however, such timeliness freezes certain pieces into their immediate historical context—such as the post–September 11th commentary, 'America at War' – or lingers too long on amusing but largely unremarkable commentaries, as is the case with 'Aboriginal Horoscope' and 'We Deserve Our Own Ethnic Holiday Too!' Taylor is at his very best when he tackles difficult issues – from residential school abuse to the controversies of identity and commercialization of Native cultural production – and he handles these with intelligence, clarity, and a plentiful amount of worldly-wise sarcasm. His occasional flippant detour into trivialities is, thankfully, the exception among these essays.

Strong Native voices in the mainstream Canadian press are all too few, but Taylor's joyful irreverence and clear-eyed analysis continue to be necessary correctives to such erasures. *Furious Observations of a Blue-Eyed Ojibway* demonstrates yet again why Drew Hayden Taylor is among the best observers of contemporary Aboriginal life in Canada. (DANIEL HEATH JUSTICE)

Tim Bowling, editor. *Where the Words Come From*: *Canadian Poets in Conversation*
Nightwood. 256. $22.95

The literary interview is a twilit genre. Its illuminations produce long and suggestive shadows more than they improve perception, but the right interviewer can play those shadows and make them magnify a body of writing's gnomic quintessence. Conversation between poets promises some excellent shadow-play. Some of the conversations Tim Bowling engineered meet this promise better than others. Each has its particular merits, but some, like Brian Bartlett's conversation with Dennis Lee, have an energy and range that individuate them. As much as each focuses primarily on a 'celebrated' poet, and secondarily on the 'less widely known' poet who asks the questions, the task of unifying them belongs to Bowling. In a recent issue of *ARC*, Bowling claimed that 'Al Purdy is the finest poet Canada has known,' and Bowling conceived the book as 'a way to honour Purdy's work and the work of the many fine poets ... in Canada' after Purdy's death in 2000. Purdy's 'The Dead Poet' provides the epigraph and the idea behind both the title and one of the three questions Bowling required his interviewers to ask: '[D]o you have any explanation of where your voice came from?' The issue of the 'Canadian-ness' of that voice never surfaces, but the most intriguing shadow the book casts limns a perspective on Canadian poetry in the absence of one its major figures.

Bowling claims his 'bringing the poets together' is only a small role, but the choice of poets and pairings determines the character of the volume. Bowling's pairings aim for amiable conversation rather than tension or debate. Some work because the poets invest in a similar approach to their craft, like Ken Babstock and Don McKay, Carmine Starnino and Eric Ormsby, Stephanie Bolster and Don Coles, or Julie Bruck and Roo Borson. Not coincidentally, these approach the conversational ideal Bowling envisioned, where others, in the absence of real sympathy, fall into a conventional, unidirectional interview. Nothing of Helen Humphreys comes through in her interview with Sharon Thesen. Only Phyllis Webb occasionally resists Jay Ruzesky, though Miriam Waddington seems to lose patience with Barbara Nickel on occasion if her succinct responses are any indication. The general lack of tension may have something to do with the vague implications of mentoring in pairing the 'celebrated' with the 'less

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

widely known.'

This pervasive congeniality seems peculiar considering the debates that characterize contemporary Canadian poetry. George Elliott Clarke's *Blue* and Steve McCaffrey's *7 Pages Missing* flank my copy of Bowling's book and the juxtaposition reminds me of Dionne Brand's position between Margaret Avison and P.K. Page (both contributors to *Where the Words Come From*) on the 2003 Griffin short list, Christian Bök's victory (over Erin Mouré) for the 2002 Griffin, and Roy Miki's 2002 Governor-General's Award. To suggest that a greater poetic diversity would be a more accurate presentation of 'the many fine poets ... in Canada' is not to knock any of the poets Bowling did select; only to show how centrally his editorial decisions reflect his vision of Canadian poetry.

The accidental convergences are fascinating. Dylan Thomas, Rilke, and Tranströmer come up repeatedly, and the old sublimity of Canadian geography seems to have been broadly internalized as a taste for 'negative transcendence.' Shadows, surely, but interesting shadows, unlike the predictable responses to Bowling's required questions, particularly 'is competition healthy or unhealthy for a poet?' To be fair, the purpose was to spur 'a range of responses to some general issues,' so the direct answers may be less important than the secondary questions. Still, the assumption encoded in this question was, perhaps by personal inclination, overshadowed only by the lack of diversity among the poets among the book's few real flaws. Few artists of any stripe will say anything positive about competition. Perhaps this is the 'right' answer, but, Harold Bloom aside, the notion of competition in poetry is as old as the word *agon* with its connotations of the divine voice that a 'victor' earns the right to embody. Sarpedon's inspiration of Glaucus in the *Iliad* is the martial model. Homeric shades were not Bowling's intent, but inspiration has always been a way to explain where the words come from. (CHRIS JENNINGS)

Stan Persky and John Dixon. *On Kiddie Porn: Sexual Representation, Free Speech and the Robin Sharpe Case*
New Star 2001. xii, 247. $20.00

On 15 January 1999 a retired city planner in Vancouver suddenly became one of the most hated men in Canada. Robin Sharpe had been charged with four offences under the child pornography law, relating to the possession, or possession for the purpose of distribution, of various stories and photographs depicting children. At his trial he had challenged the constitutionality of the law, partly on the ground that its prohibition of simple possession of child pornography was an unjustifiable infringement of the guarantee of freedom of expression in the Charter of Rights and Freedoms. In his decision on that challenge, released on 15 January Justice

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Duncan Shaw of the British Columbia Supreme Court upheld the challenge, declared the possession section of the child pornography law null and void, and dismissed the simple possession charges against Sharpe. (The other sections of the law remained in force and the other charges against Sharpe, relating to distribution, remained in place to be decided at a subsequent trial.)

Judge Shaw's decision ignited a firestorm of opposition on radio talk-shows, in newspaper editorial pages, and in Parliament. In the ensuing hysteria Shaw received a death threat, while Sharpe became the target of a neighbourhood poster campaign against the local 'pervert' as well as abusive and threatening phone calls. Some degree of calm was restored when the British Columbia attorney-general announced that the decision would be appealed, but the atmosphere worsened again on 30 June when the British Coumbia Court of Appeal upheld Shaw's decision by a 2-1 majority. The possession section of the child pornography law was now one step closer to being found constitutionally invalid, and critics expressed their (greatly exaggerated) fears that the country was in danger of inundation by a flood of child pornography.

It was obvious that the constitutional issue had to be settled ultimately by the Supreme Court. And so it was, in a judgment released on 26 January 2001, just over two years after Judge Shaw's initial decision. In a complicated but unanimous decision, the Court upheld the possession offence but narrowed it to exclude certain categories of child pornography, including 'works of the imagination' such as stories kept strictly in the possession of the author. Everyone, except Robin Sharpe himself, seemed satisfied with this compromise and the issue quickly vanished from public sight. The Court's decision had little adverse impact on the activities of police and public prosecutors in enforcing the child pornography law, and, away from the glare of publicity, Sharpe was convicted of the other charges against him.

The story of the Sharpe case, as it moved through the various levels in the judicial hierarchy from initial trial to Supreme Court resolution, is efficiently related in this book by Stan Persky and John Dixon. As philosophers they approach the case partly out of abstract interest in its implications for free expression, but Dixon was also personally involved at an earlier stage of the whole child pornography affair. In 1991–92, when the Conservative government was planning to introduce a child pornography law, he served as a senior policy advisor to the deputy minister of justice. In this role he provided advice to Kim Campbell, then minister of justice, concerning the appropriate shape of such a law. In a long and fascinating chapter we are given an insider's account of the development of the law, in which we learn how crucial aspects of that advice were ultimately ignored, with the result that the eventual legislation, which was passed in 1993, bit more deeply into freedom of expression than

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Dixon felt was justifiable.

Persky and Dixon offer no pretence of neutrality on the basic issues at stake. They are both affiliated with the British Columbia Civil Liberties Association, which intervened in support of the constitutional challenge at both the appellate and Supreme Court level. In their view the law, as it stands to this day, intrudes too deeply into the realm of personal privacy by criminalizing simple possession of materials that have not involved actual children in their production. Whether or not the case they make is persuasive, they have performed a valuable service by providing a rich and well-documented account of the recent legislative and judicial history – one that will assist the interested reader in reaching an informed judgment on the issues. My only serious complaint about the book concerns its title, whose colloquialism threatens to trivialize a serious and controversial issue closely connected to the sexual abuse of children. While the authors disavow any such intent, the excuse they offer for their persistent use of the 'kiddie porn' phrase is lame and forced. It is a rare lapse of judgment in a work which I otherwise strongly recommend to anyone endeavouring to define the limits of free expression. (WAYNE SUMNER)

Tom Warner. *Never Going Back: A History of Queer Activism in Canada*
University of Toronto Press. xvi, 430. $95.00, $29.95

This unique and comprehensive survey of the history of lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender (LGBT) organizing in Canada from the 1950s to the 1990s fills a gap in our knowledge of recent Canadian political and social history. The book's title – *Never Going Back* – recalls the title of an editorial in the Toronto gay liberation newspaper *The Body Politic*, published in the spring of 1973, which stated that, with the rise of the gay liberation movement, lesbians and gay men were *never going back* to the closet. Written by a prominent Toronto activist, who lived through many of the events described in its pages, the book strikes a balance in presenting the scope and diversity of queer organizing. In fact, one of Warner's main concerns is to demonstrate the depth and range of the lesbian and gay liberation movement and to move away from the dominant picture of the LGBT movement as dominated by legal struggles.

Warner focuses resolutely on the agency of LGBT groups as political actors, fighting back against a system of social oppression and state regulation. Based on over a hundred interviews with activists from all across Canada, Warner's book makes clear his respect for his interview subjects, and their voices come through as they tell the stories of their struggles in different parts of the country. While the media tend to depict the 'gay rights' movement as Ottawa lobby groups, this book makes it clear that queer organizing is deeply rooted at the local level and that political

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

victories at the centre may not change social practices in local areas. While Pride Day in Toronto attracts thousands and is promoted by the city as part of its tourism strategy, the issue of declaring Pride Day in towns such as Fredericton and Kelowna had to be taken before human rights tribunals after their mayors refused to proclaim it. By exploring smaller towns and cities as well as rural and northern Canada, Warner is the first to offer a picture of lesbian and gay political issues and organizing in these communities. Furthermore, Warner also documents the history of queer organizing among people of colour and Two-Spirited People. This is an important corrective to other accounts of lesbian and gay organizing (such as my own) which neglected to consider the ways in which queer organizing has been racialized.

While Warner shows the progress that has been made over the last thirty years by LGBT people in this country, he also shows how social mores and practices across the range of Canadian social institutions continue to stigmatize and discriminate against LGBT people. The sections on recent developments in social, education, and health policy show how such policies are made without regard to and without any knowledge of LGBT interests or perspectives. In the city of Toronto, for example, the combination of welfare and education cuts has dramatically increased the vulnerability of street-involved queer youth. As Warner documents, extensive organizing is now underway in queer communities around health issues.

This book is required reading for all those interested in LGBT politics in Canada. Further, this book should be used in the Canadian education system as part of a progressive pedagogy which would empower both queer and straight youth with knowledge about the history of and struggles against heterosexism in Canadian society. (MIRIAM SMITH)

Veronica Hollinger and Joan Gordon, editors. *Edging into the Future: Science Fiction and Contemporary Cultural Transformation*
University of Pennsylvania Press. viii, 280. US $22.50

For many years science fiction authors and critics have complained about the lack of serious attention paid to the genre. But in the past two or three decades a number of book-length studies and three major journals in the field have appeared. The rise of cyberpunk and feminist science fiction in the 1980s inspired the greatest outburst of critical interest, primarily because works by authors like William Gibson, Bruce Sterling, Octavia Butler, and Gwyneth Jones feature themes and techniques paralleling those of mainstream postmodernists. With their emphasis on fluid individual and gender identities, their blurring of genre boundaries, and their incorporation of popular culture intertexts, these works lend themselves easily to analysis in the light of the broader postmodern movement and recent

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

critical theory.

Edging into the Future is a collection of essays reflecting this interest in recent science fiction and the suitability of structuralist, poststructuralist, and feminist approaches to its study. Most of the essays deal with fiction of the 1980s and 1990s and provide illuminating insights into how writers like Gibson, Butler, and Melissa Scott challenge cultural and gender power structures. Two essays focus on film, and three are by authors discussing their own work.

Gary K. Wolfe begins the collection with 'Evaporating Genre: Strategies of Dissolution in the Postmodern Fantastic,' a historical overview of science fiction's perennially fluid boundaries. Wolfe argues that SF has long been infiltrated by, and has more recently infiltrated, other genres like the thriller and horror fiction. Jenny Wolmark's 'Staying with the Body: Narratives of the Posthuman in Contemporary Science Fiction' and Wendy Pearson's 'Sex/uality and the Figure of the Hermaphrodite in Science Fiction; or, the Revenge of Herculine Barbin' focus on the way science fiction challenges concepts of the 'normative' body, and, by extension, the role of biology in shaping identity. Wolmark argues for a 'queered feminist reading' of such texts as the films *GATTACA* and *The Matrix* and Kathleen Ann Goonan's novel *Queen City Jazz*. The function of the alien to highlight our insistence on projecting our own views onto others – and Others – is the subject of Brian Attebery's '"But Aren't Those Just ... You Know, Metaphors?": Postmodern Figuration in the Science Fiction of James Morrow and Gwyneth Jones' and of Joan Gordon's 'Utopia, Genocide, and the Other.' The latter is a particularly interesting synthesis of ideas about race, utopianism, and postcolonialism. Cyberpunk and other contemporary works of science fiction seek to subvert entrenched corporate power, but that power often co-opts and assimilates the very forces seeking to destroy it. Rob Latham studies this process in 'Mutant Youth: Posthuman Fantasies and High-Tech Consumption in 1990s Science Fiction.' Istvan Csiscery-Ronay, Jr, notes in 'Dis-Imagined Communities: Science Fiction and the Future of Nations' that one force with the ability to challenge globalization – a sense of national identity – is curiously absent from much science fiction, perhaps because so much science fiction is written in countries that have no reason to fear globalization. Veronica Hollinger's 'Apocalypse Coma' compares William Gibson's rejection of apocalyptic thinking to Douglas Coupland's more conservative approach.

Brooks Landon discusses CGI and other virtual film characters in 'Synthespians, Virtual Humans, and Hypermedia: Emerging Contours of Post-SF Film'; while making worthwhile points about the blurring lines between film and other media like the Internet and games, he does not explain the difference between computer-generated and conventionally animated characters. Roger Luckhurst, in '"Going Postal": Rage, Science Fiction, and the Ends of the American Subject,' argues that our contempo-

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

rary sense of radical alienation expresses itself in various forms of rage as represented in the *Terminator* films. Unfortunately, the three writers' essays are on the whole less illuminating. Brian Stableford's discussion of his own novels provides insights into his rejection of the negative opinion most have of biotechnology. Lance Olsen describes the role of rock music in the development of science fiction in 'Omniphage: Rock 'n' Roll and Avant-Pop Science Fiction,' but makes some obvious points such as the influence of rock on the Beat writers. Gwyneth Jones's '*Kairos*: The Enchanted Loom' is a discussion of her early novels in a somewhat – and characteristically – disjointed and opaque style.

The essays often echo each other in their consistent opposition to generic and other boundaries – while otherwise valorizing difference – but nevertheless cover a nicely varied range of subjects in the field. On the whole, *Edging into the Future* is a truly valuable contribution to the growing critical literature about contemporary science fiction. (ALLAN WEISS)

Greg Donaghy. *Tolerant Allies: Canada and the United States, 1963–1968*
McGill-Queen's University Press. x, 235. $75.00

This book is an examination of Canadian-American governmental relations during the Pearson years. Greg Donaghy is a historian in the Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade, and *Tolerant Allies* is a revised version of his University of Waterloo PhD thesis. In this way the book is very much what one might expect: it is carefully argued, fully sourced, academic in tone, and thoroughly researched in the official government sources, especially in the Canadian documents in Ottawa.

Donaghy takes as a starting point the well-known confrontation between Canadian prime minister Lester Pearson and American president Lyndon Johnson at Camp David in 1965 following a rather timid speech by Pearson calling on the United States to announce a temporary halt to bombing in North Vietnam. Johnson is loud, overbearing, and threatening as he berates Pearson; the Canadian is calmer, respectful, and trying to be helpful. This moment has become something of a symbol of the strain, mistrust, and hostility in Canadian-American relations during these years, with Pearson and Johnson personifying that relationship. Donaghy's goal is to demonstrate that the Canadian-American relationship was much broader and far more complex than this oversimplified and incomplete picture, and his book sets out to set the record straight.

The chapters unfold thematically, examining closely the negotiation of the Autopact, trade relations, tariff reductions and the GATT, Canadian-American financial relations and balance of payments problems, Vietnam and Asian policy generally, and relations in NORAD and NATO. Two 'central themes' or questions, really, serve as a theoretical backdrop for the book. One, 'should Canada agree to the further integration of the two North

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

American economies in exchange for the material benefits that greater access to the United States market would make possible?' Two, 'In accepting American proposals for closer economic partnership, did Pearson's government sacrifice Canada's political independence?' Donaghy would answer 'yes' to the first question and 'no' to the second. Pearson's government, he writes, 'virtually redefined the parameters of postwar Canadian-American relations. The economic relationship was increasingly grounded in a shared recognition of the value of formalized structures for continental cooperation. These in turn were slowly uncoupled from political considerations. Rather than compromising Canada's independence, Pearson's pursuit of closer economic relations with the United States rescued Canada from the parochial influence of Walter Gordon and his nationalist allies.' In this way the book is also the story of Lester Pearson, to whom Donaghy gives most of the credit for this transformation in Canadian-American relations. Pearson had to deal not only with the Americans, who could be tough and demanding, but he also had to cope with divisions in his own government, steering a careful course among competing ministers, especially between the nationalist Walter Gordon and the ambitious Paul Martin.

Donaghy painstakingly describes the various sets of negotiations over trade, finance, defence, magazines, the Mercantile Bank, and more, and presents a very convincing analysis of the growing economic co-operation and integration of the Canadian and American economies, a transformation that he sees as a pretty good thing. But this policy of closer integration was not prepared in advance of the negotiations, it emerged from them, and it wasn't an idea that originated with Pearson. The Autopact was signed and bilateral tariffs were reduced 'despite' the Pearson government's 'professed intention to reduce Canada's economic dependence on the United States.' Indeed, the outcome of the economic negotiations was less a Canadian accomplishment than it was a 'triumph' of American undersecretary of state George Ball's 'continentalist vision.' Donaghy characterizes the United States as a 'tolerant ally,' hence the title of the book, but with this economic integration well underway the Americans could afford to be understanding and 'tolerant' of Canadian differences in foreign policy.

The best chapters are those dealing with economic questions; as Donaghy rightly points out, it is these issues that historians have tended to shy away from. The chapters on Vietnam and the 'containing' of 1960s Canadian nationalism cover territory that has been well travelled before, and they are somewhat less rewarding. But it is a good book, bringing new reflection on an important decade in Canadian-American relations. (DAVID MACKENZIE)

Nicholas Gammer. *From Peacekeeping to Peacemaking: Canada's Response to the Yugoslav Crisis*
McGill-Queen's University Press. x, 244. $ 27.95

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Nicholas Gammer's book is the first full-length analysis of Canada's engagement with the wars of Yugoslav succession (1991–95). It is not an operational examination of United Nations (UN) peacekeeping during the civil conflict. The main finding is that the foreign policy of Brian Mulroney's Progressive Conservative government (1984–93) shifted because of governmental, national, and international factors. It became much more supportive of multinational intervention to stop conflict and human rights abuses. Gammer is persuasive, but he also undercuts his argument about the government's approach by revealing flaws in its thinking. The influence and extent of Ottawa's shift towards assertiveness seem somewhat exaggerated.

Gammer highlights Mulroney's strong political, legal, and military support of interventionism. The author argues that his government challenged the principle of sovereignty and moved to an interventionist stance by recognizing Croatia and Slovenia (January 1992), attempting to bolster international humanitarian law, and deploying peacekeepers to Sarajevo (July 1992) and Srebrenica (May 1993–March 1994). This thorough discussion clearly reveals the multifaceted nature of Ottawa's engagement with the Yugoslav crisis.

The principal focus is on the calls by the prime minister and the secretary of state for external affairs, Barbara McDougall, for more assertive and intrusive action by the UN, the Conference on Security and Co-operation in Europe, and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO). Gammer's analysis of the various influences on Canadian policy makers is quite well done. A proactive and assertive response emerged because of international events, vocal media and opposition parties, and prime ministerial prerogative. Gammer criticizes Jean Chrétien's Liberal government (1993–present), whose lack of enthusiasm for the NATO-led Implementation Force (1995–96) showed that it 'has not been activist or visionary.'

However, Gammer undermines the perception of Mulroney's boldness by suggesting that the government may not have known what it was doing. Evidence of Ottawa's 'questionable rationale' was McDougall's belief that the disputants would respect a cease-fire and let the UN Protection Force do its job. Gammer also indicates that when it came to the possibility of taking casualties to protect Srebrenica from attack, the Mulroney government shied away. 'Somewhat paradoxically,' Canada, like the international community at large, adopted a 'cautious foreign policy stance.' Mulroney ultimately decided to send troops to Srebrenica despite awareness of major shortcomings in the UN plan. This throws a light on Chrétien's response. It could be argued that he was not less visionary, but rather more aware of the risks and cautious after three years of peacekeeping failure.

The author convincingly argues that the government supported the expansion of the definition of peacekeeping and the inclusion of tougher

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

tasks. He notes that Ottawa realized peacekeeping would not be enough in the former Yugoslavia, and that 'peacemaking,' which involves coercive efforts to make the peace (this term also means diplomatic efforts to end conflict), was seen as required. But he neglects the fact that despite assertive mandates, the major powers never gave the mission the capability or will to act in an aggressive or effective way. It seems questionable then to argue that Canada 'force[d] the hand of the UN and the international community into assuming a more interventionist role.'

Overall, this is a very strong study, but the government's engagement may have been more traditional and reactive than the author suggests. Respect for human rights and a stable, rule-bound world have long been core values and interests in Canadian foreign policy. We learn that Ottawa engaged intensely, but to a significant degree it was responding to the increased international willingness to permit intrusive multinational activities, as evidenced in Namibia, El Salvador, and elsewhere in Central America. The immediate post–Cold War, post–Persian Gulf War period was immensely optimistic about the UN and multilateralism. Mulroney supported these developments. During the Chrétien era, the world was more pessimistic. (GRANT DAWSON)

Maya Shatzmiller, editor. *Islam and Bosnia: Conflict Resolution and Foreign Policy in Multi-Ethnic States*
McGill-Queen's University Press. xxiv, 224. $75.00, $27.95

The essays in this well-edited volume were originally written for a conference held at the University of Western Ontario. Its aim is to study the wider context of the recent Bosnian conflict; its multi-ethnic, cultural, and religious setting and the formulation of foreign policy. In other words, to investigate 'the roots of the conflict' and 'to analyze the short term contingency management.' The former perspective is presented in a series of articles written by academics; the latter by veterans of foreign affairs. By bringing together the two groups of participants and the two perspectives, 'it was hoped that a new approach to foreign policy making would emerge.'

As is usually the case with collections of essays, they tend to be of uneven quality; some are more interesting and valuable than others. However, all the scholarly articles in the first section of the book provide some fresh historical (Fine), anthropological (Bringa), literary (Buturovic, Sells) and cultural (Volkan, Riedlmayer) insights into the formation of the Islamic identity in Bosnia, and, according to the authors, to a shared Bosnian cultural and national identity. They also view Bosnia's past and present largely from the perspective of the Muslims rather than of their Orthodox (Serb) and Catholic (Croat) compatriots. This reflects the fact that the Muslim Bosnians endured, suffered, and lost the most in the recent

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

bloody conflict.

All of these authors also tend to overstate – indeed, idealize – the tradition of religious and ethnic tolerance in the history of Bosnia. One can agree with their claim that the recent conflict was not solely or even primarily religious or ethnic. It is more difficult to accept the idealized picture that the authors paint of a collective cultural identity, of tolerant inter-ethnic and inter-religious relations. True, throughout most of their history the three communities lived in peace with each other; but it is equally true that such peace was maintained by strong and not impartial, let alone democratic, rules – be it Ottoman, Habsburg, Serbian, or Communist. In times of crisis, when strong rule weakened or collapsed, tolerance turned into intolerance, as was the case in the 1870s, the First and Second World Wars and the disintegration of Communist Yugoslavia. During such times inter-ethnic/religious peace gave way to struggles for control of Bosnia. To be sure, in all these cases outsiders, Serbs, Croats, and Great Powers, were involved and contributed to the turmoil. But the Bosnians of all three communities were not blameless, even though in all cases, and particularly in the most recent one, they were not equally responsible for the violence and bloodshed.

Unfortunately for Bosnia, and this should be stressed, in the Age of Nationalism a common Bosnian identity did not form or was overshadowed by the separate ethnic national identities – the Serb and the Croat, which began to form already in the nineteenth century, and the Muslim more belatedly and recently. As a result, the Bosnian Serbs and Croats identified more readily with their ethnic and religious counterparts outside of Bosnia, in Serbia and Croatia, than with each other or with their Muslim Bosnian compatriots – who had nowhere else to turn.

In the second section of the book, diplomats who were involved in the Bosnian conflict or the Dayton settlement present their own analyses and observations. They offer no dramatic revelations, but they do shed some new light on the reluctant American involvement (Galbraith), on the slow and confusing response of the international community (Green), on the dilemmas in choosing military intervention 'as a legitimate means of conflict resolution' (Smith), on the failure of Canadian policy in the Bosnian conflict (Hashemi), and on the post-Dayton efforts to organize a functioning administration in the new federation (Reid).

All in all, this volume provides interesting readings on an all too recent conflict, which will be investigated in far greater depth by scholars in the future, when the documentary evidence from all sides in the conflict becomes available. In the meantime, each individual reader will have to decide for himself/herself whether this book contributes to 'new thinking on foreign policy making ... in the hope of achieving more than just a victory of pragmatism.' (ANDREW ROSSOS)

Patricia Marchak. *God's Assassins: State Terrorism in Argentina in the 1970s*
McGill-Queen's University Press 1999. xi, 394. $44.95, $29.95

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Between 1973 and 1983 Argentina suffered a period of unprecedented civil violence known as the 'dirty war,' in which an estimated thirty thousand people 'disappeared' at the hands of the authorities. According to Patricia Marchak, what occurred was a case of state terrorism, which she tries to understand and explain largely through the words of Argentine observers and participants. On the basis of interviews and personal recollections she provides an interesting, at times compelling, and certainly emotionally charged insiders' view of this black period in Argentina's recent history.

The roots of this apparently civilized country's degeneration into disorder, violence, and state-sponsored repression can be found in its earlier history. Marchak paints a picture of a staunchly conservative country dominated by an elite with military support whose position was challenged by the rise of Juan Domingo Perón in the 1940s. His appeal, especially to unionized workers and the poor, unsettled the country's fragile political equilibrium, so that despite his increasingly dictatorial rule and overthrow in 1955, he remained a popular hero and a symbol of democracy to many, especially during the subsequent years of military governments. His followers' attempts to restore democracy, often through violence, provoked government reprisals and also fostered bloody internecine struggles as Peronists disagreed over the methods to be used. In 1973 the elite and the military permitted Perón's return to the presidency in the hope that this might end the deepening chaos. However, neither he nor his even more ineffective wife, who replaced him after his death, could find a solution, opening the door for the military to intervene once again, now with carte blanche to do what they wished. Arrests, looting, kidnapping, and murder became the order of the day over the next decade, primarily at the hands of the authorities. Neither legal dictates nor moral scruples limited those directing the repression. As one general stated in justifying the atrocities: 'First we kill all the subversives; then we will kill their collaborators; then their sympathizers; then ... those who remain indifferent; and finally we will kill the timid.' Many quietly accepted the repression hoping that it would end the violence. With elements of the church supporting the military – explaining the book's rather misleading title – the civilian population had further reason to believe the authorities' explanations. Opposed only by a handful of human rights groups, the military leaders continued their bloody path until finally they were forced from power following the Malvinas/Falklands fiasco in 1982.

The author tries to make sense of the events through interviews with Argentines from various walks of life. Some discuss the years preceding the dirty war. Others, including union militants, students, members of various

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

guerrilla groups, peronists, Catholic activists, conservative and reformist priests, junior and senior military officers, and media representatives focus on the events of the 1970s. Some of those interviewed were innocent, ordinary people who were arrested themselves or had family members who were imprisoned or disappeared. Their testimonies present a clear picture of the fear and helplessness that permeated those years. Also evident is the naïveté of many of the participants and their differing perceptions about what was taking place. The overriding impression is of uncertainty and confusion. That same sense of confusion is evident in the author's conclusion when she uses the testimonies to provide possible explanations for the state terror. Some blamed the military, who saw themselves as the saviours of the nation against a Marxist threat and couched this in religious terms, thereby winning church support. Others held the proponents of neoliberalism with their desire to reduce the role of the state in daily life and weaken the power of the unions responsible. The cold war and an internal struggle within the local middle class were other explanations. Marchak raises questions about all of these, leaving the impression that something more is needed to explain adequately Argentina's descent into hell in the 1970s. (PETER BLANCHARD)

Mike Gasher. *Hollywood North: The Feature Film Industry in British Columbia*
University of British Columbia Press. viii, 176. $85.00, $24.95

Mike Gasher undertakes the ambitious project of seeking to redress the focus on nation as the determining category in Canadian film discourse by foregrounding regionality in his discussions of the feature film industry in British Columbia. He stakes out the potentially controversial position that this industry has clearer links to Hollywood than to Canada, undercutting the normative position that all feature film in Canada is necessarily an expression of national identity. By arguing that cinema is a 'social construction whose particular definition is contingent upon a nexus of historical, economic, political, and cultural forces,' Gasher seeks to contribute to debates over the 'relationship between cinema and place.'

The volume is organized into six chapters, an appendix with a partial list of British Columbia feature film credits (1976–2000), endnotes, and references. In chapter 1, Gasher identifies four 'sites' of production of meaning that have worked to shape the feature film industry in British Columbia, and each becomes the focus of subsequent chapters. Chapter 2 provides a brief history of the feature film industry in British Columbia, including the roles played by foreign location production and the provincial government as producer and regulator of the exhibition sector. The context of British Columbia's feature film industry within the North American context becomes the locus of chapter 3, which is especially informative for its

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

discussion of how the inclusion of British Columbia in Hollywood's transnational production broke the ground for a commercial industry on the west coast. Chapter 4 deals with the evolution of provincial film policy from the late 1970s, and explores the establishment of the BC Film Commission and the promotion of 'foreign location production within the province.' Gasher's analysis of the period of the early 1990s through 2001 during which British Columbia, in an effort to remain competitive with Ontario and Quebec, introduced the 'tax-credit program Film Incentive BC as an inducement to both foreign and indigenous producers,' offers insight on the impact of provincial policies in maintaining the viability of regional feature film industries. In chapter 5, Gasher undertakes an analysis of several feature films produced in British Columbia since the late 1970s, examining the tensions between concepts of location that depict British Columbia as 'America' and/or reassert regional distinctiveness. Chapter 6 presents concluding thoughts on the implications of British Columbia as 'place' but also as the site of transnational and local film production.

Overall, this volume is well researched and deftly explores how film became known as a growth industry in the province, suspended between the simultaneous demands of stimulating foreign service production and encouraging indigenous filmmaking. His critique of the internal east-west tensions between British Columbia and the Ontario/Quebec nodes of feature filmmaking successfully demonstrates that traditional biases in favour of the East continue to persist in Canadian federal film policy. Finally, Gasher's examination of how British Columbia masquerades as an imaginary American landscape and its role as a real geographical place touches on many of the paradoxical tensions in Canadian feature filmmaking by raising the issue of what constitutes authentic Canadian regional identity and content.

The one limitation in Gasher's approach lies in his de-emphasis of aesthetics in the analysis of the selected films. In a work that focuses on the role of landscape as a marker of identity, it would have been useful to discuss the cinematic depiction of place along with its role in narrative structure. For example, Gasher asserts that the film *The Lotus Eaters* depicts the setting of Dinner Plate Island as remote and isolated without providing a sense of how this is accomplished visually. However, this is a minor flaw and does not detract from what is overall an excellent and useful volume. This book offers a fresh view that avoids the nationalist navel-gazing that often accompanies work on Canadian film. Its interdisciplinary frame does an excellent job of communicating the importance and impact of what may be viewed as the Byzantine world of film and funding regulation. Finally, by locating British Columbia's film industry in a regional, national, and transnational context, Gasher provides a broad worldview of all the contradictions and strengths of making film outside of Ontario and Quebec.

(SHEILA PETTY)

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

Gene Walz, editor. *Canada's Best Features*:
Critical Essays on Fifteen Canadian Films
Rodopi. xxxvi, 384. US $95.00, US $40.00

Although the financing of Canadian film remains precarious, books about Canadian film continue to appear. During the past four years, over a dozen books have been published in English on Canadian cinema. Four of them are anthologies, aimed largely at the academic market; but collectively they cover a wide range of cinematic interests.

One volume celebrates the achievement of Canadian women and another that of the documentary film. There are two reference texts and two extensive studies – this time not anthologies – of the significance of our cinematic imagination, plus a detailed analysis, written by an Englishman, of Quebec's unique cinematic achievement.

Of the four anthologies, perhaps the most useful is *Canada's Best Features: Critical Essays on Fifteen Canadian Films*, edited by Gene Walz of the University of Manitoba. Conservative in outlook, dealing with a safe selection of Canadian features, the book is scrupulously edited, almost to the point of pedantry. There are extensive credits for each film, a plot synopsis, a cumulative bibliography at the end of the volume plus the wonderful luxury (if I may be allowed a pedantry of my own) of actual footnotes on the same page as the text. *Canada's Best Features* contains essays that are, almost without exception, lively, accessible, and virtually free from jargon – each casting fresh light on films culled from the cinematic canon. As was no doubt intended, the book could well serve as set text for a course on Canadian cinema but would also provide a thoughtful introduction to the subject for the general reader.

Canada's Best Features provides a roll call of some of the finest writers on Canadian film. Along with a synoptic introduction by Walz himself, Christine Ramsay offers a contestational analysis of that originary classic, *Goin' Down the Road*; Jim Leach examines the effect of shifting points of view in *Mon Oncle Antoine*; Tom McSorley explains how, for all its quality, *The Apprenticeship of Duddy Kravitz* paved the way for the assimilationist aesthetic that would, for the sake of the market, increasingly encourage Canadian productions to resemble Hollywood films. Like Angela Stukator's discussion of *The Company of Strangers*, André Loiselle explores how *Les Ordres* takes place at the intersection of documentary and fiction; Peter Morris relates *Les bons débarras* less to other works by the screenwriter, Réjean Ducharme, than to the Gothic imagination of *Wuthering Heights*.

There are essays by Blaine Allan on *The Grey Fox*, by Will Straw on *Careful*, and a most welcoming celebration of the Bollywood extravagances of *Masala* by Thomas Waugh. By examining both the narrative and cultural

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

differences between the American *The Big Chill* (1983) and the Québécois *Le Déclin de l'empire américan* (1986), Bart Testa illuminates not only the two films with their different spins on the tradition of social comedy but also the two cultures as well.

Most exceptional (to my mind) is George Toles's account of *Léolo*. Not only is Toles a professor at the University of Manitoba, but he is also the literary collaborator on the eccentrically inventive cinema of Guy Maddin, including *Careful*. Toles's account of *Léolo* lifts film analysis onto another level, or perhaps restores it to that plane where it used to live before academic priorities insisted upon a greater sobriety of tone. Toles offers a psychoanalytical interpretation of the relationship of memory to imagination as it relates to the young protagonist's desire to imagine himself as someone different than he is – possibly the desire, in one way or another, of many characters lodged within Canadian cinema.

Canada's Best Features is a splendid anthology, offering a wide range of approaches to a diverse variety of films. Although every essay is informed by a theoretical conscience, the writing rarely allows theory to swallow up the artifact to which it is applied. Both for specialists and for the general reader, the volume offers a good introduction to the achievement of our twin cinemas, along with representative examples of some of the best critical writing available today. (PETER HARCOURT)

William Beard and Jerry White, editors.
North of Everything: English-Canadian Cinema since 1980
University of Alberta Press. xxiv, 488. $49.95

The University of Alberta looks set to become a focal point for scholarship on Canadian film. First an English professor comes out with *Canadian National Cinema*, seventh in Routledge's National Cinemas series. Now two film/media studies professors have edited a hefty anthology of essays on recent Canadian film in English (and two more Alberta academics and a former instructor count among its thirty-two contributors). All the more ironic is it that the film/media studies program has been having trouble finding a resting place in the University of Alberta.

William Beard and Jerry White's anthology does not boast the scope of Christopher Gittings' monograph and seems determined both to defend and regret this choice. The corpus is declared to be English-Canadian cinema from 1980 to the present. This starting point is supported by the observation that single volumes on English-Canadian film have not appeared since Feldman's *Take Two* (1984) and Clandfield's *Canadian Film* (1987); later they also acknowledge Véronneau's *À la recherche d'une identité* (1991)! But the defence seems unnecessary, since many contributors are clearly not bound by the editors' chronology (calling it late twentieth-

century cinema would have sufficed).

They use space constraints to account for omitting studies of television, which is so closely allied with the cinema today, while at the same time acknowledging that many works 'for television' are included anyway.

Having dropped 'Francophone-Canadian' cinema to avoid subsuming Quebec's distinct film history and culture into a 'coherent Canadian national self' (Albertan academics owe it to themselves to be sceptical of Trudeau federalism), they refer to their inclusion of 'aboriginal cinema' as 'something of a cheat.' A page later they regret not having made this section much bigger. Two pages later, they celebrate the aboriginal cinema as a 'third national cinema' (having omitted one of the other two), linking it first to the cinema of other First Nations round the world and then to its English-Canadian context to make the case for its inclusion.

Documentary cinema receives less attention than narrative cinema because the editors believe the academy moved in the narrative direction as the Canadian fictional film canon unyoked itself from its earlier links to documentary aesthetics (but a large corpus of documentary film is included in the small number of articles that refer to it). They acknowledge that the section on avant-garde cinema does not include many key figures, first justifying the omission of Thirza Cuthand on the grounds that few have seen or can see her diary videos, and then genuinely regretting not having included an essay on her work.

All this being said, what about the work that did make its way into the collection?

On the evidence of these articles, what happened in the late twentieth century was the consolidation of critical theory in its various manifestations (neo-Marxist, feminist, anti-racist, queer and permutated combinations) in the cinema studies academy. But the academy also makes room for archival and newsy film writing, and that's OK by Beard and White. Accordingly, some essays clearly embed their account in a framework informed by critical theory, with or without specialized vocabulary to demonstrate the pedigree, others most decidedly do not. Some show the heritage of a certain strand of American cultural studies, perhaps, in their gleeful celebration of popular culture or in undermining boundaries that stratify cultural experience. Others bear the influence of earlier critical paradigms – one might be relieved to see that structural analysis is still hanging on (in Blaine Allan's analysis of Phillip Borsos's work), or that the various manifestations of auteurism (fifteen of these in the feature film section, with David Cronenberg getting two articles) and genre theory are being recycled, or that even the careful, sensitive textual scrutinies of the Leavisite school are still being honoured, *vide* Robin Wood's universalizing analysis of *Life Classes* (now in print for the third time, and oddly truncated from its companion analysis of Anne Wheeler's *Loyalties*, to which many references are made).

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

This is an anthology of film writing styles. It is the result of the heterogeneous accumulation that typifies film studies program design in the contemporary academy. There is something for every taste here, but individual professors may wish to recommend specific articles as role models for their students' writing rather than the vast spectrum provided here.

There are, for example, both exhaustive and selective survey articles of various corpora of recent animated film, experimental film, aboriginal film, films made in Newfoundland, and the individuals and studios producing them. D.B. Jones updates his 1982 study of the National Film Board of Canada, offering thumbnail sketches and quick judgments of a remarkable number of its films. He indulges the urge to tilt at 'isms' and 'house earnestness' and is prepared to regret the omission of 'white, English-speaking, Canadian males' from the recent 'umbrella of concern' for diversity and inclusion. Alongside these are close readings of single films, chatty interviews with filmmakers and studio executives, exercises in cultural recovery, prolegomena to promised or dreamed-for longer works, revisionist revisitings. The shadow of John Grierson, whose name gets easily the most citations in the nineteen-page index, still looms large even if only in four of the pieces. All in all, it is a typical book on Canadian cinema. Only the films and some of the critical frameworks are new. (DAVID CLANDFIELD)

Robert Astle. *Theatre without Borders*
Signature Editions. 142. $19.95

In *Theatre without Borders*, Robert Astle collects interviews with established Canadian practitioners of a kind of theatre that he finds difficult to categorize: 'call it clown, mime, mask or physical theatre, imagistic theatre, puppetry or new vaudeville.' The eclectic group of performers he interviews come from across the country: from Niagara-on-the-Lake, Harro Maskow and Robin Patterson of Theatre beyond Words; from Montreal Daniel Meilleur of Les Deux Mondes (formerly Théâtre de la Marmaille) and Yves Dagenais, the creator of the clown Omer Veilleux; from Toronto, Dean Gilmour and Michele Smith of Theatre Smith-Gilmour, Leah Cherniak and Martha Ross of Theatre Columbus, and the master puppeteer Ronnie Burkett, who has recently moved there from Calgary; from Vancouver, Wayne Specht of Axis Theatre Company and the performer and teacher Wendy Gorling; and from Halifax the four members of Jest in Time Theatre (Mary Ellen MacLean, Sherry Lee Hunter, Shelly Wallace, and Christian Murray).

Astle, himself a creator of this kind of theatre, explains that he discovered the need for such a book when he first taught an advanced clowning

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143

course at Concordia University, and found that there was very little source material on Canadian artists to which he could refer his students. In the course of the interviews, he identifies students at various levels as potential readers and invites his subjects to pass on advice for those interested in pursuing this kind of theatre. At the same time, he was motivated by the need to record the work of these established practitioners: in his interview with Leah Cherniak and Martha Burns, he observes, 'I thought it was essential to write this book, because in ten years we're not going to remember what happened at all.' In pursuit of these overlapping goals, his interviews focus on the practitioners' training and working methods. The interviews are supplemented by production photographs, production histories for each company or artist, and, in a few cases, excerpts from scripts.

Theater without Borders is more successful as a lively introduction to the selected artists than as a record of their work. While the interviews are informative about the lives and opinions of the individual practitioners and some of the methods of the companies to which they belong, they lack the context necessary to serve as substantial records of these artists' achievements. We are never told, for example, why these particular performers have been chosen (beyond their established careers), why they are grouped together, what their place is within the history of this type of theatre in Canada, or even when Astle conducted the interviews. Certain connections among the artists nevertheless emerge. A genealogy of influences can be deduced from the interviews themselves: the majority of these performers studied at L'École Jaques Lecoq in Paris and many of the anglophone artists were influenced by the now defunct Canadian Mime Theatre. Of the artists interviewed, Patterson and Gilmour are cited as influences by others. Another link among the companies is the economic necessity and artistic benefits of touring. And, despite Astle's insistence on the marginality of this kind of work, the increasing acceptance of this sort of theatre is also evident from the interviews and production histories.

Astle's attempts to convey the kind of work produced by these artists testify to the difficulty of transmitting the nature of physical, imagistic performance. If you have been fortunate enough to see one or more of these performances, they will be evoked by the excerpts and photographs, but even when supplemented by Astle's brief descriptions these documents convey very little about works that have not been experienced by the reader. More context and fuller descriptions would have assisted Astle's goal of introducing novices to these artists, as well as contributing to the documentary value of his book. Astle has not set out to write a work of scholarship, but without a structured context, the overall effect of the book is impressionistic and ephemeral, undermining his intention to produce a record of this body of work. He has made a good beginning at documenting this particularly evanescent kind of theatre, but his book also demonstrates

how much more could be done. (NANCY COPELAND)

http://www.utpjournals.press/doi/pdf/10.3138/utq.73.1.97 - Friday, June 30, 2017 12:02:07 PM - IP Address:104.249.224.143